

Санкт-Петербургский государственный университет

**УЗЮМОВА Александра Витальевна**

**Выпускная квалификационная работа**

*Spanish Civil War Interpretation in Modern Spanish and International Discourse*

Уровень образования: **магистратура**

Направление **41.04.05 «Международные отношения»**

Основная образовательная программа **ВМ.5569 «Международные отношения (на английском языке)»**

Научный руководитель:

доктор исторических наук, доцент

Хейфец Виктор Лазаревич

Рецензент:

доцент кафедры международного предпринимательства Санкт-Петербургского государственного университета аэрокосмического приборостроения, к.и.н.

Лукьянов Владимир Юрьевич

Санкт-Петербург

2022

## CONTENTS

<b>CONTENTS</b> .....	2
<b>INTRODUCTION</b> .....	3
<b>CHAPTER 1. HISTORICAL MEMORY AS A CONCEPT</b> .....	7
<b>1.1 Theoretical Framework</b> .....	7
<b>1.2 The Development of Historical Memory</b> .....	9
<b>1.3 Memory Policy Implementation in Particular Countries of Western Europe</b> .....	12
<b>1.4 Spanish Civil War, Franco’s Dictatorship and Democratic Transition Milestones</b> .....	24
<b>1.5 Conclusions</b> .....	29
<b>CHAPTER 2. SPANISH CIVIL WAR INTERPRETATION IN MODERN SPAIN</b> .....	30
<b>2.1 Memorial Legislation</b> .....	30
<b>2.1.1 Amnesty Law</b> .....	31
<b>2.1.2 Historical Memory Law</b> .....	33
<b>2.1.3 Democratic Memory Law</b> .....	35
<b>2.2 Places of Memory</b> .....	38
<b>2.2.1 Valley of the Fallen</b> .....	38
<b>2.2.2 Guernica</b> .....	41
<b>2.3 The Association for the Recovery of Historical Memory</b> .....	42
<b>2.4 Conclusions</b> .....	44
<b>CHAPTER 3. INTERNATIONAL DIMENSION OF MEMORY POLICY IN SPAIN</b> .....	46
<b>3.1 Impact of the European Union</b> .....	46
<b>3.2 Influence of the United Nations</b> .....	47
<b>3.3 Conclusion</b> .....	49
<b>CONCLUSIONS</b> .....	51
<b>REFERENCES</b> .....	54

## INTRODUCTION

The events of the World War II had changed drastically the approach to global problems. In fact, the results of the war brought some new issues to agenda, and these issues were not previously examined thoroughly. The XX century was time when new political systems appeared, new blocks had been formed and the new way of thinking had settled.

The events of XX century should be examined and understood by the world population. This need pushed forward the development of historical reassessment process. This phenomenon could be seen in modern Europe. The collapse of the USSR provoked this process in the Eastern Europe in a way of condemnation the Soviet regime and everything related to it. In the Western Europe it resulted in equating the communist ideology to nazism. However, not only the events of the World War II are experiencing the attempts of reassessment the past. There are also countries that are rethinking their own tragedies, among them is Spain.

After the Spanish civil war that had place from 1936 to 1939 the dictatorship of Francisco Franco was established. It ended in 1975 with Franco's death bringing a possibility to change Spanish political regime. Spain survived the democratic transition and changed a lot; however, it is impossible to suggest that there are no attempts to reconsider the period of Franco's governance.

**The aim** of this Master's Thesis is to determine how the modern Spanish and international institutions influence the memory policy adoption and the narrative formation on Spanish civil war and Franco's regime.

Under the Spanish discourse are considered the Spanish media reports, the statements made by politicians, national Spanish organizations, such as The Association for the Recovery of Historical Memory (ARMH), and the legislative acts adopted by the Spanish parliament in different periods of time.

Under the international discourse we consider the discourse of the international organizations, such as the United Nations, especially the UN Committee on Enforced Disappearances (CED), and the institutions of the European Union.

Present research focuses on the modern interpretation of the civil war in Spain, however it also includes the analysis of the Francisco Franco's dictatorship that followed the war. It is important because the measures that were implemented by Franco's regime representatives included the suppression the ones who had opposed the Franco's government during the civil war. In other words, two events of Spanish history are tightly interconnected.

In order to reach the mentioned aim there are set following **objectives**:

- To collect information on historical memory concept development;
- To elaborate criteria and to make observations on memory policy realization in particular countries of Western Europe;

- To determine the milestones of the Spanish civil war and Franco's dictatorship;
- To study the legislative acts that were adopted in Spain in the area of historical memory;
- To examine the practical implementation of the concept 'places of memory' in Spain;
- To research on particular non-Governmental actors that perform in the area of historical memory in Spain;
- To analyze how the international organizations do have an impact on Spanish memory policy initiatives.

**The object** of current research is Memory studies and **the subject** is the approach of Spanish and international society to Civil war in Spain and Franco's regime.

**The relevance** of this study is conditioned by the engagement of international organizations and different civil groups and also by the continuing process of historical policy making.

This Master's Thesis is composed of three chapters. The first one analyses the main scientific papers related to historical memory and the implementation of memory policy in different countries of the Western Europe. This part also studies the historical background of the issue under study and the modern approach to memory policy in Spain.

The second chapter focuses on the internal dimension of memory policy in Spain. The analysis is making on a basis of legislative cases, political statements, Spanish organizations approach and the researches of scholars and political scientists. Within the framework of this chapter the concept 'places of memory' practical implementation in Spain is examined.

The last chapter of the Master's Thesis is devoted to international dimension of memory policy in Spain. The third part presents the UN reaction on memory policy in Spain, especially the analysis of the Committee on Enforced Disappearances resolutions, and the main trends of memory policy in the European Union.

Each chapter has a conclusion that summarize the results of previous analysis. Mentioned findings are taking into consideration in the last part of the current paper.

At the present stage, the Spanish Civil war and Franco's dictatorship are well-observed. Each year appear papers and monographies on various matters related to francoist regime. In Russia, the valuable contribution to examination of Francoism is made by S.P. Pozharskaya<sup>1</sup>, G.A.

---

<sup>1</sup> Pozharskaya, S.P. Francisco Franco and His Time // Moscow: OLMA Media Group, 2007.

Filatov<sup>2</sup>, S.M. Henkin<sup>3</sup>, V.L. Vernikov<sup>4</sup>, A.A. Orlov<sup>5</sup> etc. Among international outstanding scholars could be distinguished P. Preston<sup>6</sup>, E. Beevor<sup>7</sup>, S.G. Payne<sup>8</sup> and others. This research encompasses papers of P. Preston (“Franco”; “Franco: a biography”; “Franco and Hitler: The Myth of Hendaye 1940”, etc.); E. Beevor (“The Spanish Civil War”); S.M. Khenkin (“Introduction: The Historical Significance of Spain's Transition To Democracy”; “Politico-Territorial Organization of Spain: Old Problems and New Challenges”; “Spain and the EU”; “The Monarchy and the Transition to Democracy in Spain”) and other researchers.

Despite the fact that the Francoism is examined and reconsidered by scientists, there is lack of studies that focuses on legislative aspects of historical memory implementation, as well as the issues of correlation between the memory policy initiatives and the foreign policy of the state. **The scientific novelty** of present research is in determination, if the memory policy initiatives are provided only by the demand of Spanish population or external actors, represented by international organizations, also play a significant role.

For this research the following **hypothesis** is made: the memory policy in Spain is developing under the demand of Spanish population and could be changed if this demand disappears.

There were several scientific methods used in the framework of this research:

**Case study.** Chapter 1.2 includes an analysis of memory policy implementation in different countries of Western Europe. The Chapter 2 presents a research on Spanish civil war interpretation within the borders of Spain as a case in the field of memory studies.

**Content analysis.** This scientific method is applied in the Chapter 2 as a basis for understanding the interpretation of Spanish civil war. It includes the research on Spanish magazines, such as El País, El Mundo, ABC, etc.

**Discourse analysis.** In order to obtain the results, there is a need to take into consideration the political ambient of Spain and how it changed with the time. This method is used in the Chapter 2. It also is implemented in the Chapter 1.2, while the cases of memory policy in Western Europe are investigated.

---

<sup>2</sup> Filatov, G.A. Evolution of Francisco Franco Image in Spain “No-Do” Cinema Newsreels // Nauchnyi dialog. 2015. – № 12 (48). pp. 363—373.

<sup>3</sup> Khenkin, S.M. Democratic Transition in Light of Current Realities // Spain in a Changing World. Reports of the Institute of Europe № 339. Moscow, 2017.

<sup>4</sup> Vernikov, V.L. The Political System is Changing Appearance // Spain in a Changing World. Reports of the Institute of Europe № 339. Moscow, 2017.

<sup>5</sup> Orlov, A.A. Spain in the Modern World: Problems Old and New // Spain in a Changing World. Reports of the Institute of Europe № 339. Moscow, 2017.

<sup>6</sup> Preston, P. Franco // Fontana, 1995.

<sup>7</sup> Beevor, A. The Spanish Civil War. New York, 1983.

<sup>8</sup> Payne, S.G. The Spanish Civil War // Cambridge University Press, 2012.

**Comparative analysis.** Throughout the master thesis the Spanish case of memory policy implementation is compared with the other cases of Western Europe. The comparative analysis can also be determined in the Chapter 2, where it was used in order to reveal differences of approaches of memory policy introduced by Spanish authorities.

**Historic approach.** The topic of current master thesis is tightly interconnected with history and its interpretations in modern discourses. It is important to understand how historical events are used for creation certain narratives. The review on history could be seen in Chapter 1.2 and 2.

**Approbation of research results.** The main provisions and conclusions on the topic of the thesis have been presented as a part of following scientific articles:

- Chekmazov, A.I., Uziumova, A.V. The Role of State and Non-State Actors in the Memory Policy: Comparative Analysis of Finland and Spain. *Bulletin of the Volga Region Institute of Administration*. 22 (1), 45-52.
- Uziumova, A.V., Chekmazov, A.I The Comparative Analysis of the Public Attitude Towards Franco and Mannerheim in Spain and Finland. *Public Relations as a Brand Awareness Booster: Proceedings of the Interuniversity Student Scientific-Practical Conference with International Participation*. Moscow, RUDN University, 2020.

## CHAPTER 1. HISTORICAL MEMORY AS A CONCEPT

### 1.1 Theoretical Framework

The constructivism was chosen as the theoretical framework for present Master's Thesis. According to American philosopher T. Rockmore, the ideas of constructivism have its roots in the papers of T. Hobbes, J. Vico, I. Kant.<sup>9</sup> From the point of view of T. Rockmore, such philosophers as I. Fichte, G.V.F. Hegel and K. Marx also developed various forms of constructivism. This theory started to develop in XIX century, but in the area of International Relations the term "constructivism" was brought for the first time to international discourse by N. Onuf in the framework of his book "World of Our Making" that was published in 1989.<sup>10</sup> The most famous representative of this paradigm in the field of International relations is Alexander Wendt, who created his paper "Anarchy is What States Make of It" in 1992.<sup>11</sup> The main ideas of constructivism are focused on role of person in a process of creating interpretations. According to A. Wendt, constructivists are motivated in the construction of identities and interest and, as such, take a more sociological than economic approach to systemic theory.<sup>12</sup> The ideas of A. Wend presented a balanced response to existed theories and absorbed some ideas of neorealism and neoliberalism.

In scientific papers of T.A. Alekseeva it could be found a statement that the constructivism used as a ground the whole postpositivism, but it is incorrect to believe that constructivism represents a synthesis of different paradigms of mentioned research direction. The scholar supposes that from the very beginning the constructivism aimed at providing the methodological response to the main and dominating schools in the field of International Relations theory.<sup>13</sup>

At present moment exist a huge number of researches that investigate development and practical application of constructivist theory. Here will be provided several main suggestions. According to A.M. Ulanovsky, constructivist paradigm encompasses assumptions on socially constructed nature of knowledge, rejection of the empirical science fundamentalist claims, confidence that knowledge is historical interpretation.<sup>14</sup> The researcher highlights that for constructivist the basis of knowledge is in language, culture, social relations, in norms and conventions that are adopted in any society. From constructivist point of view, the world is not just passively reflected by humans, but constructed by them.<sup>15</sup>

---

<sup>9</sup> Rockmore, T. Kant on Representationism and Constructivism // *Epistemology & Philosophy of Science*. 2005. №1.

<sup>10</sup> Onuf, Nicholas. *World of Our Making* // University of South Carolina Press, 1989.

<sup>11</sup> Wendt, A. *Anarchy is what States Make of it: The Social Construction of Power Politics* // The MIT Press. International Organization, Spring, 1992, Vol. 46, №2.

<sup>12</sup> Wendt, A. Collective Identity Formation and the International State // *The American Political Science Review*, Jun., 1994, Vol. 88, №2.

<sup>13</sup> Alekseeva, T.A. Think Like Constructivist: Discovering a Multi-Voiced World // *Comparative Politics*. 2014. №1 (14).

<sup>14</sup> Ulanovsky, A.M. Constructivist paradigm in the humanities // *Epistemology & Philosophy of Science*. 2006. 10 (4).

<sup>15</sup> Ulanovsky, A.M. Constructivist paradigm in the humanities // *Epistemology & Philosophy of Science*. 2006. 10 (4).

There should be made some references on a scientific researches of V. Petrenko in the scientific article entitled as “Constructivist Paradigm in Humanities” the scholar presents an idea that the cognizing subject (individual or collective) creates models of the world, which determine the social reality in which this subject is immersed.<sup>16</sup> In the scientific article “Constructivism as a New Paradigm for the Human Sciences”, V. Petrenko points out that the concept of “constructivism” has no clearly defined semantic boundaries and does not represent a certain author's concept. This worldview is rather a reaction to naive realism and vulgar materialism.<sup>17</sup>

Here should be noted that C. Holtorf in his article entitled “Radical Constructivism. Knowledge Beyond Epistemology” provides an idea that it is not knowledge that adapts to the real world, but the world itself adapts to our cognitive needs.<sup>18</sup>

A common feature of constructivism is the statement that people actively build and construct knowledge about the world and each other.<sup>19</sup> This provision claims to be applicable both to the level of perception and to higher-order processes - thinking and problem solving.<sup>20</sup>

There should be mentioned one more time that constructivism as a set of theoretical and methodological principles exists in all social sciences and humanities. In constructivism as a theory of International relations, political reality is presented as a product of social construction.<sup>21</sup>

According to T.A. Alekseeva, constructivism expresses the confrontation and contradictions between rationalists, who believe that the world is governed by universal laws, and relativists, who emphasize the importance of intersubjective, shared meanings and discourses, always included in a specific social context.<sup>22</sup>

Summarizing, there is a need to mention that concerning constructivism as international relations theory provides special focus on historical memory issue. Historical memory from this point of view is a collective construct of one or another nation or state that reflects a particular understanding of event of the past. In this connection, the memory policy is a set of governmental and non-governmental actors activities that impacts on the public perception and opinion in short-term and long-term perspective. However, the issue of historical memory, its features and development process will be investigated in the framework of the second part of the Chapter 1.

---

<sup>16</sup> Petrenko, V. Constructivist Paradigm in Humanities // Development of Personality. 2012. №2.

<sup>17</sup> Petrenko, V. Constructivism as a New Paradigm for the Human Sciences // Vestnik SPBU. Sociology. 2010. №2.

<sup>18</sup> Holtorf, C. Radical Constructivism. Knowledge Beyond Epistemology / translation Budenkova, V.E. // Vestnik Tomskogo Gosudarstvennogo Universiteta. 2009. №329.

<sup>19</sup> Kulikov, D.K. Constructivism and Cognitive Psychology: Analysis and Critique of Major Propositions // IZVESTIYA SFedU. Engineering Sciences. 2012. №10.

<sup>20</sup> Cobb, P. Constructivism // Encyclopedia of Psychology. – W., D.C.: 2000. Vol. 3.

<sup>21</sup> Kazantsev, A.A. “Constructivist Revolution”, or on the Role of Cultural and Civilizational Factors in the Modern International Relations // Political Science (RU). 2009. №4.

<sup>22</sup> Alekseeva, T.A. Think Like Constructivist: Discovering a Multi-Voiced World // Comparative Politics. 2014. №1 (14).



## 1.2 The Development of Historical Memory

At present moment there is no stable definition of historical memory concept. Currently exist a huge scale of different interconnected terms that substitute one another. Among them could be mentioned such terms as ‘social memory’, ‘historical memory’, ‘cultural memory’, ‘collective memory’, ‘individual memory’, etc.<sup>23</sup> According to D. Davletyshina, the social memory has a certain number of its appearances that include historical and moral memory, supra-individual memory, which is tightly bounded with the problem of saving intellectual resources of humankind.<sup>24</sup> From the other side, N.A. Kolodi determines historical memory as “the collective ideas of society about the past”.<sup>25</sup> However, some scholars, such as E.I. Tarutina, suppose that ‘social memory’ is not equal to ‘historical one’.<sup>26</sup> In other words, the historical memory could be a system of social and cultural methods and concepts that control and transform the events of the past that are important to a present moment in order to transmit the experience to new generations.

Here should be mentioned that memory, from the point of view of constructivism, cannot be understood as a representation of external experience related to the past.<sup>27</sup> Preservation and reproduction is always the construction and reconstruction of memory. ‘To remember’ means ‘to reconstruct’ the past in the framework of understanding the present.<sup>28</sup>

The idea of historical memory was brought to international discourse for the first time by P. Nora This new concept was aimed to create a new identity in Germany after the World War II. This identity had to combine the responsibility and sorrow brought by World Wars and the proudness of the German culture achievements.<sup>29</sup>

According to P. Nora, at present moment the mankind is in the epoch characterized by the rapid growth of commemorative events and museums, creating a legal assessment of the past, high rate of interest to the archives and the attachment to the historical ‘legacy’.<sup>30</sup> The scholar also introduced a term ‘places of memory’. ‘Places of memory’ is a symbol of historical event that creates understanding about this event and about the memorial itself. They are not places in a

---

<sup>23</sup> Akhmetshina, A.V. Concept of Historical Memory and Its Implication In the Modern Russian Society // Current issues of social sciences: sociology, political science, philosophy, history. 2014. No.38.

<sup>24</sup> Davletshina, D.G. Social memory as the basis of human morality: candidate of philosophy dissertation abstract. Ufa, 2006. — 18 s. P. 10.

<sup>25</sup> Kolodi, N.A. Maze of Memory – Places of Memory – The War of Memory: Experience of Interpretation // Journal of Wellbeing Technologies. 2013. №1 (7).

<sup>26</sup> Tarutina, E.I. Social memory and “unconsciousness” // Vestnik of Amur State University. 2016. №74.

<sup>27</sup> Kulikov, D.K. Constructivism and Cognitive Psychology: Analysis and Critique of Major Propositions // IZVESTIYA SFedU. Engineering Sciences. 2012. №10.

<sup>28</sup> Cobb P. Constructivism // Encyclopedia of Psychology. – W., D.C.: 2000. Vol. 3.

<sup>29</sup> Rychkov, V.A. Memory Policy Scenarios // Fundamental and applied sciences in the development of society and technology in the CIS countries: A collection of abstracts of the II International Conference / under the general editorship of M.S. Yanitsky and I.Y. Sergeeva; Kemerovo State University. - Kemerovo, 2020. - 86 p.

<sup>30</sup> Nora, P. Worldwide Triumph of Memory // Neprikosnovennyi zapas, 2005, no. 2–3, pp. 391-402.

narrow geographical sense; they can encompass people, events, objects, buildings, traditions, legends, geographical points that are surrounded by a special symbolic aura.<sup>31</sup>

M. Halbwachs, one of the important scholars in the field of historical memory, stated that individual remembrances can be understood only in the context of a group that integrates nation or community in time and space.<sup>32</sup>

According to V. Rychkov there are two possible approaches to studying the phenomenon of historical memory. The first is structural and functional approach that is focused on the influence of governmental actors on the identity creation through narratives. The second approach is aimed at the analysis of the main problems and objectives of memory policy through the comparison of actors' attitudes and their actions in the field of memory.

Some scholars believe that the historical memory is a social and cultural construction, that reflects the collective understanding of the past. The supporters of mentioned position state that each knowledge about the past reality constructs the present reality. In other words, the reality is a social construction.<sup>33</sup> According to G. Antipov this approach has its advantages and disadvantages. Among the disadvantages can be noted the elimination of any possible relation between the investigator and the reality.

There is also an opinion presented by that K.V. Akulinin that collective memory contributes to the stabilization of society, its self-reflection as a whole and acts as the basis of its spiritual culture.<sup>34</sup>

According to A.V. Sidorov, in the legal field of the European Union and the United States, there is no single English-language equivalent to the Russian-language concept of "memory policy".<sup>35</sup> The researcher notice that the concept of 'memory politics' have formed under the influence of developing so-called 'memory studies'. Here should be pointed out that memory studies have an interdisciplinary character. It encompasses findings from the different fields of study such as history, philosophy, sociology, political studies, cultural researches, literature, psychology etc.<sup>36</sup> It means that in each field of study the concept of historical memory has its practical implementation. The most obvious form of historical memory incarnation is a process of

---

<sup>31</sup> Smirnova, T.A. Researching Features of Historical Memory and Practices of Commemoration of the First World War in Britain in 1918–1939 // *Yaroslavl Pedagogical Bulletin*. 2014. № 4 (1).

<sup>32</sup> Halbwachs, M. *On Collective Memory* / ed. L.A. Coser. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992.

<sup>33</sup> Antipov, G.A. History, Memory, And History as a Science // *Epistemology & Philosophy of Science*. 2014. №4 (42).

<sup>34</sup> Akulinin, K.V. Collective Memory of First World War in Britain During Interwar Period. Statement of the Problem // *Tomsk State University Journals*. 2014. №4 (132)

<sup>35</sup> Sidorov, A.V. Official Memory Politics in the USA and the European Union: Comparative Terminology Analysis // *Education and Law*. 2022. №3.

<sup>36</sup> Dvornichenko, A.Yu., Ilyin, E.V., Bondarev, S.V., Petrov, I.V. Historical Memory, International Trialog and the Advancement to a Unified Perception of History // *Vestnik SPBU. History*. 2013. №2.

creating different types of museums, platforms, events and public spaces where people can have a possibility to become familiar with history.

K.V. Vodenko and S.S. Chernykh in scientific article “Historical Memory as a State Policy Tool in the Sphere of Higher Education: National Context and Regional Aspects” promote the idea that at present moment the higher education is responsible on transferring the historical knowledge, in a framework of which the traditions are preserved and the modern science achievements are taking into account.<sup>37</sup> The researchers point out that historical memory of nation needs not only creation and preserving, but also protection by cultural institutions and state authorities. Vodenko K.V. and Chernykh S. S. also note that developed or “trained” historical memory could be found in the consciousness of an individual that indicates on the result of individual’s formation.<sup>38</sup>

The other important form of historical memory concept practical implementation is a memorial legislation. S.A. Kulikova and I.D. Kirnosov in the article “Protection of Historical Memory as an Institution of Constitutional Law: Russian and Foreign Experience” explain that the protection of historical memory is a multi-component constitutional and legal institution that includes at least three levels, such as<sup>39</sup>:

- 1) creation and consolidation of the state memorial concept (national image of history);
- 2) preservation of historical heritage;
- 3) protection of historical memory from encroachments and distortion.

According to O. Matusевич, mostly the laws are about protection of historical and cultural heritage, however the term ‘memorial legislation’ assumes that the legal acts aim at criminalization of revisionist narrations creation or denying of historical incidents.<sup>40</sup>

Here should be made a reference to another scientific article of O. Matusевич entitled as “Historical Consciousness and Collective Memory as a Subject of Social and Humanitarian Cognition”. In the mentioned article the scholar declares that social memory creates a set of problems the study of which could be profitable for science. Among them are: investigations on the role of social memory in the regulation of various social groups behavior; study of the social

---

<sup>37</sup> Vodenko, K.V., Chernykh, S.S. Historical Memory as a State Policy Tool in the Sphere of Higher Education: National Context and Regional Aspects // Bulletin Social-Economic and Humanitarian Research. 2022. № 13 (15).

<sup>38</sup> Vodenko, K.V., Chernykh, S.S. Historical Memory as a State Policy Tool in the Sphere of Higher Education: National Context and Regional Aspects // Bulletin Social-Economic and Humanitarian Research. 2022. № 13 (15).

<sup>39</sup> Kulikova, S.A., Kirnosov, I.D. Protection of Historical Memory as an Institution of Constitutional Law: Russian and Foreign Experience // Izv. Sarat. Univ. Economics. Management. Law, 2022, vol. 22, iss. 1.

<sup>40</sup> Matusевич, O.A. Memorial Legislation: Genesis and Contradictions // Works of BSTU. Series 6: History, philosophy. 2014. No.5 (169).

institutions functioning that form collective memory of societies; identification of multifactorial conditionality of the formation of social memory.<sup>41</sup>

Summing up, there is a need to mention one more time several features of the concept of historical memory. Firstly, there is no one single definition of this term. In fact, some scholars oppose different aspects of memory in order to find the best correlation between ‘memory’ and ‘history’. Secondly, historical memory is a result of collective construction. Group of people creates its perception of the past. Thirdly, due to this constant process of reflection on history, appear so-called ‘places of memory’. This ‘places’ provide some idea about the past and collective understanding that supports further discourse creation. And then the memory policy appears as a form of structural and controlled approach to historical events. In the next part of current master thesis will be provided some examples of memory policy implementation in particular countries of Western Europe. In the framework of the next part the author explains the concept of ‘memory policy’ and analyzes several examples of its political implementation in order to applicate the obtained results studying the Spanish civil war interpretation in modern Spanish and International discourse.

### **1.3 Memory Policy Implementation in Particular Countries of Western Europe**

The concept of historical memory occupies a very significant place in European agenda. While countries of Eastern Europe, especially the countries of post-Soviet space are mostly concerned about USSR legacy, the countries of Western Europe are focused on World War II or related to the war events.

The historical memory appears to be tightly bounded with a concept of human rights. In this connection, it could be discovered that there is a certain strategy of dealing with a difficult past. According to Council of Europe, the defense of human rights could be made through remembrance.<sup>42</sup> This process includes several stages. The first stage is acknowledgement. The violent act of the past should be publicly recognized in order to prevent similar events in future. Then, on the second stage this inhumane act must be condemned. The role of all parts of conflict must be analyzed and judged. Then, there should be a compensation to the victims. The most well-known example of the third stage implementation is embodied in the efforts made by Germany to compensate the victims of World War II. And the last stage implies the remembering that is focused on promoting the results of historical analysis. There also should be mentioned that Council of Europe tries to protect human rights through remembrance affecting on young people

---

<sup>41</sup> Matusevich, O.A. Historical Consciousness and Collective Memory as a Subject of Social and Humanitarian Cognition // Works of BSTU. Series 6: History, philosophy. 2011. No.5.

<sup>42</sup> Remembrance [Electronic resource] // Council of Europe. – Mode of access: <https://www.coe.int/en/web/compass/remembrance> (accessed 12.03.2022)

through education.<sup>43</sup> This means that the role of education in the sphere of historical memory is very important. Governments can influence public opinions through the materials that are provided to students creating the further perception of the past. In other words, the growing generation will transmit in future the point of view suitable for a certain party or government. In this connection, there is always a possibility to use historical memory in a process of creating a specific ideology. Such possibility proves that memory studies are very relevant nowadays. This part of master thesis is focused on analysis of memory policy implementation in different countries of Western Europe with a purpose of identification of certain memory policy similarities existing in different countries.

Firstly, there is a need to determine what is assumed under the term ‘memory policy’. N.A. Medushevsky defines ‘memory policy’ as the modeling of collective memory by political agents using political technologies that allow the public to focus on some historical events and silence others, forming stereotyped thinking among recipients.<sup>44</sup> The researcher also provides an idea that the European approach to memory policy changed throughout the time. It is especially important in the case of European Union, where the common perception on history is a basis for integration. In this connection, there is a need to mention that European Union is not a homogeneous in itself and in some cases the national features dominate the common methods. That means that there is no need to study the whole EU, but some regions, or, probably, the cases of several countries in order to obtain the results. Here should be mentioned that the European Union is not a suitable unit for memory policy implementation in European countries analysis, because not all European countries have membership in the EU. In this connection, the author of current master thesis believes that it will be more applicable to present research to examine memory policy implementation in the countries of Western Europe.

Firstly, there is a need to determine Western Europe as a region. This determination is important for further understanding of memory policy implementation in European countries.

There are different approaches to determination the region of Western Europe. According to the UN, it is composed of 10 countries, such as Austria, Belgium, Germany, Liechtenstein, Luxemburg, Monaco, Netherlands, France and Switzerland. The CIA has a different perspective, classifying Austria, Germany, Liechtenstein and Switzerland to Central Europe and including to the list the Great Britain and Ireland which the UN describes as countries of Northern Europe.

Here should be noted that neither the classification of the UN, nor the list of the CIA does not include Spain as a country of Western Europe. In order to make a proper research on memory

---

<sup>43</sup> Remembrance [Electronic resource] // Council of Europe. – Mode of access: <https://www.coe.int/en/web/compass/remembrance> (accessed 12.03.2022)

<sup>44</sup> Medushevsky N.A., Memory Policy in the European Union as a Tool for the Implementation of the Integration Process // *Vlast*. 2019. №3.

policy implementation in European countries, there is a need to set several criteria in order to determine a region of study.

The first criteria states that Spain must be included in region. It is important because the common region provides a ground for comparative analysis. Through comparison may be obtained information about common and different strategies of memory policy implementation. Also, it would be helpful in further forecast creation.

Under the second criteria is assumed that the region under the determination does not include the European countries that were part of the USSR, former member of the Warsaw Pact Organization or belonged to countries of the socialist camp. This criterion must be implemented in order to separate the strategies that were adopted by the post-Soviet states in the field of historical memory. It is assumed that the countries of the post-Soviet space are mostly concerned about their past in the framework of the USSR. This situation differs greatly from the other countries that were not part of the Soviet Union or the Warsaw Pact Organization. There is a need to mention that Spain also did not belonged to these political entities.

From the second criteria stems the assumption that the current research could be based on memory policy implementation in countries that are members of NATO. However, the membership in NATO would not be precise criteria in determination the region of Western Europe suitable for present research. There are two arguments proving the impossibility of the equation of NATO and the term of Western countries for the paper. Firstly, this approach excludes countries that were neither part of Warsaw Pact Organization, nor NATO and preserved neutrality. Among them there is a need to distinguish such countries as Finland. Secondly, Spain joined NATO only in 1982, when Francisco Franco was already dead. If it is assumed that only the member-states of NATO form Western Europe, appears a contradiction with the idea of Spain being part of a region.

Reviewing established criteria, it could be supposed that the most suitable region for current study is located within the borders of capitalist countries that existed in XX century. From this statement steams a need to set a period of time during which have happened an event that now is interpreted in modern political discourse. The first framework that is suitable for research is 1936-1982, where the first date is starting point of Spanish civil war and the second date is acceptance of Spain in NATO. However, this timeline is not precise and it reflects only the events of Spanish history. It does not include the World War I, that influenced a lot the actions of European political elites. Taking the mentioned point into account, the time framework could be set from 1914 to 1982, where the first date is the beginning of the World War I and the last represents acceptance of Spain in NATO. However, in this occasion will be missed such events as Portugal revolution (1910) and The Spanish-American War (1898) that influenced a European

political perception. Considering the mentioned points, a period from 1898 to 1982 would be the most appropriate framework to be set for the current research.

Following the elaborated criteria for the further analysis, could be highlighted Austria, Belgium, The Great Britain, Germany, Ireland, Liechtenstein, Luxemburg, Monaco, Netherlands, France, Switzerland, Denmark, Iceland, Norway, Finland, Sweden, Andorra, Greece, Spain, Italy, Malta, Portugal, San Marino, Vatican. However, the primary selection showed a wide scale of states with a rich history and identified the need narrow the material for the analysis.

There are several approaches of narrowing the presented list of the countries. First way consists of selecting for the further research countries that were neutral or formally neutral in the years of the Word War II. This sample bases on a status that Spain had in this period. However, this selection will not include such countries as France, Great Britain, Germany, Italy and the possibility to obtain data on their memory policy implementation will be lost. The second approach is in setting neutral criteria that will create a list of random countries from the determined region for study. In this connection it was decided to restrict the research with the first 10 largest countries of Western Europe. It will give a possibility to create different observations on memory policy strategies implemented in selected countries. According to this statement, it was decided to make observations on France, Spain, Sweden, Norway, Germany, Finland, Italy, The Great Britain, Greece, Iceland.

It is also important to point out that the German case is controversial because in established time-frame Germany in its modern boundaries did not existed. There is a need to mention as well that a part of its history Germany was under the Soviet influence, which means that this case contradicts to elaborated criteria, despite the fact that German case presents a very interesting perception of problem. In this connection, the author of current master thesis believes that the final sample of countries for observations must be modified. The modified list consists of France, Spain, Sweden, Norway, Finland, Italy, The Great Britain, Greece, Iceland, Portugal. At the presented sample are included countries with different cultural, historical, social, economic background or number of population. The following brief research is focused on features of memory policy implementation and their possible similarities with other cases. Here also should be noted that the case of Spain will be studied in the following parts of present chapter.

The author of present master thesis understands that even a narrowed list of countries for the primary analysis can provide enormous number of data. Also it must be mentioned that the conduct of full-fledged study of selected countries memory policy implementation is impossible in a framework of current research due to amount of existing information and specific of each country. The following analysis represents the mainstream policy in the field of historical memory that could be helpful in further analysis of Spanish case.

All the events under the analysis could be divided into two groups. The first group includes the events that are important for the whole humankind and the development of memory policy in total. Here should be highlighted such events as the World War I and World War II. The crimes committed during these wars impacted the whole European population creating a ground for further analysis and interpretation in future. The second group of events consist of local episodes of history that are important mostly for population of one country and with some possibility for its neighbors. However, in many cases the national traumas of one country are tightly interconnected with a global historical events. In this connection the current brief research on memory policy in selected states of Western Europe will be focused on analysis of historical events happened during the World War I and World War II or related to them.

Studying the perception of the World War I in selected countries, the paper by N.N. Baranov “World War I in Popular Culture of Memory” should be taken into account. According to the author of the research paper, in France and the Great Britain the World War I is still constantly present in the culture of memory and carries a much more visible consolidating national-political idea.<sup>45</sup> According to O.S. Porshneva, the World War I itself gave a boost to developing historical memory concept and memory policy as a management method.<sup>46</sup> Some scholars believe that in Western historiography study on the World War I started before than in Russia. According to some data, about 60000 papers on World War I were published by the end of 2012.

There is a need to mention that in the case of Great Britain the World War I has more interpretations and attracts more public attention than World War II. According to the UK National Achieves, more than one million British military personnel<sup>47</sup> died during the First and Second World Wars, with the First World War alone accounting for 886,000 fatalities.<sup>48</sup> According to K.V. Akulinin, the World War I occupied an important place in collective memory of the Great Britain citizens in 1920-1930 due to the social and economic consequences of war.<sup>49</sup> The researcher traces a clear tendency to glorify the war of 1914-1918 and everything connected. There also was a process of institutionalization of places associated with the World War I as ‘places of memory’. T.A. Smirnova in article entitled as “Researching Features of Historical Memory and

---

<sup>45</sup> Baranov, N.N. World War I in Popular Culture of Memory // Perm University Herald. History. 2018. №4 (43).

<sup>46</sup> Porshneva, O.S. The Study of the Politics of Memory: To Overcome the Methodological Dichotomy (On the Example of the First World War) // Scientific Journal “Discourse-P”. 2020. 2(39).

<sup>47</sup> Rachipa, A.V., Burkov, V.V. Historical Memory and Some Problems of Studying the World War I // Actual problems of humanities and natural sciences. 2016. No.11-3.

<sup>48</sup> Deaths in the First and Second World Wars [Electronic resource] // The National Archives. – Mode of access: <https://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/help-with-your-research/research-guides/deaths-first-and-second-world-wars/> (accessed 10.02.2022)

<sup>49</sup> Akulinin, K.V. Collective Memory of First World War in Britain During Interwar Period. Statement of the Problem // Tomsk State University Journals. 2014. №4 (132)



Practices of Commemoration of the First World War in Britain in 1918–1939” notes that in the first years after the end of the World War I in the Great Britain was created a range of forms of commemoration that characterized by historical and sociological complexity.<sup>50</sup>

Despite the fact that the World War I influenced a lot public perception of the world, it’s impact on the memory policy is not so notable comparing to the events of the World War II. This period has a lot of aspects to explore as from global point of view, as from national perspective. As an example, there is a need to provide a reference on scientific article of D.V. Shmagin “The “Vichy Syndrome”: The Political Problems of the Collaborationist Past Rethinking”. The author of mentioned article analyzes how the French society realized a process of rethinking of the collaboration regime that dominated in France during the World War II. According to D.V. Shmagin, the process of rethinking the mentioned regime was displaced from the national memory of the French people, and the analysis of the events that occurred was distorted.<sup>51</sup> The author also points out that the process of rethinking consisted in four steps divided in different timelines. The duration of the first step was from 1944 to 1954. This period characterized with so-called “legal purges” and attempt of society to condemn the regime existed in country. There is also a need to mention that in 1951 France adopted a law on amnesty aimed at the forgiveness of collaborators, as well as the rehabilitation of the head of the Vichy regime. According to D.V. Shmagin, it was supposed that the amnesty would help the reconciliation of the French people and contribute to the abolition of many unjust sentences made during the beginning of purges.<sup>52</sup>

The next step was from 1954 to 1971 that obtained a name of the policy of “displacement”. It was characterized by creation of great image of French resistance. At this point it is important to make one more reference on the article by D.V. Shmagin “The “Vichy Syndrome”: The Political Problems of the Collaborationist Past Rethinking”. The scholar points out that during this period the reburial of the ashes of one of the leaders of the French National Committee, Jean Moulin occurred. He was exhumed and reburied in the Paris Pantheon, where the outstanding people of France were buried.<sup>53</sup> This act of body replacement gave a possibility to standardize the approach to history.

The third step was from 1971 to 1974 when the young generation started to protest against the established myth about the past. And the last step started in 1974 and lasts nowadays. During

---

<sup>50</sup> Smirnova, T.A. Researching Features of Historical Memory and Practices of Commemoration of the First World War in Britain in 1918–1939 // Yaroslavl Pedagogical Bulletin. 2014. № 4 (1).

<sup>51</sup> Shmagin, D.V. The “Vichy Syndrome”: The Political Problems of the Collaborationist Past Rethinking // RUDN Journal of Political Science. 2012. № 2.

<sup>52</sup> Shmagin, D.V. The “Vichy Syndrome”: The Political Problems of the Collaborationist Past Rethinking // RUDN Journal of Political Science. 2012. № 2.

<sup>53</sup> Shmagin, D.V. The “Vichy Syndrome”: The Political Problems of the Collaborationist Past Rethinking // RUDN Journal of Political Science. 2012. № 2.

this period the different president administrations approached to this controversial issue from the different angles. However, it is important to mention that in 2009, the French Council of State recognized the guilt of the French state for deportations during World War II. According to D.V. Shmagin, this decision is not only symbolic, but also historical, because the State has legally recognized its responsibility on its actions.

The review of Shmagin's article seems very important for present research, because it gives a possibility to trace how the perception of the French population on its controversial part of history has changed. The results could be used during the analysis of the Spanish case in order to determine the differences and similarities of memory policy implementation.

The French case shows a particular model of reflections on collaborationist past and several methods of interpretation that the authorities used throughout the time. It included judicial processes, silencing the problem, alternative explanations of the historical events and resulted in condemnation.

Another curious example is Sweden. Sweden traditionally is presented as an example of neutral state. However, E.M. Malysheva states in the scientific article "Swedish "Neutrality" in the Second World War" that during the World War II, Sweden was a non-belligerent state rather than a neutral one.<sup>54</sup> This idea proves with data highlighting that Sweden policy changed from 1940 to 1945. From 1940 to 1943 it economically supported Nazi Germany, but since 1944 Sweden tried to cooperate more with countries of the anti-Hitler coalition. Also, Malysheva E.M. makes a conclusion that the World War II has not become a part of collective's memory in Sweden mostly because of the absence of direct involvement in the war. The author underlines that despite the fact that many Swedish people joined the German army, there were no judicial processes on them after the war ended.<sup>55</sup> The actions of Swedish authorities created an image of the neutral state that avoided suffering.

The Sweden case of the World War II controversial neutrality is not unique. Finland also balanced between Nazi Germany and countries of the anti-Hitler coalition looking for a more profitable way of surviving. For Finland the World War II was in some way a continuation of wars with Russia. In fact, the position of Finland was not very stable, because it had a separate war with the USSR, but Germany declared Finland its ally. It resulted in some difficulties in its prevarication policy.

---

<sup>54</sup> Malysheva, E.M. Swedish "Neutrality" in the Second World War // Vestnik of Saint-Petersburg University. History of Russia. 2016. Series 2. Issue 2, pp. 4–17.

<sup>55</sup> Malysheva, E.M. Swedish "Neutrality" in the Second World War // Vestnik of Saint-Petersburg University. History of Russia. 2016. Series 2. Issue 2, pp. 4–17.

The Finnish approach to historical memory is very interesting because this case is focused on one figure, on the controversial person of the Marshal of Finland, Carl Gustaf Emil Mannerheim.

Some scholars, such as J.E.O. Screen, that during from 1918 to 1939, the dominant image of Mannerheim was the White General of the victorious White Army in the Finnish Civil War.<sup>56</sup> However, T. Tepora bring attention to the fact that for many defeated socialists he symbolized a demonic butcher-in-chief. Out of more than 36,000 people who perished as a consequence of the bloody civil war, more than three-fourths were socialists, known as the Reds.<sup>57</sup> According to the scholar, the cult of Mannerheim's personality is controversial and composed by the perceptions of two different conservative poles. Here should be mentioned that the image of Mannerheim has passed through evolution and became a symbol that causes contradictory public emotions. In other words, nowadays Mannerheim presents a 'place of memory', described as a concept by P. Nora.

There is a need to reveal how changed public attitudes to Mannerheim throughout the time. As it was mentioned before, during the Civil War in Finland were murdered thousands people. A. Uziumova and A. Chekmazov note that in some cities of modern Finland, such as Tampere, the monument to Mannerheim was abused by crowd. According to the researchers, "from year to year unknown people paint it and write on a table with the Marshal's name word "Slaughterer", thus expressing their dissatisfaction with the actions of Mannerheim during the Civil War".<sup>58</sup>

However, after the Winter War between the Soviet Union and Finland the situation changed and Finnish people united around the Marshal. And after the World War II, when trials on war criminals were held in post-war Finland, Mannerheim became the only person able to prevent Finnish society from splitting and starting guerilla warfare.

In this connection there is a need to provide some findings presented in the scientific article of A. Chekmazov and A. Uziumova entitled as "The Role of State and Non-State Actors in the Memory Policy: Comparative Analysis of Finland and Spain". The authors of mentioned research state that Finland passed through several stages of memory policy after the end of the World War II.<sup>59</sup> Firstly, right after the war Finland adopted a new policy of neutrality, so-called Paasikivi-Kekkonen doctrine, that was aimed at collaboration with both Western countries and the USSR. In order to deepen the relations with the USSR, Finland had to change its social policy too. This

---

<sup>56</sup> Screen, J.E.O. Mannerheim: The Finnish Years // Hurst. 2000.

<sup>57</sup> Tepora, T. The Image of Marshal Mannerheim, Moral Panic, and the Refashioning of the Nation in the 1990s. // Palgrave Macmillan, Cham. Palgrave Studies in the History of Experience. In: Kivimäki, V., Suodenjoki, S., Vahtikari, T. (eds) Lived Nation as the History of Experiences and Emotions in Finland, 1800-2000. 2021.

<sup>58</sup> Uziumova, A.V., Chekmazov, A.I. The Comparative Analysis of the Public Attitude Towards Franco and Mannerheim in Spain and Finland. Public Relations as a Brand Awareness Booster: Proceedings of the Interuniversity Student Scientific-Practical Conference with International Participation. Moscow, RUDN University, 2020.

<sup>59</sup> Chekmazov, A.I., Uziumova, A.V. The Role of State and Non-State Actors in the Memory Policy: Comparative Analysis of Finland and Spain. Bulletin of the Volga Region Institute of Administration. 22 (1), 45-52.

policy could be characterized as a policy of ‘forgetting’ and it eliminated Mannerheim’s figure from political discourse. The main aim of this policy was avoiding of further society polarization. Secondly, after the dissolution of the Soviet Union, the public interest to Mannerheim started to grow, because of the construction of the new Museum of Modern Art in Helsinki near to the equestrian monument to Mannerheim. At the present moment, there is no serious either discussions in Finland or contradictions in the field of historical memory. It could be explained by the policy of modern Government and the trend that Finnish people have accepted their past.

In the case of Norway, it is challenging to find an example of national trauma appeared in established as a framework period of time. However, it is impossible to say that the mechanism of remembrance was not adopted here. The Norwegian Center for Holocaust and Minority Studies has organized the national commemorative ceremony since 2002, that is held at the quayside from where the Jews living in Norway were brutally forced on board ships for deportation at the harbour in Oslo, in 1942.<sup>60</sup> In other words, Norway condemns the fascist actions, but its population has no obvious own trauma. The same phenomenon is seen in Iceland.

The case of Greece seems very interesting because in this country the events of the past are tightly interconnected with the present. A.R. Kurbanov shows a link between actions of Germany during the World War II in Greek territory with the economic crisis that occurred in 2015. The researcher points out that for Greece is important a resistant memory concept that preserves the integrity of Greek population against external threat or loss of sovereignty.<sup>61</sup> In 1940 Italy presented an ultimatum to Greece, demanding to allow Italian troops enter the territory of Greece with occupation of “strategic positions”. According to A.R. Kurbanov, the refusal of Greece would be regarded as the beginning of the World War II. The prime-minister of Greece refused and it resulted in years of suppression. In fact, when in 2015 the country faced with a crisis and the pressure from the international organizations, the Greek population fury was addressed mostly to Germany and not to the responsible institutions. People used posters with the word “No” written on them during the manifestations making a reference to the past. A.R. Kurbanov states that for Greek population the word “No” is a ‘place of memory’ and in the country also exists a public holiday with the same name devoted to the event of 1940.

Here should be mentioned that after the end of World War II Greece solved the problems in relations with Italy and Bulgaria, but the question of German reparations remained unsettled. A.K. Aleksandrova in paper entitled as “The Echo of War: The Issue of World War II Reparations

---

<sup>60</sup> International Holocaust Remembrance Day in Norway [Electronic resource] // International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance. – 23.01.2020. – Mode of access: <https://www.holocaustremembrance.com/news-archive/international-holocaust-remembrance-day-norway>

<sup>61</sup> Kurbanov, A.R. The Manifestation of Historical Memory in Political Practice // Vestnik Moskovskogo universiteta. Seriya 18. Sotsiologiya i politologiya. 2016. №1.

and Occupation Loan in Contemporary Greece” finds similarities between the process of West German debt restructuring after the end of World War II and the Greek debt restructuring in 2010-s.<sup>62</sup> The researcher also states that during the crisis Greek people created parallels between the past and the present, even if this comparisons were groundless.

Summing up, it should be noted that the Greek case presents an example of memory policy that is aimed not on conciliation among own population, but as a mean of consolidation of people against the common enemy. Memory is used as a tool for blaming other country in own economic problems and creates an image of Germany as an enemy.

It was highlighted before that Greece had a possibility to settle its disputes with Italy. In fact, Italy, as a state selected for an overview has different approach to its historical memory. V.K. Kolomiez states that in Italy the events of the fascist dictatorship were introduced as a total social evil that had to be abolished from public memory.<sup>63</sup> In this connection the Italian case has its similarities with French example of historical memory concept development because both states had ‘forgetting’ as a ground of memory policy.

The research of V.K. Kolomiez is also interesting because of the idea of Italian resistance movement influence in overcoming the fascist legacy. In fact, the Italian scholars focus their attention mostly on the Italian civil war and not on twenty years of dictatorship that creates a room for peaceful internal problems setting.

According to Swiss historian A. Mattioli, since 1990s Italy entered the process of fascism rehabilitation. I.E. Iman clarifies that the attempts to rehabilitate fascism happen despite the fact that in 1952 the Law 645/1952 – “Apology of fascism and Fascist expressions” was adopted.<sup>64</sup> This Law establishes criminal penalties for ones who promotes, organizes or directs the associations, movements or groups established by this Law and for ones who participate in such associations, movements or groups.<sup>65</sup> It shows that Italy had passed through juridical approach development. There is a need to make a reference to S.Yu. Danilov, who in revised in this article “The Juridical Aspects of Overcoming Legacy of Dictatorship: Italian Experience” how the memorial legislation was adopted in Italy.<sup>66</sup> According to this author, the Law 645/1952 – “Apology of fascism and Fascist expressions” was not unique in legislative practice of Italy. For

---

<sup>62</sup> Aleksandrova, A.K. The Echo of War: The Issue of World War II Reparations and Occupation Loan in Contemporary Greece // *Contemporary Europe*. 2021. № 3. p. 167–180.

<sup>63</sup> Kolomiez, V.K. Fascism in the Historical Memory of the Contemporary Epoch // *Bereginya 777*. Sova, 2014. №4 (23).

<sup>64</sup> Iman, I.E. Modern Approaches to the Analysis of the 20 Years of Fascism in Italy in the National Italian Studies // *Social and Humanitarian Sciences. Domestic and foreign literature. Ser. 5, History: Information and analytical journal*. 2021. №4.

<sup>65</sup> Law 645/1952 – Apology of fascism and Fascist expressions. Article 4. [Electronic resource] // *Memory Laws in European and Comparative Perspective*. – Mode of access: <http://melaproject.org/node/210> (accessed 10.03.2022)

<sup>66</sup> Danilov, S.Yu. The Juridical Aspects of Overcoming Legacy of Dictatorship: Italian Experience // *Law. Journal of the Higher School of Economics*. 2016. №3. p. 206–218.

example, in 1944 was adopted a Decree "On the punishment of fascist criminals" that introduced the rank of dictatorship punishable acts and classified persons involved in them. Such deep concern in legal condemnation of fascism is obvious because of the role that Italy played in World War II. However, the situation is not so clear with the states that formally didn't participated in the war and experienced their own dictatorships. As an example of such state can be chosen Portugal. In fact, the case of Portugal could be the most similar to the case of Spain, however this statement still needs to be proved.

The ideas on existence of some similarities between Spanish and Portuguese approach to memory policy is based on the fact that both states experienced long period of dictatorship in XX century. The geographic location and cultural features also play a role. There also should be reminded that these dictatorships assigned an important place to religion.

"The New State of Portugal" or "Estado Novo" appeared only in 1933, but before this date Portugal had faced with several drastic changes in its socio-political structure. In 1910 the revolution that put an end to monarchy occurred. But the new republican Government could not implement all the needed reforms. Portugal's public debt reached an unprecedented size and the state economy suffered from inflation. Because of this reason, Portugal did not participate in the World War I, but it supported Great Britain to preserve its interests in Africa. Approximately 12,000 Portuguese troops died during the course of the conflict, including many Africans who served in its armed forces on the colonial front.<sup>67</sup>

The prerequisites for further dictatorship appeared by the end of the World War I. But only in 1926 the political crisis reached its climax and the government of Antonio Maria di Silva was overthrown by military group. However, the militaries could not solve economic problems of Portugal, and in 1928 a talented economist and university lecturer Antonio de Oliveira Salazar was appointed to the post of Finance Minister. And then, in 1933 the New State of Portugal was created.

Salazar's rule was strongly influenced by Catholic, papal, and nationalist thought<sup>68</sup> and in the discourses on questions concerning the Estado Novo, Salazar repeatedly rejected the idea of the omnipotence of the State.<sup>69</sup>

According to Preston P., Salazar handled wartime neutrality with infinitely greater subtlety than Franco in Spain.<sup>70</sup> Some scholars, such as Manuel de Lucena, describe the dictatorship in

---

<sup>67</sup> A Remembrance Parade in Lisbon - Lest we forget [Electronic resource] // The British Historical Society of Portugal. – Mode of access: <https://www.bhsportugal.org/news/a-remembrance-parade-in-lisbon-lest-we-forget> (accessed 12.04.2022).

<sup>68</sup> António de Oliveira Salazar [Electronic resource] // Encyclopedia Britannica. – 24.04.2022. – Mode of access: <https://www.britannica.com/biography/Antonio-de-Oliveira-Salazar> (accessed: 30.04.2022)

<sup>69</sup> O'Donnell, T.J. Salazar and the New State of Portugal // Messenger Publications. Studies: An Irish Quarterly Review, 1936, Vol. 25, No. 97, pp. 131-144.

<sup>70</sup> Preston, P. Franco // Fontana, 1995.

Portugal as “a form of Fascism without a Fascist movement”.<sup>71</sup> M. Sanfey in the scientific paper entitled as “On Salazar and Salazarism” makes a reference to M.B. da Cruz, saying that “Salazarism was not characterized by radical anti-bourgeois or anti-capitalist motivations; there was neither determination of, nor threat to, the bureaucratic apparatus of the State by an armed party; there was more de-mobilization than mobilization”.<sup>72</sup> The mentioned approach to domestic policy influenced a lot perception of Portuguese population its authoritarian past.

The dictatorship ended with the Carnation Revolution. During the regime of Salazar, the memory policy was focused on issues of commemorations related to the discoveries. M.I. João and L. White in their research “Public Memory and Power in Portugal (1880-1960)” study how the approach towards centenary commemorations celebrated during the selected period of time has changed.<sup>73</sup> However, the data obtained from the analysis of people’s attitudes towards geographical discoveries is not suitable for present research and cannot be used in determination of modern memory policy of Portugal.

F.C. Palomanes Martinho starts his article “Memory of Resistance and the Resistance of Memory: An Analysis of the Construction of Corporatism in the First Years of the Portuguese Estado Novo” with observations on people’s behavior in France during the Vichy regime. Previously, in the framework of current master thesis were provided some ideas and materials on the collaborationism in France during this period and its further assessment. After providing some ideas on French case, F.C. Palomanes Martinho makes a statement that in the case of the Portuguese Estado Novo there are more frequent studies of the resistance and the opposition than those which explain the commitment of the Portuguese to the long-lived authoritarian regime.<sup>74</sup> However, this paper also studies more the reflections on corporatism of the Estado Novo.

Basing on the material presented above, there could be made a conclusion that nowadays the period of dictatorship does not cause a serious national trauma. Despite the fact that some scholars disagree with the idea of Salazar’s dictatorship being a “pale imitation of the fascist dictatorships in other parts of Europe”<sup>75</sup>, the existing material represent a weak basis for any scientific conclusion on memory policy features in Portugal.

---

<sup>71</sup> Sanfey, M. On Salazar and Salazarism // Messenger Publications. Studies: An Irish Quarterly Review, Winter, 2003, Vol. 92, No. 368. pp. 405-411.

<sup>72</sup> Sanfey, M. On Salazar and Salazarism // Messenger Publications. Studies: An Irish Quarterly Review, Winter, 2003, Vol. 92, No. 368. pp. 405-411.

<sup>73</sup> João, M.I., White, L. Public Memory and Power in Portugal (1880-1960) // Modern Humanities Research Association. Portuguese Studies, 2002, Vol. 18. pp. 96-120.

<sup>74</sup> Palomanes Martinho F.C. Memory of Resistance and the Resistance of Memory: An Analysis of the Construction of Corporatism in the First Years of the Portuguese Estado Novo // Modern Humanities Research Association. Portuguese Studies, 2016, Vol. 32, No. 2. pp. 172-198.

<sup>75</sup> Corkill, D., Pina Almeida, J.C. Commemoration and Propaganda in Salazar's Portugal: The “Mundo Português” Exposition of 1940 // Sage Publications, Ltd. Journal of Contemporary History, Jul., 2009, Vol. 44, No. 3. pp. 381-399.

Summing up it should be highlighted that the review on Spanish case will be presented in the following part of the present Chapter, where will be determined main phases of Spanish civil war, Francisco Franco's dictatorship and the key elements of Spanish transition to democracy to which the attention should be paid. The detailed analysis of key elements of memory policy implementation in Spain will be examined in the Chapters II and III of current master thesis.

#### **1.4 Spanish Civil War, Franco's Dictatorship and Democratic Transition Milestones**

In the framework of previous parts of current chapter was described how memory policy is implemented in different countries of Western Europe. The present part covers the main events of XX century that are interpreted at present moment in Spanish society. This part is purely descriptive and it encompasses events and processes of memory policy construction in Spain that will be compared in the part 1.5. Here should be pointed out one more time that in the part 1.5 will be presented analysis on the historical memory and memory policy arrangement. The study of particular features of Spanish civil war interpretation in modern Spanish and International discourse will be observed in the second and the third chapters respectively.

By the beginning of the XX century Spain had lost its influence in international arena, what could be explained by the deep crisis of Spanish monarchy. The state economy also was in the plight: more than a half of Spanish population represented by peasants were below the poverty line. The undeveloped industry hindered the advance of technologies, militaries and equipment. The social structure of the state also needed reforms. The peasants almost had no rights and freedoms, and the rights and freedoms of other social classes were suppressed. And the labor relations were not regulated. E. Beevor starts the book "The Battle For Spain. The Spanish Civil War 1936-1939" with description of photo where the king Alfonso XIII "maintains direct contact with people".<sup>76</sup> The researcher draws an attention to the image of king and people that surround Alfonso XIII, pointing out that nobles and commons look strangers in their own country. In other words, the gap between social classes was non-contiguous.

The civil war in Spain started in 1936 and ended in 1939. In the Chapter 1.3 during the process of research criteria elaborating there was set a timeline from 1898 to 1982, where the first date was a The Spanish-American War and the last date reflected accession Spain to NATO. Some scholars, such as A. Chupin<sup>77</sup>, believe that the Spanish-American War was a precondition to the civil war.

---

<sup>76</sup> Beevor, A. The Spanish Civil War. New York, 1983.

<sup>77</sup> Chupin, A.A. Background And the Beginning of the Spanish Civil War. The Birth of the Spanish Dictatorship // The Newman In Foreign Policy. 2016. №34 (78).



This statement has its ground. In 1898 Spain lost the last of its colonies. The defeat in the Spanish-American War affected not only the world perception of common people, but also brought attention to the backwardness of the country. The situation constantly aggravated due to persistent strikes for power among army, monarchy and church, that normally represented the pillars of Spanish society.

According to S.M. Khenkin, Spain entered in XX century as an unfinished state with insufficient national consolidation.<sup>78</sup> Here also should be mentioned that the high level of revolutionist ideas were noted in Spain in the beginning of XX century, what allows to create a suggestion on predetermination of civil war.

From 1898 to 1936 there were several revolts, and among them should be distinguished the one that established the dictatorship of Miguel Primo de Rivera. This dictatorship included ideas and methods of Italian fascism adopted to Spanish reality. These economic reforms of Primo de Rivera could have brought results if the global crisis had not happened. However, the implemented measures had not provided the expected results and Miguel Primo de Rivera was forced to resign.

Some scholars like J. Simpson state that the question of Spanish economic development in the beginning of XX century is controversial and consists of its ups and downs, still agrees that by 1936 Spain was a poor country.<sup>79</sup>

The Rif War occurred in a period from 1921 to 1926 exposed the lack of military capabilities of Spanish army and created a ground for further rebellion. When in 1936 the Spanish civil war started, the insurgency was led by Francisco Franco, who also had participated in the Rif War.

When the civil war started, Francisco Franco took charge on the troops loyal to him. The insurgents rapidly started to control important territories in different regions of Spain. In fact, in the lands occupied by the rebels lived more than 10 million of people and was located about 20% of Spanish industry and were produced more than 70% of agricultural products. In other words, the mentioned territories were strategically important for both belligerent parties.

Spanish civil war represents a classical example of proxy war. According to one of the existing determinations of the term “proxy war”, it is a type of conflicts, in which the third party participates indirectly providing aid (military resource, political, etc.) to one of the two parties.<sup>80</sup> In Spain, the Nationalists, as the rebels were called, received aid from Fascist Italy and Nazi

---

<sup>78</sup> Khenkin, S.M. Politico-Territorial Organization of Spain: Old Problems and New Challenges // *Politeia*. 2018. №4 (91).

<sup>79</sup> Simpson, J. Economic Development in Spain, 1850-1936 // Wiley on behalf of the Economic History Society. *The Economic History Review*, May, 1997, New Series, Vol. 50, No. 2. pp. 348-359.

<sup>80</sup> Kapizin, V.M., Smirnova, A.M., Stoletov, O.V., Shcherba, K.D., Zvereva, V.S., Dzhanayeva, A.E., Deev, I.A., Kochetkov, D.A., Kalfaoglu Rabiya, Cherpakova, A.I. Proxy wars and the viability of states in the modern world // *Socio-humanitarian knowledge*. 2019. №4.

Germany. The Republicans received aid from the Soviet Union as well as from the International Brigades, composed of volunteers from Europe, Latin America, and the United States.<sup>81</sup> Here should be pointed out that the forces of the parties were not equal because of “Non-Intervention policy” of European states. This policy aimed at quick termination of civil war in Spain, nevertheless it created a power instability. Despite the fact that the “Non-Intervention policy” prohibited all the trade of military equipment of weapons with the belligerent parties as with the insurgents, as with the Republican government<sup>82</sup>, Italy and Germany continued supporting Franco and his troops, but the Republicans faced with the difficulties of supplies. When the civil war in Spain ended, the Nationalist that wined the war were obliged to pay back their allies. Spanish economy was adopted to the needs of Germany. E.V. Kryukova provides some data proving that more than 20% of Spanish industry were under the control of German monopolists and more than 69% of Spanish export was to Germany in 1942.<sup>83</sup> The researcher also notes that Germany received from 80% to 90% of tungsten from Spanish mines and the share of exports to Germany in the country's total exports increased from 24.8% in 1939 to 46.5% in 1941. At the same time, the scholar notes that the foreign policy of francoist Spain during the World War II and during the years of isolation was frankly “selfish”.<sup>84</sup>

E.V. Kryukova states that at the beginning of war Franco declared unconditional support to Germany and even wanted to join the war, but when the inevitable defeat of Hitler became obvious, he changed his mind and started negotiations with the USA and the Great Britain.

P. Preston in the article entitled as “Franco and Hitler: The Myth of Hendaye 1940” notes that the myth of Franco cunningly “hoodwinked Hitler and kept Spain out of the World War II” occupies the central place of Francoist propaganda.<sup>85</sup> The researcher highlights that francoist propaganda used the death of Hitler in order to create an image of Franco as a savior of Spanish nation. But such image is not unique. In the book “Franco: a biography” P. Preston notice that francoist propaganda compared Franco with many different real and imaginary characters.<sup>86</sup> But G.A. Filatov argues that the image of Franco changed with the time from the “military leader” to the “father of all Spaniards”.<sup>87</sup>

---

<sup>81</sup> Spanish Civil War [Electronic resource] // Britannica. – 10.07.2021. – Mode of access: <https://www.britannica.com/event/Spanish-Civil-War> (accessed 10.01.2022)

<sup>82</sup> Malay, V.V. “Non-Intervention” to Spain as a European Policies Phenomenon of the Regional Conflict Settlement // Belgorod State University Scientific Bulletin. Politology, Economy, Informatics. 2010. № 19 (90). Issue 16.

<sup>83</sup> Kryukova, E.V. F. Franco. Prevarication (1943–1945). Izv. Saratov Univ. (N. S.), Ser. History. International Relations, 2018, vol. 18, iss. 1, pp. 90–95 (in Russian).

<sup>84</sup> Kryukova, E.V. F. Franco. Prevarication (1943–1945). Izv. Saratov Univ. (N. S.), Ser. History. International Relations, 2018, vol. 18, iss. 1, pp. 90–95 (in Russian).

<sup>85</sup> Preston, P. Franco and Hitler: The Myth of Hendaye 1940 // Cambridge University Press. Contemporary European History, Mar., 1992, Vol. 1, No. 1. pp. 1-16.

<sup>86</sup> Preston, P. Franco: a biography // HarperCollinsPublishers, 1993.

<sup>87</sup> Filatov, G.A. Evolution of Francisco Franco Image in Spain “No-Do” Cinema Newsreels // Nauchnyi dialog. 2015. – № 12 (48). pp. 363—373.

According to E.O. Grantseva, from the late 1930s to the mid-1950s, there was a difficult process of rebuilding the country. Under these conditions, Spanish society could not come to a genuine agreement. The researcher points out that in there was a fictitious agreement, called “quasi-consensus”, which had as a basis a terror, social demagoguery and a few concessions from the authorities.<sup>88</sup> The scholar highlights that this confrontation between parts of separated Spanish society could not last forever, and the idea of reconciliation started to appear in discourses.

Here should be mentioned that despite the cautious policy of Franco during the World War II, Spain occurred to be in diplomatic isolation. After the long process of negotiations on the Spanish Question, the Security Council of the UN decided “to keep the situation in Spain under continuous observation and maintain it upon the list of matters of which it is seized, in order that it will be at all times ready to take such measures as may become necessary to maintain international peace and security” and to condemn the dictatorship of Francisco Franco.<sup>89</sup>

There were several milestones during the period of Franco dictatorship from 1939 to 1975. Firstly, there is a need to mention that the foreign policy of that time characterized by diplomatic isolation of Spain. Secondly, it should be noted that the political sphere of life was tightly interconnected with economy. In the first decades of francoist regime Spain chose autarky as a model of economic development, but it did not provide fruitful results. In fact, the well-known ‘Spanish economic miracle’ appeared when the United States started to give loans and subsidies to Spain in exchange to the right of establishing its military bases. From 1953 to 1961 Spain received around \$1.4 billion in American economic and military assistance<sup>90</sup>, which makes Spain the third largest recipient of American aid in Western Europe.<sup>91</sup> In fact, the economic grants and loans received by Spain from the United States influenced a lot the image of francoist regime and supported the democratic changes. It also played a role in a period of transition to democracy.

A.A. Glazov presumes that the Spanish model of democratic transition could be named as an ideal.<sup>92</sup> S.M. Khenkin agrees in assessments of Spanish transition to democracy that it is one of the best-performing examples.<sup>93</sup> It is important to be said that one of the key role in Spanish

---

<sup>88</sup> Grantseva, E.O. Is an agreement possible? Historical memory of the events of the 20<sup>th</sup> century in the daily life and legislation of modern Spain // *Latin American Almanaque* №19. 2018.

<sup>89</sup> Resolution of 26 June 1946. S/RES/10(1946) [Electronic resource] // The UN Security Council. – 26.06.1946. – Mode of access: <https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/RESOLUTION/GEN/NR0/036/73/PDF/NR003673.pdf?OpenElement> (accessed 13.02.2022)

<sup>90</sup> U.S. Overseas Loans and Grants [Electronic resource] // The U.S. Agency for International Development report. – 2019. – Mode of access: [https://pdf.usaid.gov/pdf\\_docs/PBAAJ833.pdf](https://pdf.usaid.gov/pdf_docs/PBAAJ833.pdf) (accessed: 12.01.2022)

<sup>91</sup> Calvo-Gonzalez, O. Neither a Carrot Nor a Stick: American Foreign Aid and Economic Policymaking in Spain during the 1950s // *Oxford University Press. Diplomatic History*, June 2006, Vol. 30, No. 3. pp. 409-438.

<sup>92</sup> Glazov, A.A. Franco's Spain Social-Political Evolution As the Foundation of Spanish Transition to Democracy Between 1975 And 1982 // *RUDN Journal of World History*. 2014. №2.

<sup>93</sup> Khenkin, S.M. Introduction: The Historical Significance of Spain's Transition To Democracy // *Contemporary Spain*. 2003. №2003.

transition to democracy played the institute of monarchy and the king Juan Carlos I. According to the author, it was monarchy what started to symbolize radical changes.<sup>94</sup>

Summarizing, some stages in Spanish transformation should be underlined. Civil war occurred due to different reasons, however the main one was in economic backwardness and absence of serious changes invoked by political elites. Spanish civil war presented a typical example of proxy war, where the third parties tested their weapons before the World War II. When the Nationalists gained power in 1939, Francisco Franco became a ruler of country. Spain was in ruins after the devastating civil war and could not fully participate in the World War II. However, it supported Germany and Italy with supplies and provided military volunteers. When it became obvious that Hitler would not win the war, Franco started to cooperate with the Great Britain and the USA. The Franco's idea of saving Spain from the World War II was adopted as a key element of propaganda.

Francoism characterized with interaction between religion and fascist ideas. It imposed limits on political and social life of citizens and included violent acts and repressions. The diplomatic isolation of Spain influenced the development of its social, political and economic features.

In the 1960-es the Spanish economic miracle occurred. It was provoked by the investments from the United States. The United States also helped Spain to overcome its isolation.

When Francisco Franco died in 1975 appeared a need for transformation and democratization. This period was characterized with so-called "Pact of Forgetting". Spain was on the edge of the new civil war between the supporters and opposition of francoist regime. In order not to create tensions between two groups, a Amnesty Law was adopted. It also took significant efforts from the Spanish monarchy and Catholic church institutions, because church and the king united the population in all times.

J. Ruiz notes in the article entitled as "Seventy Years on: Historians and Repression during and after the Spanish Civil War" that a significant feature of the transition to democracy was the appearance of personal testimonies of Francoist victims.<sup>95</sup>

Nowadays some researchers are convinced that Francoism is still existing and developing. For example, Yu.V. Vasilenko asserts that the political ideology of Francoism development as

---

<sup>94</sup> Khenkin, S.M. The Monarchy and the Transition to Democracy in Spain // Outlines of global transformations: politics, economics, law, 10 (6).

<sup>95</sup> Ruiz, J. Seventy Years on: Historians and Repression during and after the Spanish Civil War // Journal of Contemporary History, 2009, Vol. 44, No. 3. pp. 449-472.

“Francoism after Franco” goes through two fairly clearly fixed historical stages: neo-Francoism (completed) and post-Francoism (emerging), each of which has a significant share of specificity.<sup>96</sup>

In conclusion, there is a need to mention that the measures that were adopted in Spain did not prevent it from the polarization of the society. However, the particular memory policy initiatives will be studied in the second chapter of current master thesis.

### **1.5 Conclusions**

The present part of master thesis summarizes the ideas and approaches ideas embedded in previous parts. This section is also aimed at analysis of the initiatives that are implemented in different countries of Western Europe.

In the first part of current chapter was described the theoretical framework that is adopted to the whole master thesis. As a theoretical approach for this research was chosen the constructivism. The main assumption of constructivism consists in the perception that people do not explore the world and the science, but construct the scientific knowledge.

In the second part of the present chapter the concept of historical memory. There were distinguished the main stages of historical memory concept development. It was studied that one of the main elements of memory policy creation consists in so-called ‘places of memory’ that could be presented by objects, persons, places, etc.

In the framework of the third part the criteria for the region of Western Europe elaborated. It was decided to choose several countries from the determined region in order to make the observations on memory policy implementation. According to the observations made in the third and the fourth part of current chapter, it could be stated that there are some similarities in approach to difficult past between Spain and France. Both countries make particular steps in overcoming its national traumas. One of these steps is ‘forgetting’, which presents almost complete elimination of some event from public memory and discourse.

There were found some similarities between Spanish and Finnish or Sweden case of memory policy implementation, but these similarities are insignificant and the differences among cases present more interest for the researcher.

The research showed that the Spanish case of memory policy implementation is unique. It proves that there is a need to study the separate sections of the process of historical memory formation for profound understanding of current socio-political situation of Spain.

---

<sup>96</sup> Vasilenko, Yu.V. Transformations of the Political Ideology of Francoism in Modern Spain // *Antinomies*. 2022. Iss. 22 (1).

## CHAPTER 2. SPANISH CIVIL WAR INTERPRETATION IN MODERN SPAIN

In the framework of previous chapter there was stated that there is a need to study particular features of Spanish initiatives in the field of historical memory. The second chapter of present master thesis is focused on examination of how the Spanish civil war interpretation have developed in Spanish discourse and what kind of memory policy initiatives were implemented. Through this analysis the author of present research aims to determine how the Spanish civil war and the dictatorship of Francisco Franco are interpreted at the present moment.

### 2.1 Memorial Legislation

Memorial legislation holds a very important place in the creation of historical perception of one or another event. Within the framework of Chapter I it was already stated that memorial legislation occupies a significant place in memory policy. Nevertheless, it is necessary to determine what the memorial legislation is before making the study on particular Spanish legislative initiatives. According to G.V. Kasianov, memorial legislation should be understood as a set of different legal acts that regulate the forms and ways of using and representing memorable events of the past in the public space, which are part of a national narrative of memory construction with a standard collection of historical myths about heroes and victims, sacred symbols and memorable places.<sup>97</sup>

Some scholars believe that memorial legislation could be used as a mean of power legitimization. For example, A.A. Dorskaia and A.Yu. Dorskii distinguish five reasons that could compel state to develop its memorial legislation<sup>98</sup>:

1. If due to the states' disintegration the former common integrational space destroys;
2. If the events of the past could be an obstacle for a new common political, economic and cultural space construction;
3. If the weak Government tries to justify himself using the past;
4. If the society is in a process of polarization;
5. If the country starts a new stage of its statehood development due to particular reasons.

According to the researchers, Spanish case meets the second and the fourth criteria.

However, in the article entitled as "The Official Remembrance Policy: A Comparative Analysis of the Legislation and Judicial Practice of Modern States" the researchers state that the

---

<sup>97</sup> Kasianov, G. V. Historical policy and 'memorial' laws in Ukraine: the beginning of the XXI century // *Istoricheskaia ekspertiza* 2: 28–55. 2016.

<sup>98</sup> Dorskaia, A.A., Dorskii, A. Yu. Memorial laws as a instrument for the legitimization of power // *Vestnik of Saint Petersburg University. Law* 1: 223–238. 2020.

attempts to adopt memorial legislation in Spain ended with the recognition of their contradictory nature to the Constitution.<sup>99</sup> But this statement does not reject the fact of existence in Spain several legal acts that stipulate advisable approach to history.

According to E.O. Grantseva, two legislative acts that were adopted with 30 years difference still are causing disagreements in Spanish society.<sup>100</sup> Since 1975, the vector of Spanish approach to the civil war and dictatorship has changed drastically. In the framework of this part it will be traced how the approach to the legal basis evolved. Within the framework of this chapter will be studied three main legislative initiatives in a field of memory. The first document for observation is Amnesty Law adopted in 1977. The second document for study is Historical Memory Law (2007) and the third is Democratic Memory Law (2021). The research on legislative base permits to trace a main vector of memory legal policy development in Spain.

### **2.1.1 Amnesty Law**

As it was mentioned before, Amnesty Law was adopted in 1977, two years after Francisco Franco's death. Spanish society was divided into two fractions, the one of which supported francoist regime and the other opposed to it. These fractions were represented by former Falangist and Republicans and both parties' representatives' descendants. There was a huge possibility of a new civil war in which victims could take revenge to their enemies.

In order to avoid historical 'billing' and to provide a peaceful transition from dictatorship to democracy, it became urgent to conclude a social contract that would 'de jure' confirm the existence of consensus in Spanish society. As a mean of such peaceful transition that could minimize tensions in society an Amnesty Law was created.

According to E.O. Grantseva, the Amnesty Law had as an objective increasing of a distance between the Spanish population and the events of Spanish civil war and francoist regime. It was important to avoid the revenge for the crimes committed during the years of Franco's dictatorship. Because of the prohibition to investigate these crimes, the descendants of Republicans felt themselves discriminated and started to call the Amnesty Law as a 'Pact of Forgetting'.

In this connection, the author of present master thesis sees a need to refer to the Amnesty Law. The document consists of 12 articles, each of which is devoted to specific aspect of amnesty.

---

<sup>99</sup> Dorskaya, A.A., Pashentsev, D.A. The Official Remembrance Policy: A Comparative Analysis of the Legislation and Judicial Practice of Modern States // Journal of Foreign Legislation and Comparative Law. 2021, vol. 17, №6, pp. 5—15.

<sup>100</sup> Grantseva, E.O. Is an agreement possible? Historical memory of the events of the 20<sup>th</sup> century in the daily life and legislation of modern Spain // Latin American Almanaque №19. 2018.

The Article 2 of the document under the analysis contains an enumeration of the categories to which the amnesty applies. Among them<sup>101</sup>:

1. The crimes of rebellion and sedition, as well as the crimes and misdemeanors committed on the occasion or reason of them, typified in the Code of Military Justice.
2. Conscientious objection to the performance of military service, for ethical or religious reasons.
3. The crimes of denial of assistance to Justice for the refusal to disclose facts of a political nature, known in the professional practice.
4. The acts of expression of opinion, carried out through the press, printing press or any other means of communication.
5. The crimes and misdemeanors that may have been committed by the authorities, officials and agents of public order, on the occasion or occasion of the investigation and prosecution of the acts included in this Law.
6. Crimes committed by officials and agents of public order against the exercise of the rights of individuals.

As it was specified above, the law encompasses different categories of people that should be amnestied. However, the law does not prescribe any penalties of non-compliance with the law or any punishment for those who committed any crimes or violated human rights. According to E.O. Grantseva, the law that was aimed at society reconciliation had an opposite effect and created prerequisites for further polarization and for a new stage of confrontation appearance.<sup>102</sup> Roewekamp M., taking into consideration the ideas of law makes a statement that based on the Amnesty Law during the transition a legal possibility for starting a process of transitional justice theoretically existed. But according to the author the processes never gained the momentum to rehabilitate the former victims and to keep them from being forgotten.<sup>103</sup>

E. Moradiellos in scientific article devoted to Franco's image in modern Spanish society concludes that the reason for amnesia is in a transcendent phenomenon reflected in a tacit political agreement sealed during the transition to forget (or, at least, not to mention in public) the crimes of the civil war and the Franco repression that followed the victory, in order to avoid the destabilizing risk to the new democratic regime that would have meant everything that could

---

<sup>101</sup> Law 46/1977, of 15 October, on Amnesty [Electronic resource] // BOE. – 15.10.1977. – Mode of access: <https://www.boe.es/buscar/pdf/1977/BOE-A-1977-24937-consolidado.pdf> (accessed 04.10.2021)

<sup>102</sup> Grantseva, E.O. Is an agreement possible? Historical memory of the events of the 20<sup>th</sup> century in the daily life and legislation of modern Spain // *Latin American Almanaque* №19. 2018.

<sup>103</sup> Roewekamp, M. Spain, Europe, Memory and the Recuperation of the Past // *Iberoamericana Editorial Vervuert. Iberoamericana* (2001-), March 2013, No. 49. pp. 185-194.



encourage the demand for responsibility and the settling of accounts for past behavior.<sup>104</sup> However, M. Davis expresses an opinion that the “pact of forgetting” reached by political elites during the transition and accepted by the majority of Spaniards was mirrored in the extensive academic literature spawned by Spain's democratization, which almost completely ignored questions about the legacy of widespread and systematic human rights abuses for the new democracy.<sup>105</sup>

In other words, Amnesty Law was aimed on preserving stability in the country after Francisco Franco’s death. Nevertheless, this law did not foresee neither any compensation to the victims of francoist regime nor support in search of buried bodies of repressed Republican supporters. The absence of any justice created ground for Historical Memory Law appearance in 2007.

### **2.1.2 Historical Memory Law**

P. Novell in the article “Revisiones del Franquismo: Olvido Presencial y Presencia del Olvido” describes the Historical memory law as the famous and controversial. Such position could be explained by the nature of this law. Some researchers believe that the appearance of this document provided everyone’s discontent: for the leftist parties it did not proposed enough support to the victims of dictatorship and for the rightist parties it brought to the surface buried problems that were expected to be solved. In this connection, the author of current master thesis sees a need to make one more reference to the paper by P. Novell The mentioned researcher highlights that the Historical Memory Law intended not only to amend the acts committed during the Spanish civil war and the Franco’s dictatorship, but also to be a symbol against oblivion for future generations.<sup>106</sup>

The document under the observation consist of 22 articles and 8 additional dispositions. As an objective of the act is the recognition and expansion of the rights of those who suffered persecution or violence for political, ideological or reasons of religious belief during the Civil War and the Dictatorship; promotion of their moral reparations and the recovery of personal and family memory; adoption of complementary measures to suppress elements of division among the citizens; encouraging the cohesion and solidarity between the various generations of Spaniards around the principles, values and constitutional liberties.<sup>107</sup>

---

<sup>104</sup> Moradiellos E. An uncomfortable specter of the past: Franco in the memory of the Spaniards // Publicacions Universitat de Valencia. Pasajes, 2003, No. 11. pp. 4-11.

<sup>105</sup> Davis M. Is Spain Recovering Its Memory? Breaking the “Pacto del Olvido”// The Johns Hopkins University Press. Human Rights Quarterly, 2005. Vol. 27, No. 3. pp. 858-880.

<sup>106</sup> Novell, P. Reviews of Francoism: Face-to-face Oblivion and the Presence of Oblivion // Revista Canadiense de Estudios Hispánicos. 2011, Vol. 36, No. 1, LA GUERRA CIVIL ESPAÑOLA: UN DOLOR QUE NO SE CALLA. pp. 101-113.

<sup>107</sup> Law 52/2007, of December 26, which recognizes and expands rights and establishes measures in favor of those who suffered persecution or violence during the civil war and the dictatorship [Electronic resource] // BOE. –

In the Article 3 of Historical Memory Law the courts, juries and any other criminal or administrative bodies that, during the Civil War, had been constituted to impose, for political, ideological or religious belief reasons, convictions or sanctions of a personal nature, as well as that of their resolutions are declared illegitimate. In fact, this article limits the area of Amnesty Law implication. The contrast between the Amnesty Law and the Historical Memory Law also could be seen in the key incentives of the documents. While Amnesty Law aims at some groups of Spanish population protection from the revenge, the Historical Memory Law focuses on promoting support and protection to the victims mainly of the dictatorship. However, it should be noticed that both documents do not provide the legal liability for crimes committed during civil war or dictatorship. On the other hand, Historical Memory Law makes amendments to Amnesty Law, especially in the issues expressed in Articles 7, 8 and 9. According to these articles, the Historical Memory Law foresees the right to compensation in favor of all those people who lost their lives in defense of democracy and who had not received the compensation due until 2007. In fact, according to the material published by Spanish magazine “El País”, the Government of Mariano Rajoy stopped payments specified in Historical Memory Law. “In the 2012 the budgets were reduced from 6.2 million euros of the last socialist Executive to 2.5 (60% less), exclusively for the opening of graves. The associations waited for the call in the Official State Gazette for the grant competition. It never came. The following year the item was 0 euros, and in 2014 the situation was the same. In 2012, the Government also closed the victim assistance office, created in 2008,” – the material says.<sup>108</sup> The situation have changed only in 2020, when appeared information on recovery of aid.<sup>109</sup>

According to the Historical Memory Law preamble, the document also extends the possibility of the Spanish nationality acquisition by the descendants up to the first degree of those who had originally been Spanish.<sup>110</sup> The Article 18 of the law under analysis stipulates the conditions for obtaining Spanish citizenship by people participated in civil war as volunteers as part of International Brigades. It is also important to mention that the Article 6 determines measures of support to orphans.

---

26.12.2007. – Mode of access: <https://www.boe.es/buscar/pdf/2007/BOE-A-2007-22296-consolidado.pdf> (accessed 13.11.2021).

<sup>108</sup> Junquera N. The Promise That Rajoy Did Fulfill [Electronic resource] // El País. – 05.10.2013. – Mode of access: [https://elpais.com/politica/2013/10/05/actualidad/1380997260\\_542677.html](https://elpais.com/politica/2013/10/05/actualidad/1380997260_542677.html) (accessed 20.03.2022).

<sup>109</sup> Junquera N. Grants For Historical Memory Return To The BOE Nine Years Later [Electronic resource] // El País. – 29.07.2020. – Mode of access: <https://elpais.com/espana/2020-07-29/las-subvenciones-para-la-memoria-historica-vuelven-al-boe-nueve-anos-despues.html> (accessed 22.03.2022).

<sup>110</sup> Law 52/2007, of December 26, which recognizes and expands rights and establishes measures in favor of those who suffered persecution or violence during the civil war and the dictatorship [Electronic resource] // BOE. – 26.12.2007. – Mode of access: <https://www.boe.es/buscar/pdf/2007/BOE-A-2007-22296-consolidado.pdf> (accessed 13.11.2021).

In the preamble of Historical Memory Law is stated that it is not the task of the legislator to implant a certain collective memory, the law only promotes the knowledge and reflection on the past in order to avoid the repetition of intolerance and violation of human rights. However, P. Novell attracts attention of reader to the fact that the unique term to name Francisco Franco introduced Historical Memory Law is ‘dictator’ and the unique term for his regime is ‘dictatorship’.<sup>111</sup>

Summarizing, it could be said that the Historical Memory Law recognized the existence of Spanish civil war and Franco’s dictatorship victims and established compensations. The act also simplified the procedure for obtaining citizenship for several categories. However, the status of monuments of francoist era remained unsolved, as well as a question of penalties for non-compliance the law.

As it was already mentioned before, the Historical Memory Law was unwelcomed by both sides. For one side, represented by right-wing parties, it created necessity to admit mistakes of the past and pay compensations. For another side, the measures provided by a law were not enough to restore the balance. In fact, it was also proved that this measures could be ignored by Government or individuals, because there was no any punishment.

The last idea that has to be highlighted in the part dedicated to Historical Memory Law is that the law under analysis considers as victims people from both parties. This conclusion could be made from the title of the Historical Memory Law, nevertheless, there is a reasonable doubt that former Francoism supporters that had lost relatives during the civil war had right on compensation. But this hypothesis could be tested only through additional analysis of post-war legislative documents.

### **2.1.3 Democratic Memory Law**

As it was mentioned in the previous part, the Historical Memory Law created obstacles for every group as for political parties or Government, as for organizations and individuals.

On September 15, 2020, a preliminary draft of Democratic Memory Law was published.<sup>112</sup> On August 30, 2021, in the Official Gazette of the Cortes Generales (Boletín Oficial de las Cortes Generales) was published the project of the law.<sup>113</sup> The first thing that must be noted is that the

---

<sup>111</sup> Novell, P. Reviews of Francoism: Face-to-face Oblivion and the Presence of Oblivion // Revista Canadiense de Estudios Hispánicos. 2011, Vol. 36, No. 1, LA GUERRA CIVIL ESPAÑOLA: UN DOLOR QUE NO SE CALLA. pp. 101-113.

<sup>112</sup> Democratic Memory Draft Law [Electronic resource] // La Moncloa. – 15.09.2020. – Mode of access: <https://www.lamoncloa.gob.es/consejodeministros/Paginas/enlaces/150920-enlace-memoria.aspx> (accessed 03.03.2022).

<sup>113</sup> Democratic Memory Law Project [Electronic resource] // Official Gazette of the Cortes Generales. – 30.09.2021. – Mode of access: [https://www.congreso.es/public\\_oficiales/L14/CONG/BOCG/A/BOCG-14-A-64-1.PDF](https://www.congreso.es/public_oficiales/L14/CONG/BOCG/A/BOCG-14-A-64-1.PDF) (accessed: 10.03.2022).

project of Democratic Memory Law consists of 43 pages, while the Historical Memory Law is only 14 pages long. The other difference between two acts is in the list of categories of people that are considered as victims. In the Article 3 of Democratic Memory Law Project are named the following categories:

- Persons who have died or disappeared as a result of the War and the Dictatorship;
- Persons who suffered deprivation of liberty or arbitrary detention, torture or ill-treatment as a result of the War, the trade union struggle and activities in opposition to the Dictatorship;
- People who suffered deportation, forced labor or internment in concentration camps, militarized prison colonies, inside or outside Spain, and suffered torture, ill-treatment or even died as a result of the War and the Dictatorship, especially the Spaniards deported in the Nazi concentration camps;
- People who went into exile as a result of the War and the Dictatorship;
- Persons who suffered economic repression with seizures and total or partial loss of property, fines, disqualification and expulsion;
- LGBTBI people who suffered repression due to their sexual orientation or identity;
- Persons who were professionally purged or repressed for holding public offices or jobs during the Second Republic or for their opposition to the Dictatorship;
- Children abducted and adopted without the legitimate and free consent of their parents as a result of the War and the Dictatorship, as well as their parents, brothers and sisters;
- The people who participated in the anti-Franco guerrilla, as well as those who actively supported them as collaborators, in defense of the Republic or for their resistance to the Franco regime in favor of the recovery of democracy;
- Persons repressed or persecuted for the use or dissemination of their own language;
- Persons repressed and expelled from the Armed Forces for belonging to the Democratic Military Union;
- People who suffered persecution or violence for reasons of conscience or religious beliefs, as well as those repressed or persecuted for belonging to Freemasonry or theosophical societies and the like;

- Persons who have suffered harm or reprisals by intervening to provide assistance to victims in danger or to prevent victimization.

Despite the fact that the list of possible victims is wide, it does not include people or their relatives that supported francoist regime and became victims from, for example, guerilla warfare. In other words, the list of possible victims of Spanish civil war and Franco's dictatorship cares more on victims from the Republican side.

In contrast to Historical Memory Law, the Democratic Memory Law is expected to deploy a broad campaign on search, exhumation and registration of the fallen during the civil war and dictatorship. It also assumes a creation a position of Chamber Prosecutor. This position should be created to investigate acts that constitute violations of International Human Rights Law and International Humanitarian Law. This Prosecutor of the Chamber will also be assigned functions of promoting the search processes for the victims of the investigated events, in coordination with the bodies of the different administrations with competence on this matter, to achieve their proper identification and location. Apart from that, the project of law establishes a list of symbols, elements and acts contrary to democratic memory as well as a procedure of their elimination (Articles 35, 36, 37, 38).

The Democratic Memory Law broadens existed provisions and adds new initiatives. Among them could be highlighted sanctions and measures to restore legality, described in Articles 61 and 62. Within the framework of mentioned articles all the violations are divided into three levels: very serious, serious and minor. The infractions typified in this law will be sanctioned with fines, amount of which will consist depend on the seriousness of the infraction, and respect for the principle of proportionality<sup>114</sup>:

- For very serious infractions: fine between 10,001 to 150,000 euros.
- For serious infractions: fine between 2,001 to 10,000 euros.
- For minor infractions: fine between 200 and 2,000 euros.

In other words, the Democratic Memory Law was developed taking into account features that were not considered in the framework of Historical Memory Law. The law also includes the idea of prohibition of National Foundation Francisco Franco.<sup>115</sup> However, the law is not adopted

---

<sup>114</sup> Democratic Memory Law Project [Electronic resource] // Official Gazette of the Cortes Generales. – 30.09.2021. – Mode of access: [https://www.congreso.es/public\\_oficiales/L14/CONG/BOCG/A/BOCG-14-A-64-1.PDF](https://www.congreso.es/public_oficiales/L14/CONG/BOCG/A/BOCG-14-A-64-1.PDF) (accessed: 10.03.2022).

<sup>115</sup> Junquera, N. The Government Tries to Shield the Extinction of the Francisco Franco Foundation in the New Democratic Memory Law [Electronic resource] // El País. – 09.07.2021. – Mode of access: <https://elpais.com/espana/2021-07-09/el-gobierno-trata-de-blindar-la-extincion-de-la-fundacion-francisco-franco-en-la-nueva-ley-de-memoria-democratica.html> (accessed 23.02.2022).

yet and probably will undergo some changes. According to Spanish diary “El País”, the main requirement for adoption is to obtain simple majority of votes.<sup>116</sup>

## **2.2 Places of Memory**

Within the framework of the first Chapter the concept of ‘Places of Memory’ was already discussed. However, the author of current master thesis sees a need to underline some key ideas of the mentioned concept before making the study on particular places of memory in Spain.

French scholar P. Nora was the first, who established the concept of ‘Places of Memory’. According to the author, ‘Places of Memory’ or ‘Territory of Memory’ is not just a description of the world of memory with the help of spatial categories, but the bonds that connects a person with the past.<sup>117</sup> P. Nora bases this idea on three semantic designations of the concept of ‘Places of Memory’: a material, symbolic and functional place, manifested to varying degrees.<sup>118</sup>

R.Yu. Sabancheev in the article “Pierre Nora’s concept of “sites of memory” as a method of historical reconstruction” writes that Nora defines memory as ‘life’, the carriers of which are social groups, and it is always an ‘actual phenomenon’.<sup>119</sup>

It should be highlighted one more time that the ‘places of memory’ do not represent only geographic locations. This concept could be extended on people, events, objects, buildings, traditions, legends, etc. In other words, on everything that surrounds people and has a specific aura.

In this part as Spanish places of memory will be observed the monument of francoist epoch Valley of the Fallen and the Basque city Guernica that was bombed during the civil war. Both sites occupy an important place in Spaniard’s perception of the civil war and dictatorship. The part dedicated to the Valley of the Fallen also relies on the articles of the laws, that were observed before, while the case of Guernica is mostly based on initiatives of civil society.

### **2.2.1 Valley of the Fallen**

The Valley of the Fallen is a monument located near to Madrid. It was built with the forced labor and serves as a crypt for more than 30 thousand of people. From 1975 to 2019 Francisco

---

<sup>116</sup> Casqueiro, J. The Democratic Memory Law Requires a Simple Majority To Be Approved // El País. – 19.11.2021. – Mode of access: <https://elpais.com/espana/2021-11-19/la-ley-de-memoria-requiere-solo-mas-sies-que-noes-para-salir-aprobada.html> (accessed: 20.02.2022).

<sup>117</sup> Boimirzaev, S.B. The Role Of Commemorative Practices In The Process Of Functioning And Historical Memory Development // Science problems. 2017. №7 (20).

<sup>118</sup> Nora P., Ozuf M., Puimezh J. de, Vinok M. France-Memory / trans. from French D. Hapaeva. // Publishing House of St. Petersburg University, 1999. p. 39.

<sup>119</sup> Sabancheev, R.Yu. Pierre Nora’s concept of “sites of memory” as a method of historical reconstruction // Humanities Research in the Russian Far East. 2018. №1 (43).

Franco also was buried in the Valley of the Fallen, but in 2019 his rest were exhumed by decision of socialist Government of Spain.

The issue of Valley of the Fallen occupies an important place in a discussion over historical memory in Spain. A growing interest to the monument could be explained with its symbolical meaning.

J. Marco characterizes Valley of the Fallen as a symbol of the humiliation and invisibility of the victims of Francoism.<sup>120</sup> The mentioned position is shared by a circle of researchers. This idea bases on nature of this memorial: in the Valley of the Fallen were buried the people who died during the civil war from both parties. The author makes a reference on paper by Fernández F.<sup>121</sup>, stating that more than 30000 bodies were deposited in the mausoleum. This number includes thousands of Francoism victims, which were removed from mass graves without the knowledge of their families.<sup>122</sup> According to J. Marco, these people “were buried beneath the tomb of their killers”.

Such moral dilemma could not fail to be reflected in the legislation. The issue of the Valley of the Fallen status was mentioned in the Article 16 and the Sixth Additional Provision of Historical Memory Law. Within the framework of Article 16 is established that<sup>123</sup>:

1. The Valley of the Fallen will be strictly governed by the rules applicable in general to places of sorrow and public cemeteries;
2. None of the acts of a political nature or exalting the Civil War, its protagonists, or Francoism may be carried out.
3. In the Valley of the Fallen, as a place of commemoration, remembrance and tribute to the victims of the conflict, may rest only the remains of people who died during the Spanish Civil War.

In turn, the Sixth Additional Provision of Historical Memory Law is devoted to the issues of management of the Valley of the Fallen. According to it, among the objectives of the memorial should be the rehabilitation of memory of all the people who died as a result of the Civil War of 1936-1939 and the political repression that followed it in order to deepen the knowledge of this historical period and constitutional values. If the key elements of the Article 16 will be enforced

---

<sup>120</sup> Marco J. *Francoist Crimes* // Sage Publications, Ltd. *Journal of Contemporary History*, 2017, Vol. 52, No. 1. pp. 157-163.

<sup>121</sup> Fernández, F. *The past underground. Contemporary Exhumations of the Civil War* // Barcelona, 2014. 261-303.

<sup>122</sup> Marco J. *Francoist Crimes* // Sage Publications, Ltd. *Journal of Contemporary History*, 2017, Vol. 52, No. 1. pp. 157-163.

<sup>123</sup> Law 52/2007, of December 26, which recognizes and expands rights and establishes measures in favor of those who suffered persecution or violence during the civil war and the dictatorship [Electronic resource] // BOE. – 26.12.2007. – Mode of access: <https://www.boe.es/buscar/pdf/2007/BOE-A-2007-22296-consolidado.pdf> (accessed 13.11.2021)

without any obstacles, it should also promote the aspirations for reconciliation and coexistence that are in society.

While the Historical Memory Law proposes only one article and one provision on issues related to the Valley of the Fallen regulation, the Democratic Memory Law Project consists of one article, one transition provision and one derogating provision on mentioned topic. The main information on Valley of the Fallen status is concentrated in Article 54 of the Democratic Memory Law Project, according to which the following measures must be established<sup>124</sup>:

1. The Valley of the Fallen is a place of democratic memory whose resignification will be aimed at making known, through plans and mechanisms of research and dissemination, the circumstances of its construction, the historical period in which it was inserted and its meaning, in order to strengthen constitutional and democratic values.

2. Acts of a political nature or exaltation of the War, its protagonists or the Dictatorship may not be carried out anywhere on the premises.

3. The crypts adjacent to the Basilica and the existing burials in it have the character of a civil cemetery.

4. In the Valley of the Fallen, only the mortal remains of people who died as a result of the War may lie, as a place of recognition, commemoration, remembrance and tribute to the victims buried there. Likewise, any mortal remains that occupy a pre-eminent place in the enclosure will be relocated.

5. The Foundation of the Santa Cruz del Valle de los Caídos is declared extinct, as its purposes are incompatible with constitutional principles and values. The extinction will take effect on the date of entry into force of the royal decree referred to in the following section.

6. By royal decree the new legal framework is applicable to the Valley of the Fallen that determines the organization, operation and patrimonial regime of the place.

7. Complaints and requests from relatives whose purpose is to urge the exhumation and delivery of the remains of the victims buried in the Valley of the Fallen will be addressed. In the case of technical impossibility of exhumation, symbolic and moral reparation measures will be agreed.

The first transitional provision and the single derogating provision of the Democratic Memory Law are related to the Foundation of the Santa Cruz del Valle los Caídos, that was partially described in Article 54.5.

---

<sup>124</sup> Democratic Memory Law Project [Electronic resource] // Official Gazette of the Cortes Generales. – 30.09.2021. – Mode of access: [https://www.congreso.es/public\\_oficiales/L14/CONG/BOCG/A/BOCG-14-A-64-1.PDF](https://www.congreso.es/public_oficiales/L14/CONG/BOCG/A/BOCG-14-A-64-1.PDF) (accessed: 10.03.2022)



The last issue that must be studied within the framework of the Valley of the Fallen is exhumation of Francisco Franco's remains. From 1975 to 2019 the grave of Francisco Franco was located in Valley of the Fallen. However, in 2019 the body of exhumed. According to Spanish magazine "El País", Pedro Sánchez of the Socialist Party (PSOE) had pledged to eliminate what United Nations rapporteurs have described as an international anomaly: having an autocrat buried in a state-run mausoleum that draws tourists and far-right sympathizers and also contains the remains of nearly 34000 victims of the Spanish Civil War (1936-1939).<sup>125</sup> The transfer of the remains of the dictator Franco from the Valley of the Fallen to the El Pardo Mingorrubio cemetery costed 125920.15 euros.<sup>126</sup>

Summarizing, there is a need to highlight that the issue of the Valley of the Fallen occupies a central place in Spanish internal discourse on the civil war and dictatorship's legacy. The decision on status of the Valley of the Fallen is important as for population, as for Government. The materials presented above permit to suppose that any historical memory initiative of the future will certainly affect the memorial under analysis.

### 2.2.2 Guernica

The tragedy that occurred in the years of Spanish civil war in Basque city Guernica is known because of Pablo Picasso's eponymous masterpiece. According to National Museum Reina Sofia, the painting of Picasso "Guernica" became a political symbol, to such a degree that it appears as an emblem in any episode of violence or the vulnerability of civilians.<sup>127</sup>

The bombing of Guernica was the first example of a mass bombing of a civilian population. A total of 31 tons of bombs and projectiles were dropped by the pro-Franco air force on a defenseless town, leading to the destruction of the urban center and approximately 500 casualties.<sup>128</sup> This event gained a huge resonance; the city itself was a place of a very important cultural significance, because here was the location of ancient folk meetings and the historical Biscay archive was stored here.<sup>129</sup>

Nowadays Guernica is an example of advanced reconciliation that still in process. Recognition of German involvement in the bombing of Guernica did not come until 1997, when

---

<sup>125</sup> Franco's exhumation: Bringing an end to a symbol of the Spanish dictatorship [Electronic resource] // El País. – 24.10.2019. – Mode of access: [https://english.elpais.com/elpais/2019/10/24/inenglish/1571900395\\_914719.html](https://english.elpais.com/elpais/2019/10/24/inenglish/1571900395_914719.html) (accessed 10.12.2021).

<sup>126</sup> González, M. The transfer of Franco's remains from the Valley of the Fallen costed 126,000 euros [Electronic resource] // El País. – 12.03.2020. – Mode of access: <https://elpais.com/espana/2020-03-11/el-traslado-de-los-restos-de-franco-del-valle-de-los-caidos-costo-126000-euros.html> (accessed 14.12.2021).

<sup>127</sup> Rethinking Guernica [Electronic resource] // National Museum Reina Sofia. – Mode of access: <https://guernica.museoreinasofia.es/en/#bombardeo> (accessed 22.01.2022).

<sup>128</sup> Fundación Museo de la Paz de Gernika [Electronic resource] // European Observatory on Memories. – Mode of access: <https://europeanmemories.net/partners/fundacion-museo-de-la-paz-de-gernika/> (accessed 23.01.2022).

<sup>129</sup> Rojge, J. Museology and Memory of the Past: the Musealization of the Spanish Civil War // VM. 2013. No. 1 (7).

President Herzog sent a letter to the survivors in which he admitted Germany's involvement in the 1937 air raid.<sup>130</sup>

A. Kopper in the article entitled as “Why Guernica became a Globally Used Icon of Political Protest? Analysis of its Visual Rhetoric and Capacity to Link Distinct Events of Protests into a Grand Narrative” underlines that the recurrent use of Guernica turns the picture into an icon, an icon that refers less and less to atrocities of the Spanish Civil War and invokes instead more and more a universal normative call.

This statement could be proved if the texts of the laws that were studied above will be examined one more time. Neither Historical Memory Law, nor Democratic Memory Law Project do not refer to Guernica as a place of historical memory. Nevertheless, it is impossible to state that Guernica is not a ‘place of memory’ or a place that contains history on Spanish civil war.

The reason why Guernica have not transformed into a place of memorial disputes seems pretty clear. Guernica in contrast of the Valley of the Fallen presents a global tragedy, where the innocent civil population was killed. There cannot be two different points of view. And the other point that could be helpful in distinguishing the case of Guernica from the case of the Valley of the Fallen is that these bombings were made by external generally recognized enemy, while the construction of the Valley of the Fallen signifies the illicit actions among the Spanish population itself.

### **2.3 The Association for the Recovery of Historical Memory**

One of the central places of the Spanish disputes around the historical memory is occupied by search, detection, exhumation and reburial of the victims of Spanish civil war. According to information published in the Spanish magazine “Público”, in the period from 2000 to 2022 were exhumed more than 9000 bodies.<sup>131</sup> The material states that the vast majority of the recovered bodies (about 89%) belongs to the civilian population that was not participating in any army or war action at the time of being executed by Franco and thrown into a mass grave.

A huge number of all exhumation was realized by the Association for the Recovery of Historical Memory (ARMH). It is a non-governmental organization that specialize at<sup>132</sup>:

---

<sup>130</sup> Bombing of Guernica. To Reconciliation [Electronic resource] // Museo de la Paz de Guernica. – Mode of access: [https://www.museodelapaz.org/docu\\_bombardeo.php](https://www.museodelapaz.org/docu_bombardeo.php) (accessed 06.05.2022).

<sup>131</sup> More than 9,000 bodies of victims of Franco's regime have been recovered in 20 years of exhumations [Electronic resource] // Público. – 18.10.2020. – Mode of access: <https://www.publico.es/politica/9000-cuerpos-victimas-franquismo-han-sido-recuperados-20-anos-exhumaciones.html> (accessed 13.11.2021).

<sup>132</sup> Activities of ARMH [Electronic resource] // Association for the Recovery of Historical Memory. – Mode of access: <https://memoriahistorica.org.es/que-es-la-asociacion-para-la-recuperacion-de-la-memoria-historica-armh-2000-2012/> (accessed 23.02.2022).

- Collaboration in the creation of a large Archive of the Civil War, which preserves historical memory;
- Promotion the study and dissemination of knowledge on the victims of the Civil War;
- Promotion, stimulation and support as many cultural actions, in the broadest terms, related to the mission and activity that concerns the conservation, dissemination and research of the general archives of the Civil War;
- The investigation, exhumation and identification of the victims of the civil war and Franco's repression;
- Promotion and coordinate research in these fields, as well as to promote collaboration with all national and foreign entities dealing with the subject of the Association;
- Serving as a meeting and information platform between researchers, national and foreign organizations and entities related to this field of study;
- Gathering all the files both in their original support or on any reproducing support of the same, in a single file dedicated to public research. From the preservation and custody of the documents in the aforementioned Archive, the mechanisms regulated by the norms and conventions may be established so that they can be disclosed in the established supports that are handled in the Documentation Centers;
- The Association may enter into collaboration agreements with other national or foreign Associations of similar characteristics and objectives in the manner determined;
- The search for the disappeared caused by Franco's repression;
- The struggle for justice for the victims of the Franco dictatorship, through any of the means permitted by law;
- The work of public recognition for all the people who built our first democracy during the Second Republic, as well as for all the men and women who fought against the dictatorship for the restoration of democracy.

According to N. Junquera, the Association for the Recovery of Historical Memory is confronting with the National Foundation Francisco Franco in the sphere of preserving and promotion the information on civil war, dictatorship and the personality of Francisco Franco.<sup>133</sup> In other words, Association for the Recovery of Historical Memory performs a role of a successful

---

<sup>133</sup> Junquera, N. The Association for the Recovery of Historical Memory Acquires the Domain Franco.es [Electronic resource] // El País. – 24.06.2019. – Mode of access: [https://elpais.com/politica/2019/06/24/actualidad/1561367051\\_204544.html](https://elpais.com/politica/2019/06/24/actualidad/1561367051_204544.html) (accessed 15.10.2021).

popularizer of historical memory and has an impact on memory policy implementation from the side of civil society.

## **2.4 Conclusions**

Within the framework of Chapter 2 were examined the different aspects of memory policy implementation in internal policy of Spain. The main focus was made on a study of Spanish legislation in the field of historical memory, because the laws determine the other governmental and non-governmental actors' behavior. For this purpose, in the first part of present Chapter were studied Amnesty Law, Historical Memory Law and Democratic Memory Law, that still was not adopted, but exists as a project. After the research made on memorial legislation of Spain in the field of historical memory, the author of current master thesis made a conclusion that still there is no a consensus on amount of measures that should be implicated by the Government. In fact, there is a possibility that the Democratic Memory Law will not be adopted, if the Government changes in December 2023. Spanish party VOX now is gaining popularity among the people and the National Party, which also represents the right wing, remains to be one of the major parties. However, if the Democratic Memory Law gains votes, after its adoption the possibilities for comprehensive research will be reduced due to the limitations that it puts on the attitudes towards francoist regime.

The second part of the Chapter 2 of current master thesis is dedicated to the concept introduced by Nora P. The author of present paper selected two examples of so-called 'places of memory' in modern Spain. For the analysis were chosen the Valley of the Fallen and Guernica. The first 'place of memory' is a monument constructed by the repressed Republicans in order to commemorate the Spanish civil war. Some of researchers believe that it was done for further reconciliation between two parties. For other scholars this place is a vivid image of humiliation, because the victims are forced to rest near to their murderers. The other dimension of the Valley of the Fallen issue is in meetings of neo-francoist movement supporters that used to gather here together. In order to prevent them from meetings, the remains of Francisco Franco were exhumed in 2019.

In contrast to the Valley of the Fallen, Guernica has no such conflict potential. The author of current master thesis believes that it is because of general understanding of tragedy. Besides, the bombings were realized by foreigners and it symbolizes more an external threat. In the case of the Valley of the Fallen, the tragedy was caused by own Spanish population and could be named as internal.

The last part of the Chapter 2 of current master thesis is dedicated to the non-governmental actors that perform in the sphere of historical memory in Spain. The author of present paper focuses

on the actions of the Association for the Recovery of Historical Memory (ARMH), however, the National Foundation Francisco Franco is also taken into account. The interest towards the ARMH could be explained by the leading role of mentioned organization in the sphere of historical memory and by its impact on memory policy implementation in Spain.

The Chapter 3 of present paper will be devoted to the impact that the International actors, such as International organizations have over memory policy implementation in Spain.

## CHAPTER 3. INTERNATIONAL DIMENSION OF MEMORY POLICY IN SPAIN

### 3.1 Impact of the European Union

Since 1986, Spain forms part of European Union. S.M. Khenkin in the article entitled as “Spain and the EU” highlights that the importance of joining the European Union was explained by the necessity to strengthen the young Spanish democracy. It also served as a guarantee that the new far-right movement riot would not happen again. In other words, the admission to the community of Western democracies became a proof of Spanish democracy legitimacy.<sup>134</sup>

As a member-state of the European Union, Spain participate in different integrational activities, including the ones related to the historical memory perception formation. Such activities fit into the framework of identity politics. The term “identity politics”, which was established in the 1960s and 1970s as part of the constructivist paradigm of analyzing socio-political changes (P. Bourdieu) in the wake of the rise of mass social movements for the rights of discriminated social groups, was originally used in the meaning of “the practice of affirming the socially disadvantaged minorities and groups uniting as carriers of a special identity (racial, ethnic, gender), the right to public recognition and legitimacy”.<sup>135</sup> One of the most significant forms of identity politics is the policy of memory, which involves purposeful work on the interpretation of the collective past, when many historical facts are reinterpreted, reinterpreted, invented or forgotten.<sup>136</sup>

According to D.O. Ryabov, the memory policy of the European Union is realizing in three different directions: for the positive identity creation (increasing the sense of affiliation to the EU); for the internal unity provision weakening of internal symbolic borders (especially, the national ones); for the negative identity creation (establishing of the stable and legitimate frontier between “the own” and “someone else's”).<sup>137</sup>

Among the various forms of memory policy that are distinguished by D.O. Ryabov could be especially mentioned the destruction of monuments. For Spain this issue was important. In 2021 the last Franco statue left in Spain was removed from the streets of Melilla.<sup>138</sup> Previously, when statues of Francisco Franco remained in Spain, occurred acts of monuments violation.<sup>139</sup>

Within the framework of the Chapter 1 the reference to the material of the Council of Europe over Remembrance was made. According to this article, the Council of Europe, “which

---

<sup>134</sup> Khenkin S.M. Spain and the EU // Current Problems of Europe. 2000. №3.

<sup>135</sup> Achkasov, V.A. Identity Politics in the Modern World // Bulletin of St. Petersburg University. Political science. International relations. 2013. №4.

<sup>136</sup> Potseluyev, S.P. “Symbolic Politics”: Towards the History of the Concept // Symbolic Politics. 2012. №1.

<sup>137</sup> Ryabov, D.O. Politics of Memory in the Formation of European Identity EU // PolitBook. 2016. №4.

<sup>138</sup> Estaire, O. The last Franco statue left in Spain was removed from the streets of Melilla // El País. – 23.02.2021. – Mode of access: <https://elpais.com/espana/2021-02-23/la-ultima-estatua-de-franco-es-retirada-de-las-calles-de-melilla.html> (accessed 20.03.2022)

<sup>139</sup> Five leftist militants arrested for painting an equestrian statue of Franco red [Electronic resource] // El Mundo. - 19.05.2001. – Mode of access: <https://www.elmundo.es/elmundo/2001/05/19/madrid/990272276.html> (accessed 14.12.2021).

emerged from the ruins of the Second World War, has defined its fundamental objectives with a view to countering the totalitarian ideologies that dominated the first half of the 20th century and their corollaries: intolerance, separation, exclusion, hatred and discrimination”.<sup>140</sup>

One of the most important initiatives in the field of historical memory provided by the European Union is the Europe for Citizens (EFC) Programme. Europe for Citizens support initiatives to strengthen remembrance of the recent European history and to enhance civic participation at EU level.<sup>141</sup> Thus, in the period from 2014 to 2020 the Europe for Citizens Programme aimed to foster a common culture of remembrance and mutual understanding between citizens from different EU Member States, notably by supporting projects that reflect on historical turning points and changes in regimes in Europe's 20th century and on their continuous importance for the modern Europe within the framework of European Remembrance initiative.<sup>142</sup> According to the Europe for Citizens Programme (2014-2020), in 2016 the beginning of Spanish civil war (1936) was included to the list of events that should be remembered and promoted.<sup>143</sup>

In other words, the trends of the European Union on creating common European identity influences a lot the perception of events in each member-state of the EU. Taking into account the focus on condemnation the totalitarian regimes that existed in XX century, the Spanish case could not avoid to be examined. According to this statement, it could be supposed that the political measures implemented by the Spanish Government are influenced not only by the demands of Spanish population, but also by the requirements of the international and integrative organizations like the European Union.

### **3.2 Influence of the United Nations**

In the previous part of the present Chapter was stated that the requirements of international organizations could play a significant role in the process of memory policy implementation. It was determined that the actions of Spanish Government lay in the mainstream of the integrational policy of the European Union.

It should be mentioned that the European Union is not the only organization that pays attention to the memory policy development in Spain. Within the framework of this part it is

---

<sup>140</sup> Remembrance [Electronic resource] // Council of Europe. – Mode of access: <https://www.coe.int/en/web/compass/remembrance> (accessed 12.03.2022).

<sup>141</sup> Europe for Citizens (EFC) [Electronic resource] // European Commission. – Mode of access: [https://ec.europa.eu/info/departments/justice-and-consumers/justice-and-consumers-funding-tenders/funding-programmes/previous-programmes-2014-2020/europe-citizens-efc\\_en](https://ec.europa.eu/info/departments/justice-and-consumers/justice-and-consumers-funding-tenders/funding-programmes/previous-programmes-2014-2020/europe-citizens-efc_en) (accessed 22.02.2022).

<sup>142</sup> ANNEX to the Commission Implementing Decision on the Financing of the Europe for Citizens Programme and the Adoption of the Work Programme for 2020 [Electronic resource] // European Commission. – Mode of access: [https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/default/files/2020\\_annex-annual-work-programme\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/default/files/2020_annex-annual-work-programme_en.pdf) (accessed 13.03.2022).

<sup>143</sup> Council regulation (EU) No 390/2014 of 14 April 2014 Establishing the «Europe for Citizens» Programme for the Period 2014–2020 [Electronic resource] // European Commission. – 17.04.2014. – Mode of access: [https://eacea.ec.europa.eu/europe-for-citizens\\_en](https://eacea.ec.europa.eu/europe-for-citizens_en) (accessed 08.04.2022).

necessary to observe the involvement of the United Nations organization into the Spanish affairs related to historical memory.

The United Nations is holding special meetings and adopts documents in memory of some of the most important events in world history.<sup>144</sup>

The main interest to the Spanish civil war and Francisco Franco's dictatorship from the part of the UN is presented by the Committee on Enforced Disappearances (CED). In this connection there is a need to make a reference to the material published by the UN News that announces that the Committee on Enforced Disappearances has recommended Spain to approve the Democratic Memory Law as soon as possible, since its adoption "would represent an advance to guarantee the rights of victims" of the Civil War and the Franco Dictatorship. The Committee notes that Spanish legislation does not currently include compensation as a form of reparation or measures to eliminate legal obstacles that impede the criminal investigation of enforced disappearances initiated in the past.<sup>145</sup> The Committee welcomed the presentation of the Bill on Democratic Memory on Babies Stolen in Spain in March 2020, but regretted that the bill has been in the Justice Committee of the Congress of Deputies since then without progress.<sup>146</sup>

The Committee have made a series of new recommendations to Spain, including the following<sup>147</sup>:

- To intensify efforts to search for and identify children who may have been victims of enforced disappearance or appropriation;
- To guarantee their right to identity;
- To investigate the alleged perpetrators;
- To ensure the prompt adoption of the Proposal of the Law on Stolen Babies in the Spanish State (122/39), guaranteeing its full compatibility with the Convention;
- To create as soon as a National DNA Bank that centralizes all the genetic samples of the victims of the cases reported by administrative or judicial, which can provide samples free of charge, voluntary and without need for a court order;
- To guarantee that the authorities initiate ex officio and without delay the exhaustive, independent, impartial and effective search and investigation for all alleged

---

<sup>144</sup> Bafoev F.M. Historical Memory in World Politics. The Role of the UN and Other International Organizations // Actual Problems of the Humanities and Natural Sciences. 2017. No.1-4.

<sup>145</sup> A UN Committee urges Spain to approve the Democratic Memory Law [Electronic resource] // UN News. – 30.09.2021. – Mode of access: <https://news.un.org/es/story/2021/09/1497732> (accessed 30.10.2021).

<sup>146</sup> UN Committee on Enforced Disappearances issues findings on Brazil, Panama, France and Spain [Electronic resource] // United Nations. – 30.09.2021. – Mode of access: <https://www.ohchr.org/en/press-releases/2021/09/un-committee-enforced-disappearances-issues-findings-brazil-panama-france> (accessed 01.11.2021).

<sup>147</sup> A UN Committee urges Spain to approve the Democratic Memory Law [Electronic resource] // UN News. – 30.09.2021. – Mode of access: <https://news.un.org/es/story/2021/09/1497732> (accessed 30.10.2021).



cases of forced disappearance or appropriation of children and allow the active participation of those close to them who so require;

- To ensure that the limitation period runs from the moment the identity of the victims is restored; that the perpetrators are brought to justice and punished in accordance with the seriousness of their acts;
- To ensure that all victims receive comprehensive reparation;
- To ensure the adequate conservation of, and access to, all archives and other public and private documentation that may be relevant to the investigation and search for children who may have been victims of forced disappearance or appropriation.

The recommendations presented above were also made in order to develop the Proposal of a Law on Stolen Babies in the Spanish State. It is a very important issue, because more than 30000 children are separated from their mothers during the francoist regime due to idea of pure nation.<sup>148</sup>

Summarizing, it is need to be said that the United Nations pay attention on Spanish initiatives in the field of historical memory, especially the ones that are related to enforced disappearances. The enforced disappearances that had happen during the civil war and the dictatorship are an obvious example of human rights violation. How it was presented before, the violent acts that occurred in the period from 1936 to 1975 were no condemned properly because of different political reasons, however nowadays Spain as a democratic state faces with a need to deal with the issues of the past in order to develop its cooperation with other international actors.

### **3.3 Conclusion**

Within the framework of the Chapter 3 was studied the impact that the international organizations have on Spanish policy in the field of historical memory. The research that was made in this Chapter aloud to understand that the actions of Spanish Government realized in this sphere are determined not only by the internal demand of Spanish population, but also by the requirements of international organizations in which Spain participates as a member-state.

In the first part of the Chapter 3 were examined the initiatives of the European Union. After the analysis of the observations, it could be stated that the memory policy of Spain is in the mainstream of the European policy towards memory. The key role in the European approach to memory performs the Europe for Citizens Programme, one of the branches of which is devoted to the European Remembrance. The beginning of the Spanish civil war (1936) was included in 2016

---

<sup>148</sup> Proposal of a Law on Stolen Babies in the Spanish State [Electronic resource] // Congress of Deputies. – 06.03.2020. – Mode of access: [https://www.congreso.es/public\\_oficiales/L14/CONG/BOCG/B/BOCG-14-B-65-1.PDF](https://www.congreso.es/public_oficiales/L14/CONG/BOCG/B/BOCG-14-B-65-1.PDF) (accessed 16.12.2021).

in the list of events that should be remembered, which means that the Spanish policy towards civil war and dictatorship attracts attention of whole European society.

The second part of present chapter is dedicated to the influence that the United Nations has over the aspects of historical memory in Spain. The special place in this issue occupies the Committee on Enforced Disappearances (CED), which controls the initiatives that Spain implements in the sphere of historical memory. Nowadays the Democratic Memory Law is under control of the Committee. On this basis it could be supposed that the internal political disposition does not play a key role in the issues of historical memory and, probably, the Democratic Memory Law will be adopted in future.

## CONCLUSIONS

The presented Master's Thesis is devoted to the issues of the Spanish civil war interpretation in modern Spanish and International discourse. Under the Spanish discourse were considered the Spanish media reports, the statements of politicians, internal Spanish organizations, such as The Association for the Recovery of Historical Memory (ARMH), and the legislative acts that were adopted by the Spanish Government in a different period of time. Under the international discourse were considered the international organizations, such as the United Nations, especially the materials of the Committee on Enforced Disappearances (CED), and the institutions of the European Union.

The aim of this research was in determination how the modern Spanish and International institutions influence the memory policy adoption and the narrative formation on Spanish civil war and francoist regime.

In order to reach the mentioned aim there were set following objectives:

- To collect information on historical memory concept development;
- To elaborate criteria and to make observations on memory policy realization in particular countries of Western Europe;
- To determine the milestones of the Spanish civil war and Franco dictatorship regime;
- To study the legislative acts that were adopted in Spain in the field on historical memory;
- To examine the practical implementation of the concept 'places of memory' in Spain;
- To research on particular non-Governmental actors that perform in the field of historical memory in Spain;
- To analyze how the international organizations do have an impact on Spanish memory policy initiatives.

This Master's Thesis is composed of three chapters. Within the framework of the Chapter 1 were studied the key theoretical concepts applicable to the present research. The chapter is divided into 5 parts, each of which is dedicated to particular theoretical issue related to the main topic. The Chapter 1 establishes a constructivism paradigm as the most suitable for present research and collects the main information on the historical memory and the key concepts that exists in this field of study. This part of Master's Thesis also examines how the memory policy was implicated in different countries of Western Europe in order to find certain similarities between the Spanish case and the other European states cases. In the result it was ascertained that

there are similarities between the approaches to historical memory in Spain and France. These findings could be used in future for other independent research.

In the Chapter 2 were examined the initiatives in the field of historical memory that were taken within the borders of Spain by its internal actors. This chapter is divided into 4 parts, the first of which is dedicated to memorial legislation, the second studies how the concept of 'places of memory' was implicated in Spain and the third revises the actions of modern non-Governmental organizations that perform in the field of memory.

The first part of Chapter 2 presents documentary analysis on three particular laws of Spain. For the analysis were chosen the Amnesty Law, the Historical Memory Law and the Democratic Memory Law, which still was not adopted. According to the results of analysis, neither Amnesty Law, nor Historical Memory Law supposed any punishment for the lawbreakers, however, the project of Democratic Memory Law contains sanctions. In contrast to the Historical Memory Law, Democratic Memory Law determines status of the Valley of the Fallen.

The issue of the Valley of the Fallen was studied in the framework of the second part of Chapter 2, as well as the case of Guernica. While the disputes over the status of the Valley of the Fallen are still on going, the case of Guernica could be understood as a settled one. Guernica represents a notification on war tragedy, nevertheless, this tragedy was caused mostly by external actors. In other words, the Valley of the Fallen reminds on internal problems and the absence of reconciliation, while Guernica is a symbol of the international peace.

The third part of the Chapter 2 presents a study on the non-Governmental actor of the memory policy in Spain. The Association for the Recovery of Historical Memory (ARMH) plays a huge role in search, determination and exhumation of victims of Spanish civil war and francoist regime. The ARMH had exhumed more than 9000 bodies in the period from 2000 to 2020. This organization influences greatly on the memory policy development in Spain.

Within the framework of Chapter 3 was revised how the international organizations influence on memory policy implementation in Spain. This Chapter is divided into 3 parts, the first of which is dedicated to the European Union and the second is devoted to the United Nations. It could be stated that the actions of Spanish Government are in the mainstream of European approach towards memory policy. It also must be highlighted that the United Nations through the Committee on Enforced Disappearances (CED) observes the actions of Spanish Government especially in the sphere of memorial legislation and expresses its concern with the speed of Democratic Memory Law adoption process. The involvement of international organizations in the process of memory policy development signifies that the adoption of the Democratic Memory Law is only a matter of time. The Law will provide some reparations to the victims of the francoist

regime, however, it could also produce obstacles for further comprehensive researches because of the narrative that it creates.

Based on the results of the study it could be concluded that the memory policy implementation in Spain depends on internal and external reasons. Among internal reasons could be distinguished the Spanish society's polarization, the absence of reconciliation, and the victim's recognition. Among external reasons could be named the issues of integrational policy and the global concern the human rights violation. Both internal and external dimensions compose narrative on Spanish civil war and francoist regime and determine the behavior of Governmental and Non-Governmental actors in the field of memory policy.

For this research was elaborated the hypothesis that the memory policy in Spain is developing under the demand of Spanish population and could be changed if this demand disappears. Probably, this hypothesis is partially incorrect, because the vector of memory policy development is influenced not only by the demand of Spanish population, but as well by the requirements of international actors.

## REFERENCES

### Primary sources

1. ANNEX to the Commission Implementing Decision on the Financing of the Europe for Citizens Programme and the Adoption of the Work Programme for 2020 [Electronic resource] // European Commission. – Mode of access: [https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/default/files/2020\\_annex-annual-work-programme\\_en.pdf](https://ec.europa.eu/info/sites/default/files/2020_annex-annual-work-programme_en.pdf) (accessed 13.03.2022).
2. Council regulation (EU) No 390/2014 of 14 April 2014 Establishing the «Europe for Citizens» Programme for the Period 2014–2020 [Electronic resource] // European Commission. – 17.04.2014. – Mode of access: [https://eacea.ec.europa.eu/europe-for-citizens\\_en](https://eacea.ec.europa.eu/europe-for-citizens_en) (accessed 08.04.2022).
3. Halbwachs, M. On Collective Memory / ed. L.A. Coser. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992.
4. Democratic Memory Draft Law [Electronic resource] // La Moncloa. – 15.09.2020. – Mode of access: <https://www.lamoncloa.gob.es/consejodeministros/Paginas/enlaces/150920-enlace-memoria.aspx> (accessed 03.03.2022)
5. Democratic Memory Law Project [Electronic resource] // Official Gazette of the Cortes Generales. – 30.09.2021. – Mode of access: [https://www.congreso.es/public\\_oficiales/L14/CONG/BOCG/A/BOCG-14-A-64-1.PDF](https://www.congreso.es/public_oficiales/L14/CONG/BOCG/A/BOCG-14-A-64-1.PDF) (accessed: 10.03.2022)
6. Law 46/1977, of 15 October, on Amnesty [Electronic resource] // BOE. – 15.10.1977. – Mode of access: <https://www.boe.es/buscar/pdf/1977/BOE-A-1977-24937-consolidado.pdf> (accessed 04.10.2021)
7. Law 52/2007, of December 26, which recognizes and expands rights and establishes measures in favor of those who suffered persecution or violence during the civil war and the dictatorship [Electronic resource] // BOE. – 26.12.2007. – Mode of access: <https://www.boe.es/buscar/pdf/2007/BOE-A-2007-22296-consolidado.pdf> (accessed 13.11.2021).
8. Law 645/1952 – Apology of fascism and Fascist expressions. Article 4. [Electronic resource] // Memory Laws in European and Comparative Perspective. – Mode of access: <http://melaproject.org/node/210> (accessed 10.03.2022)
9. Proposal of a Law on Stolen Babies in the Spanish State [Electronic resource] // Congress of Deputies. – 06.03.2020. – Mode of access: [https://www.congreso.es/public\\_oficiales/L14/CONG/BOCG/B/BOCG-14-B-65-1.PDF](https://www.congreso.es/public_oficiales/L14/CONG/BOCG/B/BOCG-14-B-65-1.PDF) (accessed 16.12.2021).

10. Nora P., Ozuf M., Puimezh J. de, Vinok M. France-Memory / trans. from French D. Hapaeva. // Publishing House of St. Petersburg University, 1999. p. 39.
11. Nora, P. Worldwide Triumph of Memory // *Neprikosnovennyi zapas*, 2005, no. 2–3, pp. 391-402.
12. Wendt, A. Anarchy is what States Make of it: The Social Construction of Power Politics // The MIT Press. *International Organization*, Spring, 1992, Vol. 46, №2.
13. Wendt, A. Collective Identity Formation and the International State // *The American Political Science Review*, Jun., 1994, Vol. 88, №2.

## **Literature**

### **Monographs:**

14. Beevor, A. *The Spanish Civil War*. New York, 1983.
15. Payne, S.G. *The Spanish Civil War* // Cambridge University Press, 2012.
16. Pozharskaya, S.P. *Francisco Franco and His Time* // Moscow: OLMA Media Group, 2007.
17. Preston, P. *Francisco* // Fontana, 1995.
18. Preston, P. *Francisco: a biography* // HarperCollinsPublishers, 1993.
19. Preston, P. *Francisco and Hitler: The Myth of Hendaye 1940* // Cambridge University Press. *Contemporary European History*, Mar., 1992, Vol. 1, No. 1. pp. 1-16.
20. Tepora, T. *The Image of Marshal Mannerheim, Moral Panic, and the Refashioning of the Nation in the 1990s*. // Palgrave Macmillan, Cham. *Palgrave Studies in the History of Experience*. In: Kivimäki, V., Suodenjoki, S., Vahtikari, T. (eds) *Lived Nation as the History of Experiences and Emotions in Finland, 1800-2000*. 2021.

### **Scientific Articles:**

21. Achkasov, V.A. Identity Politics in the Modern World // *Bulletin of St. Petersburg University. Political science. International relations*. 2013. №4.
22. *Activities of ARMH [Electronic resource]* // Association for the Recovery of Historical Memory. – Mode of access: <https://memoriahistorica.org.es/que-es-la-asociacion-para-la-recuperacion-de-la-memoria-historica-armh-2000-2012/> (accessed 23.02.2022).
23. Akhmetshina, A.V. Concept of Historical Memory and Its Implication In the Modern Russian Society // *Current issues of social sciences: sociology, political science, philosophy, history*. 2014. No.38.
24. Akulinin, K.V. Collective Memory of First World War in Britain During Interwar Period. Statement of the Problem // *Tomsk State University Journals*. 2014. №4 (132).

25. Aleksandrova, A.K. The Echo of War: The Issue of World War II Reparations and Occupation Loan in Contemporary Greece // *Contemporary Europe*. 2021. № 3. p. 167–180.
26. Alekseeva, T.A. Think Like Constructivist: Discovering a Multi-Voiced World // *Comparative Politics*. 2014. №1 (14).
27. Antipov, G.A. History, Memory, And History as a Science // *Epistemology & Philosophy of Science*. 2014. №4 (42).
28. Bafoev F.M. Historical Memory in World Politics. The Role of the UN and Other International Organizations // *Actual Problems of the Humanities and Natural Sciences*. 2017. No.1-4.
29. Baranov, N.N. World War I in Popular Culture of Memory // *Perm University Herald. History*. 2018. №4 (43).
30. Boimirzaev, S.B. The Role Of Commemorative Practices In The Process Of Functioning And Historical Memory Development // *Science problems*. 2017. №7 (20).
31. Calvo-Gonzalez, O. Neither a Carrot Nor a Stick: American Foreign Aid and Economic Policymaking in Spain during the 1950s // *Oxford University Press. Diplomatic History*, June 2006, Vol. 30, No. 3. pp. 409-438.
32. Chekmazov, A.I., Uziyomova, A.V. The Role of State and Non-State Actors in the Memory Policy: Comparative Analysis of Finland and Spain. *Bulletin of the Volga Region Institute of Administration*. 22 (1), 45-52.
33. Chupin, A.A. Background And the Beginning of the Spanish Civil War. The Birth of the Spanish Dictatorship // *The Newman In Foreign Policy*. 2016. №34 (78).
34. Cobb, P. Constructivism // *Encyclopedia of Psychology*. – W., D.C.: 2000. Vol. 3.
35. Corkill, D., Pina Almeida, J.C. Commemoration and Propaganda in Salazar's Portugal: The “Mundo Português” Exposition of 1940 // *Sage Publications, Ltd. Journal of Contemporary History*, Jul., 2009, Vol. 44, No. 3. pp. 381-399.
36. Danilov, S.Yu. The Juridical Aspects of Overcoming Legacy of Dictatorship: Italian Experience // *Law. Journal of the Higher School of Economics*. 2016. №3. p. 206–218.
37. Davis M. Is Spain Recovering Its Memory? Breaking the “Pacto del Olvido”// *The Johns Hopkins University Press. Human Rights Quarterly*, 2005. Vol. 27, No. 3. pp. 858-880.
38. Davletshina, D.G. Social memory as the basis of human morality: candidate of philosophy dissertation abstract. Ufa, 2006. — 18 s. P. 10.
39. Dorskaia, A.A., Dorskii, A. Yu. Memorial laws as a instrument for the legitimization of power // *Vestnik of Saint Petersburg University. Law* 1: 223–238. 2020.



40. Dorskaya, A.A., Pashentsev, D.A. The Official Remembrance Policy: A Comparative Analysis of the Legislation and Judicial Practice of Modern States // *Journal of Foreign Legislation and Comparative Law*. 2021, vol. 17, №6, pp. 5—15.
41. Dvornichenko, A.Yu., Ilyin, E.V., Bondarev, S.V., Petrov, I.V. Historical Memory, International Trialog and the Advancement to a Unified Perception of History // *Vestnik SPBU. History*. 2013. №2.
42. Fernández, F. The past underground. Contemporary Exhumations of the Civil War // *Barcelona*, 2014. 261-303.
43. Filatov, G.A. Evolution of Francisco Franco Image in Spain “No-Do” Cinema Newsreels // *Nauchnyi dialog*. 2015. – № 12 (48). pp. 363—373.
44. Glazov, A.A. Franco's Spain Social-Political Evolution As the Foundation of Spanish Transition to Democracy Between 1975 And 1982 // *RUDN Journal of World History*. 2014. №2.
45. Grantseva, E.O. Is an agreement possible? Historical memory of the events of the 20th century in the daily life and legislation of modern Spain // *Latin American Almanaque* №19. 2018.
46. Holtorf, C. Radical Constructivism. Knowledge Beyond Epistemology / translation Budenkova, V.E. // *Vestnik Tomskogo Gosudarstvennogo Universiteta*. 2009. №329.
47. Iman, I.E. Modern Approaches to the Analysis of the 20 Years of Fascism in Italy in the National Italian Studies // *Social and Humanitarian Sciences. Domestic and foreign literature. Ser. 5, History: Information and analytical journal*. 2021. №4.
48. João, M.I., White, L. Public Memory and Power in Portugal (1880-1960) // *Modern Humanities Research Association. Portuguese Studies*, 2002, Vol. 18. pp. 96-120.
49. Kapizin, V.M., Smirnova, A.M., Stoletov, O.V., Shcherba, K.D., Zvereva, V.S., Dzhanaeva, A.E., Deev, I.A., Kochetkov, D.A., Kalfaoglu Rabiya, Cherpakova, A.I. Proxy wars and the viability of states in the modern world // *Socio-humanitarian knowledge*. 2019. №4.
50. Kasianov, G. V. Historical policy and ‘memorial’ laws in Ukraine: the beginning of the XXI century // *Istoricheskaja ekspertiza* 2: 28–55. 2016.
51. Kazantsev, A.A. “Constructivist Revolution”, or on the Role of Cultural and Civilizational Factors in the Modern International Relations // *Political Science (RU)*. 2009. №4.
52. Khenkin, S.M. Democratic Transition in Light of Current Realities // *Spain in a Changing World. Reports of the Institute of Europe* № 339. Moscow, 2017.
53. Khenkin, S.M. Introduction: The Historical Significance of Spain's Transition To Democracy // *Contemporary Spain*. 2003. №2003.

54. Khenkin, S.M. Politico-Territorial Organization of Spain: Old Problems and New Challenges // *Politeia*. 2018. №4 (91).
55. Khenkin S.M. Spain and the EU // *Current Problems of Europe*. 2000. №3.
56. Khenkin, S.M. The Monarchy and the Transition to Democracy in Spain // *Outlines of global transformations: politics, economics, law*, 10 (6).
57. Kolodi, N.A. Maze of Memory – Places of Memory – The War of Memory: Experience of Interpretation // *Journal of Wellbeing Technologies*. 2013. №1 (7).
58. Kolomiez, V.K. Fascism in the Historical Memory of the Contemporary Epoch // *Bereginya 777*. Sova, 2014. №4 (23).
59. Kryukova, E.V. F. Franco. Prevarication (1943–1945). *Izv. Saratov Univ. (N. S.), Ser. History. International Relations*, 2018, vol. 18, iss. 1, pp. 90–95 (in Russian).
60. Kulikov, D.K. Constructivism and Cognitive Psychology: Analysis and Critique of Major Propositions // *IZVESTIYA SFedU. Engineering Sciences*. 2012. №10.
61. Kulikova, S.A., Kirnosov, I.D. Protection of Historical Memory as an Institution of Constitutional Law: Russian and Foreign Experience // *Izv. Sarat. Univ. Economics. Management. Law*, 2022, vol. 22, iss. 1.
62. Kurbanov, A.R. The Manifestation of Historical Memory in Political Practice // *Vestnik Moskovskogo universiteta. Seriya 18. Sotsiologiya i politologiya*. 2016. №1.
63. Malay, V.V. “Non-Intervention” to Spain as a European Policies Phenomenon of the Regional Conflict Settlement // *Belgorod State University Scientific Bulletin. Politology, Economy, Informatics*. 2010. № 19 (90). Issue 16.
64. Malysheva, E.M. Swedish “Neutrality” in the Second World War // *Vestnik of Saint-Petersburg University. History of Russia*. 2016. Series 2. Issue 2, pp. 4–17.
65. Marco J. Francoist Crimes // Sage Publications, Ltd. *Journal of Contemporary History*, 2017, Vol. 52, No. 1. pp. 157-163.
66. Matusевич, O.A. Historical Consciousness and Collective Memory as a Subject of Social and Humanitarian Cognition // *Works of BSTU. Series 6: History, philosophy*. 2011. No.5.
67. Matusевич, O.A. Memorial Legislation: Genesis and Contradictions // *Works of BSTU. Series 6: History, philosophy*. 2014. No.5 (169).
68. Medushevsky N.A., Memory Policy in the European Union as a Tool for the Implementation of the Integration Process // *Vlast'*. 2019. №3.
69. Moradiellos E. An uncomfortable specter of the past: Franco in the memory of the Spaniards // *Publicacions Universitat de Valencia. Pasajes*, 2003, No. 11. pp. 4-11.

70. Novell, P. Reviews of Francoism: Face-to-face Oblivion and the Presence of Oblivion // Revista Canadiense de Estudios Hispánicos. 2011, Vol. 36, No. 1, LA GUERRA CIVIL ESPAÑOLA: UN DOLOR QUE NO SE CALLA. pp. 101-113.
71. O'Donnell, T.J. Salazar and the New State of Portugal // Messenger Publications. Studies: An Irish Quarterly Review, 1936, Vol. 25, No. 97. pp. 131-144.
72. Onuf, Nicholas. World of Our Making // University of South Carolina Press, 1989.
73. Orlov, A.A. Spain in the Modern World: Problems Old and New // Spain in a Changing World. Reports of the Institute of Europe № 339. Moscow, 2017.
74. Palomanes Martinho F.C. Memory of Resistance and the Resistance of Memory: An Analysis of the Construction of Corporatism in the First Years of the Portuguese Estado Novo // Modern Humanities Research Association. Portuguese Studies, 2016, Vol. 32, No. 2. pp. 172-198.
75. Petrenko, V. Constructivism as a New Paradigm for the Human Sciences // Vestnik SPBU. Sociology. 2010. №2.
76. Petrenko, V. Constructivist Paradigm in Humanities // Development of Personality. 2012. №2.
77. Porshneva, O.S. The Study of the Politics of Memory: To Overcome the Methodological Dichotomy (On the Example of the First World War) // Scientific Journal "Discourse-P". 2020. 2(39).
78. Potseluyev, S.P. "Symbolic Politics": Towards the History of the Concept // Symbolic Politics. 2012. №1.
79. Rachipa, A.V., Burkov, V.V. Historical Memory and Some Problems of Studying the World War I // Actual problems of humanities and natural sciences. 2016. No.11-3.
80. Rockmore, T. Kant on Representationism and Constructivism // Epistemology & Philosophy of Science. 2005. №1.
81. Roewekamp, M. Spain, Europe, Memory and the Recuperation of the Past // Iberoamericana Editorial Vervuert. Iberoamericana (2001-), March 2013, No. 49. pp. 185-194.
82. Roige, J. Museology and Memory of the Past: the Musealization of the Spanish Civil War // VM. 2013. No. 1 (7).
83. Ruiz, J. Seventy Years on: Historians and Repression during and after the Spanish Civil War // Journal of Contemporary History, 2009, Vol. 44, No. 3. pp. 449-472.
84. Ryabov, D.O. Politics of Memory in the Formation of European Identity EU // PolitBook. 2016. №4.

85. Rychkov, V.A. Memory Policy Scenarios // Fundamental and applied sciences in the development of society and technology in the CIS countries: A collection of abstracts of the II International Conference / under the general editorship of M.S. Yanitsky and I.Y. Sergeeva; Kemerovo State University. - Kemerovo, 2020. - 86 p.
86. Sabancheev, R.Yu. Pierre Nora's concept of "sites of memory" as a method of historical reconstruction // Humanities Research in the Russian Far East. 2018. №1 (43).
87. Sanfey, M. On Salazar and Salazarism // Messenger Publications. Studies: An Irish Quarterly Review, Winter, 2003, Vol. 92, No. 368. pp. 405-411.
88. Screen, J.E.O. Mannerheim: The Finnish Years // Hurst. 2000.
89. Shmagin, D.V. The "Vichy Syndrome": The Political Problems of the Collaborationist Past Rethinking // RUDN Journal of Political Science. 2012. № 2.
90. Sidorov, A.V. Official Memory Politics in the USA and the European Union: Comparative Terminology Analysis // Education and Law. 2022. №3.
91. Simpson, J. Economic Development in Spain, 1850-1936 // Wiley on behalf of the Economic History Society. The Economic History Review, May, 1997, New Series, Vol. 50, No. 2. pp. 348-359.
92. Smirnova, T.A. Researching Features of Historical Memory and Practices of Commemoration of the First World War in Britain in 1918–1939 // Yaroslavl Pedagogical Bulletin. 2014. № 4 (1).
93. Tarutina, E.I. Social memory and "unconsciousness" // Vestnik of Amur State University. 2016. №74.
94. Ulanovsky, A.M. Constructivist paradigm in the humanities // Epistemology & Philosophy of Science. 2006. 10 (4).
95. Uziyomova, A.V., Chekmazov, A.I. The Comparative Analysis of the Public Attitude Towards Franco and Mannerheim in Spain and Finland. Public Relations as a Brand Awareness Booster: Proceedings of the Interuniversity Student Scientific-Practical Conference with International Participation. Moscow, RUDN University, 2020.
96. Vasilenko, Yu.V. Transformations of the Political Ideology of Francoism in Modern Spain // Antinomies. 2022. Iss. 22 (1).
97. Vernikov, V.L. The Political System is Changing Appearance // Spain in a Changing World. Reports of the Institute of Europe № 339. Moscow, 2017.
98. Vodenko, K.V., Chernykh, S.S. Historical Memory as a State Policy Tool in the Sphere of Higher Education: National Context and Regional Aspects // Bulletin Social-Economic and Humanitarian Research. 2022. № 13 (15).

## Publications in Electronic Media:

99. António de Oliveira Salazar [Electronic resource] // Encyclopedia Britannica. – 24.04.2022. – Mode of access: <https://www.britannica.com/biography/Antonio-de-Oliveira-Salazar> (accessed: 30.04.2022)
100. A Remembrance Parade in Lisbon - Lest we forget [Electronic resource] // The British Historical Society of Portugal. – Mode of access: <https://www.bhspportugal.org/news/a-remembrance-parade-in-lisbon-lest-we-forget> (accessed 12.04.2022).
101. A UN Committee urges Spain to approve the Democratic Memory Law [Electronic resource] // UN News. – 30.09.2021. – Mode of access: <https://news.un.org/es/story/2021/09/1497732> (accessed 30.10.2021).
102. Bombing of Guernica. To Reconciliation [Electronic resource] // Museo de la Paz de Guernica. – Mode of access: [https://www.museodelapaz.org/docu\\_bombardeo.php](https://www.museodelapaz.org/docu_bombardeo.php) (accessed 06.05.2022).
103. Casqueiro, J. The Democratic Memory Law Requires a Simple Majority To Be Approved // El País. – 19.11.2021. – Mode of access: <https://elpais.com/espana/2021-11-19/la-ley-de-memoria-requiere-solo-mas-sies-que-noes-para-salir-aprobada.html> (accessed: 20.02.2022).
104. Deaths in the First and Second World Wars [Electronic resource] // The National Archives. – Mode of access: <https://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/help-with-your-research/research-guides/deaths-first-and-second-world-wars/> (accessed 10.02.2022)
105. Estaire, O. The last Franco statue left in Spain was removed from the streets of Melilla // El País. – 23.02.2021. – Mode of access: <https://elpais.com/espana/2021-02-23/la-ultima-estatua-de-franco-es-retirada-de-las-calles-de-melilla.html> (accessed 20.03.2022).
106. Europe for Citizens (EFC) [Electronic resource] // European Commission. – Mode of access: [https://ec.europa.eu/info/departments/justice-and-consumers/justice-and-consumers-funding-tenders/funding-programmes/previous-programmes-2014-2020/europe-citizens-efc\\_en](https://ec.europa.eu/info/departments/justice-and-consumers/justice-and-consumers-funding-tenders/funding-programmes/previous-programmes-2014-2020/europe-citizens-efc_en) (accessed 22.02.2022).
107. Five leftist militants arrested for painting an equestrian statue of Franco red [Electronic resource] // El Mundo. - 19.05.2001. – Mode of access: <https://www.elmundo.es/elmundo/2001/05/19/madrid/990272276.html> (accessed 14.12.2021).

108. Franco's exhumation: Bringing an end to a symbol of the Spanish dictatorship [Electronic resource] // El País. – 24.10.2019. – Mode of access: [https://english.elpais.com/elpais/2019/10/24/inenglish/1571900395\\_914719.html](https://english.elpais.com/elpais/2019/10/24/inenglish/1571900395_914719.html) (accessed 10.12.2021).
109. Fundación Museo de la Paz de Gernika [Electronic resource] // European Observatory on Memories. – Mode of access: <https://europeanmemories.net/partners/fundacion-museo-de-la-paz-de-gernika/> (accessed 23.01.2022).
110. González, M. The transfer of Franco's remains from the Valley of the Fallen costed 126,000 euros [Electronic resource] // El País. – 12.03.2020. – Mode of access: <https://elpais.com/espana/2020-03-11/el-traslado-de-los-restos-de-franco-del-valle-de-los-caidos-coste-126000-euros.html> (accessed 14.12.2021).
111. International Holocaust Remembrance Day in Norway [Electronic resource] // International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance. – 23.01.2020. – Mode of access: <https://www.holocaustremembrance.com/news-archive/international-holocaust-remembrance-day-norway>
112. Junquera N. Grants For Historical Memory Return To The BOE Nine Years Later [Electronic resource] // El País. – 29.07.2020. – Mode of access: <https://elpais.com/espana/2020-07-29/las-subsuenciones-para-la-memoria-historica-vuelven-al-boe-nueve-anos-despues.html> (accessed 22.03.2022).
113. Junquera, N. The Association for the Recovery of Historical Memory Acquires the Domain Franco.es [Electronic resource] // El País. – 24.06.2019. – Mode of access: [https://elpais.com/politica/2019/06/24/actualidad/1561367051\\_204544.html](https://elpais.com/politica/2019/06/24/actualidad/1561367051_204544.html) (accessed 15.10.2021).
114. Junquera, N. The Government Tries to Shield the Extinction of the Francisco Franco Foundation in the New Democratic Memory Law [Electronic resource] // El País. – 09.07.2021. – Mode of access: <https://elpais.com/espana/2021-07-09/el-gobierno-trata-de-blindar-la-extincion-de-la-fundacion-francisco-franco-en-la-nueva-ley-de-memoria-democratica.html> (accessed 23.02.2022).
115. Junquera N. The Promise That Rajoy Did Fulfill [Electronic resource] // El País. – 05.10.2013. – Mode of access: [https://elpais.com/politica/2013/10/05/actualidad/1380997260\\_542677.html](https://elpais.com/politica/2013/10/05/actualidad/1380997260_542677.html) (accessed 20.03.2022)
116. More than 9,000 bodies of victims of Franco's regime have been recovered in 20 years of exhumations [Electronic resource] // Público. – 18.10.2020. – Mode of access:

- <https://www.publico.es/politica/9000-cuerpos-victimas-franquismo-han-sido-recuperados-20-anos-exhumaciones.html> (accessed 13.11.2021).
117. Remembrance [Electronic resource] // Council of Europe. – Mode of access: <https://www.coe.int/en/web/compass/remembrance> (accessed 12.03.2022).
  118. Resolution of 26 June 1946. S/RES/10(1946) [Electronic resource] // The UN Security Council. – 26.06.1946. – Mode of access: <https://documents-dds-ny.un.org/doc/RESOLUTION/GEN/NR0/036/73/PDF/NR003673.pdf?OpenElement> (accessed 13.02.2022).
  119. Rethinking Guernica [Electronic resource] // National Museum Reina Sofia. – Mode of access: <https://guernica.museoreinasofia.es/en#bombardeo> (accessed 22.01.2022).
  120. Spanish Civil War [Electronic resource] // Britannica. – 10.07.2021. – Mode of access: <https://www.britannica.com/event/Spanish-Civil-War> (accessed 10.01.2022).
  121. UN Committee on Enforced Disappearances issues findings on Brazil, Panama, France and Spain [Electronic resource] // United Nations. – 30.09.2021. – Mode of access: <https://www.ohchr.org/en/press-releases/2021/09/un-committee-enforced-disappearances-issues-findings-brazil-panama-france> (accessed 01.11.2021).
  122. U.S. Overseas Loans and Grants [Electronic resource] // The U.S. Agency for International Development report. – 2019. – Mode of access: [https://pdf.usaid.gov/pdf\\_docs/PBAAJ833.pdf](https://pdf.usaid.gov/pdf_docs/PBAAJ833.pdf) (accessed: 12.01.2022).