# САНКТ-ПЕТЕРБУРГСКИЙ ГОСУДАРСТВЕННЫЙ УНИВЕРСИТЕТ

### Мауытхан Айсулу Мараткызы

## Выпускная квалификационная работа

# Kazakhstan's Post-Crimea Foreign Policy towards "Great Powers": Approaches and Specifics

# Пост-Крымская внешняя политика Казахстана в отношении «Великих держав»: подходы и особенности

Уровень образования: магистратура

Направление 41.03.05 - «Международные отношения»

Основная образовательная программа *ВМ.5569 «Международные отношения* (на английском языке)»

Научный руководитель: профессор кафедры международных отношений на постсоветском пространстве, доктор исторических наук Мещеряков Константин Евгеньевич

Рецензент: кандидат политических наук, начальник Отдела технологического и промышленного форсайта Центра компьютерного инжиниринга Санкт-Петербургского политехнического университета Петра Великого

Рябов Юрий Александрович

Санкт-Петербург 2020

#### Abstract

The work provides a look at Kazakhstan's foreign policy development during 2014-2019 approved by the fourth Foreign Policy Concept, and how the country has been managing its pragmatic "balance of power" policy following the Ukrainian Crisis. The Master's thesis focuses on approaches of relations between Kazakhstan and three "great powers": Russia, China, and the United States. The continued tense situation in Russian-Ukrainian-Western and American-Chinese relationships is one of the central cases in current international relations. It makes studying topic especially significant. The thesis examines and describes different spheres of cooperation and selected integration projects engaging the actors.

**Keywords:** Kazakhstan's Foreign Policy in the 2010s, Kazakhstan's Multi-Vector Diplomacy, Kazakhstani-Russian Alliance, Kazakhstan – US Relations, Kazakhstan – China Cooperation.

#### Аннотация

Данная диссертация посвящена внешней политике Казахстана на 2014-2019 гг., утвержденный четвертой государственной Концепцией страны. Магистерская диссертация рассматривает подходы и особенности отношения Казахстана к трем сверхдержавам: Россия, Китай и США. Сохраняющаяся напряженность в российско-украинско-западных и американо-китайских отношениях являются одним из актуальных вопросов на повестке дня современного международного отношения. Это делает изучение темы особенно актуальным. В диссертации рассматриваются подходы управления Казахстаном прагматичной внешней политики «баланса сил» после украинского кризиса. В этих целях были изучены и описаны различные уровни сотрудничества в политической, торгово-экономической, военно-безопасной и гуманитарной сферах.

**Ключевые слова:** Внешняя политика Казахстана в 2010-е годы, многовекторная дипломатия Казахстана, казахстано-российские отношения, казахстанско-американские отношения, казахстано-китайские отношения.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of abbreviations
INTRODUCTION5
CHAPTER I. Post-2014 Assessment of Trade and Economic Strategic Cooperation of
Kazakhstan with Great Powers
1.1. Brief Trade and Economic Statistics Summary of 2014-2019
1.2. Key Trade and Economic Dimensions of Contemporary Cooperation24
1.3. Energy Resources Remain a Key Sector of Bilateral Dialogue32
1.4. Regions as an important element of deepening trade and economic cooperation40
CHAPTER II. Military and Security Cooperation, and How "Peace-Loving" Policy Works in
Outer Space Uses
2.1. Post-2014 Aspects of Kazakhstan's National Security in Foreign Policy
2.2. Defense Equipment & Military Training Arm Wrestling
2.3. Experience of Contemporary Peacful Uses of Outer Space
CHAPTER III. Educational, Scientific and Cultural triad in Kazakhstan's Foreign Policy
3.1. Dialogue between Kazakhstan and Great Powers in Education and Science71
3.2. Beginning of the Dialogue in High-Technology78
3.3. Intercultural Dialogue with Great Powers
Conclusion90
References93
Primary source
Secondary source
Appendix

### **List of Abbreviations**

CA – Central Asia

CICA - Conference on Interaction and Confidence-Building Measures in Asia

CIS – Commonwealth of the Independent States

DIF – Direct Investment Flow

EAEU\EEU – Eurasian Economic Union

ENU – Eurasian National University

EU – European Union

IR – International Relations

K – thousand

KazNU - Kazakh National University

MFA – Ministry of Foreign Affairs

MON - Ministry of Education and Science

NATO – North Atlantic Treaty Organization

OBOR - One Belt One Road

OECD – Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development

OSCE - Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe

PRC (KNR) – People's Republic of China

RF – Russian Federation

RK – Republic of Kazakhstan

STEM – Science, Technology, Engineering and Math

UN – United Nations

UNESCO – United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

US/ USA - United States of America

USAID – United States Agency for International Development

USGS - United States Geological Survey

USSR – Union of Soviet Socialist Republics

XUAR – Xinjiang Uyghur Autonomous Region

WTO – World Trade Organization

#### Introduction

In the early 1990s, as a result of largest geopolitical shift, newly created post-Soviet countries had an opportunity to build a state from the very beginning. At the same time, there was a challenge to quickly adapt to the new environment and develop new approaches in foreign and domestic policy.

The first President-Elbasy of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Kazakhstan) Nursultan Nazarbayev outlined that challengeable period for a young country in his memoir, "... we had no traditions of foreign policy. Imagine a country that faces all these sophisticated problems, and there is not a single diplomatic mission abroad, even elementary foreign affairs strategy plans, not to mention foreign policy traditions. The situation we found ourselves in was as absurd as much distressing".<sup>1</sup>

But, three decades later, Kazakhstan became the most successful among the post-Soviet countries in developing its foreign policy providing regional security, stability and strengthens its sovereignty. The country has always tried to adhere to a multi-vector policy. Full membership in international structures such as the UN, OSCE, CIS, SCO, CICA, CSTO, WTO; involvement in integration processes such as the EEU, OBOR, C5+1 show that the state had caught the challenges of the surrounding international system in time and adequately responds to them. In this vein, Kazakhstan develops multilateral diplomacy with all countries – Russia, China, the United States, EU, CA, Muslim countries and Turkic-speaking world as well. The position is explained, except for the process of globalization and regionalization occurring in world politics and economy, by country's geopolitical position, economic potential, socio-demographic and many other factors.

According to official documents and scientific papers, the foreign policy evolution of Kazakhstan can be characterized in four long-term stages. The first attempts to understand and develop foreign policy levers were made in 1992.<sup>2</sup> The second stage began with the approval of the Foreign Policy Concept of Kazakhstan in 1995, where the multi-vector policy's roots grew from. In 2001, there was approved the third Foreign Policy Concept "economy first, then politics".<sup>3</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Nazarbayev N. A. Gasyrlar togysynda [The Critical Decade]. Almaty, Atamura, 2003. p. 256

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Qazaqastannyń egemen memleket retinde qalyptasý jane damý strateguasy [Strategy of Formation and Development of Kazakhstan as a Sovereign State]. Jul. 15, 1992. URL: <a href="https://online.zakon.kz/Document/?doc\_id=30006969">https://online.zakon.kz/Document/?doc\_id=30006969</a> (Accessed: 19 November 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Tokayev T. K.-J. Strategiya Respubliki Kazakhstan v otnoshenii Zapada: natsionalnye interesy, prioritety, napravleniya [Strategy of the Republic of Kazakhstan to the West: national interests, priorities, approaches]. Ph.D. thesis: 23.00.04. Diplomatic Academy of MFA of the Russian Federation, Moscow, 2009, p. 216.

The next Foreign Policy Concept had been developed in 2014 based on the Strategy directions: Kazakhstan-2050.<sup>4</sup>

The distinctive feature of the Concept 2014-2020 was not only the increased role of Kazakhstan in the international arena. The concept of multi-vector diplomacy had been faced a serious challenge for strength coming alongside with Russian-Western conflict on Crimea. And the research work focuses on this particular period of Kazakhstan's foreign policy in concerning its three main strategic directions: relationships with Russia, China, and the US

The relevance. Kazakhstan's current role as a key regional player undeniable. Being located at the junction of East and West and acting as a mediator of negotiations in case of international disputes, Kazakhstan demonstrates its crucial importance in CA. The country's chairmanship in major structures such as CSTO, SCO, OSCE, and UN Security Council exemplifies its elevated international status achieved in the last 30 years.

Kazakhstan has been attracting various external actors` attention since independence, especially the powers. Both Kazakhstan and great powers have broad political, trade and economic, socio-cultural, and military-technical intersect interests in each other. On the one hand, stable partnership with Kazakhstan in various dimensions allows great powers to maintain their continued presence in CA and have leverage. On the other hand, for the balance of power and avoiding one-sided dominance, it is important to have a broad presence of several equal leaders in the region for Kazakhstan itself. But, the events of 2014 – integration of Crimea radically changed the situation. After 2014, existing contradictions between the powers became more visible, and, in case of Kazakhstan, it put on risk its "balance of power" foreign policy. Russophobia after the Ukrainian maidan and accession to the EEU, anti-Chinese sentiment after the Land Code conflict threw oil on the fire. The Kazakh mass media's discussion on the post-Crimean sanctions consequences and the possibility for a similar situation in the North/East of Kazakhstan inflamed the situation inside the country. Despite the large Russian diaspora in the country and ethnic Kazakh residents in Russia and China, pro-Western ideology widely spread among political and social activists. In other words, in the backyard of sanctions, trade war, and conflicting approaches

\_

http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/Z1500000389/info (Accessed: 24 November 2019)

[Bulletin of the Parliament of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2015, No. 21-I, art. 126]. URL:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Qazaqstan Respýblikasy syrtqy saiasatynyń 2014–2020 jyldarga arnalgan tujyrymdamasy: Qazaqstan Respýblikasy Prezidentiniń 2014 jylgy 21 qańtardagy Jarlygy [Foreign Policy Concept for 2014–2020 Republic of Kazakhstan approved by the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan of January 21, 2014]. Yegemen Qazaqstan, Jan. 30, 2014, № 20 (28244). URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/U1400000741/info">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/U1400000741/info</a> (Accessed: 28 August 2019) <sup>5</sup> Jer Kodeksine ózgerister men tolyqtyrýlar engizý týraly: Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyň 2015 jylgy 2 qarashadagy Zańy [Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On the amendments and additions to the Land Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan" of November 2, 2015]. Qazaqstan Respýblikasy Parlamentiniń Jarshysy. 2015 j., № 21-I, 126-qujat

inside the country, it was a challenge for Kazakhstan to conduct multi-vector diplomacy. Since these three powers are the main priorities of the country on the foreign policy Concept. Indeed, Kazakhstan has historically rooted ties with Russia and China sharing common borders. The USA as a global hegemon remains a weighty partner as well. The countries` accumulated huge baggage of bilateral cooperation experience cannot be ignored.

And the six-year marathon completion of another foreign policy Concept, N. Nazarbayev's retirement as President obviously is "the end of the beginning", which requires summarizing. It makes the research work even more relevant.

The above circumstances highlight the scientific-practical relevance of the analysis of how Kazakhstan's relations with Russia, China, and the US were developed during 2014-2019.

Literature and the degree of research development of the topic. Foreign policy of Kazakhstan and its relations with Russia, the USA, and China are studied quite extensively, and serve as a title of many domestic and foreign authors' scientific articles. There are scientific researches that make a significant contribution to study Kazakhstan's foreign policy evolution and Kazakhstan-Russian, -American, -Chinese relations individually during 1991-2014. But, all available scientific works to date characteristically cover the early periods of independence and early Crimean conflict's period. Neither domestic nor foreign study has conducted comprehensive research that thoroughly and objectively investigate the features of Kazakhstan's foreign policy, and comparatively analyze its cooperation with great powers after Crimea.

There are scientific works that served as the basis for the thesis. Remarkably, Kazakhstani and Russian authors enriched the development of the subject.

The following publications of *Kazakhstani experts* generate interest.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Tokayev K.-J. Vneshnyaya politika Respubliki Kazakhstan v period stanovleniya novogo mirovogo poryadka [Foreign policy of the Republic of Kazakhstan during the formation of the new world order]. Diplomatic Academy of the MFA of Russia Federation, Moscow, 2001, p. 263;

Passolt D. Kazakhstan's Foreign Policy Towards Russia, China and Central Asia (1991–2001): International and Domestic Factors. London School of Economics and Political Science (University of London), 2007, p. 622;

Tokayev T. K.-J. Strategiya Respubliki Kazakhstan v otnoshenii Zapada: nacionalnye interesy, prioritety, napravleniya [Strategy of the Republic of Kazakhstan to the West: national interests, priorities, approaches]. Diplomatic Academy of MFA of the Russian Federation. Moscow, 2009, p. 216;

Meshcheryakov K.Y. Stanovleniye strategicheskogo partnerstva i soyuznichestva v rossiysko-kazakhstanskikh otnosheniyakh v 1991-1999 [Establishment of strategic and allied Russian-Kazakhstani relations in 1991-1999]. Scientific and technical bulletin of SPbSTU, 2012, pp. 143-151;

Rossiysko-kazakhskiye otnosheniya v 1998–2009: tesnoye soyuznicheskoye vzaimodeystviye [Russian-Kazakhstani relations in 1998-2009: allied cooperation]. Klio (scholarly journal), 2014, №5 (89). pp. 133-139;

Evolyutsiya vneshney politiki Rossiyskoy Federatsii v Tsentralnoy Azii v 1991-2012 [Evolution of the Russian Federation's foreign policy in Central Asia in 1991-2012]. Thesis...Ph.D. of Historical Sciences, St.Petersburg, 2014, p. 709;

Alipbaev A.R., Bozheyeva B.Z. Qazaqstan Respýblikasy syrtqy sayasatynyń hronologiasy (1991-2014) [Foreign policy chronology of the Republic of Kazakhstan (1991-2014)]. KazNU, Almaty, 2016. p. 300

*Dr. F. Kukeyeva* with leading Kazakhstani experts in political science and international relations deeply analyze dynamics of the balance of power in the modern geopolitical environment of Kazakhstan, its milti-vector policy towards great powers. *F. Kukeyeva and G. Raimova* thoroughly studied the latest foreign policy concept of Kazakhstan, and separately Kazakhstan-American relations. The authors concluded that modern bilateral relations should look for new forms of interaction. The authors cited the example of the views of American experts questioned the ability of Kazakhstan to maintain balance in the region between the three major powers by the events in Ukraine, and the weakened U.S. interest in CA countries. About this, the authors admit the idea of reducing the US. presence in some countries of the region, but regarding Kazakhstan, they do not see any reason for concern.<sup>7</sup>

F. Kukeyeva and D. Dyussebayev examines the prospects and risks of Kazakh-Chinese regional integration. The authors conduct a broad review of the position of Kazakh experts on modern Kazakhstan-Chinese relations, dividing them into two fronts. Those who support the integration of Kazakhstan's Nurly Zhol with OBOR, and those who warn about possible risks. The review covers literature from 2014-2018. According to the authors, the advantages of actively developing Kazakhstan-Chinese relations will mainly affect trade and economy, science and technology.<sup>8</sup>

A. Kuzembayeva analyzes different issues of Kazakhstan-American interaction: energy, regional security, and military cooperation. The author positively considers bilateral relations, sometimes pointing out the possible risks associated with Kazakhstan's accession to the EEU and the WTO.<sup>9</sup>

Authors who investigate the contemporary Sino-Kazakhstan Cooperation under promotion of the Belt and Road Initiative is *N. Mukhametkanuly* and Director of Chinese Research Center *A. Kaukenov. N. Mukhametkanuly* conducts an overview of exicting joint industry projects within the trade and economic cooperation during 2014-2018. <sup>10</sup> *A. Kaukenov* explains trade and economic relations headed by the transit of energy resources and problems of cross-border rivers. In addition, the author noted an interesting trend after Russian-Western friction: China began more actively promote cooperation of OBOR with the EEU. To the author, before the conflict in Ukraine and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Kukeyeva F., Raimova G. Foreign Policy Concept of the Republic of Kazakhstan: Cooperation with the U.S. KazNU Bulletin, International relations and international law series, 2014, №2(66). pp. 28-33

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Dyussebayev D., Kukeyeva F. Belt and road initiative for Kazakhstan: Opportunities and risks. Silk Road to Belt Road: reinventing the past and shaping the future, Springer Singapore, 2018. pp. 296-305

 $<sup>^9</sup>$  Kuzembayeva A. B. Specific issues in Kazakhstan – U.S. relations at the present stage. KazNU Bulletin, 2015, N01(69). pp. 151-155

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Mukhametkhanuly N. China's Concept of "Win-Win Cooperation" find the New Stage of Cooperation between China and Kazakhstan, China, 2018. pp. 512-521

the sanctions standoff, Chinese press was quite critical of the EEU prospects and pointed out the damage caused by customs barriers.<sup>11</sup>

*K. Syroezhkin* is an outstanding Kazakh-Chinese specialist who collected the archival documents during 1991-2010: bilateral agreements, protocols including all possible branches of cooperation. The book helped create a clearer picture of Kazakhstan-Chinese relations from the very beginning. K. Syroezhkin gave an analysis of the current relations at an early stage of cooperation, when the initiatives of the two countries start to go hand in hand. Later, the author provides a full analysis of Kazakhstan-Chinese relations since 2014: realities, results, risks, and problems. Another Kazakh-Sino specialist studying Nur-Sultan-Beijing's cooperation is political scientist *G. Ageleuov*. The author studies prospects of interaction between the countries not excluding drawbacks.

*M. Shibutov* is predominantly focused on Kazakhstani-Russian relations. Political expert analyzed trade-economic, interregional, military-technical cooperation between Kazakhstan and Russia. <sup>14</sup> The author alongside experts of political science *Z. Karazhanov, D. Satpayev, M. Taizhan, A. Sarym, D. Kosnazarov, L. Karatayeva* actively and comprehensively provide analytical forecasts on the domestic and foreign policy as well. Scientific analysis of the experts are usually published in "Egemen Kazakhstan", "Kazakhstanskaya pravda" newspapers, "Azattyq", "Tengri News" news website, "Sayasat", "Central Asia Monitor", "Forbes Kazakhstan" internet-portals in Kazakh, Russian and English languages.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Kaukenov A. Vzaimootnosheniya Kitaya i Kazakhstana v novykh geopoliticheskikh usloviyakh. [Relations between China and Kazakhstan in new geopolitical conditions]. Central Asian Bureau for Analytical Reporting, February 18, 2015 URL: https://cabar.asia/ru/adil-kaukenov-vzaimootnosheniya-kitaya-i-kazakhstana-v-novykhgeopoliticheskikh-usloviyakh/ (Accessed: 15 August 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Syroezhkin K. Kazakhstan-Kitay: ot prigranichnoy torgovli k strategicheskomu partnerstvu [Kazakhstan-China: from cross-border trade to strategic partnership]. Almaty, KazISS, Monography in 3 books. – Book 3. Collection of documents. 2010. p. 524;

Kazakhstan i Kitay: analiz poslednikh dogovorennostey [Kazakhstan and China: analysis of recent agreements]. November 4, 2016. URL: <a href="http://www.ca-portal.ru/article:30965">http://www.ca-portal.ru/article:30965</a> (Accessed: 18 December 2019);

Problems of Modern Kazakh-Chinese Relations. Russia and New States of Eurasia, 2019, No I (XLII). pp. 21-36

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Ageleuov G. Kitay-Kazakhstan: Perspektivy vzaimodeystviya [China-Kazakhstan: Prospects for cooperation]. News Agency "Fergana", May 25, 2017. URL: <a href="https://www.fergananews.com/articles/9422">https://www.fergananews.com/articles/9422</a> (Accessed: 11 October 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Shibutov M. Provokatsiya o kazakhstanskikh i kirgizstanskikh mirotvortsakh v Sirii: dlya chego? [Provocation on Kazakhstan and the Kyrgyz peacekeepers in Syria: why?]. Information agency "Regnum", June 26, 2017. URL: <a href="https://regnum.ru/news/polit/2292829.html?utm\_medium=source&utm\_source=rnews">https://regnum.ru/news/polit/2292829.html?utm\_medium=source&utm\_source=rnews</a> (Accessed: 3 March 2020); Uranovaya zavisimost KNR ot Kazakhstana: zachem Kitayu stolko urana? [China's uranium dependence on Kazakhstan: why does China need so much uranium?] Information agency "Regnum", August 11, 2017. URL: <a href="https://regnum.ru/news/2309464.html">https://regnum.ru/news/2309464.html</a> (Accessed: 15 December 2019);

Eksport Kazakhstana: obzor dinamiki [Export of Kazakhstan: overview of dynamics]. Information agency "Regnum", August 27, 2019. URL: https://regnum.ru/news/2700790.html (Accessed: 11 October 2019)

In addition, there are articles of domestic authors that consider particular issues of foreign policy. For instance, transport and logistics sphere, <sup>15</sup> industrial and innovative development, <sup>16</sup> interregional partnership. <sup>17</sup> These analyses were conducted in the relevant period for our research.

**Russian experts** make a significant contribution to Kazakhstan's foreign policy studying during the relevant period as well.

Professor *K. E. Meshcheryakov* examines Russian-Kazakhstani relations during the Ukrainian crisis.<sup>18</sup> After the Crimean events, *K. E. Meshcheryakov* with *I. N. Novikova, V. G. Burkov* study Russia's policy in the post-Soviet space.<sup>19</sup> The authors conducted large-scale analysis ivolving political, security, military, interregional aspects of cooperation.

*E. P. Ionova* studies Kazakhstan in the context of Ukrainian crisis, and separately examines economic situation, main trends in the country's foreign and domestic political development after 2014. The expert explained the situation that it was not easy for Kazakhstan to take a clear position since its multi-vector foreign policy promote close economic ties with both Russia and West.<sup>20</sup>

*E. F. Troitskiy*'s scientific papers cover both the early 90's and the post-Crimean period. The author provides an overview of more general topics, in which Kazakhstan is considered in the context of Russian-American policies in CA. At the same time, there are individual tasks as factors that influenced Kazakhstan's foreign policy, the content of "multi-vector and balanced" doctrine, Kazakhstan-American relations.<sup>21</sup>

D. B. Malysheva studies Kazakhstan-Chinese relations, Chinese factor in Kazakhstan, and the problems of modern cooperation focusing on post-2014. The analysis of scientific articles

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Suleimenova G. S. Kazakhstan-China transit. 2018. pp.77-80 URL: <a href="http://elib.bsu.by/bitstream/123456789/195606/1/%D0%A1%D1%83%D0%BB%D0%B5%D0%B9%D0%BC%D0%B5%D0%BD%D0%BE%D0%B2%D0%B0 %D0%9A%D0%90%D0%97%D0%90%D0%A5%D0%A1%D0%A2%D0%90%D0%9D-%D0%9A%D0%98%D0%A2%D0%90%D0%99-%D0%A2%D0%A0%D0%90%D0%9D%D0%9D%D0%97%D0%98%D0%A2.pdf</a> (Accessed: 18 December 2019);

Aliyev N. U.S.-Kazakhstan Transit Agreement Faces Challenges from Russia. The Central Asia-Caucasus Analyst, September 20, 2018. URL: <a href="https://www.cacianalyst.org/publications/analytical-articles/item/13534-us-kazakhstan-transit-agreement-faces-challenges-from-russia.html">https://www.cacianalyst.org/publications/analytical-articles/item/13534-us-kazakhstan-transit-agreement-faces-challenges-from-russia.html</a> (Accessed: 18 December 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Rakhmanova G. B. Project "Western Europe and Western China" in the industrial development of Kazakhstan. Bulletin KazUIR&WL "International relations and Regional studies", 2013, №1-2 (11-12). pp. 113-120

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Yergaliyeva K., Zhanbulatova R. Kazakhstan-Russia cross-border cooperation in the context of the common economic space. Bulletin D'Eurotalent-fidjip, 2019, №3. pp.13-21

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Meshcheryakov K. Y. The Russian-Kazakh relations during the "Ukrainian crisis", Klio, 2016, №5. pp. 118-134

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Burkov V. G., Meshcheryakov K. Y., Novikova I. N. Policy of Russia in the former Soviet Union after return of the Crimea: challenges and priorities. Journal "Administrative Consulting", 2015, №11. pp. 71-79

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Ionova E. Kazakhstan and the Ukrainian crisis. Russia and New States of Eurasia, 2014, No 2. pp. 43-53

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Troitskiy E. F. Kazakhstansko-amerikanskiye otnosheniya i "dilemma mnogovektornosti" [Kazakh-American relations and the "multi-vector dilemma"]. Center for Eurasian Studies at TSU, 2018, Expert comment No.1. Pp. 1-4

demonstrates, there is certain commonalities of the expert's opinion with Kazakh experts such as G. Ageleuov, F. Kukeyev, and D. Dyusebayeva. <sup>22</sup>

Head of the Center for research on the neighboring countries problems of RISS, Dr. of historical science *O. V. Petrovskaya* with a group made a report on the consequences of the integration of Crimea for post-Soviet countries` military-technical realm. The experts were focused on countries` cooperation with the U.S., and NATO`s role, activities during 2014-2018. The scientific report applies events that are more distant in security and military relations as well, and each post-Soviet country is considered separately, including Kazakhstan.<sup>23</sup>

A. Zelenina<sup>24</sup> and A. Harlanov<sup>25</sup> focused on more narrow issues as Kazakhstan's role in New Silk Road, cooperation with the powers in transportation and logistics, and Kazakhstan-Russian cooperation in space.

To complete a picture of Kazakhstan's multi-vector activities with superpowers since 2014, analytical assessments of Russian scientists *D. Zhuravlev*, *A. Grozin*, *L. Gusev*, *A. Kazantsev*, *A. Dubnov*, *A. Kostin*, *V. Kashin* are a valuable source.

To avoid one-sided research, the author reviewed databases of Western and Chinese scientific papers in Russian and English.

There are reports and research papers prepared by *Chinese expert*s as Li Xin and Tian E. *Li Xin* studies Kazakhstan-Russian relations within the regional economic integrations, <sup>26</sup> while *Tian E* focused on cultural-humanitarian aspects. <sup>27</sup>

There are *American experts* whose work the author found informative and explanatory.

Research paper of *S. R. Roberts* is of an informative nature as well as providing the assessment of the country's multi-vector policy, bilateral or trilateral relations with the U.S., Russia,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Malysheva D. B. Post-Soviet states of Central Asia in China's policies. Mirovaya ekonomika i mezhdunarodnye otnosheniya, 2019, vol. 63, No. 5. pp. 101-108

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Aleksandrova D. A., Andreeva E. S., Yermakova S. M., Ivanova V. A., Ippolitova I. V., Makarevskiy M. N., Nemenskyi O. B., Popova D. S., Petrovskyi O. V., Tacica K. I., Shevchenko A. M., NATO v politike postsovetskikh gosudarstv posle vossoyedineniya Kryma s Rossiyey [NATO in the politics of post-Soviet States after the reunification of Crimea with Russia]. Moscow, Russian Institute for Strategic Studies (RISS), Center for CIS countries studies, 2018. p. 90

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Zelenina A. Bitva za Shelkovyy put: Kazakhstan pereformatiruyet kartu logistiki Yevrazii [Battle for the silk road: Kazakhstan reformats the logistics map of Eurasia]. Information agency "Regnum", November 7, 2015. URL: <a href="https://regnum.ru/news/2006996.html">https://regnum.ru/news/2006996.html</a> (Accessed: 15 December 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Harlanov A. S. Cooperation of Russia and Kazakhstan in the space and high technologies. "Economics. Management. Law" Series, 2019, No. 2. pp. 59-68

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Li Xin. Chinese perspective on the creation of a Eurasian Economic space. Valdai Discussion Club Report. Moscow, 2016. p. 22

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Tian E. Vzaimootnosheniya Kitayskoy Narodnoy Respubliki i Respubliki Kazakhstan na primere sotrudnichestva v sfere obrazovaniya [Relations between China and Kazakhstan on the example of cooperation in education]. 2018 − №4. pp. 8-17. URL: <a href="https://nbpublish.com/library\_read\_article.php?id=27722">https://nbpublish.com/library\_read\_article.php?id=27722</a> (Accessed: 2 April 2020)

and China during and after the Crimean events. Professor describes the Ukrainian conflict as the first serious challenge to Astana's long-standing and successful multi-vector policy <sup>28</sup>

S. Engels studies Kazakhstan-American relations in the security and military professionalization during 2014-2016 characterizing this cooperation one of the excellent examples of effective one and a way to further bilateral strategic relations` development. In this case, the author opinion has converging views with its Russian colleagues from RISS.<sup>29</sup>

*R. Isaacs* conducted a review of Kazakhstan foreign policy on the background of transit of power, and Kazakhstan-Russian relations both in the last years of N. Nazarbayev`s presidency and the current President Tokayev.<sup>30</sup>

There are couple of *joint research works* of Kazakh-American experts. *Zh. Baizakova and R. McDermott* examine Kazakhstan's perception of the Ukraine crisis, and the possibilities of being exposed to such intervention by Russia. There were also demonstrated analyses of Russian minority in Kazakhstan, the country's foreign policy, joining the EEU, importance of security strategy, and cooperation with the U.S., Russia.<sup>31</sup>

American experts S. F. Starr, S. E. Cornell, S. E. Wimbush, specializing in the regions of CA and the Caucasus, with F. Kukeyeva, A. Nursha, and B. Sultanov worked on Kazakhstan-American relations after 2014. The research is on the prospects for bilateral relations in sociocultural contacts in human rights, rule of law, democracy, economy, defense, and security.<sup>32</sup>

There is also British expert H. Barnes, whose analytical paper intently examines the uranium industry. The author describes Kazakhstan's relations with Russia, the United States and China with a focus on 2015-2017 events. For instance, Kazatomprom's distancing from Rosatom, a strategic leap towards China, and the construction of a low-enriched uranium storage facility with American assistance.<sup>33</sup>

<sup>29</sup> Engels S. Military Professionalization Programs in Kazakhstan and the U.S.: How to Implement and What Will We Gain? Connections: The Quarterly Journal, 2017, No. 2. pp. 91-104

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Robert S. R. The Ukraine Conflict and the Future of Kazakhstan's Multi-Vector Foreign Policy. PONARS Eurasia Policy Memo, 2015, No. 388. pp. 1-6

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Lillis J. Lillis J. Kazakhstan: Po lezviyu britvy mezhdu Rossiyey i Zapadom (interview with R. Isaacs); Isaacs R. Russia–Kazakhstan Relations and the Tokayev-Nazarbayev Tandem. Russian Analytical Digest, March 6, 2020, No 248. pp. 2-12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Baizakova Zh., McDermott R. Threat Perception in Central Asia in Response to Russia–Ukraine: Kazakhstan Will Not Be Next. NATO Defense College`s Research Paper, 2015, №119. pp. 1-16

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Cornell S.E., Kukeyeva F., Nursha A. Starr S.F., Sultanov B., Wimbush S.E. Looking Forward: Kazakhstan and the U.S. Singapore, Central Asia-Caucasus Institute & Silk Road Studies Program, 2014. p. 54

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Barnes H. Uranovaya igra Kazakhstana: mezhdu Rossiyey, Kitayem i Zapadom [Uranian game of Kazakhstan: between Russia, Chuins and West]. BBC Russian service, December 18, 2017. URL: <a href="https://www.bbc.com/russian/features-42315870">https://www.bbc.com/russian/features-42315870</a> (Accessed: 3 January 2020)

To sum up, there is a common trend in case of Kazakhstani, Russian, and American experts. The authors generate all aspects of Kazakhstan's foreign policy. These are comparative analysis with other powers, advantages, disadvantages, possible threats in cooperation, etc. Meanwhile, Chinese experts' scientific reports for this period is limited by purely Kazakhstan-Chinese relations within the regional initiatives. The most large-scale among them is considered only cooperation within OBOR and EEU tandem, generously noting the role of Russia. Specialists are quite positive in their expert analyses, completely excluding any disadvantages. Especially noteworthy, Kazakhstani-Russian experts' analyses among others are the most balanced and objective with all prospects and possible consequences. The reason for that the experts practice referring to both primary sources and colleagues' work, while other countries' experts neglect it.

According to relevance, limitations, and references, the **scientific novelty** is defined by:

- 1) chronological period;
- 2) comprehensive analysis due to the lack of scientific works;
- 3) sources from Kazakh, Russian, English papers of literature;
- 4) study foreign policy during the leadership both N. Nazarbayev and K.-J. Tokayev.

**Primary sources** include a wide range of materials that can be divided into the following groups:

- 1. International agreements of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Analysis of relevant intergovernmental documents let us create a vision of the goals, principles, and development directions of bilateral relations;
- 2. Legislation of Kazakhstan and the "Great Powers". Relevant sources allow to get an idea of the country's foreign policy mechanism establishment and the role of "superpowers" in it;
- 3. Documents of state authorities. Relevant sources give an idea of the official positions of the countries in various spheres;
- 4. Speeches, joint statements of Presidents, statesmen. It helps to assess the results of meetings, negotiations, and clarify problems, results, and prospects of partnerships;
- 5. Official statistics illustrating the features of the Kazakhstan-Russian, -American, Chinese interaction in the political, trade, economic, military and humanitarian spheres;
- 6. Agreements within the regional organizations, partnership dialogues, and integrations. It helps to study the mechanisms promoting partnerships between Kazakhstan and great powers;
- 7. Documents of major Kazakh, Russian, Chinese, and American companies. Agreements between large companies on state programs let us get acquainted with the current process of interaction more deeply;

- 8. Informational materials of the periodical press on Kazakhstan's interaction with the great powers;
- 9. Informational materials of electronic mass media. It helps to expand the thesis's source base and more accurately describe the process.

Hence, the **object** of the research are forms, mechanisms and practices of cooperation with Russia, China, and the US, while the **subject** are intergovernmental partnerships of Kazakhstan with Russia, China, and the USA in 2014-2019.

The chronological framework of the study is limited to 2014-2019. The lower chronological scope is focused on the Crimean event. But the author did not focus much on the crisis itself rather using it as a countdown on the current agenda of international affairs. The upper chronological limit is indicated by the end of the presidential period of N. Nazarbayev. Nevertheless, the logic of the study requires looking at more distant events to identify general trends for a whole picture of Kazakhstani-Russian, -Chinese, - American relations.

The author's **hypotheses**, a) the country's long-term "power-balanced" policy had been threatened by existing contradictions between great powers' different ideologies; b) and, Crimea issue in 2014 stressed it calling into question multi-vectorism; c) but even so, Kazakhstan continued its policy, and quite successfully finished 2014-2019' marathon.

Thus, the **aim** is to analyze Kazakhstan's post-Crimea foreign policy approaches, specifics towards great powers.

To achieve the aim, the author set the following **research objectives**:

- 1. Analyze Kazakhstan-Russian, -Chinese, -American relations in trade and economy from 2014:
- 2. Describe the Kazakhstan-Russian, -Chinese, -American cooperation in military and security fields during the given period.
- 3. Research the trends of cooperation of Kazakhstan with the powers in cultural and humanitarian spheres after 2014.

Theoretical approach. The thesis utilizes a neorealist framework of IR's theory to interpret the country's foreign policy towards great powers, and discern dominant features. Neoreolistic approach claims that the overriding goal of states in the international system is to survive (national interest), or at a minimum seek its own survival. Other approaches criticize Waltz's neorealism that it is paying more attention to the international system ignoring unit-level factors (states' characteristics, etc.). But, some neorealists, for example, R. Jervis, did not completely deny countries' matter, "system and units (each country) are interconnected. So any

changes in some elements of units or their relations produce changes in the international system". <sup>34</sup> Neorealism just omits the internal factors and strongly believes that countries` decisions, preferences, behaviors can be a product of competition, benefits which is explained by countries` national interest (survival, maximizing or accumulation of power). Besides, states` behaviors could be an outcome of the international system influence, because they calculate it to their advantage. But, in behavior dictated by an external system, sometimes there will be a gap between what states want and what states actually get.

Moreover, Waltz argued that based on the situations change, the country chooses to adopt an offensive or defensive strategy. In spite of being defensive neorealist, Kenneth Waltz said, "a state having too much power may scare other states into uniting against it and thus become less secure. A state having too little power may tempt other states to take advantage of it". 35

The case of Kazakhstan, the great powers are not only a threat but also an opportunity. As neorealist theory assumes, less powerful countries caught between strong powers choose a defensive strategy to balance forces and ensure security.

Hence, neorealism aptly suited to research Kazakhstan's multi-vector foreign policy searching for its own survival and understand its behavior.

Methodology. During the research, the author used an analytical approach, historiographic approach, foreign policy analysis (political process model), comparative analysis, discourse, and content analysis. They were applied in each chapter. The historical approach considers the foreign policy relations of Kazakhstan and the superpowers in the context of the 2014-2020 realm. At the same time, this approach helped to put puzzle pieces together through analysis of relatively early events. The analytical approach helped to analyze and understand the different ideological views of all actors and Kazakhstan's perceptions concerning cooperation during 2014-2020. Foreign policy analysis and its political process model allowed a better understanding of how each figuring countries relate to each other, and how Kazakhstan conduct its foreign policy, diplomacy. There were used content and discourse analysis, which considered and contrasted divergent opinions, expressions made by public officials or experts. Comparative analysis was actively used throughout the research. As great powers' positions differ, which became even more noticeable after the Crimean integration. Comparing Kazakhstan's foreign policy towards each great powers in specific areas helped to identify real patterns of multi-vector policy.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Griffiths M. International Relations Theory for the Twenty-First Century. New York, 2007. p.184

<sup>35</sup> Ibid. pp.17-20

# CHAPTER I. Post-2014 Assessment of Trade and Economic Strategic Cooperation of Kazakhstan with Great Powers

#### 1.1. Brief Trade and Economic Statistics Summary of 2014-2019

Kazakhstan, having experienced a strong decline in socio-economic activity in early `90s, began to show relatively positive changes since the end of the decade. Despite a sharp economic growth collapse because of global crises in different periods, the country with an increase of raw materials` price was able to gain momentum and resume growth again.

The year 2014, began for Kazakhstan with another optimistic Presidential state-of-thenation address – Kazakhstan's way 2050. The ambitious strategic was a roadmap of concrete steps for the next three decades. According to the address, N. Nazarbayev indicated an ultimate goal – join the world's 30 most developed states – citing as an example the OECD members. Following it, the government approved the Foreign Policy Concept over the next six years and a new infrastructural and economic policy – Nurly Zhol. The state of the presidential state-of-thenation address a roadmap of concrete steps for the next three decades. According to the address, N. Nazarbayev indicated an ultimate goal – join the world's 30 most developed states – citing as an example the OECD members. The presidential state-of-thenation address a roadmap of concrete steps for the next three decades. According to the address, N. Nazarbayev indicated an ultimate goal – join the world's 30 most developed states – citing as an example the OECD members. The presidential state-of-thenation address are stated as a presidential state-of-thenation address are stated as a presidential state-of-thenation address and the presidential state-of-thenation address are stated as a presidential state-of-thenation address and the presidential state-of-thenation address are stated as a presidential state of the stated as a presidential stated

The economic strategy was guidance to minimize the risk in case of the deceleration in world economic growth or sanctions policy aggravation, since Russian-Western relations had become tense. Long-term priority was to resist global threats and become a successful and developed country in economic terms.

In 2014-2015, Kazakhstan's economy was noticeably experiencing predicted difficulties because of the economic crisis. According to the World Economic Outlook and World Bank, real GDP had fallen to 1%. Such sharp jumps and instability are due to the country's economy built on the export of raw materials. A country that has an undifferentiated export basket and export prevails over import is subjected to frequent fluctuations. Kazakhstan exports more than 80% of raw materials, which was not without consequences for the state budget decreased by 35% in 2014-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Qaqstan joly-2050: bir maqsat, bir múdde, bir bolashaq: 2014 jylgy 11 qarashadagy Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń Prezidenti N. Á. Nazarbaevtyń Qazastan Halqyna Joldaýy [Kazakhstan's way – 2050: common aim, common interests, common future by the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan N. A. Nazarbayev of January 17, 2014]. Yegemen Qazaqstan, Jan. 18, 2014, № 11 (28235). URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/K1400002014">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/K1400002014</a> (Accessed: 24 November 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Nurly Jol – bolashaqqa bastar jol: 2014 jylgy 17 qańtardagy Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń Prezidenti N. Á. Nazarbaevtyń Qazastan Halqyna Joldayy [Nyrly Zhol – The Path to the Future by the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan N. A. Nazarbayev of November 11, 2014]. Yegemen Qazaqstan, Nov. 11, 2014, № 221 (28444). URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/K14002014">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/K14002014</a> 2z (Accessed: 24 November 2019)

2015.<sup>38</sup> Only since the first half of 2017, there were signs of recovery and the growth rate reached again 4%. Until 2020, the situation was stable and had been improving considerably. (Appendix)

Although the economy is heavily dependent on oil and gas, the state's above-mentioned systematically structured political and economic strategies helped to attract foreign investment and establish long-term strategic relationships with major powers and institutions, which have become a guarantee of stable foreign trade relations. Thus, the country managed not only to save itself from running into negative territory, but to show a modest increase after the crises.

Kazakhstan has foreign economic relations with more than 120 countries. As noted Kazakh political expert M. Shibutov, about 20 of these countries have been playing a key role last 8 years. Among them, Russia, China, and the US are the main partners not mentioning the EU countries.<sup>39</sup>

Last 30 years, Kazakhstan attracted \$320 billion of direct investment. 80% of investment were received only in the last ten years. To the last 5 years` results, direct investment flow from the powers to Kazakhstan is about \$34.25 billion. Though the overall flow of investment decreased significantly during 2015-2017, it concludes, outside of the crisis, investments to Kazakhstan are continuously and in a stable amount. It confirms the investment climate`s stability in the country and the effectiveness of national policy. (Appendix)

Metal, fuel, minerals, and a small share of vegetables, textiles and clothing commonly constitute the basis of Kazakhstan's exports to all three countries. Kazakhstan imports preferably electronic, transportation, chemicals, plastic or rubber, textiles and clothing. Separately, the case of the US, the list includes animals, China – footwear, and Russia – food products, wood. Thus, one of the features of trade and economic cooperation is the supply of mainly raw materials from Kazakhstan, and manufactured products from Russia, China, USA.

There is a brief analytical overview of the statistical indicators of mutual trade in 2014-2019: total turnover, imports, exports, and direct investments. Here also a review of the structures and agreements based on which contemporary trade and economic relations between Kazakhstan and superpowers are developing.

#### 1.1.1. Kazakhstan and Russia

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Reforming Kazakhstan: Progress, Challenges and Opportunities. Global Relations Secretariat of OECD. Source: The work was published under the responsibility of the OECD Secretary-General, 2017. p.187 URL: <a href="https://www.oecd.org/eurasia/countries/OECD-Eurasia-Reforming-Kazakhstan-EN.pdf">https://www.oecd.org/eurasia/countries/OECD-Eurasia-Reforming-Kazakhstan-EN.pdf</a> (Accessed: 25 August 2019)

<sup>39</sup> Shibutov M. Eksport Kazakhstana: obzor dinamiki [Export of Kazakhstan: overview of dynamics]. Information

agency "Regnum", August 27, 2019. URL: https://regnum.ru/news/2700790.html (Accessed: 11 October 2019)

40 Kazakhstan trade statistics: export, import, products, etc. in 2014-2018. Source: World Integrated Trade Solution.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Kazakhstan trade statistics: export, import, products, etc. in 2014-2018. Source: World Integrated Trade Solution URL: <a href="https://wits.worldbank.org/CountryProfile/en/KAZ">https://wits.worldbank.org/CountryProfile/en/KAZ</a> (Accessed: 15-20 November 2019)

Contemporary trade and economic relations between Kazakhstan and Russia proceeds on a number of agreements and responsible mechanisms.

There are three main structures:

- 1. Trade representative offices under the authorities of Trade and Integration Ministry of Kazakhstan and Economic Development Ministry of Russia;
- 2. Intergovernmental Commission on cooperation conducting its wide-ranged activities in both trade and economy, and other areas of cooperation for 20 years;
- 3. Russia Kazakhstan Business Council under the authorities of Commerce and Industry Chamber of Russia and Foreign Trade Chamber of Kazakhstan.

There are both documents related to the early years of independence such as Treaty of Friendship, Cooperation, and Mutual Assistance of 1992, but still in force,<sup>41</sup> and documents signed relatively later. These are Intergovernmental Long-term Economic Cooperation Program up to 2020,<sup>42</sup> Agreement on Good-Neighbourliness and Alliance in the 21st century of 2013,<sup>43</sup> and Treaty on the Eurasian Economic Union of 2015.<sup>44</sup>

The last two are truly breakthrough ones. The first agreement indicates the exclusive character of bilateral relations, on the basis of which Russia is the only country-ally of Kazakhstan in all areas of cooperation. To the second agreement, Kazakhstan became a full-fledged member of EEU on January 1, 2015. As noted Russian expert K. Meshcheryakov, EEU created additional opportunities to reach a higher level for bilateral trade and economic cooperation.<sup>45</sup>

2014-2019's statistics reveal, Kazakhstan's main trading partner is Russia. Kazakhstan's trade turnover with Russia is 1/3 more than with China, not to mention the U.S. But if Russia

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> 1992 jyláy 25 mamyrdaáy Qazaqstan Respýblikasy men Resei Federatsuasy arasyndaáy dostyq, yntymaqtastyq jáne ózara kómek týraly shartqa ózgerister engizý týraly hattama, [Protocol on the amendments to the Treaty of Friendship, Cooperation and Mutual Assistance between the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Russian Federation of May 25, 1992]. Bulletin of International Agreements of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2013, no. 5, doc. 53 (Accessed: 7 August 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> 2011 jylgy 25 qarashadagy Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń Úkimeti men Resei Federatsiasynyń Úkimeti arasyndagy (2020 jylga deiingi) uzaq merzimdi ekonomikalyq yntymaqtastyq bagdarlamasy [Program of long-term economic cooperation between the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Government of the Russian Federation (until 2020) of November 25, 2011]. Source: Embassy of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the Russian Federation. URL: <a href="https://www.kazembassy.ru/kaz/dvustoronnee">https://www.kazembassy.ru/kaz/dvustoronnee</a> sotrudnichestvo/dogovornaya baza/?cid=9 (Accessed: 7 August 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Qazaqstan Respýblikasy men Resei Federatsiasy arasyndagy XXI gasyrdagy tatý kórshilik jane odaqtastyq týraly shartty ratifikatsialaý: Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyň Zaňy 2014 jylgy 7 qarashadagy [Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On ratification of the Agreement between the Russian Federation and the Republic of Kazakhstan on Good-Neighbourliness and Alliance in the XXI century of November 7, 2014]. Bulletin of International Agreements of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2015, no. 1, art. 3. (Accessed: 7 August 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Treaty on Eurasian Economic Union. Jan. 1, 2015. URL: docs.eaeunion.org/docs/en-us/0003610/itia\_05062014 (Accessed: 2 October 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Meshcheryakov K. Y. The Russian-Kazakh relations during the "Ukrainian crisis", Klio, 2016, №5. pp. 118-134

occupies the top position with 35% of all foreign transactions, Kazakhstan's position in the foreign trade turnover of Russia is quite modest: in 10th place with a share of 2.9% in 2019.<sup>46</sup>

Statistics on trade between the countries show consistently positive figures in 2014. A significant decrease to about 23.3% in mutual trade turnover occurred in 2015 compared to the previous year. In 2016, the trade turnover continued to decline. However, this negative trend was overcome, and the trade turnover showed 22% growth in 2017. In the following years, Kazakhstan and Russia worked on to achieve pre-2015 results. As a result, the total volume of trade turnover amounted to \$19.6 billion in 2019.

Russia provides the most important market for Kazakhstan's export products and access to the markets of other countries, mainly Europe. But, the country comes after the main export destinations, China and Italy, sometimes give way to Netherlands. On the contrary, Russia is an indispensable partner in imports. The Northern neighbor sells Kazakhstan goods one-and-a-half-times more than all Asian countries, including large ones like China and Turkey. Even though the crisis led to the decline in trade turnover between the countries over the past 5 years, Russia's imports indicators have never been lower than 30%.

In 2015-2016, Russia's direct investment fell significantly being off top 5 Kazakhstan's investor-countries with reference to economic difficulties overshadowed by political tension. However, the country stabilized its investment in Kazakhstan in the years to come. (Appendix) Russia's investment predominantly comes from the joint Eurasian Development Bank institutionalized to support integration in Eurasia through investment and enlarge trade and economic ties. EDB commonly finances energy, transport, and infrastructure projects. Since 2014, there were implemented 6 projects with EDP'investment in Kazakhstan, and 8 are still in the process.<sup>47</sup>

Thus, although Russia is the country's main trading partner, the bulk of this trade is accounted for imports. But even so, China steps on Russia's toes.

#### 1.1.2. Kazakhstan and China

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> The Report on Russian-Kazakhstani foreign trade turnover in 2019. Source: Russian Foreign Trade`s statistics based on data from the Federal Customs Service of Russia, Feb. 13, 2020. URL: <a href="https://russian-trade.com/reports-and-reviews/2020-02/torgovlya-mezhdu-rossiev-i-kazahstanom-v-2019-g/">https://russian-trade.com/reports-and-reviews/2020-02/torgovlya-mezhdu-rossiev-i-kazahstanom-v-2019-g/</a> (Accessed: 18 December 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Eýrazıa damý bankin qurý turaly kelisimdi ratifikatsiyalaý týraly: Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń 2006 jylgy 2 sáýirdegi № 137 Zańy [№ 137 Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan on ratification of the Agreement on Eurasian development Bank establishment dated April 12 2006] URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/Z060000137">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/Z060000137</a> (Accessed: 2 October 2020)

Current Kazakhstan-Chinese trade relations are developing under the responsibility of Kazakh-Chinese Business Council chaired by National Welfare Fund "Samruk-Kazyna" and Chinese Council for the Promotion of International Trade, Kazakhstan-Chinese Cooperation Committee led by Deputy Prime Ministers re-estableshed in 2013-2014.

Kazakhstan's trade and economic relations with China intensified after the countries began to actively conduct partnership activities within the OBOR and Nurly Zhol in 2015. These two initiatives are perfectly coincided in trade-economic and industrial-innovative points of view. There were formed roadmap for expanding cooperation, and a special Joint group started working. The Kazakhstan national managing holding "Baiterek" and the Export-Import Bank of China created a special Joint Investment Fund. China's largest energy company CNPC joined the Foreign Investors` Council chaired by the President of Kazakhstan.<sup>48</sup> Since then, China in Kazakhstan`s policy was associated not only with large gratuitous financial assistance, but also with long-term trade and economic interests.

In 2017, there was launched Chinese Entrepreneurs Union in Almaty. 49 The Union's establishment is a vivid example of a successfully developing bilateral partnership in the area. Because, on Statistics Ministry of National Economy of Kazakhstan, 1018 enterprises with the Chinese capital were registered in the country by that time. Obviously, it led to the unification of entrepreneurs in a new union. The purpose of the structure is, as it was noted by Chinese entrepreneurs, to open up new levels of bilateral cooperation.

In 2019, Prime Minister A. Mamin informed, Kazakhstan plans to open 10 trade representative offices of Kazakhstan in different countries, two of which are planned in Chinese cities – Beijing and Urumqi.

Except for structural mechanisms regulating the implementation of bilateral trade and economic tasks, there legal mechanisms. Programme for the medium- and long-term development

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Mukhametkhanuly N. China's Concept of "Win-Win Cooperation" find the New Stage of Cooperation between China and Kazakhstan, China, 2018. pp. 512-521

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> V Almaty sozdan Soyuz kitayskikh predprinimateley [Union of Chinese entrepreneurs established in Almat]. Xinhua News, Apr. 26, 2017. URL: <a href="http://russian.news.cn/2017-04/26/c">http://russian.news.cn/2017-04/26/c</a> 136236350.htm (Accessed: 30 December 2019)

of trade and economic cooperation until 2020 from 2013<sup>50</sup> and Joint Declaration on New Stage of Comprehensive Strategic Partnership officially submitted in 2015<sup>51</sup> are by far the key documents.

China occupies the 3rd place in the foreign trade turnover of Kazakhstan according to 2018 data, while Kazakhstan had stopped at 41st place with a 0.4% in the foreign trade activity of China. Technically, within the EEU, Kazakhstan along with the participating countries is in 9th place with a 2.8%. But the lion's share of the percentage belongs to Russia.<sup>52</sup>

Statistics on trade turnover between Kazakhstan and China also show lower indicators in 2015-2016: from \$17 billion to \$7.8 billion. But, since 2017, the trade turnover had had an increasing trend. By the end of 2019, the volume of trade between the countries increased by 50% compared to the indicators of 2016.

Although more than 50% of Kazakhstan's export belong to EU members, outside the EU, China has been the main export destination for decades, second only to Italy. After Russia, China is the second in import importance. However, the difference between them is impressive since imports from China are 2 times less than Russia.

In recent years, China increased its position among investor countries. Its indicators had come on par with Russia in 5 years, and was ahead as a result. (Appendix) G. Ageleuov argues that China is investing a huge amount of money in the industrial sectors since 2014: agriculture, oil, and gas. <sup>53</sup>

Thus, according to the concluded documents and re-establishement of structures, there is a certain kind of increasing tendency in Kazakhstan-Chinese trade and economic dialogues. To the statistics, China has the most stable, balanced import and export indicators among the powers.

#### 1.1.3. Kazakhstan and USA

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> 2013 jyláy 7 qyrkúiektegi Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń Úkimeti men Qytai Halyq Respýblikasynyń Úkimeti arasyndaáy saýda-ekonomikalyq yntymaqtastyqty orta jane uzaq merzimdi damytý baádarlamasy (2020 deiin) [Medium- and long-term trade and economic development Cooperation Program between the Republic of Kazakhstan and the People's Republic of China (until 2020)" of September 7, 2013]. URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P1300000940">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P1300000940</a> (Accessed: 16 September 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Joint Declaration on New Stage of Comprehensive Strategic Partnership between the People's Republic of China and the Republic of Kazakhstan. Source: Ministry of Foreign Affairs of People's Republic of China. Aug. 31, 2015. URL: <a href="https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\_eng/wjdt\_665385/2649\_665393/t1293114.shtml">https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\_eng/wjdt\_665385/2649\_665393/t1293114.shtml</a> (Accessed: 16 September 2019)

 $<sup>\</sup>frac{52}{\text{http://www.eurasiancommission.org/ru/act/trade/catr/monitoring/Documents/Obzor3/\%D0\%95\%D0\%90\%D0\%AD}{\frac{\text{http://www.eurasiancommission.org/ru/act/trade/catr/monitoring/Documents/Obzor3/\%D0\%95\%D0\%90\%D0\%AD}{\frac{\text{http://www.eurasiancommission.org/ru/act/trade/catr/monitoring/Documents/Obzor3/\%D0%95\%D0%90\%D0%AD}{\frac{\text{http://www.eurasiancommission.org/ru/act/trade/catr/monitoring/Documents/Obzor3/\%D0%95\%D0%90%D0%AD}{\frac{\text{http://www.eurasiancommission.org/ru/act/trade/catr/monitoring/Documents/Obzor3/%D0%95%D0%90%D0%AD}{\frac{\text{http://www.eurasiancommission.org/ru/act/trade/catr/monitoring/Documents/Obzor3/%D0%95%D0%90%D0%AD}{\frac{\text{http://www.eurasiancommission.org/ru/act/trade/catr/monitoring/Documents/Obzor3/%D0%95%D0%90%D0%AD}{\frac{\text{http://www.eurasiancommission.org/ru/act/trade/catr/monitoring/Documents/Obzor3/%D0%95%D0%90%D0%AD}{\frac{\text{http://www.eurasiancommission.org/ru/act/trade/catr/monitoring/Documents/Obzor3/%D0%95%D0%90%D0%AD}{\frac{\text{http://www.eurasiancommission.org/ru/act/trade/catr/monitoring/Documents/Obzor3/%D0%BD%D0%B0$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Ageleuov G. Kitay-Kazakhstan: Perspektivy vzaimodeystviya [China-Kazakhstan: Prospects for cooperation]. News Agency "Fergana", May 25, 2017. URL: <a href="https://www.fergananews.com/articles/9422">https://www.fergananews.com/articles/9422</a> (Accessed: 11 October 2019)

As the first country to recognize the independence of Kazakhstan and start a business relationship with, the USA is currently the largest investor and key partner of the country. In Kazakhstan-American trade and economic interaction there are documents adopted in the 1990's such as Investment incentive Agreement, Agreement on trade relations and in the late 2000's such as Kazakhstan-U.S. program for economic development Agreement.<sup>54</sup> But there is no agreement on strategic partnership between Kazakhstan and USA, which bring the bilateral trade and economic partnership to a strategic level. The main content of the expanded cooperation between them is considered in the framework of a Joint Statement on Enhanced Strategic Partnership in the 21st century from 2018.<sup>55</sup> Only in US Presidents' announcement, Kazakhstan was several times declared "a strategic partner in Central Asia". This "strategic partnership" was institutionalized into a structure, Strategic Partnership Dialogue Commission, only in 2012. The Commission is jointly led by the Foreign Ministries. Kazakhstan, for the record, is the first and only CA country had created such a regulating mechanism on the full range with the USA.<sup>56</sup>

Telling about other structures, there are American-Kazakh Business Association <sup>57</sup> successfully carried out its work in trade and economic partnership and Trade and Investment Framework dialogue between USA and CA countries. <sup>58</sup> The main purpose of TIFA was facilitate the accession of countries to the WTO, member of which Kazakhstan became in July, 2015 with the establishment of a transition period for certain industries until 2020. Russian-Western conflict and Kazakhstan's intention to become a member of the EEU at the beginning of 2015 intensified the accession process of Kazakhstan to WTO, which had already lasted for two decades. During

\_\_\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> A List of Treaties and Other International Agreements of the United States in Force on January 1, 2019. U.S. Department of State, Office of the Legal Adviser, Kazakhstan-U.S., pp. 246-248. URL: <a href="https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/2019-TIF-Bilaterals-web-version.pdf">https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/2019-TIF-Bilaterals-web-version.pdf</a> (Accessed: 11 September 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Qazaqstan men AQSH: XXI gasyrdagy keńeitilgen strategialyq áriptestik [United States and Kazakhstan: An Enhanced Strategic Partnership for the 21st Century]. Jan. 17, 2018. URL: <a href="https://www.akorda.kz/kz/events/international community/foreign visits/kazakstan-zhane-aksh-xxi-gasyrdagy-keneitilgen-strategiyalyk-ariptestik">https://www.akorda.kz/kz/events/international community/foreign visits/kazakstan-zhane-aksh-xxi-gasyrdagy-keneitilgen-strategiyalyk-ariptestik</a> (Accessed: 15 August 2019);

Joint Press Statements of President Trump and President N. Nazarbayev of Kazakhstan. Jan. 16, 2018. URL: <a href="https://translations.state.gov/2018/01/16/remarks-by-president-trump-and-president-nursultan-nazarbayev-of-kazakhstan-in-joint-press-statements/">https://translations.state.gov/2018/01/16/remarks-by-president-trump-and-president-nursultan-nazarbayev-of-kazakhstan-in-joint-press-statements/</a> (Accessed: 15 August 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Cornell S.E., Kukeyeva F., Nursha A. Starr S.F., Sultanov B., Wimbush S.E. Looking Forward: Kazakhstan and the U.S. Singapore, Central Asia-Caucasus Institute & Silk Road Studies Program, 2014. p. 54

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Amerikansko-kazakhstanskoy biznes assotsiatsii ispolnilos 20 let [American-Kazakhstan business Association`s 20<sup>th</sup> anniversary]. "Khabar" news agency, Jan. 20, 2019. URL: <a href="https://24.kz/ru/news/economyc/item/291188-amerikansko-kazakhstanskoj-biznes-assotsiatsii-ispolnilos-20-let">https://24.kz/ru/news/economyc/item/291188-amerikansko-kazakhstanskoj-biznes-assotsiatsii-ispolnilos-20-let</a> (Accessed: 30 December 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Framework agreement between the Government of the United States of America, the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic, the Government of the Republic of Tajikistan, the Government of Turkmenistan, and the Government of the Republic of Uzbekistan concerning the development of trade and investment relations dated June 1, 2004. Source: UNCTAD International Investment Agreements Navigator. URL: <a href="https://investmentpolicy.unctad.org/international-investment-agreements/treaties/treaties-with-investment-provisions/3346/us-central-asia-tifa">https://investmentpolicy.unctad.org/international-investment-agreements/treaties/treaties-with-investment-provisions/3346/us-central-asia-tifa</a> (Accessed: 13 September 2019)

U.S. Deputy Secretary of State's visit to Kazakhstan in May 2014, there were discussed the main directions of relations, including trade, economic and investment spheres. The Deputy started his important message by addressing the local government, "a critically important strategic partner in a critically important region at a critically important time". The US noted further assistance in the accession process of Kazakhstan's to WTO and relevance to reinforce cooperation even stronger and deeper in conditions Ukraine, Afghanistan issues as well. <sup>59</sup> Although Director of the Kazakhstani Foreign Trade Development Department announced that the process of joining the WTO was ongoing difficult, all the opinions of domestic economics and political science experts merged into one common. The experts did not see a contradiction in the simultaneous membership either in international law, or insurmountable problems in economic terms. Existing problems with joining was more about politics than economics, because of the geopolitical situation the EEU and WTO had become a new platform for public clarification of relations between Russia-Ukraine-West. <sup>60</sup>

After Kazakhstan joined the WTO, U.S. Secretary of State J. Kerry arrived in Astana within a CA tour by the end of 2015. Since then, Kazakhstan became a participant another US-led regional initiative C5+1 to promote expanded cooperation in economy and regional interaction. <sup>61</sup> But, Kazakhstan-American trade and economic relations within C5+1 was overrated, since the structure did not function fully in the following years.

The US, while not having a high percentage in the country's foreign trade, remain an important economic partner of Kazakhstan. Kazakhstan's share in the foreign trade turnover of the US was only 0.092% in 2019. But the country is responsible for 20% of uranium imports of US market by 2018, second only to Canada in a few percentage points.

The two countries` trade turnover has shown low indicators throughout the cooperation. In 2015-2017, the value of mutual trade decreased even more by 44% compared to 2014. Only in 2018, there was a 38% growth trend, and the value of trade between Kazakhstan and the US reached a stable \$2.2 billion in 2018-2019.

<sup>59</sup> Press Availability by Deputy Secretary Burns in Astana. U.S. Embassy & Consulate in Kazakhstan, May 8, 2014. URL: <a href="https://kz.usembassy.gov/press-availability-by-deputy-secretary-burns-in-astana/">https://kz.usembassy.gov/press-availability-by-deputy-secretary-burns-in-astana/</a> (Accessed: 9 September 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> Kakim budet Kazakhstan odnovremenno v VTO i EAES? [What will Kazakhstan be like in the WTO and the EEU at the same time?] Source: Azattyq Radio, Nov. 27, 2014. URL: <a href="https://rus.azattyq.org/a/kazakhstan-vstuplenie-vto-eaes/26712958.html">https://rus.azattyq.org/a/kazakhstan-vstuplenie-vto-eaes/26712958.html</a> (Accessed: 24 August 2019);

L. Karatayeva. VTO i EAES: seryeznykh protivorechiy vozniknut ne dolzhno. 02.10.2015. Source: <a href="https://inbusiness.kz/">https://inbusiness.kz/</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Dzhon Kerri ob Ukraine, ugroze IG i EAES [J. Kerry about Ukraine, ISIS`s threat and EEU]. Nov. 3, 2015. URL: <a href="https://mir24.tv/news/13466526/dzhon-kerri-ob-ukraine-ugroze-ig-i-eaes">https://mir24.tv/news/13466526/dzhon-kerri-ob-ukraine-ugroze-ig-i-eaes</a> (Accessed: 9 September 2019)

In case of Kazakhstan's export destination, the US is not even in the top 10. This list of top 5 Kazakhstan's goods importing countries, for the record, has been remained unchanged for several years. Similar situation with imports. The USA is on the list with a small share. Although the country is in the top 5, the results have not reached even 4% of all Kazakhstan's imports over the past 2 years. It once again confirms that the main volume of imports to Kazakhstan comes from Russia and China, and key export-partners of the country are China, Russia, EU-members.

But the US does not concede to neighboring powers on an investment. In the list, the USA is an indisputable leader, being second only to the Netherlands. It is evidenced by the indicators of each neighboring powers, which are 4 times less than the investment flows coming from the USA. (Appendix)

Giving a brief summary, the relations between the US and Kazakhstan are neither in terms of trade nor strategic partnership at the high level that is attributed to it. In comparison with the neighboring powers of Kazakhstan, its share of imports and exports remains negligible. The only pedestal in which the US is not inferior is an investment, which is explained by the "buying loyalty". But, currently, China is also intensively financing and entering into economic sectors of Kazakhstan, generating a worthy competition.

#### 1.2. Key Trade and Economic Dimensions of Contemporary Cooperation

At the contemporary stage, Kazakhstan is prioritizing the development of manufacturing industries, a destination point of which is to export its own products. It was announced in the State Program on Industrial and Innovative Development (SPIID) of Kazakhstan for 2015-2019. SPIID operates within the Nurly Zhol. Although there are agreements by virtue of which Kazakhstan's trade relations with Russia, USA, and China are developing, the SPIID is the starting point explaining the trade-economic direction of Kazakhstan in its foreign policy during 2014-2019.

According to the Program, the country's areas of focus are automobile manufacturing, agro-industry, chemical, metallurgical, and oil refining industries. The country intended to attract large multinational companies and create joint ventures with leading investors – international strategic partners in the second wave of industrialization. Currently, GM, Baker Huges, Nalco Holding Company, Coca-Cola, Flowserve Corporation, O-Basf, GE (USA), Geely (China), Evraz (USA\Russia), Kamaz, LS Group, Rostselmash Group (Russia) are firmly rooted in the abovementioned industries. The list was compiled on SPIID, where companies are pointed next to the most priority sectors and tasks for 2015-2019. Alongside it, there should have been continued transport infrastructure work to activate transnational corridors, which is essential for the further

effective functioning of the economy. <sup>62</sup> Once again, it shows the country's intention not to abandon its multi-vector diplomacy, notwithstanding the geopolitical tensions after 2014.

#### 1.2.1. Kazakhstan and Russia

Kazakhstani-Russian cooperation in industrial sectors has been developing since the early 2000s. Kazakhstan actively promotes partnerships with Russian gold mining company Polymetal, coal company RUSAL, engineering companies Transmashholding, AvtoVAZ, KAMAZ, and EuroChem for a decade.

It seemed that the restart of the EEU brought bilateral inter-industry cooperation to a new level. In 2015, Kazakhstani Association of light industry signed a trilateral Memorandum of cooperation with Russia and Belarus within the EEU program to promote innovation and industry. In 2016, the parties within the EEU structured a legal framework for creating conditions for joint development in this industry. These basic measures mainly provided for regulatory mechanisms to support producers, introduction of a duty-free system, and development of a joint method for calculating public demand, etc. But, joint projects of industrial production cooperation that stimulate Kazakhstani-Russian relations in practical terms have not been implemented. The development of relations in the production and manufacturing sectors was hindered by financial difficulties such as the devaluation of the national currencies of the two countries.

More concrete steps in this industry have been taken since 2017, since interaction in agroindustrial and transport sectors intensified. Discussion on agro-industry and transport logistics during Interregional Cooperation Forums 2015-2016 were not random. As a result, a programme on the main directions of coordinated transport policy is being prepared within the EEU for approval, aimed at phased liberalization, formation of single transport space, and common market for logistics services. The Joint Collegium at the level of Agriculture Ministries is working on the introduction of swap operations for transparency and synchronism of mutual trade accounting. If these plans are implemented in practice, it will be a crucial step taken in industrial and innovative integration.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> Idrisov M. M. The program for social-innovation development of the Republic of Kazakhstan in 2015-2019. Kazakhstan Institute of the Industry Development, 2015, 4(5). pp. 253-272

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Rossiya, Kazakhstan i Belorussiya budut sotrudnichat v sfere legkoy promyshlennosti [Russia, Kazakhstan and Belarus will cooperate in the light industry]. "Regnum" news agency, Jan. 20, 2015. URL: <a href="https://regnum.ru/news/1886009.html">https://regnum.ru/news/1886009.html</a> (Accessed: 1 June 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Create conditions for the development of light industry in the EAEU Member States. Source: Eurasian Economic Commission, Nov. 24, 2016. URL: <a href="http://www.eurasiancommission.org/en/nae/news/Pages/24-11-2016-2.aspx">http://www.eurasiancommission.org/en/nae/news/Pages/24-11-2016-2.aspx</a> (Accessed: 2 June 2020)

With the arrival of K.-J. Tokayev, cooperation with Russia in industrial sphere was resumed. During the first official visit of Kazakhstani President to Russia, the countries signed a number of important documents, including the Joint Action Programme of Kazakhstan-Russian industrial cooperation. More than 12 joint projects were accepted for implementation, but they have not yet been disseminated to a wide audience. K.-J. Tokayev noted the exceptional importance of developing joint projects in petrochemistry, light industry, agriculture, automobile, and railway engineering. Indeed, there are about 9,000 enterprises successfully operating in Kazakhstan, more than 6,500 of which are active.<sup>65</sup>

As the President noted, mechanical engineering remains one of the highest priorities in the intersectoral cooperation. There is a joint project of "Asia Auto Kazakhstan" in Oskemen, owned by Kazakhstani Bipek Auto and Russian AvtoVAZ. Although Asia Auto has been operating since 2002, in recent years the plant's productivity grew cutting above a rest. Even during 2014-2016, the company continued to show the best results of bilateral industrial cooperation. In 2014, during the official visit of AvtoVAZ's President, negotiations were held with the Prime Minister of Kazakhstan and the administration of the East Kazakhstan region. The parties discussed the implementation of the project to switch the automobile production in Oskemen to a full cycle.<sup>66</sup> The parties subsequently signed an Agreement on joint activities in the Russian market within the Kazakh-Russian Interregional forum. The companies agreed to develop service networks in the of the Siberian and Ural Federal districts markets.<sup>67</sup> Accordingly, by the end of 2015, 15 car centers were opened in these regions to sale and provide automobile services produced by Asia Auto. As a result of successful experience, Kazakhstan and Russia signed another Agreement on joint development in the of other Central Asian countries markets, including Mongolia. <sup>68</sup> The first wave of automobile deliveries to these countries took place in early 2016. In 2017, the first 120 cars were sent to the Chinese market. To the Asia Auto Deputy Director for production, Russia emerges as the most important strategic partner of the company. Russia supplies all the necessary

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> Kazakhstan i Rossiya podpisali neskolko soglasheniy [Kazakhstan and Russia signed several agreements]. "Kapital" business information center, Apr. 3, 2019. URL: <a href="https://kapital.kz/economic/77205/kazakhstan-i-rossiya-podpisali-neskol-ko-soglasheniy.html">https://kapital.kz/economic/77205/kazakhstan-i-rossiya-podpisali-neskol-ko-soglasheniy.html</a> (Accessed: 1 June 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> Bo Andersson the President of "Avtovaz" JSC had a series of meetings in Kazakhstan. Spource: Asia Avto – Kazakhstan car assembly plant, Sep. 23, 2014. URL: <a href="http://aziaavto.kz/en/bo-andersson-the-president-of-avtovaz-jsc-had-a-series-of-meetings-in-kazakhstan">http://aziaavto.kz/en/bo-andersson-the-president-of-avtovaz-jsc-had-a-series-of-meetings-in-kazakhstan</a> (Accessed: 2 June 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> Presidents of Russia and Kazakhstan approved of cooperation between Avtovaz and Bipek avto at Siberian market. Asia Avto – Kazakhstan car assembly plant, Oct. 10, 2014. URL: <a href="http://aziaavto.kz/en/presidents-of-russia-and-kazakhstan-approved-of-cooperation-between-avtovaz-and-bipek-avto-at">http://aziaavto.kz/en/presidents-of-russia-and-kazakhstan-approved-of-cooperation-between-avtovaz-and-bipek-avto-at</a> (Accessed: 2 June 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Avtovaz and Bipek Avto – Azia Avto proceed with cooperative capturing of Central Asia markets. Asia Avto – Kazakhstan car assembly plant, Oct. 15, 2015. URL: <a href="http://aziaavto.kz/en/avtovaz-and-bipek-avto-azia-avto-proceed-with-cooperative-capturing-of-central-asia-markets">http://aziaavto.kz/en/avtovaz-and-bipek-avto-azia-avto-proceed-with-cooperative-capturing-of-central-asia-markets</a> (Accessed: 1 June 2020)

technologies for mechanical engineering that are processed under local production conditions during the development of the model.<sup>69</sup>

Asia Auto is not the only Kazakh-Russian project. There are factories in the Kostanay region and Kokshetau, which also actively cooperate with Russia in the supply of automobile components for assembly which are not produced in Kazakhstan. The plants specialize in the assembly of both passenger cars and agricultural machinery such as tractors, combines, etc. Kazakh economist A. Baiganov highlighted that joint projects in automobile industry represent a mutual benefit for the countries. Kazakhstan will get the necessary auto components for assembly, increase the share of localization of production, reduce the cost of cars, and access to neighboring foreign markets, while Russia will be presented with loyal conditions for the introduction of business in Kazakhstan. Notably. in the expert's word, Kazakhstan has the lowest taxation among the EEU countries, which is an extra reason for building its own business.<sup>70</sup>

Thus, cooperation between Russia and Kazakhstan in machinery engineering become a successful example of an industrial partnership. Due to bilateral cooperation, Kazakhstan is slowly moving away from the time when it was only involved in the assembly. In the transport and logistics and agricultural sectors, it can be assumed that the potential of the countries was not fully used. It requires a more systematic approach to implementation, otherwise, it slows down the full development of other related industries.

#### 1.2.2. Kazakhstan and China

Expert on Kazakhstan-Chinese relations K. Syroezhkin considered bilateral trade and economic partnership over the period in 4 areas: infrastructure-logistics, industrial projects, agriculture, science and high technologies.<sup>71</sup> Kukeyeva and Dyussebayev pointed out similar four items of benefits for Kazakhstan.<sup>72</sup> To date, the classification can be reduced based on results – logistics and industry – since major events took place in the two areas.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> Rossiya i Kazakhstan narashchivayut sotrudnichestvo v sfere mashinostroyeniya [Russia and Kazakhstan are increasing their cooperation in the field of mechanical engineering]. "MIR 24" information and analytical Internet portal, Sep. 14, 2018. URL: <a href="https://mir24.tv/news/16322764/rossiya-i-kazahstan-narashchivayut-sotrudnichestvo-v-sfere-mashinostroeniya">https://mir24.tv/news/16322764/rossiya-i-kazahstan-narashchivayut-sotrudnichestvo-v-sfere-mashinostroeniya</a> (Accessed: 31 May 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Sotrudnichestvo Kazakhstana i Rossii v oblasti mashinostroyeniya [Cooperation between Kazakhstan and Russia in the field of mechanical engineering]. "Khabar" news agency, May 8, 2019. URL: <a href="https://24.kz/ru/tv-projects/promyshlennost/item/313677-sotrudnichestvo-kazakhstana-i-rossii-v-oblasti-mashinostroeniya-promyshlennost">https://24.kz/ru/tv-projects/promyshlennost/item/313677-sotrudnichestvo-kazakhstana-i-rossii-v-oblasti-mashinostroeniya-promyshlennost</a> (Accessed: 31 May 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup>Syroezhkin K. Kazakhstan i Kitay: analiz poslednikh dogovorennostey [Kazakhstan and China: analysis of recent agreements]. November 4, 2016. URL: <a href="http://www.ca-portal.ru/article:30965">http://www.ca-portal.ru/article:30965</a> (Accessed: 18 December 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> Dyussebayev D., Kukeyeva F. Belt and road initiative for Kazakhstan: Opportunities and risks. Silk Road to Belt Road: reinventing the past and shaping the future, Springer Singapore, 2018. pp. 296-305

In 2014, Kazakhstan and China reached an Agreement on joint ventures. In 2015, Kazakhstan and China signed a Memorandum on Strengthening Cooperation in Industry and Investment. <sup>73</sup> In 2016, the Minister of economy of Kazakhstan and Chairman of the State Committee for development and reform of China signed a cooperation plan. As a result, 51 joint projects` list was formulated for \$24-26 billion. Later, it expanded to 55. Currently, 14 projects launched, 11 at the implementation stage, 12 in development, 10 at the preparatory stage, and 8 are considered passive (some of them may be excluded). The lion's share of launched or implementation process projects is in the regions, 11 out of 14:

- 1. Development of deposits of tungsten ores and copper in Almaty region;
- 2. Processing and production of natural stone products, construction of mining, chemical and metallurgical complex in Zhambyl region;
  - 3. Production of polyethylene terephthalate waste processing in Turkestan region;
  - 4. Production of soda ash, cement and construction of a glass factory in Kyzylorda region;
  - 5. Production of mobile drilling rigs, ceramic products, potash fertilizers in Aktobe region;
  - 6. Production of potash fertilizers in the West Kazakhstan region;
  - 7. Polypropylene production in Atyrau region;
  - 8. Production of LOVOL tractors and JAC brand cars in Kostanay region;
- 9. Production of cable products, industrial explosives, complex alloys and construction of carbon-chemical complex, electrolytic manganese in Karaganda region;
  - 10. Production of oilseeds processing in the North Kazakhstan region;
- 11. Construction of mining, chemical and metallurgical complex and production of primary aluminum in Pavlodar region. <sup>74</sup>

In transport and logistics, Kazakhstan is included in North and Central corridors of OBOR. Both corridors include key regions of South and West Kazakhstan. For the record, OBOR has three corridors and one sea route in two directions. The Northern corridor with more than 8000 km length (Kazakhstani section is 2787 km) from Lianyungang port to St. Petersburg is called Western China-Western Europe highway. Kazakhstani part passes through major cities: Aktobe, Kyzylorda, Shymkent, Taraz, Kordai, Almaty and Khorgos neutral zone. <sup>75</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> Li Xin. Chinese perspective on the creation of a Eurasian Economic space. Valdai Discussion Club Report. Moscow, 2016. p. 22

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> Proyekty Kazakhstana i Kitaya [Kazahstan-Chinese projects]. "Sputnik" news agency, Sep. 20, 2019. URL: <a href="https://ru.sputniknews.kz/infographics/20190920/11579476/proekty-kazakhstan-china.html">https://ru.sputniknews.kz/infographics/20190920/11579476/proekty-kazakhstan-china.html</a> (Accessed: 9 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> Rakhmanova G. B. Project "Western Europe and Western China" in the industrial development of Kazakhstan. Bulletin KazUIR&WL "International relations and Regional studies", 2013, №1-2 (11-12). pp. 113-120

On December 6, 2017, Kazakhstani authorities announced that its section was near to complete. Currently, Kazakhstan and China are waiting Russian part for a full operation of highway. Russian section includes 5 cities. The project deadline planned no later than 2020 was disrupted and pushed back to 2027.

Although the highway to Europe is not fully operational, Kazakhstan carries Chinese goods through other surface transit transportations. According to the Transit and Transport Logistics Development Department, railway transport and seaports have been activated simultaneously with the start of the Northern corridor. In 2017, N. Nazarbayev and Xi Jinping jointly launched a railway transport from Lianyungang port to Khorgos. <sup>76</sup> In mid-2018, a large Kuryk port started operating in Kazakhstan, through which goods from Khorgos are sent to Europe. It is the Kazakhstani part of the Central corridor. Railway transport includes the same regions from Khorgos to Kyzylorda. But the main destinations from Kyzylorda are Aktau and Kuryk ports. The volume of cargo transit in Kazakhstan increased by a record 6% in less than one year (2018). <sup>77</sup> Currently, all branches are functioning actively, and the capacity of the Aktau port reached 19 million tons of cargo (2014\14 million tons) making it the absolute leader among Caspian seaports. Cargo goes in 2 directions: Europe with exits to the Baltic sea accompanied by EEU and Persian Gulf. <sup>78</sup> It leads to conclude, the country is trying to differentiate its transport routes, and cooperation with China contributes to it.

Kazakhstani experts noted that the country had been waiting for such large-scale transition project for all the time of cooperation with China. Kazakhstan's presence in the project is extremely important as well. Without Kazakhstan, providing a powerful transit potential, stability and security to Europe, it is impossible to implement the project or is less economically feasible.<sup>79</sup>

Tolerand G. S. Kazakhstan-China transit. 2018. pp.77-80 URL: <a href="http://elib.bsu.by/bitstream/123456789/195606/1/%D0%A1%D1%83%D0%BB%D0%B5%D0%B9%D0%BC%D0">http://elib.bsu.by/bitstream/123456789/195606/1/%D0%A1%D1%83%D0%BB%D0%B5%D0%B9%D0%BC%D0</a> <a href="http://elib.bsu.by/bitstream/123456789/195606/1/%D0%A1%D1%83%D0%BB%D0%B5%D0%B9%D0%BD%D0%B0%D0%BB%D0%B5%D0%BB%D0%BB%D0%BB%D0%BB%D0%BB%D0%BB%D0%BB%D0%BB%D0%BB%D0%BB%D0%BB%D0%BB%D0%BB%D0%BD%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> Cherez Kazakhstan iz Kitaya v Yevropu perevezeno za god 19 mln tonn gruzov [19 million tons of cargo were transported from China to Europe via Kazakhstan during the year]. "Khabar" news agency, Apr. 26, 2019. URL: <a href="https://24.kz/ru/news/economyc/item/311177-cherez-kazakhstan-iz-kitaya-v-evropu-perevezeno-za-god-19-mln-tonn-gruzov">https://24.kz/ru/news/economyc/item/311177-cherez-kazakhstan-iz-kitaya-v-evropu-perevezeno-za-god-19-mln-tonn-gruzov</a> (Accessed: 14 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> Zelenina A. Bitva za Shelkovyy put: Kazakhstan pereformatiruyet kartu logistiki Yevrazii [Battle for the silk road: Kazakhstan reformats the logistics map of Eurasia]. Information agency "Regnum", November 7, 2015. URL: <a href="https://regnum.ru/news/2006996.html">https://regnum.ru/news/2006996.html</a> (Accessed: 15 December 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> Kitayskiy Shelkovyy put i "Nurly zhol" poydut odnoy dorogoy [Interview with M. Shibutov, D. Satpayev: Chinese Silk Road and Nurly Zhol will go the same way]. Forbes Kazakhstan, May 2015. URL: <a href="https://forbes.kz/finances/integration/kitayskiy shelkovyiy put i nurlyi jol poydut odnoy dorogoy/">https://forbes.kz/finances/integration/kitayskiy shelkovyiy put i nurlyi jol poydut odnoy dorogoy/</a> (Accessed: 4 October 2019)

Russian expert D. Malysheva outlined, "timely arrived Chinese initiative and investment, attracted Kazakhstan and other CA countries. With the declining interest from other powers, falling oil prices and continuing sanctions, China had also took an interest by its political position, which does not consider interfering in the domestic affairs of other States unlike Western countries". The author did not exclude the possible threats in the future, pointing to excessive economic interaction, which may eventually lead to the dominance of China and its reorientation from purely trade and economic direction to political and military-technical. <sup>80</sup> According to Kukeyeva and Dyussebayev, local population protest riots, threat for local manufacturers, environmental pollution because of Chinese business relocation to Kazakhstan, and other social risks due to Chinese labor surplus can become a challenge. Regardingly, to avoid a massive influx of Chinese migrant workers and possible harm to the environment, Kazakhstan should more clearly promote its national interests. <sup>81</sup>

#### 1.2.3. Kazakhstan and USA

Kazakhstan-American inter-industry interactions are not as differentiated as in the case of its neighboring powers. Taking into account the US decision to withdraw from the Central Asia and the long-term absence of any mutual economic cooperation after 2015, it explains the stagnation in bilateral inter-industry cooperation. The main American focus was on investment and energy industries. The investment itself goes to the construction, oil and gas industry, and to finance other public sectors. In the case of Kazakhstan and the United States, this is more like simulating intensive economic interactions. However, recovery several post-2017 intersectoral dialogues` examples existis.

In heavy industry, GE Transportation closed a deal to acquire a 50% factory from Kazakhstan Temir Zholy, 50% of which is owned by the largest Russian manufacturer "Trnasmashholding". The deal was in exchange for a contract on 300 locomotives and 175 passenger locomotives for 18 years. The launch of a huge number of locomotives, surely, should have a positive impact on the industrial sector of Kazakhstan in accordance with its industrial policy. Kazakhstan, for the record, has been successfully cooperating with Pennsylvania GE Transportation on the assembly of locomotives since 2009. The company is one of the world's

\_\_\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> Malysheva D. B. Post-Soviet states of Central Asia in China's policies. Mirovaya ekonomika i mezhdunarodnye otnosheniya, 2019, vol. 63, No. 5. pp. 101-108

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> Dyussebayev D., Kukeyeva F. Belt and road initiative for Kazakhstan: Opportunities and risks. Silk Road to Belt Road: reinventing the past and shaping the future, Springer Singapore, 2018. pp. 296-305

leading suppliers of railways, shipping, drilling, and mining products. To date, over 300 modern locomotives of the Evolution series have been produced in Astana's (Nur-Sultan) factory.<sup>82</sup>

During President N. Nazarbayev`s January visit to Washington, 23 commercial documents on trade and economic cooperation were signed. Documents are aimed at implementing projects in infrastructure development, petrochemical and agricultural industries for \$7 billion. Since then, cooperation in the agro-industrial sector has been the most effective and productive one. Bilateral relations in this area are developed on the "regions-states" model. So far, it is known only on which sectors of agriculture will be implemented projects, the total amount and the selected regions for cooperation. Notably that the US began to develop relations with Kazakhstan in agriculture and in regions with the highest Russian-Chinese presence in these industries sectors.

Since mid-2018, Kazakhstan have been cooperating with the US in marketing research, business networking, financial and legal advice. Accordingly, it provides Kazakhstan the access to Western financial and technological resources. In 2018, Akorda hosted meeting with the heads of ExxonMobil, Goldman Sachs, Nasdaq companies. There were discussed the future prospects of established relations within Astana International Financial Center (AIFC). AIFC was officially presented in May 2018 in the former Expo-2017 pavilion. The intention was to enhance the country's image turning into a regional financial hub. Currently, the center operates under the jurisdiction of English law. During the meeting, the President of Nasdaq was impressed with AIFC development plan and showed the willingness to provide Kazakhstan's Stock Exchange with advanced technologies. Except Goldman Sachs and Nasdaq, the center is maintaining the partnership with Shanghai Stock Exchange (China), PAAMCO, Coursera, Bloomberg (USA), and SKOLKOVO (Russia). As AIFC Governor K. Kelimbetov highlighted, it is the only example in the region where the powers jointly work on developing the regional project.<sup>85</sup>

At the beginning of present year, US Government and Kazakhstani Minister of industry and infrastructure development signed an Agreement on air traffic or, in other words, open skies. According to the Agreement, airlines can make decisions based on their commercial interests and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> GE Transportation signs over \$900 million locomotive and service agreements. Global Railway Review, Jan. 17, 2018. URL: <a href="https://www.globalrailwayreview.com/news/65539/ge-transportation-locomotive/">https://www.globalrailwayreview.com/news/65539/ge-transportation-locomotive/</a> (Accessed: 9 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> Podvodim itogi vizita N. Nazarbayeva v SSHA [Summing up the results of N. Nazarbayev's visit to the US]. "Kaspiyskiy vestnik" Caspian region news portal, Jan. 18, 2018. URL: <a href="http://casp-geo.ru/podvodim-itogi-vizita-nursultana-naz/">http://casp-geo.ru/podvodim-itogi-vizita-nursultana-naz/</a> (Accessed: 1 January 2020)
<a href="https://casp-geo.ru/podvodim-itogi-vizita-nursultana-naz/">https://casp-geo.ru/podvodim-itogi-vizita-nursultana-naz/</a> (Accessed: 1 January 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup> MFTs "Astana" stanet klyuchevym elementom novoy finansovoy infrastruktury Yevrazii [Interview with MFC Director K. Kelimbetov: Astana MFC will become a key element of the new financial infrastructure of Eurasia]. Rossiyskaya gazeta, Jul. 2, 2018. URL: <a href="https://rg.ru/2018/07/02/mfc-astana-stanet-kliuchevym-elementom-novoj-finansovoj-infrastruktury-evrazii.html">https://rg.ru/2018/07/02/mfc-astana-stanet-kliuchevym-elementom-novoj-finansovoj-infrastruktury-evrazii.html</a> (Accessed: 11 February 2020)

market demand without interference from government mechanisms. The agreement allows countries to establish relations in the field of civil aviation in accordance with American international aviation policy. This provides unlimited capacity and frequency of transportation, rights to an open route, liberal mechanisms for charter transportation, and opportunities for joint flights. Air transport and affordable shipping services under the agreement can promote the development of tourism and trade, thereby opening up new opportunities for airlines, travel companies, and customers.<sup>86</sup> Thus, Kazakhstan-American transport and logistics cooperation is not developing in the traditional way.

#### 1.3. Energy Resources Remain as a Key Sector of Bilateral Dialogue

The fuel and energy are fundamental dimensions of Kazakhstan's cooperation with the powers. In recent years, Kazakhstan sought to become not only an exporter, but also, in accordance with the national interests of the country, to gain weight in the energy infrastructure. Additionally, one of the long-term priorities of Kazakhstan is the effective use of energy resources, which does not have such a huge reserve, with the subsequent goal of full digitization and greening of this industry. The importance of development in this direction was announced by N. Nazarbayev in 2015, during which the President instructed the national company "KazMunayGas" and the Ministry of Energy to intensify work on the exploration of hydrocarbon deposits. N. Nazarbayev asked a rhetorical question, adding: "The next issue is the processing of our raw materials. It applies to oil and gas, all metallurgy, chemistry. Drilling and selling are the easiest ones. The main point, how to reach higher value-added?" Thus, Kazakhstan was given the task of deep processing of raw materials, development of production, and attracting global companies for this purpose.

When it comes specifically to energy resources cooperation with the powers, all oil, gas, uranim triad are covering.

#### 1.3.1. Kazakhstan and Russia

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> The United States and Kazakhstan Sign Open Skies Agreement. U.S. Embassy & Consulate in Kazakhstan, Jan. 6, 2020. URL: <a href="https://kz.usembassy.gov/the-united-states-and-kazakhstan-sign-open-skies-agreement/">https://kz.usembassy.gov/the-united-states-and-kazakhstan-sign-open-skies-agreement/</a> (Accessed: 1 June 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> Prezident RK poruchil usilit razvedku uglevodorodnykh mestorozhdeniy [The President of Kazakhstan instructed to strengthen the exploration of hydrocarbon deposits]. "Kapital" business information center, Sep. 17, 2015. URL: <a href="https://kapital.kz/economic/43762/prezident-rk-poruchil-usilit-razvedku-uglevodorodnykh-mestorozhdeniy.html">https://kapital.kz/economic/43762/prezident-rk-poruchil-usilit-razvedku-uglevodorodnykh-mestorozhdeniy.html</a> (Accessed: 28 February 2020)

Interregional cooperation structures and large companies play a significant role to promote dialogue between countries in particular industries. Topic of the annual Interregional Cooperation Forum in 2014 was not random on hydrocarbon innovation. It follows that they discussed oil and gas fields prospects, fuel and energy cooperation.<sup>88</sup>

In Kazakhstan-Russian relations, one of the major energy projects is the Caspian Pipeline Consortium (CPC), which has been operating systematically since 1999. CPC transports oil from Kazakhstan's Tengiz station to Novorossiysk port in the Black Sea. In 2011, there was a decision to expand the pipeline's capabilities and began construction in Atyrau. In early 2014, the consortium Director said that there are significant delays in the deadline of the first phase of the project – there were three phases in Kazakhstan – and it had to be intensified. 89 Negotiations with recently appointed KazTransOil's Director helped to build momentum. At year-end, the first stage of expansion was completed, and upgraded Tengiz and Atyrau stations became operational. In 2016, an important event, oil transition from Kashagan through CPC system started. It is the most optimal route in terms of logistics. Late 2017, remaining stations in Kazakhstan came into force, completing the expansion and modernization process. Currently, 19% of the project belongs to Kazakhstan (Russia-24%, Chevron-15%) and four oil fields are operational: Tengiz, Atyrau, Isatay, Kurmangazy. Thus, we can assume that the international conflict and sanctions did not have a significant impact on the consortium, where the interests of the world's giants coincide in economic terms. It was a guarantee of the further expansion of Kazakhstan-Russian partnership. Former Director of KazTransOil outlined, it is one of the few projects in the world where international cooperation has been successfully implemented despite the unstable political situation. 90

N. Nazarbayev held a large-scale meeting with Russian companies in 2016. There were EuroChem, Polymetal, and Lukoil, etc.<sup>91</sup> Kazakhstan was actively engaged in negotiations with Lukoil. Past years of cooperation, the company invested \$9 billion in the national economy. In 2017-2018, the company intensively promoted environmental protection programmes in

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> XI Russia-Kazakhstan Interregional Cooperation Forum (full text content of meeting and speeches of N. Nazarbayev and V. Putin). Atyrau, Sep. 30, 2014. URL: <a href="http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/46700">http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/46700</a> (Accessed: 18 December 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> CPC General Director Nikolay Brunich gave the interview to Interfax on CPC plans. Caspian Pipeline Consortium, Feb. 10, 2014.URL: <a href="http://www.cpc.ru/EN/press/pressaboutus/Pages/20140210.aspx">http://www.cpc.ru/EN/press/pressaboutus/Pages/20140210.aspx</a> (Accessed: 4 February 2020) <sup>90</sup> KTK – effektivnyy i nadezhnyy marshrut dlya eksporta nefti [Interview with former Kaztransoil General Director K. Kabildin: CPC is an effective and reliable route for oil exports]. Caspian Pipeline Consortium, Mar. 3, 2018. URL: <a href="http://www.cpc.ru/RU/press/pressaboutus/Pages/20180303.aspx">http://www.cpc.ru/RU/press/pressaboutus/Pages/20180303.aspx</a> (Accessed: 4 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> Nazarbayev vstretilsya s rukovoditelyami Skolkovo, AvtoVAZa i RZHD [Nazarbayev met with with the heads Skolkovo, AvtoVAZa and RZHD]. "Vzglyad" business newspaper, Jun. 16, 2016. URL: <a href="https://vz.ru/news/2016/6/16/816400.html">https://vz.ru/news/2016/6/16/816400.html</a> (Accessed: 17 February 2020)

Kazakhstan, and signed a Memorandum with Kazakhmys on "green energy". <sup>92</sup> In April 2019, Lukoil and KazMunayGas signed a contract for Joint hydrocarbon field development project Zhenis in the Caspian. <sup>93</sup> It was followed by Agreement on joint mining activities and field development of another 1-P-2 block. In addition, Lukoil is going to participate in geological exploration program of Energy Ministry of Kazakhstan for 2021-2025. In the same year, Director of Lukoil was awarded Dostyk (Friendship) medal – the highest award of Kazakhstan for foreigners – personally by K.-J. Tokaev. <sup>94</sup> Apparently, bilateral relations will develop in the same way.

For 20 years, Kazakhstan's *gas production* is traditionally linked to the Russian market. KazRosGaz, operating under KazMunayGas and Gazprom, is responsible for all joint projects. Since 2012, Kazakhstan and Russia have been developing Karachaganak field with the following transportation to Orenburg gas processing plant. Bilateral tandem in Karachaganak covers both the country's and to neighboring countries' markets. Part of the processed gas is usually shipped back to Kazakhstan. In 2016, for the record, gas supply from Russia to Kazakhstan amounted to 2.8 billion m<sup>3</sup>. In the following years, gas imports showed only growth, resulting in a purchase volume of 5 billion m<sup>3</sup> in 2019. In case of Russia, Kazakhstan's natural gas exports show a decline: 2017-2 billion m<sup>3</sup>, 2018-2.3 billion m<sup>3</sup>, 2019-1 billion m<sup>3</sup>.

Kazakhstan depends on gas imports from a neighboring country not because of a lack of local resources. It is more technical issues. The country does not have a gas processing plant and a gas pipeline to all regions. Since the main volume of natural gas is located in the West, completely cutting off the Northern and Eastern parts from gas. To the experts, if Kazakhstan builds a gas processing plant planned in the Atyrau region, about 70% of the service used by Russian plant will be reduced. Thus, at the moment, Kazakhstan is more a gas carrier country of neighboring countries than an exporter of its own resources. It is worth noting that this model of cooperation is designed until 2027. In 2015, it was prolonged to 2038, which demonstrates the

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> Lukoil analyses possibilities for green energy projects in Kazakhstan. Lukoil oil company, Apr. 4, 2018. URL: https://www.lukoil.com/PressCenter/Pressreleases/Pressrelease?rid=210636 (Accessed: 4 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> Lukoil concludes contract for hydrocarbon exploration and developmet on Zhenis block in Kazakhstan. Lukoil oil company, Apr. 3, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.lukoil.com/api/presscenter/exportpressrelease?id=332259">https://www.lukoil.com/api/presscenter/exportpressrelease?id=332259</a> (Accessed: 4 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> V. Alekperov nagrazhden vysshey gosudarstvennoy nagradoy Kazakhstana [V. Alekperov was awarded the highest state award of Kazakhstan]. Lukoil oil company, Sep. 5, 2019. URL: <a href="https://lukoil.ru/PressCenter/Pressreleases/Pressrelease?rid=389625">https://lukoil.ru/PressCenter/Pressreleases/Pressrelease?rid=389625</a> (Accessed: 4 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>95</sup> Transportirovka gaza i marketing [Gas transportation and marketing]. LLP KazRosGas, May 27, 2020. URL: <a href="https://kazrosgas.org">https://kazrosgas.org</a> (Accessed: 2 June 2020)

countries` long-term attitude in cooperation. <sup>96</sup> Unless Kazakhstan`s intention to intensify its own gas structures launch could change the situation.

Kazakhstan started supplying liquefied natural gas (LNG) via road transport from Russia to Astana and the North-Eastern regions in 2016. In 2018, Gazprom and Energy Ministry of Kazakhstan once again discussed enhancing joint efforts to gasify these regions at the meeting in St.Petersburg. In 2019, Kazakhstan showed a willingness to join Russian project "Power of Siberia". Deputy Minister of Energy outlined that participation in the project helps the country to gasify the regions nearby to Russia. At the moment, Kazakhstan provides two possible ways of project development. Russian experts predict great benefits for Kazakhstan as well. First, the country will be able to supply the North-Eastern regions with natural gas from Barnaul. Second, although Kazakhstan cannot resell Russian gas to other markets as China under existing agreements, the country can supply remaining excess. Last not least, the country will earn extra income from transit. In the country will earn extra income from transit.

Kazakhstan-Russian cooperation in *uranium sector* pointed out in joint action Plan for 2013-2015. Since 2014, Russian company ARMZ (Rosatom) entered Kazakhstan's uranium production purchasing 100% shares of Uranium One company (Canada) with all deposits. It means, currently, Rosatom owns in Kazakhstan:

- 1. 70% of Betpak Dala LLP Akdala and South Inkai mines;
- 2. 50% of Karatau LLP Karatau mine;
- 3. 30% of Kyzylkum LLP Khorasan mine;
- 4. 50% Akbastau Akbastau mine;
- 5. 49.67% of JSC Zarechnoye Zarechnoye and South Zarechnoye mines. 99

In 2016, there were adopted documents within XI Interregional Cooperation Forum – Memorandum on expanding strategic cooperation in nuclear fuel between the Ministry of energy of Kazakhstan, national uranium mining company Kazatomprom and Rosatom. Hence, Kazakhstan and Russia reached Memorandum on construction nuclear power plant (NPP).

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> Kolomeytseva A. A. Problemy i perspektivy vzaimootnosheniy Rossii i stran SNG na rynke gaza [Problems and prospects of relations between Russia and the CIS countries in the gas market]. Moscow, Nauchnaya biblioteka, 2017. p. 246

p. 246

97 Alexey Miller and Kazakh Energy Minister Kanat Bozumbayev address cooperation prospects. Gazprom, Feb. 26, 2018. URL: <a href="https://www.gazprom.com/press/news/2018/february/article408091/">https://www.gazprom.com/press/news/2018/february/article408091/</a> (Accessed: 4 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>98</sup>Novyy tranzit: zachem Kazakhstanu "Sila Sibiri" [New transit: why Kazakhstan needs the "Power of Siberia"]. "Gazeta.ru" socio-political online publication, Nov. 27, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.gazeta.ru/business/2019/11/26/12833018.shtml">https://www.gazeta.ru/business/2019/11/26/12833018.shtml</a> (Accessed: 2 June 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup>Barnes H. Uranovaya igra Kazakhstana: mezhdu Rossiyey, Kitayem i Zapadom [Uranian game of Kazakhstan: between Russia, Chuins and West]. BBC Russian service, December 18, 2017. URL: <a href="https://www.bbc.com/russian/features-42315870">https://www.bbc.com/russian/features-42315870</a> (Accessed: 3 January 2020)

Following Memorandum, an Intergovernmental Agreement was preparing. But the process was suspended.

Kazakhstani government has been considering for a long time about the NPP, items under discussion only – when, where, and with whom. Since several countries – USA, Japan, France – are interested in cooperation except for Russia. 100 In 2019, V. Putin reminded K.-J. Tokayeva of the joint plan. But, in mid-2019, the President of Kazakhstan announced that there will be no construction of NPP in the country yet. 101 It remains unclear whether it was the result of a public protest or interference of other powers. Thus, Kazakhstan decided to bypass the NPP construction, so that it would not become another critical issue. However, cooperation with Rosatom is remaining a positive evidenced in recent meeting of Prime Minister A. Mamin with Rosatom's Director A. Likhachev and negotiations on other projects. 102

#### 1.3.2. Kazakhstan and China

G. Ageleuov argues that China is widening its presence in energy sectors of Kazakhstan. The author gave a number of examples how Chinese companies involved in the industries. For example, China acquired 95% shares of "Maten Petroleum" in 2014, which controls the Kazakh coast of the Caspian Sea near Atyrau. In 2015, Geo-Jade Petroleum bought KoZHan for \$350 million from the Eurasian Group with 100% field development right and shipping it to the Atyrau refinery, which also has a Chinese stake. 103

In 2014, Kazakhstan-Chinese cooperation in *oil industry* reached a higher level. Although the main Atasu-Alashankou oil pipeline was launched long before, in 2006, the pipeline became fully operational after Russia joined the project. The relevant agreement was reached after Kazakhstan decided that it could not fully cover the Chinese market demand, initially planned 20 million tons. Since 2014, the first oil transportation was carried out on the expanded route Priirtyshsk-Atasu-Alashankou on a contract between KazTransOil and Rosneft. 104 The contract

<sup>100</sup> Bitva titanov za mirnyy atom [Battle of the titans for the peaceful atom]. "Automic Energy" information portal, Mar. 25, 2013. URL: <a href="https://www.atomic-energy.ru/smi/2013/03/25/40683">https://www.atomic-energy.ru/smi/2013/03/25/40683</a> (Accessed: 13 September 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> Construction of a NPP in Kazakhstan is not planned yet – K. Tokayev. "The Qazaq Times" social-political portal, Jun. 11, 2019. URL: <a href="https://gazagtimes.com/en/article/63704">https://gazagtimes.com/en/article/63704</a> (Accessed: 11 October 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup>A. Mamin receives Head of Rosatom State Corporation Alexey Likhachev. Official Information Source of the Prime Minister of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Nov. 26, 2019. URL: https://primeminister.kz/en/news/a-mamin-prinyalglavu-goskorporacii-rosatom-a-lihacheva (Accessed: 29 May 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> Ageleuov G. Kitay-Kazakhstan: Perspektivy vzaimodeystviya [China-Kazakhstan: Prospects for cooperation]. News Agency "Fergana", May 25, 2017. URL: https://www.fergananews.com/articles/9422 (Accessed: 11 October

<sup>104</sup> Belova M. Atasu-Alashankou: istoriya reeksporta rossiyskoy nefti [Atasu-Alashankou: history of Russian oil reexport]. Business newspaper "RBK - TEK 360", July 2014. URL: http://tek360.rbc.ru/articles/4/ (Accessed: 11 October 2019)

was for a five-year term. In 2019, it was extended up to 2023. The volume of transit increased by 10 million tons per year in 2017 (2014\7 million tons). The share of Kazakhstan in this volume is not large, over 20% (2017\23.75%). Although Kazakhstan's oil was predominated by Russian, the country created new opportunities as a key oil transportation link in Atasu-Alashankou project, which was initially limited to only a small prospect. In the following years, the countries showed the intention to continue to cooperate. Accordingly, Energy Minister of Kazakhstan and the Chinese National Petroleum Company signed a Memorandum on enhanced bilateral cooperation. Currently, Kazakhstan is working on Kenkiyak-Atyrau oil pipeline, which will connect the Atasu-Alashankou with the West Kazakhstan region. In turn, it is expected that the country will increase oil transit to China to 13 million tons. 106

In *gas sector*, Kazakhstan has been cooperating with China since 2009, launched the first line of the gas pipeline. In this area, Kazakhstan similarly servers as a transportation corridor for gas from Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan to China.

In 2015, the construction of Beineu-Bozoi section of the main gas pipeline, connecting the West and South of Kazakhstan, was completed. In 2016, KazTransGas with Chinese Trans-Asia Gas Pipeline Company launched a gas pumping unit at the Bozoi compressor station of Beineu-Bozoi-Shymkent pipeline (BBS). BBS is the largest pipeline project in the history of independence transporting up to 6 billion m<sup>3</sup> and connecting all main gas pipelines of Kazakhstan into a single transport system. It lets, firstly, to reduce the country's energy dependence on external supplies. Secondly, Kazakhstan began to export its own gas to China.

In September 2016, KazMunayGas announced that Kazakhstan will start exporting gas to China at the end of the year. <sup>107</sup> Although Kazakhstan planned to supply 7 billion m3 of gas in 2017, the reached only 1 billion m3. In the coming two years, the volume demonstrated exceptional upswing, as a result, the country reached its initial goal in 2019. <sup>108</sup>

To date, Kazakhstan is the number one producer of uranium in the world. Although the country entered the market in 2009, it had already started to show record indicators in 2014. The case of China, Kazakhstan sharply increased uranium export by 35% in 2012. Since 2014, there

<sup>106</sup> Kazakhstan to increase Russian crude transit to China. "Reuters" international multimedia portal, Sep. 25, 2019. URL: https://www.reuters.com/article/kazakhstan-russia-china-oil-idAFL5N26G2X0 (Accessed: 2 June 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>105</sup> Kazakhstan i Kitay prodlevayut kontrakty na nedropolzovaniye [Kazakhstan and China to extend the contracts for subsoil use]. Azattyq Radio, Jul. 8, 2017. URL: <a href="https://rus.azattyq.org/a/28535123.html">https://rus.azattyq.org/a/28535123.html</a> (Accessed: 31 May 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>107</sup> Kitay i Kazakhstan rasshiryayut sotrudnichestvo [China and Kazakhstan are expanding their cooperation]. "Stan Radar" CA news, Nov. 15, 2016. URL: <a href="https://stanradar.com/news/full/22923-kitaj-i-kazahstan-rasshirjajut-sotrudnichestvo.html">https://stanradar.com/news/full/22923-kitaj-i-kazahstan-rasshirjajut-sotrudnichestvo.html</a> (Accessed: 1 June 2020)

Transportirovka gaza i marketing [Gas transportation and marketing]. LLP KazRosGas, May 27, 2020. URL: <a href="https://kazrosgas.org">https://kazrosgas.org</a> (Accessed: 2 June 2020)

was a decrease in the supply volume. But, it was insignificant and did not affect, as M. Shibutov noted, the status of China as a "strategic importer" of Kazakhstani uranium. <sup>109</sup> In the late 2014, the Prime Ministers of the two countries met in Beijing, and there were signed several documents between energy companies. There was an Agreement on mutually beneficial cooperation in nuclear energy between Kazatomprom and China Nuclear Energy Industry Corporation. The document facilitates the establishment of joint ventures of NPP inventive fuel assembly in Kazakhstan and development of uranium resources. <sup>110</sup> In 2015, Kazatomprom and CNEIC signed an Agreement to purchase temporary storage services for natural uranium concentrates in China and transport it to the USA. Thus, Kazakhstan expanded its uranium supply cooperation with China. <sup>111</sup> In 2015-2018, Kazakhstan and China have repeatedly noted, bilateral interaction should not be limit by uranium supply. Cooperation would cover all possible production sectors of nuclear energy. These issues were discussed between the Kazakhstan Energy Ministry and Chinese atomic energy Agency Chairman during the IAEA General Conference in 2019. As a result, the parties agreed to start supplying Kazakhstan's fuel assemblies to Chinese from this year. <sup>112</sup>

## 1.3.3. Kazakhstan and USA

During 2016-2018, N. Nazarbayev several times held an official reception of Chevron Executive Director (USA) and discussed further prospects for cooperation. Currently, Chevron remains one of the main players involved in all *oil and gas* projects, including field exploration, exploitation, production, transportation and marketing. The company had produced 3 billion barrels of oil putting into the country's budget \$113 billion (2017\28.7 million tons of oil\\$229 million). On past negotiations, energy will remain the leading industry of Kazakhstan-American

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> Shibutov M. Uranovaya zavisimost KNR ot Kazakhstana: zachem Kitayu stolko urana? [China's uranium dependence on Kazakhstan: why does China need so much uranium?] Information agency "Regnum", August 11, 2017. URL: https://regnum.ru/news/2309464.html (Accessed: 15 December 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> Kazakhstan i Kitay podpisali soglasheniy na \$14 mlrd. [Kazakhstan and China signed agreements worth \$14 billion]. "Kapital" business information center, Dec. 15, 2014 URL: <a href="https://kapital.kz/economic/35907/kazakhstan-i-kitay-podpisali-soglasheniy-na-14-mlrd.html">https://kapital.kz/economic/35907/kazakhstan-i-kitay-podpisali-soglasheniy-na-14-mlrd.html</a> (Accessed: 17 September 2019)

<sup>111</sup> Kazakhstan budet transportirovat uran v Severnuyu Ameriku cherez Kitay [Kazakhstan will transport uranium to North America via China]. "Ria Novosti" – Russian agency of international information, Sep. 2, 2015 URL: <a href="https://ria.ru/20150902/1223598591.html">https://ria.ru/20150902/1223598591.html</a> (Accessed: 31 May 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> Kazakhstan nameren uvelichit postavki urana v Kitay [Kazakhstan intends to increase uranium supplies to China]. "Kapital" business information center, Sep. 18, 2019 URL: <a href="https://kapital.kz/economic/81282/kazakhstan-nameren-uvelichit-postavki-urana-v-kitay.html">https://kapital.kz/economic/81282/kazakhstan-nameren-uvelichit-postavki-urana-v-kitay.html</a> (Accessed: 31 May 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup> Nazarbayev vstretilsya s ispolnitelnym direktorom Chevron [Nazarbayev met with Chevron Executive Director]. "Tengri news" online publication and information portal, May 2016. URL:https://tengrinews.kz/kazakhstan\_news/prezident-kazahstana-vstretilsya-rukovodstvom-kompanii-293973/; Nazarbayev vstretilsya s ispolnitelnym direktorom Chevron [Nazarbayev met with Chevron Executive Director]. "Tengri news" online publication and information portal, Nov. 22. 2017. URL:https://tengrinews.kz/kazakhstan\_news/nazarbaev-vstretilsya-s-ispolnitelnyim-direktorom-chevron-331528/;

economic cooperation as well. In this purpose, in 2017, the Kazakh-American energy partnership Commission started to work.<sup>114</sup>

At the end of 2017, the Minister of energy of Kazakhstan held a series of meetings with the U.S. Energy Ministers, presidents of a number of large companies such as Chevron, Gray, Parker Drilling, and other companies in nuclear, oil and gas in Washington. <sup>115</sup> In 2018, N. Nazarbayev and D. Trump shared intention to raise the level of bilateral energy partnership to a Strategic energy dialogue. According to discussion, the energy cooperation will not be limited exclusively by hydrocarbons. The dialogue will be carried out in an expanded format covering peaceful nuclear industry, technologies for carbon capture, storage and utilization, sustainability of energy networks, nuclear safety and non-proliferation. In 2019, Energy Ministry of Kazakhstan and Chevron signed a Memorandum of Understanding on reinvestment funds to finance profitable projects in Kazakhstan. It amounts to \$251 million.

Thus, it predicts further expanded presence of American companies in the Caspian. It also supported by Protocol on American cargo transportation through Aktau and Kuryk ports from 2017. Early negotiations on which, in fact, began in 2013. Russian expert E. Troitsky argues that the U.S. successfully took advantage freezing about 40% of Kazakhstani National Fund's assets in the London branch of the American Bank in 2017. In the author's word, the frozen assets story demonstrates that Kazkhstan came under strong pressure by the West for the first time. And the America expected from Kazakhstan, in exchange for access to Western financial and technological resources, a clearer positioning itself in global political confrontations. <sup>116</sup>

In 2014, Kazakhstan came out on top of *uranium exports* for the US market. The country overtook major uranium leaders such as Canada, Russia, and Australia. According to statistics, the volume of exports in 2014 is twice as large year-on-year. Since 2015, the USA became the largest donor for an International low-enriched uranium Bank establishment in Kazakhstan. To

\_

N. Nazarbayev obsudil s glavoy Chevron perspektivy vzaimodeystviya v sfere neftedobychi i neftepererabotki [Nazarbayev met with Chevron Executive Director]. "Kapital" business information center, Apr. 4, 2018. URL: <a href="https://kapital.kz/economic/68097/prezident-vstretilsya-s-glavoy-soveta-direktorov-shevron-mayklom-uirtom.html">https://kapital.kz/economic/68097/prezident-vstretilsya-s-glavoy-soveta-direktorov-shevron-mayklom-uirtom.html</a> (Accessed: 9 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> Kukeyeva F., Raimova G. Foreign Policy Concept of the Republic of Kazakhstan: Cooperation with the U.S. KazNU Bulletin, International relations and international law series, 2014, №2(66). pp. 28-33

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> Kazakhstan i SSHA obsudili ryad voprosov v oblasti energeticheskogo partnerstva [Kazakhstan and the United States discussed a number of issues in the field of energy partnership]. "Kursiv" business portal, Dec. 20, 2017. URL: <a href="https://kursiv.kz/news/otraslevye-temy/2017-12/kazakhstan-i-ssha-obsudili-ryad-voprosov-v-oblasti-energeticheskogo">https://kursiv.kz/news/otraslevye-temy/2017-12/kazakhstan-i-ssha-obsudili-ryad-voprosov-v-oblasti-energeticheskogo</a> (Accessed: 9 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> Troitskiy E. F. Kazakhstansko-amerikanskiye otnosheniya i "dilemma mnogovektornosti" [Kazakh-American relations and the "multi-vector dilemma"]. Center for Eurasian Studies at TSU, 2018, Expert comment No.1. pp. 1-4 <sup>117</sup> Sosedyam – pshenitsu, SSHA – uran [Neighbors – wheat, the US – uranium]. Azattyq Radio, Oct. 10, 2015. URL: <a href="https://rus.azattyq.org/a/export-kazakhstana-pshenitsa-uran-import-myasa/27298694.html">https://rus.azattyq.org/a/export-kazakhstana-pshenitsa-uran-import-myasa/27298694.html</a> (Accessed: 2 June 2020)

2015's data, America had invested \$99 million in this project. Meanwhile Kazakhstan-Russian negotiations on uranium and NPP construction had paused, Kazakhstan signed Agreement with the IAEA to create Low Enriched Uranium Bank to store reserves. In 2017, with the US partnership, the Bank became operational on the Ulba Metallurgical Plant territory in the East Kazakhstan region. Previously, the region was considered by Kazakhstan and Russia for NPP construction. In 2018, the US began conducting investigations on uranium imports, since it revealed a violation against its own interests. Possible sanctions or duties on uranium certainly would damage Kazakhstan. The country actively negotiated with the US within the existing bilateral commissions, personal meetings with the ministries of energy and economic sectors. They considered ways to protect the country's national interests and prevent the application of sanctions. However, in 2019, President Donald Trump decided not to take such radical measures. It, in turn, was warmly received by the authorities of Kazakhstan.

# 1.4. Regions as an Important Element of Deepening Trade and Economic Cooperation

While the political dimension of international relations is primarily governed by capitals, economic, social and cultural interactions are, in most cases, under regions responsibility. Kazakhstan cooperates with powers not only at the government or parliamentary level. Regions` cooperation is also a priority and significant. The case of Russia and China, it tends to apply predominantly to border regions, while Kazakhstan and USA intend to promote "regions-states" dialogue through local multi-national companies.

#### 1.4.1. Kazakhstan-Russian inter-regional and cross-border cooperation

Kazakhstan's earliest inter-regional and cross-border agreements were signed with Russia as an important mechanism. These are Agreement on border regions cooperation of 1995, 120

<sup>11</sup> 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup> Barnes H. Uranovaya igra Kazakhstana: mezhdu Rossiyey, Kitayem i Zapadom [Uranian game of Kazakhstan: between Russia, Chuins and West]. BBC Russian service, December 18, 2017. URL: <a href="https://www.bbc.com/russian/features-42315870">https://www.bbc.com/russian/features-42315870</a> (Accessed: 3 January 2020)

Minenergo Kazakhstana udovletvoreno otkazom Trampa ot kvot na uran [The Ministry of energy of Kazakhstan is satisfied with trump's rejection of quotas for uranium]. "Informburo.kz" information and analytical portal, Jul. 17, 2019. URL: <a href="https://informburo.kz/novosti/minenergo-kazahstana-udovletvoreno-otkazom-trampa-ot-kvot-na-uran.html">https://informburo.kz/novosti/minenergo-kazahstana-udovletvoreno-otkazom-trampa-ot-kvot-na-uran.html</a> (Accessed: 1 June 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>120</sup> Agreement between the Government of Russian Federation and the Government of Republic of Kazakhstan on cooperation of border regions of Jan. 26, 1995. Source: CIS Legislation. URL: <a href="https://cislegislation.com/document.fwx?rgn=8607">https://cislegislation.com/document.fwx?rgn=8607</a> (Accessed: 18 December 2019)

Agreement on interregional and cross-border cooperation of 2010.<sup>121</sup> This list includes documents between Russia and CIS, member of which Kazakhstan: Concept of interregional and cross-border cooperation up to 2020 from 2015.<sup>122</sup>

Agreements made it possible to acquire the necessary experience at the present stage. Currently, Kazakhstan maintains contacts with 76 constituent entities of Russia, and has more than 400 documents. Contemporary bilateral inter-regional cooperation carried out on the Programme for 2012-2017, <sup>123</sup> 2018-2023.

President K.-J. Tokayev`s words in the Omsk Interregional Forum, 70% of last year's trade turnover between Kazakhstan and Russia belongs to border-regions, which is 20% higher in 2014. This annual Forum is attended by Presidents, heads of regions, and representatives of all subjects of cooperation. Plenary and exhibition on a specific topic are usually held within the Forum. Previously, it was said on which topics Forums were held in 2014-2016. In those meetings, bilateral Joint Action Plan for 2016-2018 and Agreement on the preservation of the transborder Ural River ecosystem was concluded. The countries launched the International "Eurasia" project as well. The project is aiming at researching and assessing oil and gas reservoirs in the Caspian region. According to Kazakhstan, about 80% of the country's resources could be concentrated on this territory at a depth of up to 10 km. This is of great interest to major oil companies. 125

In Chelyabinsk XII Forum on a "Human capital development", a dozen intergovernmental treaties and 30 interregional agreements were signed. Key among these are Memorandum on cooperation between Transneft and KazTransOil, Agreement between Russian Centre of Expertise and Kazakhstani Agrarian Credit Corporation, Law on Determination of the Status of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>121</sup> 2010 jyláy 7 qyrkútektegi Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń Úkimeti men Resei Federatsiasynyń Úkimeti arasyndagy óńiraralyq jane shekara mańy yntymaqtastyqy týraly kelisim [Agreements between the Government of Republic of Kazakhstan and the Government of Russian Federation on interregional and cross-border cooperation of Sep. 7, 2010].
URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P100000905">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P100000905</a> (Accessed: 17 December)

<sup>122</sup> Yergaliyeva K., Zhanbulatova R. Kazakhstan-Russia cross-border cooperation in the context of the common economic space. Bulletin D'Eurotalent-fidjip, 2019, №3. pp.13-21

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>123</sup> 2011 jylgy 15 qyrkúiektegi Qazaqstan Respýblikasy men Resei Federatsiasy arasyndagy 2012-2017 jyldarga arnalgan óniraralyq jane shekara many yntymaqtastyq bagdarlamasy [Program of interregional and cross-border cooperation between the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Russian Federation for 2012-2017 of Sep. 15, 2011]. Source: Embassy of the RK in the RF.

URL: <a href="https://www.kazembassy.ru/rus/dvustoronnee-sotrudnichestvo/dogovornaya-baza/?cid=9">https://www.kazembassy.ru/rus/dvustoronnee-sotrudnichestvo/dogovornaya-baza/?cid=9</a> (Accessed: 18 December 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>124</sup> Russia-Kazakhstan Interregional Cooperation Forum (full text content of meeting and speeches of K.-J. Tokayev and V. Putin). Omsk, Nov. 7, 2019. URL: <a href="http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/61997">http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/61997</a> (Accessed: 18 Dec. 2019) <sup>125</sup> Meshcheryakov K. Y. The Russian-Kazakh relations during the "Ukrainian crisis", Klio, 2016, №5. pp. 118-134

Technological Oil in Main Oil Pipelines "Tuimazi - Omsk - Novosibirsk - 2" and "Omsk - Paylodar". 126

In 2018, on the initiative of President N. Nazarbayev, tourism in Kazakhstan and Russia was the topic of the session's agenda. The countries dealt with the modernization of border crossings for tourists, development of tourist transport and logistics infrastructure, promotion of maritime tourism in the Caspian Sea based on the "Treasures of the East" programme and space tourism in Baikonur. As a result, 25 interregional and commercial-type agreements were signed, including a Memorandum of Understanding and Tourism Cooperation between Economic Development Ministry of Russia and Culture and Sport Ministry of Kazakhstan and Protocol amending the Agreement on the Procedure for Crossing the Russian-Kazakhstan Borders for Residents since 2006.<sup>127</sup>

In 2019, the Forum was held for the second time in Omsk on the proposal of President V. Putin since its launch in 2003. At the XYI Forum, the heads of state and regions gathered to discuss topical issues of cross-border cooperation. Forum discussion was a wide-ranged covering all dimensions. For the first time, newly elected Kazakhstani President participated as a speaker. K.-J. Tokayev noted that it is necessary to focus on practical work and clear implementation of specific tasks after the Forum. These tasks have been consolidated into a package of more than 20 signed documents. The Concept of cross-border cooperation between the Ministries of economy, which unites about 20 regions of the countries, Joint Actions Programme of Transport Ministry of Russia and Industry and Infrastructure Development Ministry of Kazakhstan on border checkpoints, Agreement on cooperation between Russian SME Bank and Kazakhstani "Damu" Fund are an example of it. Kazakhstani President outlined the creation of a new economic zone "Qyzyljar" in the North Kazakhstan region for cooperation. In Kazakhstan, there have been functioning 12 special zones to promote foreign economic ties and develop the regions. To date, Oyzyljar is the only area on the border territory of Kazakhstan and Russia. The zone focuses on the production and processing of food products, building materials, furniture, electronics, and mechanical engineering. Kazakhstan intends to cooperate with both foreign investors and Russian

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>126</sup> Russia-Kazakhstan Interregional Cooperation Forum (full text content of meeting and speeches of N. Nazarbayev and V. Putin). Chelyabinsk, Nov. 9, 2017. URL: <a href="http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/56031">http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/56031</a> (Accessed: 16 December 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>127</sup> Russia-Kazakhstan Interregional Cooperation Forum (full text content of meeting and speeches of N. Nazarbayev and V. Putin). Petropavlovsk, Nov. 9, 2018. URL: <a href="http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/59075">http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/59075</a> (Accessed: 17 December 2019)

regions. More than 500 enterprises with Russian capital are already working in these spheres in Kazakhstan. 128

The case of Russia, it is difficult to analyze separately one region from another. It is as much as 7000 km., and several dozen large border regions such as the Altai Republic, Novosibirsk, Orenburg, Astrakhan, Omsk (Russia), Pavlodar, Atyrau, Aktobe, Kostanay, -Western,- Northern,- Eastern Kazakhstan. Only the Republic of Tatarstan signed an Agreement on cooperation in all dimensions with Kyzylorda, Atyrau and Aktobe during 2014-2017. There is an annual Action Plan for cooperation between Tatarstan and the East Kazakhstan region as well. At the moment, the countries are working on a plan of a logistics center for Kazakhstani producers in Tatarstan. The preliminary estimated project is at 3 billion tenge. In addition, Kazakhstan promotes cooperation with non-border regions. To rexample, since 2013, there is a special short-term large-scale programme between Astana and St. Petersburg. St. Petersburg "Kirovtsev" company in the Kostanay region produced 500 tractors during 2014-2017. In 2019, Prime Minister A. Mamin announced the launch of an expanded project, where Kirovtsev plant in Kazakhstan will launch 500 tractors a year. This will certainly have a positive impact on the national strategy for industrial development. Examples like these abound in the Kazakhstan-Russian interregional

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup> Russia-Kazakhstan Interregional Cooperation Forum (full text content of meeting and speeches of K.-J. Tokayev and V. Putin). Omsk, Nov. 7, 2019. URL: <a href="http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/61997">http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/61997</a> (Accessed: 18 Dec. 2019) <sup>129</sup> Soglasheniye mezhdu Pravitelstvom Respubliki Tatarstan i Akimatom Kyzylordinskoy oblasti o cotrudnichestve ot 2 dekabrya 2014 [Agreement on cooperation between Republic of Tatarstan and Akimat of Kyzylorda region of Dec. 2, 2014] 02.12.2014. Source: Ministry of Industry and Trade of the Republic of Tatarstan. URL: <a href="https://mpt.tatarstan.ru/rus/respublika-kazahstan.htm">https://mpt.tatarstan.ru/rus/respublika-kazahstan.htm</a> (Accessed: 21 March 2020);

Soglasheniye mezhdu Pravitelstvom Respubliki Tatarstan i Akimatom Atyrauskoy oblasti o sotrudnichestve ot 2 dekabrya 2014 [Agreement on cooperation between Republic of Tatarstan and Akimat of Atyrau region of Dec. 2, 2014]. Source: Ministry of Industry and Trade of the Republic of Tatarstan. URL: https://mpt.tatarstan.ru/rus/respublika-kazahstan.htm (Accessed: 21 March 2020);

Soglasheniye mezhdu Pravitelstvom Respubliki Tatarstan i Akimatom Aktyubinskoy oblasti sotrudnichestve ot 10 noyabrya 2017 [Agreement on cooperation between Republic of Tatarstan and Akimat of Aktobe region of Nov. 10, 2017]. Source: Ministry of Industry and Trade of the Republic of Tatarstan. URL: ttps://mpt.tatarstan.ru/rus/respublika-kazahstan.htm (Accessed: 21 March 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>130</sup> V Tatarstane planiruyut postroit logisticheskiy tsentr dlya produktov iz Respubliki Kazakhstan [Tatarstan plans to build a logistics center for products from Kazakhstan]. Trade Representative Office of Ministry of trade and integration of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the Russian Federation, Mar. 31, 2020. URL: <a href="https://kaztrade.ru/news/v-tatarstane-planiruyut-postroit-logisticheskiy-centr-dlya-produktov-iz-respubliki-kazahstan.html">https://kaztrade.ru/news/v-tatarstane-planiruyut-postroit-logisticheskiy-centr-dlya-produktov-iz-respubliki-kazahstan.html</a> (Accessed: 29 May 2020)

Astana and St. Petersburg reached agr't on cooperation. "Strategy2050.kz" Information agency, Nov. 13, 2013. URL: https://strategy2050.kz/en/news/3179/ (Accessed: 25 May 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>132</sup> V Kazakhstane zapustili zavod po proizvodstvu traktorov "Kirovets" [In Kazakhstan, the plant launched the production of tractors "Kirovets"]. Trade Representative office of Ministry of trade and integration of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the Russian Federation, Oct. 25, 2019. URL: <a href="https://kaztrade.ru/news/v-kazahstane-zapustili-zavod-po-proizvodstvu-traktorov-kirovec.html">https://kaztrade.ru/news/v-kazahstane-zapustili-zavod-po-proizvodstvu-traktorov-kirovec.html</a> (Accessed: 29 May 2020)

partnership. As V. Putin pointed out, "due largely to regional activity, Russian-Kazakh economic ties are strengthening, expanding and, most importantly, diversifying from year to year." <sup>133</sup>

# 1.4.2. Kazakhstan-Chinese cross-border cooperation

Kazakhstan-China interregional dialogue began relatively later. By 2014, the legal framework contained a bilateral Agreement on the Seaport of Lianyungang city to transport Kazakh cargo from September 11, 1995, and Agreement on the International Center for cross-border cooperation (ICBC) "Khorgos" from September 24, 2004. In 2005, an Agreement on the center's activities was reached and construction began. The document had been amended several times since then. The most recent was set out from March 11, 2014.<sup>134</sup>

In 2015, as a result of Astana negotiations, Kazakhstan-Chinese Cross-border Cooperation Programme for 2015-2020 was drawn up. 135 It took bilateral relations to a new level and enabled it to proceed with both previous agreements and new projects.

Since 2017, an interregional forum analogous to the Russian-Kazakh has been functioning. It was held for the first time in Nanning (China). The Kazakh delegation was led by Prime Minister A. Mamin. The event discussed investment opportunities for each Kazakhstani region and possible establishment of a joint investment fund. In consequence, in 2018, during the official visit of N. Nazarbayev to Beijing, a trilateral Agreement on the Eurasian (Nurly) Investment Fund was reached. National Holding "Baiterek", Chinese-Eurasian Economic Cooperation Fund, and CITIC Eurasian Capital Limited signed the agreement.

II Interregional Forum on "Industrial cooperation" took place in Almaty 2019. The countries discussed possible cooperation in transport and agriculture, and agreed to continue

documents. 2010. p. 524

<sup>135</sup>2015 jyláy 11 jeltoqsandaáy Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń Úkimeti men Qytai Halyq Respýblikasynyń Úkimeti arasyndaáy 2015-2020 jyldaráa arnaláan shekara mańy yntymaqtastyq baádarlamasy [Cross-border cooperation program for 2015-2020 between the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Government of People's Republic of China for 2015-2020 of Dec. 11, 2015]. URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P1500001004">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P1500001004</a> (Accessed: 12 January 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>133</sup> Russia-Kazakhstan Interregional Cooperation Forum (full text content of meeting and speeches of K.-J. Tokayev and V. Putin). Omsk, Nov. 7, 2019. URL: <a href="http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/61997">http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/61997</a> (Accessed: 18 Dec. 2019) <sup>134</sup> Syroezhkin K. Kazakhstan-Kitay: ot prigranichnoy torgovli k strategicheskomu partnerstvu [Kazakhstan-China: from cross-border trade to strategic partnership]. Almaty, KazISS, Monography in 3 books. – Book 3. Collection of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>136</sup> A. Mamin takes part in 1st Kazakhstan-China Interregional Coop Forum. Kazahstanskaya pravda, Sep. 12, 2017. URL: <a href="https://www.kazpravda.kz/en/news/politics/askar-mamin-took-part-in-the-first-kazakhstan-china-interregional-coop-forum">https://www.kazpravda.kz/en/news/politics/askar-mamin-took-part-in-the-first-kazakhstan-china-interregional-coop-forum</a> (Accessed: 12 March 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>137</sup> Kazakhstan and China have established a joint investment fund. JSC National Managing Holding "Baiterek", Jun. 11, 2018. URL: <a href="https://www.baiterek.gov.kz/en/news/kazakhstan-and-china-have-established-joint-investment-fund">https://www.baiterek.gov.kz/en/news/kazakhstan-and-china-have-established-joint-investment-fund</a> (Accessed: 10 February 2020)

operating within the intergovernmental agreement on strengthening cooperation in industrialization and investments. 138

Currently, cooperation between Almaty region, East Kazakhstan region, and Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous (XUAR) are the most successful. It was mentioned as a priority one in the above-mentioned Programme. In Chinese Consul General's words, Almaty, Shymkent cities, and Zhambyl, Turkistan regions are active as well. Northern and Western regions similarly cooperate with China in particular trade and economic projects. 139

Kazakhstan has been deepening cooperation with XUAR, which includes 24 Chinese entities, since the early `90s. More than half of bilateral trade belongs to the region. In 2014, the result of the first three-quarters of trade between Kazakhstan and XUAR amounted to \$8.3 billion, which was 11.3% lower than the previous years. Despite the XUAR`s high share, total trade turnover with the region in the next two years decreased in a crisis consequence. He are the previous gave a new impetus to trade and economic ties. In 2016, the official launch of ICBC "Khorgos" gave a new impetus to trade and economic ties. In 2017, total trade increased by 49.3% to \$9.42 billion. It was a whole 89% of Kazakhstan-Chinese total trade turnover that year. Such dynamic growth can be attributed not only to the ICBC "Khorgos", but also the beginning of the gas export to China since 2017. The main advantages of the center are exemption from customs payments up to 50 kg (\$1600), and the possibility of free movement within Khorgos to both citizens and foreigners legally staying in these countries. Currently, 2 to 7 thousand people visit Khorgos per day. He

In 2018, Nur Zholy automobile checkpoint started to work. Kazakhstan announced that it is provided with modern technology and is able to pass from 2500 to 5000 heavy and passenger transports per day. In turn, XUAR's Chairman highlighted that such projects are very important

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>138</sup> Kazakhstan-China Interregional Cooperation Forum kicks off in Almaty. "Informburo.kz" information and analytical portal, May 15, 2019URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-china-interregional-cooperation-forum-kicks-off-in-almaty\_a3526427">https://www.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-china-interregional-cooperation-forum-kicks-off-in-almaty\_a3526427</a> (Accessed: 8 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>139</sup> Podnimem parusa dlya dalnego plavaniya po vostochnomu vetru "Odnogo poyasa, odnogo puti" [We will raise sails for long-distance navigation on the East wind "One belt-One way"]. Embassy of the people's Republic of China in the Republic of Kazakhstan, Apr. 25, 2019. URL: <a href="http://kz.china-embassy.org/rus/dszc/emba/t1657856.htm">http://kz.china-embassy.org/rus/dszc/emba/t1657856.htm</a> (Accessed: 28 January 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>140</sup> Syroezhkin K. Problems of Modern Kazakh-Chinese Relations. Russia and New States of Eurasia, 2019, No I (XLII). pp. 21-36

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>141</sup> Khorgos – raiskoe mesto dlia pokupatelei i turistov iz Kitaia i Kazakhstana [Khorgos is a key destination for shoppers and tourists from China and Kazakhstan]. Xinhua News, Jun. 18, 2017. URL: <a href="http://russian.mofcom.gov.cn/article/counselorsreport/201706/20170602595194.shtml">http://russian.mofcom.gov.cn/article/counselorsreport/201706/20170602595194.shtml</a> (Accessed: 11 February 2020) <sup>142</sup> Rekordnoe chislo turistov posetilo MTSPS Khorgos [Record number of tourists visited ICBC "Khorgos" in 2018]. "Informburo.kz" information and analytical portal, Jan. 7, 2019. URL: <a href="https://informburo.kz/novosti/rekordnoe-chislo-turistov-posetilo-mcps-horgos-v-2018-godu.html">https://informburo.kz/novosti/rekordnoe-chislo-turistov-posetilo-mcps-horgos-v-2018-godu.html</a> (Accessed: 8 February 2020)

for trade and economic partnership. Accordingly, 2018's trade turnover increased by 3.5%, placing Kazakhstan at the top of the list of countries cooperating with the autonomous region.<sup>143</sup>

In 2019, 4 new checkpoints were opened. These are Maikapchagai-Zimunai, Dostyk-Alashankou, Kolzhat-Dulat, Bakhty-Bakitu. They connect XUAR with Almaty and East Kazakhstan regions. To the Urumqi Customs Authority, the trade turnover with the region increased by 22.9%, which certainly affected a 10.4% increase in total trade turnover compared to 2018. On the latest data, the first two months of 2020, the trade between Kazakhstan and the region amounted to \$2.81 billion. The share of export was 64.75%, import – 35.4%.

Cooperation between XUAR and East Kazakhstan region is one of the most significant in the context of "strategic developing". Although the East Kazakhstan region has close industrial, social, and trade ties with Russia, today's Chinese influence is increasing. 25% of the East Kazakhstan region's trade turnover belongs to XUAR. The regions have joint ventures in construction, agriculture, forestry, metallurgy.<sup>146</sup>

Key projects in the East Kazakhstan region concern the gas sector. Kazakhstan's Tarbagatai Munai Gas and China have been exploiting Sarybulak deposit in Zaisan border city since 2013. Part of the gas is supplied for the local population, the rest is exported to China. Over the past 5 years, Sarybulak exported 400-500 million m³ out of the total available 5 billion m³, while only 10 million m³ was used to provide the region. Initially, the governor of the region considered the prospects of gas transportation to neighboring sub-regions – Kurshim, Tarbagatay, Zharma, and the administrative center Oskemen – providing the entire region. But, in 2018, Deputy General Director of Tarbagatai Munai Gas noted that Sarybulak's geological reserves are smaller compared to the Western and Southern Kazakhstan fields, and it may last only for 2 years. The low wholesale price, which has not been changed since 2013 despite the crisis and devaluation, calls into question

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>143</sup> "Nur zholy" new vehicle pass to be opened on the Kazakhstan-Chinese border. The national chamber of entrepreneurs of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Atameken", Sep. 26, 2018. URL: <a href="https://atameken.kz/en/news/30561-na-kazahstansko-kitajskoj-granice-otkroyut-novyj-avtopropusk-nur-zholy">https://atameken.kz/en/news/30561-na-kazahstansko-kitajskoj-granice-otkroyut-novyj-avtopropusk-nur-zholy</a> (Accessed: 28 January 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>144</sup> V ianvare-iiule 2019 goda tovarooborot mezhdu Kitaem i Kazakhstanom uvelichilsia [In Jan.-Jul., the trade turnover between China and Kazakhstan increased by 8.6 percent]. Xinhua News, Sep. 23, 2019. URL: <a href="http://russian.news.cn/2019-09/23/c">http://russian.news.cn/2019-09/23/c</a> 138415033.htm (Accessed: 8 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>145</sup> Import kitayskikh tovarov v Kazakhstan snizilsya na 24% [Imports of Chinese goods to Kazakhstan decreased by 24%]. "Kapital" business information center, Apr. 3, 2020. URL: <a href="https://kapital.kz/economic/85964/import-kitayskikh-tovarov-v-kazakhstan-snizilsya-na-24.html">https://kapital.kz/economic/85964/import-kitayskikh-tovarov-v-kazakhstan-snizilsya-na-24.html</a> (Accessed: 8 May 2020)

Wostochno-Kazakhstanskaia oblast kak obrazets sotrudnichestva [East Kazakhstan region as a role-model of cooperation]. SILUXGC – New silk road observation, Jun. 28, 2019. URL: http://ru.siluxgc.com/html/R1413/201906/8998008735502706114017.shtml (Accessed: 13 March 2020)

the expansion of the project as well. Thus, the largest Kazakh-Chinese project in the region requires a decision at the government level at the moment.<sup>147</sup>

In industrial sphere, China participates in the construction of a mining and processing complex "Aktogay" in Ayaguz and Turgusun hydroelectric power station (HEPP) in Zyryanov. Aktogay built by Non Ferrous China launched the first production of copper in 2017. In 2019, KAZ Minerals` Head mentioned about the expansion. They have already started building "Aktogay-2", which is being planned finished by 2021. Turgusun HEPP's construction, which is underway since 2013, was interrupted in mid-2019 due to weather conditions. Late 2019, the Director of Turgusun-1 reported that 92% of the project was ready, and it is near to complete. Simultaneously, East Kazakhstan region's Deputy Governor noted, the region plans 5 more projects with China.

The regions are also interested in tourism, another profitable area in economic terms. In 2014, Kazakhstan started to develop destinations for Chinese tourists. In 2015, the country launched direct flights Urumqi-Ust-Kamenogorsk. <sup>150</sup> In 2018, official visit of the regional Governor to Xinjiang gave new impetus to the tourism cooperation development. As a result, Chinese bloggers and media representatives were invited to the region. In early 2019, a Chinese cultural and tourist exhibition was held in Oskemen. It is the first large-scale Chinese cultural event organized in Kazakhstan. After that, XUAR's Deputy Chairman officially visited the region, and the local administration came to an agreement to cooperate in tourism and culture. The regions are enthusiastic about a lanned Urumchi-Tacheng (Shaueshek) railway, which helps to promote tourism between regions. <sup>151</sup>

Thus, it can be conclude, contemporary interregional cooperation between Kazakhstan and China is evolving rapidly in different dimensions.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>147</sup> Kto v konechnom itoge dolzhen zanimatsia gazifikatsiei VKO? [Interview with A. Kulzhanov, first Deputy General Director Tarbagatai Munai: Who should ultimately be engaged in gasification of East Kazakhstan region?]. Forbes Kazakhstan, Feb. 10, 2020. URL: <a href="https://forbes.kz//process/energetics/strategicheskiy\_gaz/?">https://forbes.kz//process/energetics/strategicheskiy\_gaz/?</a> (Accessed: 13 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>148</sup> KAZ Minerals namerena poluchit med s proyekta Aktogay II v 2022 godu [Kazakhstan: Kaz Minerals to get copper from Aktogay II in 2022]. "Kapital" business information center, Jan. 23, 2018. URL: <a href="https://kapital.kz/economic/66287/kaz-minerals-namerena-poluchit-med-s-proyekta-aktogay-ii-v-2022-godu.html">https://kapital.kz/economic/66287/kaz-minerals-namerena-poluchit-med-s-proyekta-aktogay-ii-v-2022-godu.html</a> (Accessed: 11 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>149</sup> Uzhe v dekabre na reke Turgusun v raione Altai planiruiut poluchit elektroenergiiu [It is planned to get electricity on the Turgusun river in the Altai region]. "Altaynews.kz" online publication, Nov. 10, 2019. URL: <a href="https://altaynews.kz/ru/uzhe-v-dekabre-na-reke-turgusun-v-rajone-altaj-planiruyut-poluchit-elektroenergiyu-43896.html">https://altaynews.kz/ru/uzhe-v-dekabre-na-reke-turgusun-v-rajone-altaj-planiruyut-poluchit-elektroenergiyu-43896.html</a> (Accessed: 13 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>150</sup> Zaisan. Zhizn prigranichnogo goroda [Zaisan. Life at the border]. Azattyq Radio, Jan. 23, 2020. URL: <a href="https://rus.azattyq.org/a/kazakhstan-vko-zaisan-reportage/30389825.html">https://rus.azattyq.org/a/kazakhstan-vko-zaisan-reportage/30389825.html</a> (Accessed: 11 February 2020)

<sup>151 1</sup>st China Culture and Tourist Expo kicks off in East Kazakhstan. "Kazinform" international news agency, Feb. 23, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/en/1st-china-culture-and-tourist-expo-kicks-off-in-e-kazakhstan a3503098">https://www.inform.kz/en/1st-china-culture-and-tourist-expo-kicks-off-in-e-kazakhstan a3503098</a> (Accessed: 14 February 2020)

## 1.4.3. First attempts of cooperation between Kazakhstani regions and American states

Obviously, the Kazakh-American interregional partnership differs from its neighboring powers, and there are no interregional agreements or memoranda in the legal framework. From one side, it is constrained by geographical distance. On the other side, it is because regional cooperation with Kazakhstan in American foreign policy was interpreted as a part of its policy in CA. Therefore, Kazakhstan itself was seen as part of a whole. Accordingly, there is a lack of successful examples of cooperation between the countries` regional actors. Nevertheless, it does not alter the power's "largest investor" position in the energy, tourism, health, and resource industries. The U.S. actively operates through its multinational companies in the big cities and Western Kazakhstan. Last 5 years, positive changes can be seen in other regions, where the emphasis is placed on agriculture.

In 2014, Kazakhstan's Ambassador K. Umarov made a working trip to Pennsylvania and met with State House Representative Joe Pitts. During the meeting, the American parliamentarian was introduced the strategy Kazakhstan-2050, and K. Umarov stressed the desire to improve the investment climate in the country. In turn, the Congressman praised possible cooperation between Pennsylvania and Kazakhstani regions with particular emphasis on agriculture and engineering. <sup>152</sup>

In 2015, the Karaganda region reached an agreement with Halliburton on a joint project. The Texas company has been involved in all major oil and gas production projects in Western Kazakhstan since 1994: Tengiz, Karachaganak, Kashagan. The project is aimed to produce barite concentrate, which is used during oil drilling. Another American company MOUAT participated in the design and manufacture of the plant's equipment. The result of the cooperation is currently functioning Karazhal Operating with a monobarite deposit with a 107 m. depth. The plant is the largest and high-tech in the entire CIS with a capacity of 200.000 tons per year. <sup>153</sup>

In 2016, Shymkent and AECOM Corporation signed Cooperation and Understanding Memorandum. To the Memorandum, the company will participate in a large-scale "Shymkent City" project, conduct marketing research, and attract investment. As the regional Director noted, AECOM plans to work with the city administration in the industrial and logistics constructions

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>152</sup> Kazakhstan and the USA interested in developing interregional coop. "Kazinform" international news agency, Oct. 22, 2014. URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-and-the-usa-interested-in-developing-interregional-coop-a2709037">https://www.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-and-the-usa-interested-in-developing-interregional-coop-a2709037</a> (Accessed: 16 February 2020)

Operating]. Forbes Kazakhstan, Oct. 7, 2015.

URL: <a href="https://forbes.kz//process/businessmen/jumabek janyikulov ot mechtyi do dostijeniya tseli/?">https://forbes.kz//process/businessmen/jumabek janyikulov ot mechtyi do dostijeniya tseli/?</a> (Accessed: 9 February 2020)

going beyond this project. In mid-2019, the first houses of the apartment complex were put into operation. 154

In 2018, Deputy Ambassador John M. Pommersheim to Kazakhstan went to Petropavlovsk, an administrative center of the North Kazakhstan region. During a two-day visit, Deputy Ambassador visited the "Universal" road and highway construction company, which uses American technology. J. M. Pommersheim pointed out that the purpose of his visit was to get acquainted with the region and its potential to further deepen cooperation and strengthen economic ties. 155 Deputy Prime Minister – Minister of agriculture U. Shukeyev's official visit to Illinois and Minnesota in the fall of 2018 was with an efficient outcome. 156 As early as October 2018, U.S. Secretary of Commerce Wilbur Ross arrived in Kazakhstan with directors of 16 major American companies to establish and expand business ties. Visited companies such as Tyson Foods, Global Beef Production, ANIMART, and Valmont Industries mainly specialize in agriculture, infrastructure, and energy. Within the trade Mission, a high-level meeting and a business forum were organized. After the official part, the delegation visited several regions of Kazakhstan. 157

The subsequent years were characterized by the gradual implementation of bilateral agreements. For instance, Illinois Corporation AGCO-GSI started a large-scale 16 billion tenge project in the Karaganda region. The project is aimed at the establishment of a Nuanced Genetic Breeding and Hybrid Centre for Pig Breeding. AGCO-GSI made this decision after three years of analysis of local market prospects. 200 hectares of the region has been allocated for the construction of the project. The partners aim to export goods to the Russian and Chinese markets. 158 The company had visited the Kostanay region and explored possibilities of cooperation in the meat and milk products processing as well. 159 But so far, no joint projects have been accepted with this region.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>154</sup> Amerikanskaia kompaniia AECOM namerena privlech investitsii v proekt Shymkent-Siti [American company AECOM intends to attract investment in the project "Shymkent city"]. "Inbusiness.kz" news agency, Jun. 25, 2016. URL: https://inbusiness.kz/ru/last/amerikanskaya-kompaniya-aecom-namerena-privlech-investitsii (Accessed: 16 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>155</sup> Zamestitel posla SSHA rasskazal zachem priezzhal v Petropavlovsk [The Deputy US Ambassador told why he came to Petropavlovsk]. Petropavlovsk News, Apr. 05, 2018. URL: <a href="https://pkzsk.info/zamestitel-posla-ssha-">https://pkzsk.info/zamestitel-posla-ssha-</a> <u>rasskazal-zachem-priezzhal-v-petropavlovsk/</u> (Accessed: 16 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>156</sup> Kazakhstan nameren privlech amerikanskiye investitsii [Kazakhstan intends to attract American investment]. "Kapital" business information center, Jul. 29, 2018. URL: https://kapital.kz/economic/72393/kazakhstan-nameren-<u>privlech-amerikanskiye-investitsii.html</u> (Accessed: 16 February 2020)

157 Biznes SSHA zainteresovan v investitsiiakh v selskoe khoziaistvo Kazakhstana. 26.10.2018. Source:

https://www.inform.kz/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>158</sup> Amerikantsy investiruiut v Karagandinskuiu oblast [Americans invest in Karaganda region]. "Novyi vestnik" magazine - News of Karaganda and Karaganda region, Nov. 8, 2018. URL: https://nv.kz/2018/11/08/222291/ (Accessed: 16 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>159</sup> American companies are studying investment opportunities in Kostanay region. Akimat of Kostanay region, Nov. 9, 2018. URL: https://www.gov.kz/memleket/entities/kostanay?lang=ru (Accessed: 16 February 2020)

Late 2019, Prime Minister A. Mamin got acquainted with the research and production capabilities of Tyson Foods and Valmont Industries during a business visit of Arkansas and Nebraska. As a result, Kazakhstan reached an agreement with Tyson Foods to implement the agromultiprotein industry program. And Agriculture Ministry of Kazakhstan, Kazakhstani Kusto company, and Valmont Industries signed an agreement on efficient irrigation and improvement of agricultural productivity. Early 2020, on the Agreements, Tyson Foods showed its willingness to cooperate with the Almaty region, and build a meat processing plant for \$300 million. The governor of the region supported the idea. He mentioned that 9 out of 19 projects implemented by transnational companies are in their region, emphasizing the importance of administrative actor and its experience. Meanwhile, Turkistan region with Valmont Industries and Lindsay Corporation agreed to a rainwater irrigation programme and promote animal farming. Turkistan region Governor instructed to create a special working group to implement these projects. 162

Kazakhstani Ambassador E. Kazykhanov's working trip to Atlanta to discuss opportunities of trade and economic cooperation between Kazakhstan and Georgia <sup>163</sup> and the ceremonial opening of Agrotech exhibition in Kazakhstan by U.S. Ambassador W. Moser in early 2020<sup>164</sup> demonstrates that cooperation between Kazakhstan and USA at the region-states level will continue. And the main catalyst from the American side will be multinational companies.

\*\*\*

To sum up, Kazakhstan's trade and economic strategic interaction with great powers in 2014-2019 had persistent and progressive character. To identify this feature in trade and economic cooperation, different aspects were examined. Firstly, the structural and legal mechanisms

1/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>160</sup> Prime Minister Askar Mamin's working trip to the US and Great Britain. Official Information Source of the Prime Minister of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Dec. 10, 2019. URL: <a href="https://primeminister.kz/en/media/photo/rabochiy-vizit-premer-ministra-rk-askara-mamina-v-ssha-i-velikobritaniyu">https://primeminister.kz/en/media/photo/rabochiy-vizit-premer-ministra-rk-askara-mamina-v-ssha-i-velikobritaniyu</a> (Accessed: 16 February 2020)

premer-ministra-rk-askara-mamina-v-ssha-i-velikobritaniyu (Accessed: 16 February 2020)

161 Tyson Foods looks into processing meat in Kazakhstan. Trend News Agency, Feb. 14, 2020. URL: https://en.trend.az/business/construction/3191924.html (Accessed: 16 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>162</sup> Amerikanskie tekhnologii vnedriaiut v Turkestanskoi oblasti [American technologies are being introduced in Turkestan]. "Yuzhnyy Kazakhstan" socio-political newspaper, Jan. 31, 2020. URL: <a href="https://yujanka.kz/amerikanskie-tehnologii-vnedryayut-v-turkestanskoj-oblasti/">https://yujanka.kz/amerikanskie-tehnologii-vnedryayut-v-turkestanskoj-oblasti/</a> (Accessed: 16 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>163</sup> Ambassador strengthens commercial ties with Georgia. Consulate General of the Republic of Kazakhstan in New York city, Jan. 28, 2020. URL: <a href="https://kazconsulny.org/kazykhanov-kazakhstan-strengthens-ties-georgia">https://kazconsulny.org/kazykhanov-kazakhstan-strengthens-ties-georgia</a> (Accessed: 16 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>164</sup> Mezhdunarodnaya vystavka selskogo khozyaystva startovala v stolitse [International exhibition of agriculture started in Nur-Sultan]. "Khabar" news agency, Mar. 11, 2020. URL: <a href="https://24.kz/ru/news/economyc/item/379753-mezhdunarodnaya-vystavka-selskogo-khozyajstva-startovala-v-">https://24.kz/ru/news/economyc/item/379753-mezhdunarodnaya-vystavka-selskogo-khozyajstva-startovala-v-</a>

stolitse#:~:text=%D0%A1%D0%B5%D0%B3%D0%BE%D0%B4%D0%BD%D1%8F%20%D0%B2%20%D1%81 %D1%82%D0%BE%D0%BB%D0%B8%D1%86%D0%B5%20%D0%B7%D0%B0%D1%80%D0%B0%D0%B1 %D0%BE%D1%82%D0%B0%D0%BB%D0%B0%20%D1%83%D0%B6%D0%B5,%D0%BA%D0%BE%D0%B C%D0%BF%D0%B0%D0%BD%D0%B8%D0%B9%20%D0%B8%D0%B7%2018%20%D1%81%D1%82%D1% 80%D0%B0%D0%BD%20%D0%BC%D0%B8%D1%80%D0%B0 (Accessed: 20 February 2020)

responsible for the current trade and economic relations of Kazakhstan with Russia, China, and the US. Secondly, the overall bilateral trade turnover by comparative analysis to import, export, investment. Mutual trade turnover with all powers was reduced in 2014-2016, as well as the country's GDP. In 2016-2017, there is growth in all the above items.

Despite the tense political situation in the region in 2014-2015, Kazakhstan managed to maintain a balance in cooperation without neglecting any powers. Kazakhstan actively conducted national economic policy joining the Russian-led EEU, Chinese-initiated OBOR, and the U.S's C5+1. WTO could also be found in the list. Certainly, the country's "maintaining balance, pragmatism, mutual benefit, and defending national interests" foreign policy was attributable to such trade and economic activities.

The traditional sector of Kazakhstan's cooperation with superpowers remains energy resources. Transport and logistics projects revolve around the transit of oil and natural gas as well.

A positive trend discerns in industrial and innovative inter-sectoral interactions: agroculture, machinery engineering, financing, cargo transition.

Cooperations between the regions of Kazakhstan and the powers were studied as a micromodel for assessing trade and economic dialogue. The question was whether the powers maintain
a dialogue with the regions of Kazakhstan or whether Kazakhstan equally promotes regional
cooperation with the powers. Because, one of the country's economic strategy aim is to develop
manufacturing specifically in the regions. It gives an opportunity to assess how extensive and indepth cooperations with the powers were actually being conducted. Studying the trends of
economic cooperation at the regional level, the author came to the conclusion that Kazakhstan
similarly developed partnerships.

Seperately analyzing the powers, there were successfully conducted achievements with China. Regarding the US and Russia, Kazakhstan had not always been able to promote "purely" trade and economic policy, since the geopolitical interests of the powers are initially contradictory. While Kazakhstan-Chinese relations have been developing in all sectors without setbacks in 2014-2019, Russia and the United States have fallen out in some areas of trade and economic cooperation.

# CHAPTER II. Military and Security Cooperation, and How "Peace-Loving" Policy Works in Outer Space Uses

# 2.1. Post-2014 Aspects of Kazakhstan's National Security in Foreign Policy

National security and protecting its own interests in the international arena are significant for every country, including Kazakhstan. Socio-political, economic, geopolitical factors and national interests determine the priorities of foreign policy, collectively constituting the system for ensuring national security. In the Foreign Policy Concept, it as indicated as the "number one" objective, "In accordance with the national interests of Kazakhstan, the main foreign policy efforts will focus on achieving the following main goals: 1) all-round provision of national security, defense capability, sovereignty and territorial integrity of the country…" 165

In addition to the Concept, there are laws on the activities of responsible bodies, ensuring national security of both individuals and the State serving as a regulatory framework. Laws "On national security" and "On State border" were signed relatively later. One of the key documents among is the Law "On national security" adopted two decades after independence. <sup>166</sup>

Domestic expert D. Abdakimova points to an exicting double standard in the documents. In the author's word, if Kazakhstan's foreign policy gives national security the top priority, domestic legislation based on the country's geopolitical location does not prioritize external factors of security. It superficially considers general issues of terrorism, extremism, drug trafficking, etc.<sup>167</sup>

Kazakhstan's geopolitical situation largely determines the country's priorities. It was evident in the previous analysis of trade and economic strategy, and the security here. Kazakhstan is pursuing to a multi-vector approach, developing partnerships both collectively and individually. Collective cooperation is promoted within the international organizations: UN, SCO, CSTO, CICA, and OSCE. Individual bilateral cooperations are regulated within the strategic agreements.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>165</sup> Qazaqstan Respýblikasy syrtqy saiasatynyń 2014–2020 jyldarga arnalgan tujyrymdamasy: Qazaqstan Respýblikasy Prezidentiniń 2014 jylgy 21 qańtardagy Jarlygy [Foreign Policy Concept for 2014–2020 Republic of Kazakhstan approved by the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan of January 21, 2014]. Yegemen Qazaqstan, Jan. 30, 2014, № 20 (28244). URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/U1400000741/info">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/U1400000741/info</a> (Accessed: 28 August 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>166</sup> Ulttyq qaýipsizdiģi týraly: Qazaqstan Respýblıkasynyń 2012 jylgy 2 qańtartdagy Zańy [Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On national security of the Republic of Kazakhstan" dated January 2, 2012]. Yegemen Qazaqstan, Jan. 17, 2012, № 18-19 (27090). URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/Z1200000527">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/Z1200000527</a> (Accessed: 10 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>167</sup> Abdakimova D. A. Voprosy sootnosheniya vneshney politiki i natsionalnoy bezopasnosti Respubliki Kazakhstan [Correlation issues of foreign policy and national security of the Republic of Kazakhstan]. Materials of the XVI International scientific and practical conference "Tatishchev readings: actual problems of science and practice", 2019, vol. 2. pp. 29-34

In 2014-2015, Kazakhstan sought to maintain stable relations with Russia, despite the tension in its relations with Ukraine, Turkey at that time. In 2014, Russian Defense Minister visited Kazakhstan two times, and held meetings with President and Kazakh Defense Minister. At the second meeting, Ministries signed a protocol amending the Agreement on the Organization of the Reception, Airfield Maintenance and Security of Military Aircraft. Since 2015, Kazakhstan has been participating in international Army Games initiated by Russia. Since 2016, the games partially had been hosted in Kazakhstan. The largest among was the games of 2017, when Kazakhstan organized three military competition programmes. In 2018, Defense Ministers signed Strategic Partnership Programme in the Military Area 2019-2021 and Military Cooperation Plan 2019. Kazakhstan's rapprochement with Russia in security and military-technical supply during this period is treated differently. It is often associated with the Crimea, after which Russia allegedly decided to strengthen its presence in Kazakhstan. But domestic experts say that such activity occurs within CSTO and other bilateral agreements held before the "known events". In 2018, Defense Ministers allegedly decided to strengthen its presence in Kazakhstan. But domestic experts say that such

In 2014, Akorda demonstrated an active approach to security cooperation with China. Previously, the country limited to diplomatic gestures and general military maneuvers within the common international structures. At the regular CICA meeting in Beijing, N. Nazarbayev reported on the need for an Asian analogue of OSCE, which can be a competitive structure. But, domestic experts stated that neither SCO, CSTO nor CICA had displayed anything except for statements. Kazakhstan's pivot to China can be explained as the search for another "pillow of safety". After the U.S. military withdrawal from Afghanistan, Kyrgyzstan, and Crimea conflict, Kazakhstan had to deepen existing relations with other major players to maintain the balance towards Russia. 173

ИURL: <a href="http://mil.ru/et/news/more.htm?id=11898005@egNews">http://mil.ru/et/news/more.htm?id=11898005@egNews</a>;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>168</sup> Meshcheryakov K. Y. The Russian-Kazakh relations during the "Ukrainian crisis", Klio, 2016, №5. pp. 118-134 <sup>169</sup> Ministr oborony Rossii posetit Respubliku Kazakhstan s ofitsialnym vizitom [Russian defense Minister to Kazakhstan]. Ministry of Defense of Russia, Jan. 30, 2014.

V Astane sostoyalas vstrecha ministrov oborony Rossii i Kazakhstana [In Astana hosted a meeting of defense Ministers of Russia and Kazakhstan]. Ministry of Defense of Russia, Jul. 4, 2014. URL: <a href="https://function.mil.ru/news\_page/country/more.htm?id=11965665@egNews">https://function.mil.ru/news\_page/country/more.htm?id=11965665@egNews</a> (Accessed: 16 March 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>170</sup> International Army Games 2017 start in Alabino. Ministry of Defense of Russia, Aug. 1, 2017. URL: <a href="https://eng.mil.ru/en/news-page/country/more.htm?id=12135064@egNews">https://eng.mil.ru/en/news-page/country/more.htm?id=12135064@egNews</a> (Accessed: 16 March 2020)

Ministr oborony Kazakhstana vstretilsya s glavoy oboronnogo vedomstva Rossii [The Minister of defence of Kazakhstan met with the defense Ministry of Russia]. "Tengri news" online publication and information portal, Nov. 8, 2018. URL: <a href="https://tengrinews.kz/kazakhstan news/ministr-oboronyi-kazahstana-vstretilsya-glavoy-oboronnogo-357300/">https://tengrinews.kz/kazakhstan news/ministr-oboronyi-kazahstana-vstretilsya-glavoy-oboronnogo-357300/</a> (Accessed: 23 March 2020)

<sup>357300/ (</sup>Accessed: 23 March 2020)

172 Zachem Kazakhstan sblizhayetsya s Rossiyey v oblasti vooruzheniy? [Why is Kazakhstan getting closer to Russia in military equipment?]. "Kursiv" business portal, Sep. 8, 2016. URL: <a href="https://kursiv.kz/news/politika/2016-09/zachem-kazakhstan-sblizhaetsya-s-rossiey-v-oblasti-vooruzheniy">https://kursiv.kz/news/politika/2016-09/zachem-kazakhstan-sblizhaetsya-s-rossiey-v-oblasti-vooruzheniy</a> (Accessed: 18 March 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>173</sup> Eksperty prizyvayut k regionalizatsii strategii bezopasnosti [Experts call for regionalization of security strategy]. Azattyq Radio, Feb. 16, 2015. URL: <a href="https://rus.azattyq.org/a/strategii-bezopasnosti-kazakhstan/26851515.html">https://rus.azattyq.org/a/strategii-bezopasnosti-kazakhstan/26851515.html</a> (Accessed: 23 August 2019)

Dialogue with the U.S. was also quite constructive. Cooperation was carried out within the long-term Plans of the Defense Ministers. The last two documents were estimated for 2013-2017 and 2018-2022. Plane Each five-year plan was drawn up with emphasis on a specific security sector: military infrastructure modernization, formation of peacekeeping detachment, and military personnel training. But, the details of the fourth Programme have not yet come into broad view.

Conflicts in neighboring countries and between powers in 2014 created additional concerns about the country's security. In mid- 2014, Kazakh experts assessed threats to national security and compared the results of analyses with 2010. Political, external-military, and information security, not surprisingly, were pointed out as fragile. Economic and public security, which always been the most unstable, closed the last line. In the external-military threat, the significance of international conflicts along Kazakhstan's borders increased. Experts attached importance to the dissemination of negative and misleading information to the detriment of national security as well.<sup>175</sup>

# 2.1.1. Mass-media "impact-factor" in security

A negative information flow, for the record, on political disputes` background intensified internal unrest for territorial integrity. Especially, Northern and Eastern regions with a predominant Russian-speaking population. It was the ground for the public protest of Kazakhstani population seeing the EEU as a threat for both the independence and national economy. President N. Nazarbayev had to reassure the population saying that "Kazakhstan would not join organizations that threaten its sovereignty. Kazakhstan's rights within the Union are not infringed as well, if they are, the country has rights to refuse membership". The country took measures of cultural-humanitarian nature, to satisfy local population indignity and verify that "Kazakhstan is not Ukraine". This is an active promotion of trilingualism policy, transition to the Latin alphabet, a large-scale celebration of the 550th anniversary of Kazakh khanate, organization of "Enbek", "Serpin" programmes, aimed at relocating Kazakh-speaking population from the Southern region

1,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>174</sup> Kuda letit "Stepnoy orel"? [Where is the Steppe eagle going?]. "Strategic culture Foundation" electronic edition, Jul. 1, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.fondsk.ru/news/2019/07/01/kuda-letit-stepnoj-orel-48504.html">https://www.fondsk.ru/news/2019/07/01/kuda-letit-stepnoj-orel-48504.html</a> (Accessed: 27 September 2019)

<sup>175</sup> Ekspertnaya otsenka netraditsionnykh ugroz natsionalnoy bezopasnosti RK [Expert assessment of non-traditional threats to national security of Kazakhstan]. Sayasat: all about Kazakhstan politics, Oct. 7, 2014. URL: <a href="http://sayasat.org/articles/1028-ekspertnaja-ocenka-netradjicionnyh-ugroz-nacionalnoj-bezopasnosti-rk">http://sayasat.org/articles/1028-ekspertnaja-ocenka-netradjicionnyh-ugroz-nacionalnoj-bezopasnosti-rk</a> (Accessed: 23 March 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>176</sup> Kazakhstan may leave EEU if its interests are infringed: Nazarbayev. "Tengri news" online publication and information portal, Aug. 25, 2014. URL: <a href="https://en.tengrinews.kz/politics-sub/kazakhstan-may-leave-eeu-if-its-interests-are-infringed-255722/">https://en.tengrinews.kz/politics-sub/kazakhstan-may-leave-eeu-if-its-interests-are-infringed-255722/</a> (Accessed: 15 September 2019)

to the North of the country. According to domestic political scientist A. Zhusupova, internal migration within the "South-North" has doubled since 2014.<sup>177</sup>

Thus, instability in the region served as a catalyst for protest outbreaks within Kazakhstan itself, which required necessary measures of adjustment. In the future, it may have a "mirrored effect" on the country's external activity. This weakness can be exploited by other actors in promoting their interests, which is not safe for stability. One of the prime examples are the protests against the country's Land legislation amendment led by Chinese presence from 2016, and against NPP construction by Russia. Although the country has a well-established Russian-language information platform, the American influence is appreciable. For instance, Azattyq channel, which is financed by the West and pro-Western sentiment prevails. Through such channels, the U.S. successfully promotes its ideology, which certainly has an impact on public opinion After the Ukrainian crisis, one of the most successful examples, from the American poin of view, was the widespread anti-Chinese sentiment. On the American-Chinese trade war, the U.S. skillfully used the historical sinophobia of Kazakh population with the conflict on Muslim population mass reeducational camps in XUAR against China.

Initially, it was important to Kazakhstan to position itself as a stable, safe, and peaceful country. Abandonment of nuclear weapons in the early years of independence had a positive impact on the country's image and credibility, which helped in subsequent stages of negotiations with the international community. Currently, the country participates in UN peacekeeping activities, and acts as a mediator between parties to Syrian or Ukrainian conflicts. It tries to organize platforms for EEC-EU, CSTO-NATO, OSCE-CSTO, OBOR-EU dialogues. Accession to the UN Security Council in 2018 is an example of the country's long-standing efforts.

In 2017, Kazakhstan's possible participation in Russia's peacekeeping operations in Syria within the CSTO appeared on the Russian-language information platform. It was another occasion for a media scandal which, to M. Shibutov, appeared out of nowhere. Because, firstly, it should be approved by a special UN mandate. Since there was no mandate, there are no Kazakh peacekeepers in Syria. A similar case was with the USA regarding Afghanistan. Although the U.S. case, to obtain a mandate would not be a problem, it failed to achieve the participation of Kazakh military

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>177</sup> Zhusupova A. Programmy pereseleniya "Yug-Sever": vostrebovannost i uspeshnost [Resettlement programme "South-North": the demand and success]. 2019. URL: <a href="https://ekonomist.kz/zhussupova/programy-pereseleniya-ug-sever-vostrebovannost/">https://ekonomist.kz/zhussupova/programy-pereseleniya-ug-sever-vostrebovannost/</a> (Accessed: 25 March 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>178</sup> Shibutov M. Provokatsiya o kazakhstanskikh i kirgizstanskikh mirotvortsakh v Sirii: dlya chego? [Provocation on Kazakhstan and the Kyrgyz peacekeepers in Syria: why?]. Information agency "Regnum", June 26, 2017. URL: https://regnum.ru/news/polit/2292829.html?utm\_medium=source&utm\_source=rnews (Accessed: 3 March 2020)

in Afghanistan operations despite financial and organizational assistance to KAZBAT.<sup>179</sup> Because, participation in a NATO military operation, being a full member of another military community, would be an occasion of resentment wave. However, Kazakhstan skilfully circumvented the situation and send its military to Lebanon in 2019, thereby informing that the country had already sent its peacekeepers within the UN mission.<sup>180</sup>

# 2.1.2. Caspian factor in security

Another issue threatening national security is the presence of the powers in the Caspian region. In 2014, at the regular Caspian Summit, the countries raised a question on the legal status of the Sea. It is another broad subject for a whole dissertation. Briefly, the real cause for concern was the Nabucco gas pipeline project planned by the U.S. and Europe, which leaves Russia, Kazakhstan, and Iran out of business. It could possibly serve as a cause of trade war and destabilization of the region. Accordingly, the initial intention of the Caspian States was to attach legal status to the Sea and close access to non-regional players. But when it came to delineation, the countries' opinions differed. Kazakhstan and Russia were not affected by it. Thus, in 2017, the countries signed an Additional Protocol on the delimitation of the bottom in the Northern part of the Sea. 181 On August 12, 2018, a historic event took place. The Convention on the legal status of the Sea was signed by all Caspian five members. On the one hand, Kazakhstan remained the biggest winner with a 29% control share. On the other hand, the mass-media declared it "another Russia's victory". Because there are separate issues of American cargo transit to Afghanistan. A short time before the Convention was approved, Kazakhstan and the U.S. signed Agreement on Support for Commercial Rail Transit of Special Cargo through the Territory of Kazakhstan to Afghanistan, which indicates the direct use of Caspian ports. After Russia stopped the transit of NATO military cargo, which included Kyrgyzstan as well, the U.S. had to find reliable alternative routes. It was Kazakhstan.

. .

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>179</sup> Aleksandrova D. A., Andreeva E. S., Yermakova S. M., Ivanova V. A., Ippolitova I. V., Makarevskiy M. N., Nemenskyi O. B., Popova D. S., Petrovskyi O. V., Tacica K. I., Shevchenko A. M., NATO v politike postsovetskikh gosudarstv posle vossoyedineniya Kryma s Rossiyey [NATO in the politics of post-Soviet States after the reunification of Crimea with Russia]. Moscow, Russian Institute for Strategic Studies (RISS), Center for CIS countries studies, 2018. p. 90

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>180</sup> Mirotvorchestvo – effektivnyy otvet globalnym vyzovam [Peacemaking is an effective response to global challenges]. Komsamolskaya pravda, Nov. 26, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.kp.kz/daily/27059/4127712/">https://www.kp.kz/daily/27059/4127712/</a> (Accessed: 21 March 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>181</sup> Additional Protocol to the Protocol to the Agreement between the Russian Federation and the Republic of Kazakhstan on the delineation of the bottom of the northern part of the Caspian Sea. Decree for the purposes of exercising sovereign rights to subsoil use of July 6, 1998 of Apr. 12, 2017. Source: B. Yeltsin Presidential Library, 2017. URL: <a href="https://www.prlib.ru/en/node/682642">https://www.prlib.ru/en/node/682642</a> (Accessed: 24 November 2019)

On the one hand, the Agreement between Kazakhstan and America definitely incite Russia, although there were no special statements. On the other hand, entering into an agreement with the United States and Russia simultaneously can be considered as, once again, a balancing situation. Russian expert D. Zhuravlev argues that the disagreement between Akorda and Moscow on the issue was exaggerated by the media, in reality, there are no disputes at the interstate level. The author added that Kazakhstan does not cooperate with the U.S. for military purposes, the transit is more commercial. And there is not a violation of the agreement, because the transit will be carried out but by local vessels, not American. Although official meetings predominantly refer to the trade and economic importance of the Caspian Sea, it is extremely significant to avoid militarization of the region.

It seems that Caspian issue was ignored by China, and the Kazakhstani-Chinese relations include purely trade and economic interests. But, it does not exclude the relevance of security for China, which is systematically fighting extremism and terrorism emanating from these regions. It can be assumed, if Kazakhstan deepens military cooperation with the U.S. in the Caspian, it will outrage both Russia and China. It will be a great trade and economic loss for Kazakhstan. However, militarization is not yet planned on the Kazakh side, so the question remains open. Domestic experts in this regard say that the U.S. uses its interests in the Caspian and CA as for Russia. But the long-term targets are China and India, which may threaten in the future. Accordingly, all Central Asian and Caspian regions, including Kazakhstan, may involve in the "stability shaking" process. 184

\*\*\*

It can be concluded that Kazakhstan has successfully solved and is still working on national security issues. The country mediates and provides a peaceful negotiation arena for settlement disputes. There are still "hot issues" such as public discontent, information security, stability in Caspian, etc. A ticking bomb that can explode at any moment threatening stability both inside and outside the country. Thereupon, Kazakhstan should focus on different aspects of security and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>182</sup> Aliyev N. U.S.-Kazakhstan Transit Agreement Faces Challenges from Russia. The Central Asia-Caucasus Analyst, September 20, 2018. URL: <a href="https://www.cacianalyst.org/publications/analytical-articles/item/13534-us-kazakhstan-transit-agreement-faces-challenges-from-russia.html">https://www.cacianalyst.org/publications/analytical-articles/item/13534-us-kazakhstan-transit-agreement-faces-challenges-from-russia.html</a> (Accessed: 18 December 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>183</sup> Alekseeva N. "De-fakto soglasheniye uzhe deystvuyet": kak soobshcheniya o "bazakh SSHA v Kazakhstane" povliyayut na peregovory o statuse Kaspiya ["De facto agreement already in effect": how reports of "US bases in Kazakhstan" will affect negotiations on the Caspian sea status]. New channel "RT", April 30, 2018. URL: https://russian.rt.com/world/article/508306-kaspii-kazakhstan-nato-tranzit (Accessed: 11 October 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>184</sup> Kuzembayeva A. B. Specific issues in Kazakhstan – U.S. relations at the present stage. KazNU Bulletin, 2015, №1(69). pp. 151-155

internal factors. First, to be able to respond and influence these threats in a timely manner. Secondly, these weaknesses do not become "a tool of maneuver" on the powers` hands.

# 2.2. Defense Equipment & Military Training arm wrestling

Military cooperation between Kazakhstan and the powers is developing in several directions. It includes military education, joint military exercises, assistance, and purchase of military equipment. In particular cases, a common air defense system with Russia, peacekeeping and cargo transit to Afghanistan with the USA could be added.

Kazakhstan has been actively supplementing its military capacity purchasing military equipment since the attainment of independence. Although the country inherited large Soviet military-industrial enterprises, after independence production was reduced to a minimum. Both serious political and economic consequences and lack of a clearly formulated armed forces policy could explain it. It seemed, the country entered into military equipment modernization with the adoption of state Programme on Military-Industrial Complex Development up to 2015 in 2007. Yet, there were no significant changes in diversification of imports and military-technical industry development. Only the last years of the Programme, National Company of Kazakhstan Engineering increased its activity. Kazakhstan Engineering reached an agreement with U.S. Department of Defense and General Atomics for the delivery of an unmanned aerial vehicle. And Kazakhstani missile ships, prepared on special order in St. Petersburg, were launched. 185

Political scientist M. Shibutov attributed positive results with the efforts of Minister of defense I. Tasmagambetova in 2014-2016. The expert notes that the former Minister formed procurement priorities not in connection with diplomatic considerations, but on military doctrine. <sup>186</sup>

After 2015, there was not found a newly developed plan in the legal base of Defense Ministry of Kazakhstan. But, the statement of Elbasy from 2016, "new military equipment is put on on alert in full compliance with the rearmament programme. In the coming years, at least 70% of all types of equipment will be updated, in some categories up to 100%", demonstrates the country's intention to further modernize armed equipment. <sup>187</sup>

Tem li i tak li vooruzhena kazahstanskaya armiya? Central Asia Monitor, Jul. 22, 2015. URL: <a href="https://camonitor.kz/17141-tem-li-i-tak-li-vooruzhena-kazahstanskaya-armiya.html">https://camonitor.kz/17141-tem-li-i-tak-li-vooruzhena-kazahstanskaya-armiya.html</a> (Accessed: 27 February 202)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>185</sup> Istoriya VPK Kazahstana [History of the military industrial complex of Kazakhstan]. Kazakh military website. URL: https://military-kz.ucoz.org/index/istorija\_vpk\_kazakhstana/0-44 (Accessed: 16 March 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>187</sup> Kazakhstan planiruyet perevooruzhitsya na 70% [Kazakhstan plans to rearm by 70%]. National news service, May 13, 2016. URL: <a href="https://nsn.fm/hots/hots-kazakhstan-planiruet-perevooruzhit-vooruzhennye-sily-na-70">https://nsn.fm/hots/hots-kazakhstan-planiruet-perevooruzhit-vooruzhennye-sily-na-70</a> (Accessed: 9 April 2020)

For this purpose was organized Kazakhstan Defense Expo (KADEX) in 2010 on a permanent arrangement every two years. The international exhibition is organized by the Defense Ministry, Industry and Infrastructure Ministry and Kazakhstan Engineering. On the one hand, Kazakhstan presents its technical capabilities during the event. On the other hand, the country is getting acquainted with the arms markets of different countries and is increasing communication between foreign and domestic companies for joint assembly. KADEX is run by Russian companies showing a large-scale exhibition every year. Major Russian companies Rostec, Rosoboronexport are participants and key partners of KADEX. In 2014, Kazakhstan signed a contract for \$2.6 billion. Although the amount decreased in subsequent years – \$138 million in 2016, \$916 million in 2018 190 – the exhibition itself became well-known. American companies Boeing, General Atomics, and Sikorsky attended the exhibition for the first time in 2014. In 2016, China participated in KADEX as a result of personally invitation I. Tasmaganbetov. There were signed two contracts with China in KADEX 2016.

The country is working on arrangement military-technical production and assembly on its own as well. In KADEX 2016, N. Nazarbayev pointed out, "We mostly use the technology we had in the Soviet era. But now we can be proud that it is time to produce military equipment and weapons independently. We cooperate with various countries to supply weapons and transfer some enterprises to the territory of Kazakhstan." Hence, a remarkable feature of KADEX 2018 was the change military-industrial policy. Previously, the country purchased ready-made weapons, now it relies on creating its own military-technical production with a long-term export goal.

Russia, USA, and China are among the top 10 arms exporters to Kazakhstan by far. (Appendix) Types, categories, and purposes of imported military equipment are different: combat vehicle or aircraft, new or second-handed, obtained as a purchase or free of charge on military regional cooperation. SIPRI points to the predominance of aircraft, air defense systems, armoured

. .

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>188</sup> Itogi KADEX-2014 [KADEX-2014 results]. Military-industrial complex news portal "VPK News", May 28, 2014. URL: <a href="https://vpk.name/news/115898\_kadex\_2014\_itogi\_i\_perspektivy.html">https://vpk.name/news/115898\_kadex\_2014\_itogi\_i\_perspektivy.html</a> (Accessed: 11 March 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>189</sup> Karazhanov Z. "KADEX 2016": glavnaya skhvatka za tsentralnoaziatskiy rynok vooruzheniy yeshche vperedi [KADEX 2016: the main battle for the Central Asian arms market is still ahead]. Expert information platform "Ritm Eurasia", June 10, 2016. URL: https://www.ritmeurasia.org/news--2016-06-10--kadex-2016-glavnaja-shvatka-zacentralnoaziatskij-rynok-vooruzhenij-esche-vperedi-24051 (Accessed: 3 April 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>190</sup> Kadex 2018 – kratkiye itogi [Kadex 2018 – a brief summary]. "Arsenal Otechestva" information and analytical magazine, May 28, 2018. URL: <a href="https://arsenal-otechestva.ru/new/1056-kadex-2018-kratkie-itogi">https://arsenal-otechestva.ru/new/1056-kadex-2018-kratkie-itogi</a> (Accessed: 11 March 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>191</sup> Verkhovnyy Glavnokomanduyushchiy VS RK posetil tseremoniyu otkrytiya 4-oy Mezhdunarodnoy vystavki "KADEX – 2016" [N. Nazarbayev attended the opening ceremony of the 4th International exhibition]. "Bastion" military-technical magazine, Jun. 2, 2016. URL: <a href="http://bastion-karpenko.ru/2016/06/03/03-06-2016-2/">http://bastion-karpenko.ru/2016/06/03/03-06-2016-2/</a> (Accessed: 3 March 2020)

vehicles, and missiles. Over the past five years, ships and engines had also been actively transferred.

#### 2.2.1. Kazakhstan and Russia

Russia remains the key partner of Kazakhstan. According to statistics of Stockholm International Peace Research Institute (SIPRI), more than 80% of military equipment comes from Russia among 12 exporting countries. The import from Russia halved compared to the previous year in 2014, but the volume had increased sharply since 2015. It amounted to \$441 million, which is 50% of all arms purchases from Russia during 1995-2014.

In 2014-2019, Kazakhstan supplemented arsenal by 458 Russian arms. In case of Russia, procurement of aviation equipment for this period is predominant. Transport helicopters Mi-8MT, Mi-17, attack helicopters Mi-35M, Su-30MK, the total number of which is 37. The largest order among is Su-30MK, which has been delivered since 2015. Initially, Kazakhstan planned to buy 36 fighters by 2020 on a bilateral agreement from 2014. In 2017, Kazakhstan and Russia signed a new contract on purchasing 12 helicopters of this series. It is not known whether it is a part of the early contracts or in addition. At the moment, 16 helicopters had delivered. They are intended for border guards. The country also acquired 326 surface-to-air missile systems 5V55U/SA-10, Buk-M2/SA-17 Grizzly, S-300PS, Igla-1/SA-16. SAM is probably second hand and upgraded before delivery. Among them, the S-300PS was delivered by Russia as an aid in 2015 under the joint air defense system. The rest of the equipment consists of 91 infantry mobility vehicles BTR-82A, Tigr Gaz, and special minesweeper Project-10750/Lida and 3 vessels Project-22180/Barys. 192

Telling about the joint military equipment projects, among the powers only Russia recently reached an agreement to assemble Mi-8AMT/Mi-171 helicopters at the Almaty aircraft repair plant. <sup>193</sup> In 2014, perspectives on the assembly of Sikorsky aircraft in Kazakhstan were discussed with the USA, so far inconclusive. <sup>194</sup>

<sup>1 (</sup> 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>192</sup> Transfers of major weapons: Deals with deliveries or orders made for 2014 to 2019 between Kazakhstan and Russia, USA, China. Source: SIPRI's trade registers. URL: <a href="http://armstrade.sipri.org/armstrade/page/trade\_register.php/;">http://armstrade.sipri.org/armstrade/page/trade\_register.php/;</a>, <a href="http://armstrade.sipri.org/armstrade/html/export\_values.php">http://armstrade.sipri.org/armstrade/html/export\_values.php</a>, (Information generated: 26 April 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>193</sup> Mi-171 helicopters will be launched in Kazakhstan. KADEX Ministry of Industry and infrastructural development of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Dec. 14, 2019. URL: https://kadex.kz/eng/starting 2020 the assembly of mi-8amt mi-171 helicopters will be launched (Accessed: 12 March 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>194</sup> Kazakhstan and the USA interested in developing interregional coop. "Kazinform" international news agency, Oct. 22, 2014. URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-and-the-usa-interested-in-developing-interregional-coop-a2709037">https://www.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-and-the-usa-interested-in-developing-interregional-coop-a2709037</a> (Accessed: 16 February 2020)

Thus, the statistics indicate the stable strategic nature of Kazakhstan-Russian relations. Even during 2014-2015's turbulence, arms supply did not stop, on the contrary, increased. Bilateral documents concluded during that period are also a witness of enhanced relations. It is an Agreement on military-technical cooperation from 2015. In 2015, the Ministers of Defence, S. Shoigu and I. Tasmagambetov, signed two interstate and two intergovernmental protocols on amendments to Russian testing range's use and lease Agreement on the territory of Kazakhstan. More than 1.6 million hectares of Sary Shagan anti-ballistic missile testing range in the Karaganda region were withdrawn from lease. The Russian authorities interpret its concession that Russia is taking this step in response to the requests of Kazakhstani side and leave only the most necessary areas for testing. The Russian Ministry of Defence noted that the agreement is a win-win for both countries, and will strengthen cooperation between the relevant ministers. Since, on the one hand, rents will decrease promising savings for Russia. On the other hand, the returned land will be used for the benefit of the national economy of Kazakhstan and the construction of transport and logistics. 196

#### 2.2.2. Kazakhstan and China

Compared to Russia, China started exporting arms to Kazakhstan only in 2016. It can be considered the result of the intensified Kazakhstani-Chinese military relations after the ministerial meeting of Defense in 2015.<sup>197</sup>

In 2016-2018, Kazakhstan supplemented arsenal by 4 Chinese arms. In 2016-2018, China supplied Kazakhstan 3 Wing Loong-1 unmanned aerial vehicle for the national guard. Initially, it was planned to purchase 20 aircraft for Aktau, Atyrau, Kyzylorda and Zhetygen airfields until 2020. But, the delivery has been limited to only a small number. In June 2018, one Shaanxi Y-9 military transport aircraft was delivered to Kazakhstan as a result of a bilateral contract reached that year. Although Air Force Commander D. Kosanov previously announced that the first

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>195</sup> Zachem Kazakhstan sblizhayetsya s Rossiyey v oblasti vooruzheniy? [Why is Kazakhstan getting closer to Russia in military equipment?]. "Kursiv" business portal, Sep. 8, 2016. URL: <a href="https://kursiv.kz/news/politika/2016-09/zachem-kazakhstan-sblizhaetsya-s-rossiey-v-oblasti-vooruzheniy">https://kursiv.kz/news/politika/2016-09/zachem-kazakhstan-sblizhaetsya-s-rossiey-v-oblasti-vooruzheniy</a> (Accessed: 18 March 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>196</sup> Vneseniye izmeneniy v rossiysko-kazakhstanskiye dogovory ob ispolzovanii i arende poligonov Minoborony Rossii budet sluzhit interesam obeikh stran [Amendments to the Russian-Kazakh agreements on the use and lease of polygons of the Russian defense Ministry will serve the interests of both countries]. Ministry of Defense of Russia, Apr. 16, 2015. URL: <a href="http://mil.ru/et/news/more.htm?id=12016305@egNews">http://mil.ru/et/news/more.htm?id=12016305@egNews</a> (Accessed: 8 December 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>197</sup> Kazakhstan, China Strengthen Defence Cooperation. The Astana Times News, Oct. 16, 2015. URL: <a href="https://astanatimes.com/2015/10/kazakhstan-china-strengthen-defence-cooperation/">https://astanatimes.com/2015/10/kazakhstan-china-strengthen-defence-cooperation/</a> (Accessed: 22 March 2020)

deliveries would be only by 2021. <sup>198</sup> The exact numbers of contracted aircraft were not previously mentioned, but according to official SIPRI data, 4 were indicated. <sup>199</sup>

In such a way, Kazakhstan buys both Russian weapons and other foreign arms on a small scale. This initiative of Kazakhstan is assessed negatively by some Russian experts. If the country positions it as "maintaining balance and multi-vectorism", according to experts, "Kazakh government is sitting on two chairs". A common argument is Kazakhstan's pivot to other countries markets such as China, at the same time, purchasing Russian arms at low prices. Earlier, experts mentioned about China's ability to expand its military presence in CA to ensure regional-transit security for OBOR. A counter-argument of mine, even there is a slight note of competition, Russian-Chinese interests had not been intersecting since 2016. To the above-mentioned SIPRI data, Kazakhstan delivered limited unmanned combat aerial vehicles, which was not produced by Russia until 2019. 202

#### 2.2.3. Kazakhstan and USA

Kazakhstan-American military-technical cooperation is not large-scale and regular compared to Russia as well. Kazakhstan started importing arms from the USA since 2004. Although the purchase of military equipment declined sharply after the 2007 crisis, today's statistics show small but stable figures.

In 2013-2017, Kazakhstan supplemented arsenal by 4 American arms. In 2013-2017, 4 multi-purpose Bell-205 helicopters arrived from the U.S. The helicopters were previously used in combating terrorism program, but were modernized before delivery.<sup>203</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>198</sup> Kazakhstan zakupayet kitayskiye samolety [Kazakhstan buys Chinese aircrafts]. Belarus Security blog, Jan. 31, 2018. URL: https://bsblog.info/kazaxstan-zakupaet-kitajskie-samolety/ (Accessed: 26 April 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>199</sup> Transfers of major weapons: Deals with deliveries or orders made for 2014 to 2019 between Kazakhstan and Russia, USA, China. Source: SIPRI's trade registers. URL: <a href="http://armstrade.sipri.org/armstrade/page/trade register.php/">http://armstrade.sipri.org/armstrade/page/trade register.php/</a>; <a href="http://armstrade.sipri.org/armstrade/page/trade register.php/">http://armstrade.sipri.org/armstrade/page/trade register.php/</a>; <a href="http://armstrade.sipri.org/armstrade/html/export\_values.php">http://armstrade.sipri.org/armstrade/html/export\_values.php</a>; (Information generated: 26 April 2020)

Pentagon formiruyet v Kazakhstane antirossiyskiy rubezh [Pentagon is forming an anti-Russian sentiment in Kazakhstan]. Nezavisimaya gazeta, Aug. 9, 2017. URL: <a href="http://www.ng.ru/politics/2017-08-09/1">http://www.ng.ru/politics/2017-08-09/1 7047 kazahstan.html</a> (Accessed: 22 March 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>201</sup> Kashin V. U Kitaya poyavyatsya vozmozhnosti po obespecheniyu bezopasnosti svoikh obyektov vdol "shelkovogo puti" [China get an opportunity to ensure the security of its facilities along the Silk Road]. Information-analytical publication "Eurasia. Expert", March 4, 2018. URL: <a href="https://eurasia.expert/kitaya-bezopasnosti-obektov-shelkovogo-puti-/">https://eurasia.expert/kitaya-bezopasnosti-obektov-shelkovogo-puti-/</a> (Accessed: 16 February 2020)

puti-/ (Accessed: 16 February 2020)

202 Russia has released footage of its new "Hunter" stealth attack drone. CNN World news, Aug. 7, 2019. URL: https://edition.cnn.com/2019/08/08/europe/russia-hunter-drone-scli-intl/index.html (Accessed: 25 April 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>203</sup> Transfers of major weapons: Deals with deliveries or orders made for 2014 to 2019 between Kazakhstan and Russia, USA, China. Source: SIPRI's trade registers. URL: <a href="http://armstrade.sipri.org/armstrade/page/trade\_register.php/">http://armstrade.sipri.org/armstrade/page/trade\_register.php/</a>; <a href="http://armstrade.sipri.org/armstrade/html/export\_values.php">http://armstrade.sipri.org/armstrade/html/export\_values.php</a>; (Information generated: 26 April 2020)

Whilst Russia dominates Kazakhstan's foreign military-technical activities, the country tries to develop other areas of military cooperation to maintain balance. It is mainly joint exercises, military personnel training. Russian Institute for Strategic Studies` experts argued in a report on the role of NATO in the post-Soviet countries` politics after the Crimean events, Kazakhstan-American relations developed significantly more successfully in this direction after 2014-2015. The authors highlighted the role of financing and "soft power" promoting NATO&USA's positive image.<sup>204</sup>

Steppe Eagle exercise has been held every two years since 2003 and is formally aimed at training peacekeepers. The last three exercises for 2014-2018 were held abroad for the first time: Germany, UK, and the USA. Previously, it held in a narrative form, where the U.S. and CA countries participated. Other NATO countries were mostly present as observers. The last narrative form training was conducted last year at the Iliyskiy Training Center in Kazakhstan. The center was built in 2013 by the U.S. assistance. Additionally, the U.S. helps Kazakhstan to train peacekeepers under the UN program at KAZCENT center. The center was established with USA financial support as well in 2008.

Since 2015, American military schools have been training sergeants for Kazakhstani Army. In 2016, four Kazakh military personnel completed language courses were sent to the United States Naval Academy for training. According to the State Department, in total, 28 Kazakhstanis were trained at the U.S. military universities in 2015 within "Foreign Military Training" programme. In 2016, the number reached 567 people. <sup>206</sup> But the above figures are "second hand" resources. To the primary resource, the Foreign Military Training Report of the Department of State and Department of Defence for 2014-2019, American programmes trained hundreds of Kazakh military personnel. There are programmes of Foreign military sales, Foreign military financing, International military education and training for one year, Peacekeeping operations, Regional defense combating terrorism and irregular warfare, Service-sponsored academy

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>204</sup> Aleksandrova D. A., Andreeva E. S., Yermakova S. M., Ivanova V. A., Ippolitova I. V., Makarevskiy M. N., Nemenskyi O. B., Popova D. S., Petrovskyi O. V., Tacica K. I., Shevchenko A. M., NATO v politike postsovetskikh gosudarstv posle vossoyedineniya Kryma s Rossiyey [NATO in the politics of post-Soviet States after the reunification of Crimea with Russia]. Moscow, Russian Institute for Strategic Studies (RISS), Center for CIS countries studies, 2018. p. 90

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>205</sup> K Kuda letit "Stepnoy orel"? [Where is the Steppe eagle going?]. "Strategic culture Foundation" electronic edition, Jul. 1, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.fondsk.ru/news/2019/07/01/kuda-letit-stepnoj-orel-48504.html">https://www.fondsk.ru/news/2019/07/01/kuda-letit-stepnoj-orel-48504.html</a> (Accessed: 27 September 2019)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>206</sup> Aleksandrova D. A., Andreeva E. S., Yermakova S. M., Ivanova V. A., Ippolitova I. V., Makarevskiy M. N., Nemenskyi O. B., Popova D. S., Petrovskyi O. V., Tacica K. I., Shevchenko A. M., NATO v politike postsovetskikh gosudarstv posle vossoyedineniya Kryma s Rossiyey [NATO in the politics of post-Soviet States after the reunification of Crimea with Russia]. Moscow, Russian Institute for Strategic Studies (RISS), Center for CIS countries studies, 2018. p. 90

exchanges. Since 2019, the U.S. started to train the Kazakh military personnel in two more programmes. It is Coast guard assistance to enhance cooperation with the U.S.'s key maritime partners. The second one is Section 333 programme providing training and equipment to Kazakhstan's national security forces. The annual number of students and American financial assistance are stable except for the 2015.<sup>207</sup> (Appendix)

Steppe Eagle is more a personal area of Kazakh-American activities rather than cooperation with NATO members. Even the same exercises are held with both Russia and China at higher level, the U.S. activity in training young Kazakh military personnel gives access to educate the next generation. It is important, because military personnel who trained under the American military system will be able to take up higher positions. And this generation will become a leader who determines the military and political direction of the country in the future. It was mentioned by the American expert S. Engels as well that an effectively implemented program of military professionalization will help the U.S. to have a fundamental level influence in promoting its ideology.<sup>208</sup>

\*\*\*

Thus, the anticipated pivot of Kazakhstan's military-technical industry from Russia was unwarranted for 2014-2019. It is noteworthy for justice, Kazakhstan's cooperation with Russia is at a more senior and stable level among the powers. But the country does not exclude cooperation with other powers following the multi-vector policy. It avoids the excessive influence of one power as well.

## 2.3. Experience of Contemporary Peaceful Uses of Outer Space

Kazakhstan, with the largest cosmodrome in the world, has vast potential to develop its space industry. The conceptual development of domestic space activities can be considered since the 2000s. But the plans elaborated during the period were poorly carried out because, according to the former Chairman of the National Space Agency, the lack of a single governing body that

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>207</sup> Foreign Military Training. FY 2014-2019. Source: Join report of U.S. Department of Defense and the Department of State. URL: <a href="https://securityassistance.org/sites/default/files/243009.pdf">https://securityassistance.org/sites/default/files/243009.pdf</a> (2014-2015);

https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/fmt\_vol1\_16\_17.pdf (2016-2017);

https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/fmt\_vol1 17 18.pdf (2017-2018);

https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2019/12/FMT Volume-I FY2018 2019.pdf (2018-2019) (Accessed: 28 April 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>208</sup> Engels S. Military Professionalization Programs in Kazakhstan and the U.S.: How to Implement and What Will We Gain? Connections: The Quarterly Journal, 2017, No. 2. pp. 91-104

was fully responsible. <sup>209</sup> Since the adoption of the country's Law "On Space Activities" in 2012, the country had set the task to create a new Kazakh space sphere. <sup>210</sup>

In 2013, N. Nazarbayev instructed the Ministry to bring existing projects to a logical conclusion and to enter the world market of space services by 2030. Since then up to establishment of Digital Development, Innovation and Aerospace Industry Ministry, Kazkosmos conducted all space activities under its Strategic Plan for 2011-2015. In 2016, the structure was transferred into the newly organized Ministry. A new Strategic Plan for 2017-2021 was simultaneously put forward. The branch in Baikonur was reorganized and Kazkosmos was relaunched into "Kazakhstan Gharysh Sapary". It can be assumed of a new era for the Kazakh aerospace sector. 212

# 2.3.1. Aerospace cooperation between Kazakhstan and Russia

Kazakhstan and Russia share a common historical past in the area. Even after independence, Baikonur remained a joint platform for implementing space projects. In 2004, the countries signed an agreement to extend the lease term of the cosmodrome until 2050 for an annual amount of \$115 million.<sup>213</sup> During the cooperation, the countries jointly developed a line of satellites KazSat-1, KazSat-2, KazSat-3, the last of which was launched in 2014. Although the first systems failed shortly after launch, according to the Kazakh Ministry, all three satellites are currently operating at 100% of the population's audio-visual communications needs.<sup>214</sup>

To the Roadmap 2014-2016, Kazakhstan and Russia approved the creation of a joint Bayterek rocket and space complex, which has been discussed since 2004, on the existing Zenit

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>209</sup> Kosmicheskiy put Kazakhstana: cherez ternii k zvezdam [Kazakhstan's space path: through thorns to the stars]. "Kazinform" international news agency, Feb. 25, 2018. URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/ru/kosmicheskiy-put-kazahstana-cherez-ternii-k-zvezdam">https://www.inform.kz/ru/kosmicheskiy-put-kazahstana-cherez-ternii-k-zvezdam</a> a3165631 (Accessed: 26 April 2020)

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>210</sup> Garysh qyzmeti týraly: Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń 2012 jylgy 6 qańtartdagy Zańy [Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On space actibity" dated January 2, 2012]. Yegemen Qazaqstan, Jan. 26, 2012, № 37-38 (27110). URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/Z1200000528">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/Z1200000528</a> (Accessed: 9 March 2020)
 <sup>211</sup> Strategic plan of national space agency of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2011-2015. Old website of Aerospace

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>211</sup> Strategic plan of national space agency of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2011-2015. Old website of Aerospace Comittee Ministry of investments and of the Republic of Kazakhstan: URL: <a href="https://gh-ecology.kz/en/o-predpriyatii/ba-darlamaly-zhane-strategiyaly-dokumentter/strategiyaly-ba-darlamalar/ctrategicheskij-plan-natsionalnogo-kosmicheskogo-agentstva-respubliki-kazahstan-na-2011-2015-gody (Accessed: 9 March 2020)</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>212</sup> Tsıfrlyq damý, ınnovatsıya jane aerogarysh ónerkásibi mınıstrliginiń 2017-2021 arnalgan strategiyalyq jospary [Ministry's strategic plan for 2017-2021]. Ministry of Digital Development, Innovations, Aerospace Industry of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Jan. 13, 2020.

URL: https://www.gov.kz/memleket/entities/mdai/documents/details/8195?lang=kk (Accessed: 10 April 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>213</sup> Qazaqstan Respýblikasy men Resei Federatsiiasy arasyndágy "Baiqońyr" keshenin tiimdi paidalaný jónindégi yntymaqtastyqty damytý týraly 2004 jylgy 9 qańtardágy kelisimdi ratifikatsialaý: Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń 2010 jylgy 29 sáýirdegi Zańy [Law dated April 29, 2010 on ratification of the Agreement between the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Russian Federation on the development of cooperation on the effective use of the Baikonur complex of January 9, 2004]. Collection of acts of the President and the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2010, №8 (2561), art. 42. URL: http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/Z100000273 (Accessed: 17 March 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>214</sup> Ministry of Digital Development, Innovations, Aerospace Industry of the RK. Source: <a href="https://www.gov.kz/">https://www.gov.kz/</a>

complex infrastructure. But, Russian-Ukrainian conflict suspended the process. The roadmap otherwise gave a certain impetus to the Kazakhstani-Russian tandem. Later it was reported that Bayterek will be created on the Angara, not Zenit. And the Chairman of Kazakhstan Aerospace Committee noted that it is an entirely new rocket and space complex, which will allow Kazakhstan to rank with the "launching" countries. <sup>215</sup> Indeed, the project is of strategic importance for Kazakhstan and the premise for the further development of cosmodrome.

In 2014, Kazakhstan released its domestic remote sensing satellites (ERS) on a special order of Elbasy for the first time. KazEOSat-2 was launched from the Russian Yasny base in the Orenburg region. A similar experience with KazEOSat-1 was with France earlier in the year. Both satellites had entered the foreign market in mid-2015.<sup>216</sup> To the Ministry, ERS are conducting total digitization of land resources in Kazakhstan. 34 sectoral geo-services were carried out, which successfully identified problems in agriculture, land use and ecology.

The Russia ratified a cooperation agreement on outer space research and use for peaceful purposes from 2008. Kazakhstan and Russia agreed to reduce the number of toxic Proton launch vehicles. To the latest announce of Deputy Head of the Ministry, the country is working on the development of new fuel, and toxic rocket launchers will not be used by 2025.<sup>217</sup>

In 2015, a truly historic event took place. 20 years later, the third Kazakhstani went into space as a crew member of the Soyuz TMA-18 with Danish and Russian cosmonauts. The Kazakh side paid Russia \$20 million from the national fund for the mission. The President personally thanked V. Putin for the opportunity.<sup>218</sup>

In the following years of cooperation, short-term Road maps were signed on further action at the Baikonur complex. 62 launches were carried out during 2015-2019. At the moment, the countries are working on two joint projects. The first is the modernization of Gagarin's Start launch. Kazakhstan and Russia cooperate with the UAE in the project implementation. The second is the Bayterek space-rocket complex mentioned earlier. Although Kazakhstan had already removed the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>215</sup> T. Musabayev rasskazal o planakh i perspektivakh razvitiya kosmicheskoy otrasli RK [T. Musabayev about plans and prospects for the development of space industry]. "Kapital" business information center, Oct. 10, 2015. URL: <a href="https://kapital.kz/economic/44972/talgat-musabayev-rasskazal-o-perspektivakh-baykonura.html">https://kapital.kz/economic/44972/talgat-musabayev-rasskazal-o-perspektivakh-baykonura.html</a> (Accessed: 29 April 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>216</sup> Vvod v ekspluatatsiyu vtorogo sputnika DZZ zaplanirovan na vtoroy kvartal 2015. [Commissioning of the second remote sensing satellite is scheduled for the second quarter of 2015]. National Company Kazakhstan Garysh Sapary, Jan. 16, 2015. URL: http://old.gharysh.kz/news/73.html (Accessed: 15 March 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>217</sup> Kuda v Kazakhstane ukhodyat milliardy tenge, potrachennyye na kosmos [Interview with the Ministry of Digital Development, Innovations, Aerospace Industry: Where do billions of tenge spent on space go in Kazakhstan?]. "Liter" governmental socio-political newspaper, Oct. 25, 2019. URL: <a href="https://liter.kz/12886-kuda-v-kazahstane-uhodyat-milliardy-potrachennye-na-kosmos-bolshoe-intervyu/">https://liter.kz/12886-kuda-v-kazahstane-uhodyat-milliardy-potrachennye-na-kosmos-bolshoe-intervyu/</a> (Accessed: 17 April 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>218</sup> Meshcheryakov K. Y. The Russian-Kazakh relations during the "Ukrainian crisis", Klio, 2016, №5. pp. 118-134

Bayterek complex from the lease of Russia, the long-term cooperation has not suffered from it. In the complex, the countries are working on Soyuz-5 (Fenix) and Sunkar rockets planned for launch in 2035 and 2020.<sup>219</sup>

It seems the increasing rumours about Russia's premature withdrawal from Baikonur did not have any detrimental effect on bilateral relations. The reasons for Russia's possible withdrawal were interpreted in different ways in the media: from economic impracticability to harmful effects on the health of locals, supported by protests of social activists. It was reinforced by the return of 11.6K hectares on Chelyabinsk-2017 Protocol, transition of schools, medical centers into the Kazakhstani system in 2016-2017, which previously functioned under the Russian legislation.<sup>220</sup>

The Aerospace industry Ministry explained the situation, "Kazakhstan does not exclude the premature departure of Russia from Baikonur. It is a very difficult question. The process will be carried out step by step by discussing and consulting with Russian partners. At the same time, it does not mean that Kazakhstan has started to cut ties with Russia". Earlier, the Foreign Affairs Ministry stated that the military is leaving Baikonur, not Roscosmos.<sup>221</sup>

Thus, the phased preparation for 2050 has already begun. So that when the time comes, it will be without unnecessary losses for both Kazakhstan and Russia. The space industry is often referred to as a military-technical issue. But, the country demonstrates that it gives preference to the civil status of Baikonur and the commercial perspective through military staff removal.

## 2.3.2. Kazakhstan-Chinese cooperation in space technology

On the one hand, Kazakhstan is working on the independent operation of Baikonur without affecting strategic partnership with Russia. On the other hand, it started to establish ties with other countries, trying to be attractive in commercial terms. The country has been holding an annual International Seminar "Space Days in Kazakhstan" since 2015 for such purposes. Currently, the

<sup>220</sup> Dorozhnaya karta po sovmestnomu ispolzovaniyu kompleksa "Baykonur" na 2014-2016 gody vypolnena [The road map for the joint use of the Baikonur complex for 2014-2016 has been completed]. "Kazinform" international news agency, Jan. 25, 2017. URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/ru/dorozhnaya-karta-po-sovmestnomu-ispol-zovaniyu-kompleksa-baykonur-na-2014-2016-gody-vypolnena\_a2992709">https://www.inform.kz/ru/dorozhnaya-karta-po-sovmestnomu-ispol-zovaniyu-kompleksa-baykonur-na-2014-2016-gody-vypolnena\_a2992709</a> (Accessed: 1 May 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>219</sup> Harlanov A. S. Cooperation of Russia and Kazakhstan in the space and high technologies. "Economics. Management. Law" Series, 2019, No. 2. pp. 59-68

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>221</sup>Kazakhstan i Rossiya obsuzhdayut vykhod goroda Baykonyra iz arendy [Kazakhstan and Russia are discussing the exit of the city of Baikonur from the lease]. "Sputnik" news agency, Apr. 11, 2019. URL: <a href="https://ru.sputniknews.kz/politics/20190411/9789932/kazakhstan-russia-baikonyr-gorod-arenda-vyvod.html">https://ru.sputniknews.kz/politics/20190411/9789932/kazakhstan-russia-baikonyr-gorod-arenda-vyvod.html</a>;

Kazakhstan otberet u Rossii chast Baykonura [Kazakhstan will take back part of Baikonur from Russia]. "Lenta.ru" online news publication, Dec. 12, 2019. URL: <a href="https://lenta.ru/news/2019/12/12/baikonur/">https://lenta.ru/news/2019/12/12/baikonur/</a> (Accessed: 1 May 2020)

number of participants exceeded 500 bringing together residents from more than 50 countries. All major space powers participate in the seminar.<sup>222</sup>

In 2015, Kazakhstan and China discussed cooperation in aerospace industry. It was the first meeting of Kazakh-Chinese working group on aerospace held in Astana. The working group operates under the Vice-Chairman of Kazakh Aerospace Committee and the Secretary-General of Chinese National Space Administration. The working group will focus on the implementation of a bilateral Agreement on Cooperation for Peaceful Purposes from 2011.

On the working visit, Chinese delegation visited the objects of ground-based space infrastructure: Center for remote sensing and high-precision satellite navigation systems in Astana, Space Communication Center "Akkol" in the Akmola region.<sup>223</sup>

In 2016, Prime Minister of Kazakhstan visited China to get acquainted with Chinese centers of high technology and aerospace development. After, Kazakh Ambassador to China met with the President of a large Chinese international company – Aerospace Long-March International Trade. The parties discussed and agreed on the exchange of technical personnel and training Kazakh specialists in space technologies in China.<sup>224</sup>

In 2017, Chairman of Chinese Space Technology Academy was a speaker in the "Space Days in Kazakhstan" along with local and Russian specialists.

In 2019, the activities on space between Kazakhstan and China resumed, though bilateral relations predominantly focused on trade and economy in 2017-2018. Next meeting of the space cooperation working group was in Beijing. The delegation of Kazcosmos visited Chinese space infrastructure facilities. The Kazakh delegation was acquainted with Chinese specialists` developing technologies during the visit Aerospace Academy №5. There were construction and testing of communication, navigation and remote sensing satellites, and the lunar programme spacecraft. The Chinese side briefed the delegation with the ongoing and planned missions to explore the Moon, Mars, and deep space. There also was a follow-up meeting with representatives of China Satcom, Aerospace Long-March International Trade to discuss electromagnetic

<sup>223</sup> Kazakhstan i Kitay namereny sovmestno razrabotat sputnik svyazi [Kazakhstan and China intend to jointly develop a communications satellite]. "Kapital" business information center, Dec. 4, 2015. URL: <a href="https://kapital.kz/economic/46008/kazakhstan-i-kitay-namereny-sovmestno-razrabotat-sputnik-svyazi.html">https://kapital.kz/economic/46008/kazakhstan-i-kitay-namereny-sovmestno-razrabotat-sputnik-svyazi.html</a> (Accessed: 20 April 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>222</sup> Press-reliz "Dni kosmosa v Kazakhstane – 2015" [Press release "space Days in Kazakhstan-2015"]. National Company Kazakhstan Garysh Sapary, Nov. 24, 2015. URL: <a href="http://old.gharysh.kz/news/681.html">http://old.gharysh.kz/news/681.html</a> (Accessed: 9 March 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>224</sup> Kazakhstan and China intend to cooperate in the field of space technologies. "Kazinform" international news agency, Sep. 10, 2016. URL: <a href="http://lenta.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-china-to-cooperate-in-the-sphere-of-space-technologies a2935481">http://lenta.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-china-to-cooperate-in-the-sphere-of-space-technologies a2935481</a> (Accessed: 18 April 2020)

compatibility. The parties agreed to intensify cooperation within the short-term programme and take measures to improve the effectiveness of joint work on cooperation.<sup>225</sup>

# 2.3.3. Kazakhstan-American interaction in space industry

Kazakhstan-American relations in space industry began later and were not as active, except that Baikonur was a point of departure and return for American astronauts.

Up to 2017, Kazakhstan and the U.S. primarily collaborated in the geological survey. It started with the Turgai steppe geoglyphs. The geoglyphs made by a Kazakh scientist through KazEOSat-1 caused American specialists` interest. Pittsburgh University, then NASA were interested in cooperation. Notably, the pictures were exhibited at EXPO-2017. To the National Center of Space Research and Technology President, there are both scientific and practical interest in bilateral relations. It could contribute to the development of tourism in Kazakhstan, as well as the preservation of geoglyphs is the object of cultural and historical heritage.<sup>226</sup>

In 2015, Kazakhstan Gharysh Sapary with USAID and USGS, a division of UNESCO for CA region, held a training seminar. At the seminar, scientists from the USA studied how to manage water resources using satellites KazEOSat-1 and KazEOSat-2. The American specialists provided Kazakhstan software for modeling the flood situation – USGS flash flood. The Kazakhstani government had already mastered the programme independently as shown by American scientists at the seminar. Scientists delivered lectures at L. Gumilyov ENU and Nazarbayev University and outlined that Kazakhstan has all opportunities to effectively cooperate in aerospace with the USA.<sup>227</sup>

In 2016, Kazkosmos held negotiations with the Geological Survey Office of International Programs Director. A number of important issues were discussed during the negotiation. For instance, organization of training seminars on a permanent basis, joint search for scholarships for projects and programs implementation, Kazcosmos's further joining the International Charter "Space and Major Disasters", creation of a national spatial data infrastructure in

<sup>226</sup> Ancient Geoglyphs Discovered in Kazakhstan. National Geographic Education Blog, Feb. 11, 2015. URL: <a href="https://blog.education.nationalgeographic.org/2015/11/02/ancient-geoglyphs-discovered-in-kazakhstan/">https://blog.education.nationalgeographic.org/2015/11/02/ancient-geoglyphs-discovered-in-kazakhstan/</a> (Accessed: 22 March 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>225</sup> Kazcosmos delegation visited space infrastructure facilities of China. "Kazinform" international news agency, May 30, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/en/kazcosmos-delegation-visited-space-infrastructure-facilities-of-china">https://www.inform.kz/en/kazcosmos-delegation-visited-space-infrastructure-facilities-of-china</a> a3532424 (Accessed: 20 April 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>227</sup> Geologicheskaya sluzhba SSHA na primere raboty kazahstanskih sputnikov DZZ obuchila upravleniyu vodnymi resursami [The US geological survey trained water resources management on the Kazakhstan's remote sensing satellites]. National Company Kazakhstan Garysh Sapary, Oct. 7, 2015. URL: <a href="http://old.gharysh.kz/news/558.html">http://old.gharysh.kz/news/558.html</a> (Accessed: 12 March 2020)

Kazakhstan on USA geological survey experience. Kazakhstan and USA thereby strengthened its relations.<sup>228</sup>

In 2018, during N. Nazarbayev's visit to the USA, the above-mentioned negotiations in Kazakhstan were consolidated into a series of agreements. 3 of signed 26 documents were dedicated to the aerospace industry:

- 1. Letter of Intent between Kazakhstani Aerospace Committee of the Ministry and American Geological Survey;
  - 2. Memorandum between Kazakhstan Gharysh Sapary and Hexagon Geospatial;
  - 3. Memorandum between Galam and iDirect. <sup>229</sup>

The agreements are aimed at cooperation in sensing satellite communication systems establishment for various purposes.

As a result, Kazakhstan launched two of its satellites with Space X missiles in the U.S. late 2018. The Government explained the reason for using the American rocket, not the Russian one having its own space launch, from a commercial point of view. And there is considered an options for cooperation at the Buran launch site for American Intercontinental passenger aircraft.<sup>230</sup>

\*\*\*

To sum up, Kazakhstan has started strategic development of the space sector within its existing capabilities since 2014. Positive changes began with the state structures responsible for the aerospace industry. The country's foreign policy priority is to develop ties with other space powers, meanwhile, keep maintaining good-neighborly relations with Russia. But, it is noteworthy that Kazakhstan prefers European countries in space and high technology. Kazakhstan has a strategic partnership with France, which has started enhanced cooperation since 2017. Kazkosmos also intensively enters into partnerships with Italy, Spain, and Germany.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>228</sup> Geologicheskaya sluzhba SSHA ukreplyaet sotrudnichestvo s Kazkosmosom [US geological survey strengthens cooperation with Kazkosmos]. National Company Kazakhstan Garysh Sapary, Jun. 16, 2016. URL: <a href="http://old.gharysh.kz/news/1030.html">http://old.gharysh.kz/news/1030.html</a> (Accessed: 12 March 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>229</sup> Kazakhstan, U.S. vow to step up space cooperation. "Kazinform" international news agency, Jan. 18, 2018. URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-u-s-vow-to-step-up-space-cooperation">https://www.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-u-s-vow-to-step-up-space-cooperation</a> a3125396 (Accessed: 18 March 2020)
<sup>230</sup> Kuda v Kazakhstane ukhodyat milliardy tenge, potrachennyye na kosmos [Interview with the Ministry of Digital Development, Innovations, Aerospace Industry: Where do billions of tenge spent on space go in Kazakhstan?]. "Liter" governmental socio-political newspaper, Oct. 25, 2019. URL: <a href="https://liter.kz/12886-kuda-v-kazahstane-uhodyat-milliardy-potrachennye-na-kosmos-bolshoe-intervyu/">https://liter.kz/12886-kuda-v-kazahstane-uhodyat-milliardy-potrachennye-na-kosmos-bolshoe-intervyu/</a> (Accessed: 17 April 2020)

# CHAPTER III. Educational, Scientific, and Cultural triad in Kazakhstan's Foreign Policy

# 3.1. Dialogue between Kazakhstan and Great Powers in Education and Science

Education has been a priority in Kazakhstan's policy since the early years of independence. Until 2010, the reforms were mainly related to higher education: building the legal framework, strategic modernization of the system. "Bolashak" program is a most germane example created to train a high-class workforce for the young country in public administration, international trade, diplomacy, and exact sciences. Over the 27 years, more than 10,000 people have graduated from advanced universities in foreign countries. To the Education and Science Ministry, 26.6% of Bolashak residents were educated in the USA, 3.9% in Russia in 2015-2018.

In 2010, Kazakhstan signed the Bologna Declaration and became the first CA country to enter the European educational space. Since then, the state educational system, especially secondary, has started to undergo positive changes. Although the Kazakhstani system is not listed in the world and there are problems with obtaining equal access to quality education, the country is working on it.

After signing the Declaration, the Government put forward a Programme for the development of education up to 2020. The program consists of two short-term Concepts for 2011-2015 and 2016-2020.<sup>231</sup> According to the Programme, the country had to gradually switch to a 12-year education system. As for higher education, the three-level model of professional training became mandatory, and academic mobility programs were conducted more actively.

Kazakhstan annually accepts students and scientists from foreign universities as well. The President of the International Programs Center of Education and Science Ministry (CIP MES RK) Zh. Meldeshov noted that in the new decade Kazakhstan will strive to become an educational hub in CA. It will help the country develop both educational tourism and attract cash flows. The country organized "Days of Kazakhstan education" exhibition in a number of CA countries, China and India in 2017. CIP's President connects the 1.7% growth of foreign students in 2018 with the effectiveness of the campaign. In the current years, educational exhibitions will be held in other countries, and Kazakhstan plans to increase the number of foreign students in the country to 50K

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>231</sup> Qazaqstan Respýblikasynda bilim berýdi damytýdyń 2011-2020 jyldarģa arnalģan memlekettik baģdarlamasyn bekitý týraly: Qazaqstan Respýblikasy Prezidentiniń 2010 jylģy 6 jeltoqsandaģy Jarlyģy [State Program of Education Development for 2011-2020 Republic of Kazakhstan approved by the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan of December 6, 2010]. Yegemen Qazaqstan, Dec. 14, 2010, № 529-532 (26375). URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/U1000001118">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/U1000001118</a> (Accessed: 22 March 2020)

people by 2020-2021.<sup>232</sup> If the state aims to become a regional educational hub by increasing the number of foreign students to 2 times in the coming years, Kazakh citizens are actively sent to study abroad as well. Statistics of 2014 show more than 50K Kazakhstanis studied abroad. 78.4% of them at Russian and Chinese universities: Russia-28K, China-11.2K.<sup>233</sup> CIP announced today's number has exceeded 100K: Russia – more than 70K, China – more than 14K, the U.S. – about 2K. The students study through both Kazakhstani scholarships as "Bolashak", and own budget or state scholarships provided by the host countries. MES of Kazakhstan plans to increase the number of students to 200K over the next 5-10 years.<sup>234</sup>

K.-J. Tokayev demonstrated commitment to the previous education policy. In June 2019, the President held a meeting of the Foreign Investors` Council, which includes 32 large multinational companies. The Council has been functioning since 1998 as an advisory body providing a direct dialogue. Today it includes CNPC (China), LUKOIL, Sberbank, Citibank, Polymetal, RUSAL (Russia), Baker McKenzie, GE, JPMorgan Chase (USA) and other companies.

At the meeting, it was said, Kazakhstan planned to build 180 colleges and 20 universities over the next 3 years. The number of total GDP on education and science spending will rise by 5% (2018\3.52%). Thus, 58 billion tenge was allocated for the initial stage. K.-J. Tokayev was not satisfied with the quality of secondary education-colleges, and pointed out its modernization to technical areas. By 2019-2021, it was instructed to train specialists in 100 most popular industrial and service professions. The tasks will be fulfilled within the state program "Zhas Maman" advanced by N. Nazarbayev for Year of Youth. All educational institutions have to conform to the WorldSkills standard. For this purpose, the country will strengthen its ties with the world's leading universities. The promotion of partnerships between universities and multi-national companies was prioritized. A successful example of recent years was called the experience of GE (USA) with

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>232</sup> Skolko Kazakhstan tratit na Bolashakerov i deystvitelno li oni tsennyye rabotniki. (Interview with the President JSC "Center for International Programs": How much Kazakhstan spends on the Bolashak students?). "Tengri news" online publication and information portal, Apr. 2, 2019. URL: <a href="https://tengrinews.kz/article/skolko-kazahstan-tratit-bolashakerov-deystvitelno-oni-1110/">https://tengrinews.kz/article/skolko-kazahstan-tratit-bolashakerov-deystvitelno-oni-1110/</a> (Accessed: 11 May 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>233</sup> Sadovskaya E. Y. Kiaytskaya migratsiya v Kazakhstane [Chinese migration in Kazakhstan]. Demaskop Weekly, 2015, №629-630. pp. 1-27

MON planiruyet vdvoye uvelichit kolichestvo obuchayushchikhsya za rubezhom kazakhstantsev v blizhayshiye 10 let [Interview with the President JSC "Center for International Programs": MES plans to double the number of Kazakhstani students studying abroad]. "Kursiv" business portal, Jan. 4, 2019. URL: <a href="https://kursiv.kz/news/obrazovanie/2019-01/mon-planiruet-vdvoe-uvelichit-kolichestvo-obuchayuschikhsya-za-rubezhom">https://kursiv.kz/news/obrazovanie/2019-01/mon-planiruet-vdvoe-uvelichit-kolichestvo-obuchayuschikhsya-za-rubezhom</a> (Accessed: 15 May 2020)

the Satpayev University and KBTU on training students in advanced methods of the oil and gas industry.<sup>235</sup>

In this regard, significant positive dynamics occurred in the Kazakhstan-Russian, -Chinese, - American relations in education and science. In 2014-2020, as part of government initiatives, a dozen Kazakh universities established partnerships with Russia, China and the U.S. In case of the USA and Russia, the State Program on trilingual education: Kazakh, Russian, and English facilitate dialogues as well.<sup>236</sup>

#### 3.1.1. Kazakhstan and Russia

Kazakhstan-Russian interregional mechanisms play a key role in establishing Interuniversity cooperation. In 2017, alongside the Chelyabinsk Interregional Forum, a Conference of Kazakhstani-Russian higher educational institutions was held. The conference was attended by 77 Russian and 49 Kazakh universities bringing together more than 300 people.<sup>237</sup> The meeting discussed the prospects of Russian university branches establishment in Kazakhstan, creation of joint research centers of bioinformatics technology, space, energy, IT, etc. By the time, 30 Kazakh universities were already conducting joint scientific research, and 6 Russian universities were successfully functioning in the country. For instance, Ural Federal University, Belgorod State University with al-Farabi KazNU have been successfully cooperating for several years conducting research in the International Laboratory of Applied Biotechnology.

As a result of the meeting, a joint Resolution on cooperation in science and education was adopted. And 40 Memoranda of cooperation were signed between the heads of universities:

- 1) Y. Altynsarin National Academy of Education, Yessenov Caspian State University, M. Kozybayev North Kazakhstan State University Ural State Pedagogical University;
  - 2) M. Auezov South Kazakhstan State University Lomonosov Moscow State University;
  - 3) L. N. Gumilyov ENU South Ural State University;
  - 4) K.Zhubanov Aktobe Regional State University Ural Federal University;

\_\_\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>235</sup> Tokayev obeshchayet provesti reformy v sfere obrazovaniya [Tokayev promises to carry out reforms in education]. "Kursiv" business portal, Jul. 4, 2019. URL: <a href="https://kursiv.kz/news/obrazovanie/2019-07/tokaev-obeschaet-provesti-reformy-v-sfere-obrazovaniya">https://kursiv.kz/news/obrazovanie/2019-07/tokaev-obeschaet-provesti-reformy-v-sfere-obrazovaniya</a> (Accessed: 18 April 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>236</sup> Úsh tilde bilim berýdi ilgeriletý jónindegi is-sharalar josparyn bekitý týraly: Qazaqstan Respýblikasy memleket hatshysynyń 2015 jylgy 30 qazandagy Ókimi [Order of the Republic of Kazakhstan Secretary of state "on approval of the Action Plan for trilingual education promotion" of October 30, 2015]. Official Site of the President Republic of Kazakhstan. URL: <a href="https://www.akorda.kz/ru/secretary">https://www.akorda.kz/ru/secretary</a> of state/secretary of state orders/ob-utverzhdenii-planameropriyatii-po-prodvizheniyu-trehyazychnogo-obrazovaniya (Accessed: 22 March 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>237</sup> Russia-Kazakhstan Interregional Cooperation Forum (full text content of meeting and speeches of N. Nazarbayev and V. Putin). Chelyabinsk, Nov. 9, 2017. URL: <a href="http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/56031">http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/56031</a> (Accessed: 16 December 2019)

- 5) Rudny Industrial Institue Nosov Magnitogorsk State Technical University;
- 6) Karaganda State Technical University Ural State Mining University, Chelyabinsk State University, South Ural State University;
- 7) Abai Kazakh National Pedagogical University South Ural State Humanitarian Pedagogical University.<sup>238</sup>

Russian President noted, the country fully supports Kazakhstan's trilingual initiative, and ready to support the training of Russian language teachers. <sup>239</sup> The topic was discussed at the Rectors' Forum as well, where the conference of Russian and 6 Kazakhstani pedagogical universities was organized separately.

In 2019, Kazakhstan hosted a meeting of Kazakhstan-Russian Ministries of education and science. The Ministry of Russia provided colleagues a preliminary list of universities, branches of which could be opened in Kazakhstan. Then, the two sides came to a mutual decision to transform the sub-Commission on cooperation in science and new technologies operating under the Intergovernmental Kazakhstani-Russian Commission into a sub-Commission on cooperation in education and science. Once again, it demonstrates the tasking priorities of science and educational cooperation. <sup>240</sup>

In the XVI Interregional Forum, K.-J. Tokayev suggested V. Putin to establish a Physics and Mathematics School on the Bauman University in the capital of Kazakhstan emphsizing to good prospects in science and education. And establish the Nazarbayev Intellectual school in one of the border regions of Russia.<sup>241</sup> The proposal of the Kazakh President indicates that the country is interested in cooperation both in higher and secondary education.

On the background of recent events – endless discussions about the distortion of the history and existence or non-existence of statehood – Kazakhstan-Russian scientists decided to cooperate and research the common historical past together.

<sup>239</sup> Otkrytiye rossiysko-kazakhstanskikh shkol i universitetov obsudili Putin i Tokayev [Putin and Tokayev discussed the opening of Russian-Kazakh schools and universities]. "Sputnik" news agency, Nov. 7, 2019. URL: <a href="https://ru.sputniknews.kz/education/20191107/11978308/russia-kazakhstan-shkoly-putin-tokaev.html">https://ru.sputniknews.kz/education/20191107/11978308/russia-kazakhstan-shkoly-putin-tokaev.html</a> (Accessed: 18 April 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>238</sup> International Forums of Russian-Kazakh Rectors. Lomonosov Moscow State University, Nov. 11, 2017. URL: <a href="https://www.msu.ru/news/forum-rektorov-rossii-i-kazakhstana.html">https://www.msu.ru/news/forum-rektorov-rossii-i-kazakhstana.html</a> (Accessed: 8 April 2020)

April 2020)

240 Rossiya i Kazakhstan dogovorilis o rasshirenii nauchno-obrazovatelnogo sotrudnichestva [Russia and Kazakhstan agreed to expand scientific and educational cooperation]. Ministry of science and higher education of the Russian Federation, Oct. 16, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.minobrnauki.gov.ru/ru/press-center/card/?id\_4=1992">https://www.minobrnauki.gov.ru/ru/press-center/card/?id\_4=1992</a> (Accessed: 7 May 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>241</sup> Nazarbayev Intellectual School may appear in Russia. "Kazinform" international news agency, Nov. 7, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/en/nazarbayev-intellectual-school-may-appear-in-russia">https://www.inform.kz/en/nazarbayev-intellectual-school-may-appear-in-russia</a> a3583313 (Accessed: 18 April 2020)

Since February 2017, the Joint working group of historians started to work. The working group is coordinated by the Directors of the Institute of History of MES RK and the Institute of World History of the Russian Academy of Sciences. The first extended meeting of specialists was held in Astana, during which a special Regulation was signed and approved. The parties agreed to hold an annual meeting and share the results of the joint work. Joint projects will be funded by both Russian and Kazakh funds. As the work Plan for 2018-2019, the working group presented a journal "Russia-Kazakhstan: Milestones of History" during the II meeting. On the 2019-2020's plan, scientists agreed to present a book on the history of the Great Patriotic War references to documents from Kazakhstan-Russian archives. The group is also working on a large-scale collection of manuscript materials for the upcoming joint monograph on Kazakh-Russia's new turn in history. The Director of the Russian Institute highlighted, it is a completely different level of interaction, which can be called "scientific diplomacy". The Kazakh side, in turn, noted that it would be a huge mistake to lose close ties with a neighbor like Russia with a powerful scientific potential. <sup>242</sup> Such platforms of cooperation will help the two countries find areas of convergence, achieve mutual understanding, and strengthen it at the scientific level rather mass media.

#### 3.1.2. Kazakhstan and USA

In November 2017, Kazakhstan held analogous Kazakh-American Forum of Higher Education with more than 80 universities. Currently, partnerships are built within the Kazakh-American University Partnership Coaching Program initiated by American Councils. In 2018, the U.S. Embassy in Astana and the American Council for international education awarded scholarships to 5 American universities to establish bilateral partnerships. The initiative was approved by both governments. Then, the representatives of American universities visited Kazakhstan and signed a joint Memorandum established relations with the following universities:

- 1) S. Seifullin Kazakh Agricultural Technical University Pennsylvania State University Beaver;
- 2) Narxoz University, L. N. Gumilyov ENU, and Al-Farabi KazNU Washington State University's Carson College of Business;
- 3) Pavlodar State University State University of New York College of Environmental Science and Forestry;

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>242</sup> Pervoe zasedanie Sovmestnoi rabochei gruppy istorikov Rossii i Kazahstana [First meeting of the Joint working group of historians of Russia and Kazakhstan]. IWH RAS, Mar. 3, 2018. URL: <a href="http://igh.ru/news/pervoe-zasedanie-sovmestnoi-rabochei-gruppy-istorikov-rossii-i-kazahstana?locale=ru">http://igh.ru/news/pervoe-zasedanie-sovmestnoi-rabochei-gruppy-istorikov-rossii-i-kazahstana?locale=ru</a> (Accessed: 20 April 2020)

- 4) East Kazakhstan State Technical University Western Michigan University's Department of Geological and Environmental Sciences;
- 5) Kazakh National Agrarian University Ohio State University's College of Food, Agricultural, and Environmental Sciences.<sup>243</sup>

Kazakhstan and USA are increasing communication in trilingual direction under the Joint Commission for Strategic Partnership. From the U.S. Ambassador's words, *as support for the state initiative of trilingualism, there are professional development programs for teachers of English and exact sciences*.<sup>244</sup> In Kazakhstan, English Language Fellow programs and cooperation with Ball State University are being implemented with the support of the American Embassy.

English Language Fellow is focused on higher education where the Fulbright program teachers arrive and provide assistance to professors of Kazakhstani universities. The cooperation with Ball State University is operating within the secondary education. On the project, the professors of American universities mentoring Kazakh school teachers in the subject of English and STEM in English for one year. According to the Director of Press and Public Diplomacy of South and Central Asian Affairs, 100 Kazakhstani teachers have successfully completed training in five major cities such as Pavlodar, Oskemen, Karaganda, Kostanay and Aktobe by the Ball State University programme. And the number of American teachers came by the English Language Fellow program has doubled in recent years.<sup>245</sup>

#### 3.1.3. Kazakhstan and China

Cooperation with China in education and science carries out within the Silk Road University Alliance established in 2015.<sup>246</sup>

In August 2018, Kazakhstan-Chinese Higher-Education dialogue on cooperation was implemented for the first time in Guizhou (China). It was the 11th China-ASEAN Education Week. The event was attended by more than 100 representatives from more than 10 well-known

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>243</sup> Grant Awards support higher education collaboration between US and Kazakhstan. American Councils for International Education, Mar. 19, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.americancouncils.org/news/across-globe/grant-awards-support-higher-education-collaboration-between-us-and-kazakhstan-0">https://www.americancouncils.org/news/across-globe/grant-awards-support-higher-education-collaboration-between-us-and-kazakhstan-0</a> (Accessed: 7 May 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>244</sup> My khotim, chtoby Kazakhstan byl stabilnoy i nezavisimoy stranoy (U.S. Ambassador to Kazakhstan William H. Moser: We want Kazakhstan to be a stable and independent country) Jan. 31, 2020. URL: <a href="https://kursiv.kz/news/obschestvo/2020-01/uilyam-mozer-my-khotim-chtoby-kazakhstan-byl-stabilnoy-i-nezavisimoy">https://kursiv.kz/news/obschestvo/2020-01/uilyam-mozer-my-khotim-chtoby-kazakhstan-byl-stabilnoy-i-nezavisimoy</a> (Accessed: 16 February 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>245</sup> Ya byla voskhishchena tem, chto v Kazakhstane vnedryayut politiku trekhyazychiya [Interview with Kerri Hannan: I was delighted that Kazakhstan is implementing a policy of trilingualism]. "Bilimdi El" educational socio-political newspaper of Kazakhstan, Nov. 22, 2019. URL: <a href="https://bilimdinews.kz/?p=75548">https://bilimdinews.kz/?p=75548</a> (Accessed: 31 March 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>246</sup> Tian E. Vzaimootnosheniya Kitayskoy Narodnoy Respubliki i Respubliki Kazakhstan na primere sotrudnichestva v sfere obrazovaniya [Relations between China and Kazakhstan on the example of cooperation in education]. 2018 − №4. pp. 8-17. URL: <a href="https://nbpublish.com/library\_read\_article.php?id=27722">https://nbpublish.com/library\_read\_article.php?id=27722</a> (Accessed: 2 April 2020)

Kazakhstani universities and 30 Chinese universities. 24 cooperation agreements were adopted between 10 Chinese and 9 Kazakh universities. For instance, Rectors of Almaty Management University and Abai Kazakh National Pedagogical University signed Memorandum on cooperation with Nanjing Pedagogical University, Guizhou University, School of International Education in Tianjin Polytechnic University. Currently, more than 30 Kazakh universities maintain close contacts with Chinese partners. <sup>247</sup> Director of the Confucius Institute at L. N. Gumilyov ENU stated that joint internships, exchange programmes, working on scientific books within the memoranda help to prepare a new generation of specialists who will work for the OBOR projects in the future. <sup>248</sup>

Though Chinese is not a priority of Kazakhstan's educational policy, it does not prevent the language from becoming widely known. The Confucius Institutes under major Kazakh universities have been successfully working. The Confucius Institutes promote not only the language but understanding of the cultures. The last Institute, being the fifth one, was opened at Ablai Khan Kazakh University of International Relations and World Languages in 2017.

Kazakh language has also gained some popularity in the academic circles of China and interest from society. For instance, the Kazakh language is taught as a specialization at the National Defence University administered by the Chinese People's Liberation Army since 2015. During 2015-2017, 4 Kazakhstani centers were launched in China under the Shanghai International Studies University, Dalian University of Foreign Languages, Beijing Foreign Studies University, Xi'an International Studies University. It opens the opportunity to promote Kazakh language, culture, and history. The Kazakh language is also widely spoken in XUAR, where 1.5 million ethnic Kazakhs live. According to the latest data, there are 3 broadcasting channels, and 50 publishing newspapers and magazines in the Kazakh language.<sup>249</sup>

\*\*\*

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>247</sup> 19 kitayskikh i kazakhstanskikh vuzov zaklyuchili soglasheniya o sotrudnichestve [19 Chinese and Kazakh universities have signed cooperation agreements]. People's Daily Online, Aug. 1, 2018. URL: <a href="http://russian.people.com.cn/n3/2018/0801/c31517-9486878.html">http://russian.people.com.cn/n3/2018/0801/c31517-9486878.html</a> (Accessed: 8 April 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>248</sup> Kazakhstan i Kitay narashchivayut sotrudnichestvo v sfere obrazovaniya i nauki. (interview with the Director of the Kazakhstan i Kitay narashchivayut sotrudnichestvo v sfere obrazovaniya i nauki [Interview with the Director of the Confucius Institute of ENU S. Koshanova: Kazakhstan and China increase cooperation in education and science]. "Kazinform" international news agency, Jul. 18, 2018. URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/ru/kazahstan-i-kitay-naraschivayut-sotrudnichestvo-v-sfere-obrazovaniya-i-nauki a3324011">https://www.inform.kz/ru/kazahstan-i-kitay-naraschivayut-sotrudnichestvo-v-sfere-obrazovaniya-i-nauki a3324011</a> (Accessed: 18 April 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>249</sup> Tian E. Vzaimootnosheniya Kitayskoy Narodnoy Respubliki i Respubliki Kazakhstan na primere sotrudnichestva v sfere obrazovaniya [Relations between China and Kazakhstan on the example of cooperation in education]. 2018 − №4. pp. 8-17. URL: <a href="https://nbpublish.com/library\_read\_article.php?id=27722">https://nbpublish.com/library\_read\_article.php?id=27722</a> (Accessed: 2 April 2020)

Thus, the results of interaction in education and science over the past 5 years show that Kazakhstan's foreign policy activities towards superpowers were not limited to political, military, trade and economic interactions.

# 3.2. Beginning of the Dialogue in High-Technology

Kazakhstan had taken a course on the development of high-tech production and digital technologies in recent years. It aimed at obtaining competitive products, ensuring the interests of national economic security, and the development of scientific and technical potential.

The Government's high-tech science is under the responsibility of 3 executive bodies: Ministry of education and science (MES), Ministry of industry and technology (MIT), Ministry of digital development, innovation and aerospace industry (MDDIAI). MIT was reorganized in 2014, and MDDIAI took office in 2016. It demonstrates that the scientific and technical areas became priorities since 2014. The state science and technology policy is implemented both within the long-term initiatives and in the medium term as a Strategic Plan of MIT for 2014-2018.<sup>250</sup>

In 2015, 390 organizations in Kazakhstan were engaged in science and technology. The country has scientific and technological consortia, some of which have international status. In 2016, an International innovative and production consortium was created on the Kazgiprotsvetmet Institute and KazNU. Currently, the Consortium cooperates with countries such as Russia, Australia, South Korea, Indonesia, and India within more than 30 Memoranda of joint work.<sup>251</sup>

The second International consortium was created on the MES. It was aimed at developing a digital educational space. Within the consortium, Kazakhstan actively cooperates with foreign companies and educational organizations, including VIZERRA (Russia) and Intel (USA).

The world exhibition Expo-2017 – Future Energy held in Kazakhstan demonstrated the country's vision and intention. The exhibition presented advanced ideas and scientific breakthroughs of "green" technology from more than 110 countries, including the real achievements of Kazakhstani scientists. It highlighted the country's intention not only in energy policy. It means that Kazakhstan will move and conduct cooperation with partner countries towards the "green" economy and digitization. The country's policy in this direction is governed

251 International innovative and production consortium. Source: http://kgcm.kz/ (Engineering company of Kazakhstan "Kazgiprotsvetmet")

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>250</sup> Qazaqstan Respýblikasy Indýstrua jáne Jaňa tehnologualar munustrliginiň 2014-2018 jyldarga arnalgan strategualyq jospary: Qazaqstan Respýblikasy Úkimetiniň 2013 jylgy 31 jeltoqsandagy Qaýlysy [Resolution of the Republic of Kazakhstan Government of Industrial and New technologies Strategic Plan 2014-2018 approved in December 12, 2017]. Collection of acts of the President and the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2013, №87, art. 1080. URL: http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P1300001574 (Accessed: 12 April 2020)

by the Concept for the transition of Kazakhstan to the "green economy" of 2013<sup>252</sup> and the State Programme "Digital Kazakhstan" of 2017. <sup>253</sup>

Despite the recent introduction of mass digitization, 120K employment opportunities had been created for two years. It was planned to increase to 200K by 2020. According to preliminary count, a direct economic effect of the program should be 1.7-2.2 trillion.tenge by 2025. At the moment, the overall economic effect is 802.5 billion tenge. There was created an ultra-modern "greenhouse environment" – Astana Hub on the former Expo pavilion with 17 laboratories. In 2 years, there were released 91 IT start-up projects widely used by Kazakhstanis today.<sup>254</sup>

Digitization did not spare industries including 23 "icebreaker" projects designed to hack entire sectors of the economy. Currently, the fuel and energy complex has 49 digital farms and 10 smart oil fields of the planned 17.

In terms of cooperation, Kazakhstan has an open and transparent policy. According to Digital Kazakhstan, the country intends to implement partnerships with other international innovation clusters, including the EEU, SCO countries.

# 3.2.1. Kazakhstani-Russian intentions to create a common digitization shifting system

At the Republican Conference on digitization of Kazakhstan where was presented the above-mentioned "Digital Kazakhstan" programme, the Russian Ministry of Digital Development, Communications and Mass Media was invited to attend. The Minister pointed out that countries should develop key technologies together. There was highlighted the importance of joining efforts not to turn the Kazakhstani-Russian economy digitization into the use of certain foreign solutions. In turn, N. Nazarbayev proposed to create a joint Commission on digitization including Belarus, Kazakhstan, and Russia. 255 Hence, the steps in implementing the plan of following Kazakhstan-Russian cooperatiom are intensively discussing within the EEU, CIS's meetings. Noteworthy is the different socio-economic development level of the countries. So it is

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>252</sup> Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń "jasyl ekonomikaga" kóshý jónindegi tujyrymdamasy: Qazaqstan Respýblikasy Prezidentiniń 2013 jylgy 30 mamyrdagy Jarlygy [Concept for the transition of the Republic of Kazakhstan to a "green economy" by the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan of May 30, 2013]. Yegemen Qazaqstan, Jun. 1, 2013, № 139 (28078). URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/T1300000577">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/T1300000577</a> (Accessed: 12 April 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>253</sup> "Tsifrlyq Qazaqstan" memlekettik baśdarlamasyn bekitý: Qazaqstan Respýblikasy Úkimetiniń 2017 jyléy 12 jeltoqsandaśy Qaýlysy [Resolution of the Republic of Kazakhstan Government "On approval of the State Program "Digital Kazakhstan" of December 12, 2017]. URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P1700000827">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P1700000827</a> (Accessed: 12 April 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>254</sup> Aymurzinov M. S., Baimukhamedov M. F., Baimukhamedova G. S. Technological modernization of the economy of the country based on the implementation of state program "digital Kazakhstan". Agrarian Bulletin of the Urals, 2019, №2 (181). pp. 42-45

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>255</sup> Russia proposed Kazakhstan to jointly transit to digital economy. "Strategy2050.kz" Information agency, Sep. 14, 2017. URL: <a href="https://strategy2050.kz/en/news/48093/big/">https://strategy2050.kz/en/news/48093/big/</a> (Accessed: 2 May 2020)

not expected a simultaneous shift to digitization. Therefore, Kazakhstan proposed first to create the Commission of three countries whose indicators are the highest on the Digital Implementation Index.<sup>256</sup> But, the Joint Commission has not yet been established. The creation of legal acts regulating cooperation still faces bureaucracy and complicates the process, not to mention jointly developed technologies.

## 3.2.2. OBOR facilitates Kazakhstan-Chinese digital cooperation

By the latest negotiations, it can be assumed that among the powers, Kazakhstan's cooperation with China are the most intensive and efficient. Notably, the tendancy of foreign activities in this sphere shows the country's preference for Asian and European countries.

In 2018, the Kazakh Ambassador to China met with the Chairman of OBOR Cloud Network Technology company. The OBOR Cloud is one of the leading IT company in China developing major software products for the country's customs administration. During the meeting, there were discussed the prospects of combining Digital Kazakhstan and Digital Silk Road programs. Kazakh Ambassador pointed out the importance of create a cross-border ecommerce in Khorgos. It allows to keep a full record of the movement of goods and citizens. For the record, last year, China had already released the first experimental zones of cross-border ecommerce in the Chinese part of Khorgos.<sup>257</sup>

It is important to cooperate with China in digitization for Kazakhstan. As long as it means digitization of the Silk Road: from Southeast Asia to Europe passing through the Caspian sea. The main goal of Kazakhstan is to provide 4G Internet to the entire population by 2023. For this purpose, negotiations between Kazakh operators and Chinese companies are in the implementation phase. The main Chinese partner of Kazakhstan, Huawei, started to implement 5G networks in the necessary industrial sectors and major cities. Kazakhstan is already cooperating with Huawei in the state's digital "Safe City" and "Smart Home" projects. 258 National company Kazakhtelecom (Samruk-Kazyna) signed a deal with the world's largest communications operator China Mobile. The deal will allow the Kazakh company to expand the channel's capacity for data transit by almost

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>256</sup> The digital potential of the countries-participants of the EDB. EDB Centre for integration studies, Research Department, Sep. 23, 2019. URL: <a href="https://eabr.org/upload/iblock/566/EABR Digital Potential EN.pdf">https://eabr.org/upload/iblock/566/EABR Digital Potential EN.pdf</a> (Accessed: 6 April 2020)

April 2020)

257 V Sintszyane poyavilis pervyye eksperimentalnyye zony transgranichnoy elektronnoy kommertsii [The first experimental zones of cross-border e-Commerce appeared in Xinjiang]. SILUXGC – New silk road observation, Mar. 12, 2019. URL: <a href="http://ru.siluxgc.com/html/R1683/201903/22100552389616.shtml">http://ru.siluxgc.com/html/R1683/201903/22100552389616.shtml</a> (Accessed: 2 May 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>258</sup> Kazakhstan to test 5G in pilot mode this year – Abayev. "Kazinform" international news agency, Feb. 20, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-to-test-5g-in-pilot-mode-this-year-abayev">https://www.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-to-test-5g-in-pilot-mode-this-year-abayev</a> a3500121 (Accessed: 6 May 2020)

six times. The Director of the Kazakhstani company noted that the agreement will catalyze the development of both Kazakhstan and CA region.<sup>259</sup>

Kazakhstan-Chinese cooperation reinforced by K.-J. Tokayev's announcement made during an official visit to China in 2019, *China has become a world leader in the new technologies, and bilateral cooperation in this field is "of great importance for Kazakhstan"*.<sup>260</sup> The President visited major Chinese high-tech companies. On return to Kazakhstan said, "We have to go in this direction. It is a global trend. I set the task for the government and relevant ministries. Follow the developed countries' example. In China, everything had been digitized. In the end, you can borrow some technologies from there. The main thing now is the result. We are still lagging behind. Of course, it may look not so bad in the CA, but how can it satisfy us…".<sup>261</sup>

## 3.2.3. Kazakhstan-American digital cooperation in healthcare

Kazakhstan-U.S. bilateral cooperation in digitization began recently as well. In 2017, Samruk-Kazyna and GE Digital signed a Strategic Partnership Agreement on creating a "fasr-track" digital evolution and sustainable digital ecosystem in Kazakhstan.<sup>262</sup>

In 2018, Kazakhstani Ministry of Health signed a Memorandum of Strategic Partnership with GE Healthcare, one of the business divisions of GE. The Memorandum is on the modernization and development of the healthcare system in Kazakhstan. A partnership was also established between the company and the Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology. The parties agreed to create a national clinical archive, organize electronic document management, and establish telemedicine centers for teleradiology, breast cancer screening. As the vice-Minister of Health and the vice-Chairman of GE Healthcare noted, bilateral cooperation will allow developing both digital healthcare industry and a quality medicine for the population, especially

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>259</sup> Kazakhtelecom builds the digital Silk Road (interview with director of Kazakhtelecom B2B products development L. Muravjov). Mobile World Live, Jul. 8, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.mobileworldlive.com/latest-stories/kazakhtelecom-builds-the-digital-silk-road/">https://www.mobileworldlive.com/latest-stories/kazakhtelecom-builds-the-digital-silk-road/</a> (Accessed: 12 April 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>260</sup> Kazakhstan seeks high-tech, agricultural cooperation with China, says Tokayev during Beijing Business Council meeting. The Astana Times News, Sep. 13, 2019. URL: <a href="https://astanatimes.com/2019/09/kazakhstan-seeks-high-tech-agricultural-cooperation-with-china-says-tokayev-during-beijing-business-council-meeting/">https://astanatimes.com/2019/09/kazakhstan-seeks-high-tech-agricultural-cooperation-with-china-says-tokayev-during-beijing-business-council-meeting/</a> (Accessed: 6 May 2020)

<sup>261</sup> Tokayev poruchil perenyat u Kitaya opyt tsifrovizatsii grazhdan [Tokayev instructed to learn China's experience in digitization of civil sectors]. "Kursiv" business portal, Oct. 8, 2019. URL: <a href="https://kursiv.kz/news/obschestvo/2019-10/tokaev-poruchil-perenyat-u-kitaya-opyt-cifrovizacii-grazhdan">https://kursiv.kz/news/obschestvo/2019-10/tokaev-poruchil-perenyat-u-kitaya-opyt-cifrovizacii-grazhdan</a> (Accessed: 6 May 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>262</sup> On first visit to Kazakhstan, GE Digital CEO says digital transformation transforms global industry (lecture of CEO of GE Digital Bill Ruh at the NU). The Astana Times News, Nov. 5, 2017. URL: <a href="https://astanatimes.com/2017/11/on-first-visit-to-kazakhstan-ge-digital-ceo-says-digital-transformation-transforms-global-industry/">https://astanatimes.com/2017/11/on-first-visit-to-kazakhstan-ge-digital-ceo-says-digital-transformation-transforms-global-industry/</a> (Accessed: 13 May 2020)

in the regions.<sup>263</sup> In 2019, Digital Health Astana established a partnership with GE Healthcare as well. At the meeting, the two sides discussed the prospects of medical equipment production and cooperation with local development companies for start-ups.<sup>264</sup>

\*\*\*

Thus, it reveals that Kazakhstan has entered the high technology and began to digitize various sectors of public administration and economy. The gradual transition to digital technology smoothly leading to a green economy requires comprehensive cooperation with successful countries in this industry. Among the powers, cooperation only with China is engaged in systematic and targeted activities at the stage. The case of Russia and USA, there is no consistency and cooperation is conducted only on a limited scale.

## 3.3. Intercultural Dialogue with Great Powers

The cultural policy of the state is the basis of patriotism, fondness for its history, and respect for the people. Currently, the cultural sovereignty's gaining popularity is not a coincidence, and an increasing number of countries are realizing the importance of own independent cultural policies as the basis for nation-building.

In the Address to the people of Kazakhstan dated January 17, 2014, among the necessary conditions for creating new opportunities and revealing the creative potential of Kazakhstanis, N. Nazarbayev outlined, "...it is necessary to give new impulses to the development of all-Kazakh culture". <sup>265</sup>

Contemporary work in the cultural policy was conducted systematically and consistently within the Concept of cultural policy of Kazakhstan dated November 4, 2014. The Concept highlighted a special role of culture, "world experience has shown that the state's interest and well-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>263</sup> GE Healthcare to take part in Kazakh Ministry's digitalization projects. "Kazinform" international news agency, Nov. 15, 2018. URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/en/ge-healthcare-to-take-part-in-kazakh-ministry-s-digitalization-projects\_a3456715">https://www.inform.kz/en/ge-healthcare-to-take-part-in-kazakh-ministry-s-digitalization-projects\_a3456715</a> (Accessed: 11 May 2020)

GE Healthcare rasskazala, kak digital-resheniya mogut povysit effektivnost raboty meduchrezhdeniy v Kazakhstane [GE Healthcare told how digital solutions can improve the efficiency of medical institutions in Kazakhstan]. GE Reports, Oct. 25, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.genewsroom.com/press-releases/ge-healthcare-%D1%80%D0%B0%D1%81%D1%81%D0%BA%D0%B0%D0%B7%D0%B0%D0%BB%D0%B0-%D0%BA%D0%B0%D0%BA-">https://www.genewsroom.com/press-releases/ge-healthcare-%D1%80%D0%B0%D1%81%D1%81%D0%BA%D0%B0%D0%B7%D0%B0%D0%B8%D0%B0-%D0%BA%D0%B0%D0%BA-</a>

 $<sup>\</sup>frac{\text{digital-}\%D1\%80\%D0\%B5\%D1\%88\%D0\%B5\%D0\%B5\%D0\%BD\%D0\%B8\%D1\%8F-\%D0\%BC\%D0\%BE\%D0\%B3\%D1\%83\%D1\%82-\%D0\%BF\%D0\%BE\%D0\%B2\%D1\%8B\%D1\%81\%D0\%B8\%D1\%82\%D1\%8C-\%D1%8D\%D1%84\%D1%84\%D0\%B5\%D0\%BA\%D1%82\%D0\%B8\%D0\%B2\%D0\%BD\%D0\%BE\%D1%81\%D1%82\%D1%8C-\%D1%80\%D0\%B0\%D0\%B1\%D0\%BE\%D1%82\%D1%8E\%D1%82\%D1%8E (Accessed: 15 April 2020)$ 

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>265</sup> Qaqstan joly-2050: bir maqsat, bir múdde, bir bolashaq: 2014 jylgy 11 qarashadagy Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń Prezidenti N. Á. Nazarbaevtyń Qazastan Halqyna Joldaýy [Kazakhstan's way – 2050: common aim, common interests, common future by the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan N. A. Nazarbayev of January 17, 2014]. Yegemen Qazaqstan, Jan. 18, 2014, № 11 (28235). URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/K1400002014">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/K1400002014</a> (Accessed: 24 November 2019)

structured policy in culture contribute to social stability, stimulate innovative development of the industry and sustainable economic growth." The implementation of the cultural policy was designed for two short-term stages: 2015-2019, 2020-2030.<sup>266</sup>

Some local art historians highly noted the development of the Concept by cultural figures, rather than politicians, and pointed to the relevance and novelty. Another group of specialists was not satisfied with the "hard edges" of the Concept, which is always based on international actors and initiatives such as UNESCO, Silk Road, etc. Although experts` opinions differ, the country's cultural mission for 2015-2019 can be called successfully completed. It was proved by the number of large-scale events of the last few years held in Kazakhstan: 550<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the Kazakh Khanate, World Weightlifting Championships, Silk Road International Cultural Forum, International conference "Almaty – the Capital of Islamic Culture 2015", XXVIII Winter Universiade, Expo-2017.

Systematic and targeting policy is reflected in the country's foreign policy and its relations with powers as well. Certainly, to such global giants as the U.S., Russia, and China, it is quite difficult to conduct public diplomacy on an equal basis. It seems that the cultural policy of Kazakhstan is lost in the countries` "soft power" backyard. However, there are positive transformations and results in recent country's foreign policy. The main engines of culture, the Ministry of culture and sport (MCS), Kazakh scientific research institute of culture of MCS (KazRIC), and Embassies of Kazakhstan perform extensive work. It can be said, over the past six years, Kazakhstan has intensified all cultural levers to promote people-to-people contacts.

In 2014, MCS organized Kazakhstan Cultural Days in the USA. The best voices of Kazakhstan performed in the best halls of New York and Washington. The concert "Melodies of the Steppe" was attended by representatives of both American society and the UN including Secretary-General Ban Ki-Moon. Former UN Secretary General noted that it sees how the country reaches great heights in both economy, politics and culture, as evidenced by the concert. <sup>267</sup> In 2015, Kazakhstan hosted a delegation of Chinese Culture Days as a response to the cultural gesture of

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>266</sup> Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń mádeni saiyasatynyń tujyrymdamasy: Qazaqstan Respýblikasy Prezidentiniń 2014 jyláy 21 qarashadaáy Jarlyáy [Cultural Policy Concept of the Republic of Kazakhstan approved by the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan of November 4, 2014]. Collection of acts of the President and the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Dec. 30, 2014, №67, art. 619. URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/U1400000939">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/U1400000939</a> (Accessed: 23 April 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>267</sup> V SSHA proshli Dni kultury Kazakhstana [Days of Kazakh culture were held in the USA]. Kazakh Research Institute of Culture of Ministry of culture of Kazakhstan, Jul. 7, 2014. URL: <a href="http://cultural.kz/en/news/view?id=1732">http://cultural.kz/en/news/view?id=1732</a> (Accessed: 22 May 2020)

Kazakhstan Culture Days held in China year earlier.<sup>268</sup> Kazakhstan-Russia relations have not been spared by a good tradition. In September-October 2019, the countries held Cultural Days in tandem. The programs of Cultural Days covered all directions: gala concert, ballet, modern choreography, exhibitions. The Russian Minister of Culture highly appreciated the bilateral work that has increased interaction in the culture, thereby strengthening the foundation for continuing the multilateral humanitarian dialogue.<sup>269</sup>

In 2014-2019, a huge package of agreements was signed between Kazakhstan and the powers. In 2016-2017, it was reinforced by the cultural events of the 25<sup>th</sup> anniversary of Kazakhstan's diplomatic relations with Russia, China and the USA:

- 1) Memorandum on cooperation of the National Museum of Kazakhstan with the Russian Museum of Ethnography, State museum exhibition centre "ROSIZO", Isaakiev Cathedral, I. E. Repin St. Petersburg State Academic Institute of Painting, Sculpture and Architecture in 2014;
- 2) Memorandum between Kazakhstan and China on the construction of Kazakh National Academy of Choreography in 2014. The academy launched in Astana after two years. The rector of Academy was appointed the People's Artist of Russia, the soloist of the Mariinsky Theatre A. Ashimuratova;
  - 3) Cooperation Agreement between KazRIC and Russian Institute of Art History of 2014;
- 4) Cooperation Agreement between KazRIC and Chelyabinsk State Academy of Culture and Arts of 2015;
- 5) Trilateral Cooperation Agreement between the State Hermitage Museum, National Museum of Kazakhstan, KazRIC of 2015;
- 6) Memorandum of Understanding and Cooperation between KazRIC and "National Geographic" Qazaqstan from 2017. The result was the joint project of the Sacred Geography of Kazakhstan;

<sup>269</sup> Dni kultury Kazakhstana v Rossii otkrylis gala-kontsertom na VDNKH [Days of Kazakh culture in Russia opened with a gala concert at VDNH]. Ministry of culture of Russian Federation, Sep. 9, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.mkrf.ru/press/news/dni\_kultury\_kazakhstana\_v\_rossii\_otkrylis\_gala\_kontsertom\_na\_vdnkh/">https://www.mkrf.ru/press/news/dni\_kultury\_kazakhstana\_v\_rossii\_otkrylis\_gala\_kontsertom\_na\_vdnkh/</a> (Accessed: 23 May 2020);

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>268</sup> Days of Chinese Culture will be held in Kazakhstan. Silkroad News, Sep. 23, 2014. URL: <a href="http://silkroadnews.org/en/news/days-of-chinese-culture-will-be-held-in-kazakhstan-on-september-25-28">http://silkroadnews.org/en/news/days-of-chinese-culture-will-be-held-in-kazakhstan-on-september-25-28</a> (Accessed: 23 May 2020)

Dni kultury Rossii v Kazakhstane otkroyutsya vystupleniyem Kubanskogo kazachyego khora. [Days of Russian culture in Kazakhstan will open by Kuban Cossack choir]. Ministry of culture of Russian Federation, Oct. 14, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.mkrf.ru/press/news/dni">https://www.mkrf.ru/press/news/dni</a> kultury rossii v kazakhstane otkroyutsya vystupleniem kubanskogo kazachego khora / (Accessed: 23 May 2020)

- 7) As part of Kazakh-American cultural exchange, the exhibition "In Search of Shambhala: masterpieces from the Nicholas Roerich Museum in New York City" and "Masterpieces of Russian art from private collections of the USA" was organized in 2017;
- 8) Agreement between KazRIC Director and the U.A. State Department expert on CA in 2018. On the agreement, the partners will work on joint projects, one of which is a monograph on Kazakhstan's culture. The monograph will be published by the Smithsonian Institution;
- 9) Cooperation Agreement between KazRIC and Rostkultproekt Ministry of Culture of Russia in 2018;
- 10) Cooperation Agreement between Culture and Sport Ministry of Kazakhstan and the U.S. Commission for the Preservation of America's Heritage Abroad from 2018;
- 11) Memorandum on cooperation between mountain resorts "Shymbulak" (Almaty) and "Rosa Khutor" (Sochi) from 2019. Within the memorandum, the sides envisage holding thematic days of the partner resort and joint discount programmes.<sup>270</sup>

According to the agreements, inter-museum cooperation was actively promoted through museum staff's internship, exchange programmes. Thus, a number of Kazakhstani museums and nature reserves' staff underwent exchange programmes in the State Hermitage Museum, Russian Ethnographic Museum, and Chinese museums of Shanghai, Nanjing, and Xi'an. The cultural figures held a meeting with American colleagues and exchanged ideas of bilateral cooperation within the IVLP International Visits Programme of the U.S. State Department as well.

As illustrating successful cases in culture were chosen Kazakhstan's newly built cooperations with the powers in cinematography in this sub-chapter. Cinematography is a powerful weapon of public diplomacy successfully used for many decades as soft power. Joint works with Russia, the U.S., and China in this area show that Kazakhstan has every possibility to use it to promote the national culture, tradition, and Kazakhstani people's image.

## 3.3.1. Rejuvenated Kazakhstan-Russian cinematographic cooperation

Kazakhstan and Russia are linked in cinematography by long-term close cooperation based on historical commonality. Although the film schools of countries were estranged after independence, the ties are being restored within the new cultural Concept.

In August 2016, KazRIC of MCS organized a round table on cinematography in Mosfilm. Kazakh experts wanted to consult its Russian colleagues about the conditions and measures

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>270</sup> Kazakh Research Institute of Culture. Source: <a href="https://www.cultural.kz/">https://www.cultural.kz/</a>

necessary for the development of domestic cinematography to adopt the best foreign experience. As a result, experts agreed that Kazakhstan needs to create a Law "on cinema" and a Concept for the development of cinematography. Prospects for joint projects were also discussed. It is noteworthy that the cooperation was initiated at governmental level. In 2014, during the III St. Petersburg Cultural Forum, the two Ministers of culture signed an Agreement on cooperation. Later, the Ministry of Kazakhstan separately signed a Memorandum of cooperation with the Union of Cinematographers of Russia. One of the key documents in the regulatory framework is the short-term Interstate programmes of cooperation in culture between Kazakhstan and Russia for 2014-2016, 2017-2019.<sup>271</sup> The last similar Program for 2020-2022 was signed by the Ministers during the Interregional Cooperation Forum in Omsk.

The result of the intensification of the bilateral relations were Panfilov's 28 Men and Ayka. Panfilov's 28 Men was produced on a special order of the Ministries of culture in 2016 in honor of Victory in the Great Patriotic War. Although there were critics around the film and refinings due to the Kazakh side's discontent, much energy had been devoted by the working group which will forever remain in favor of joint production.

Aika was filmed by a Kazakh-Russian film director with Russian Ministry of culture assistance, and was released in 2018. The film is dedicated to current social issue: full-of-challenge life of migrants abroad, problems of mothers and children in illegal migration. It demonstrated a truly urgent world problem on the example of CA region, which highly appreciated by world film critics. The joint six-year effort of working group was paid off. The film is a recipient of the best awards in recent years. It was nominated for Kazakhstan for an Academy Award and entered the shortlist of the Best Foreign Language Film in 2019 along with Germany, Japan, South Korea, Poland. Although the film did not win an Oscar, but the Kazakh actress played the main character received "Asian Oscar" – Asian Film Awards Academy and became the first actress from the post-Soviet space won the award for Best Actress at Cannes. And for great service to the country, S. Eslyamova awarded Honoured Culture Worker of Kazakhstan by Elbasy. Thus, the

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>271</sup> Ministry kultury Kazakhstana i Rossii podpisali soglasheniye o sotrudnichestve [Russian-Kazakh Culture Ministers signed a cooperation agreement]. Kazakh Research Institute of Culture of Ministry of culture of Kazakhstan, Dec. 9, 2014. URL: <a href="http://www.cultural.kz/ru/news/view?id=885">http://www.cultural.kz/ru/news/view?id=885</a> (Accessed: 19 May 2020);

V Mosfilme obsudili kontseptsiyu razvitiya kazakhstanskogo kinematografa [Mosfilm discussed Kazakhstan's concept of cinematography development]. Kazakh Research Institute of Culture of Ministry of culture of Kazakhstan, Aug. 12, 2016. URL: <a href="http://www.cultural.kz/ru/science/view?id=59">http://www.cultural.kz/ru/science/view?id=59</a> (Accessed: 19 May 2020);

Kazakhstan i Rossiya podpisali programmu sotrudnichestva v oblasti kultury na 2017-2019 [Kazakhstan and Russia signed a cooperation programme in culture for 2017-2019]. Forbes Kazakhstan, Sep. 6, 2016. URL: <a href="https://forbes.kz/news/2016/09/06/newsid 120197">https://forbes.kz/news/2016/09/06/newsid 120197</a> (Accessed: 30 April 2020)

cinematographies of the two countries had shown the best example of good-neighborliness. which can make films not only on historical topics.<sup>272</sup>

To date, Kazakhstan and Russia have agreed to become a worthy continuation of the EEU and create Eurasian Film Space having its own equivalent of Oscar.

## 3.3.2. A new milestone of Kazakhstani-Chinese relations in film production

Dynamically developing Kazakhstan-Chinese relations continued in film industry as well. The Composer is the brightest project created on the 25th anniversary of diplomatic relations. The film had a world premiere at the IX Beijing International Film Festival in 2019. The Composer is a joint work of Kazakhfilm and Chinese Shineworks Pictures Company. The film starred both Kazakh and Chinese actors. The main part of the film was shot in Kazakhstan. The production of the joint film was initiated at the government level, within the Agreement on cultural and humanitarian cooperation signed on August 31, 2015, by Elbasy N. Nazarbayev and President Xi Jinping. The basis for the implementation of the film was an Intergovernmental Agreement on cooperation in joint film production, signed on June 8, 2017, during Xi Jinping's visit to Kazakhstan. The film is based on a real story about the friendship of a Kazakh composer Bakhytzhan Baykadam and a Chinese composer Xian Xinghai who came to Kazakhstan during the Great Patriotic war. Despite the difficult times and different cultures, two legendary composers became a close friend. To date, Composer had received several international awards among which four prestigious Golden screen awards in Los Angeles. The joint project was called the Best coproduction film. A Kazakh actress who played the main female role was awarded for the Best actress.<sup>273</sup>

Currenatly, the countries intend to continue beneficial cooperation in various branches of cultural activity, including film producing.

## 3.3.3. First Kazakh-American attempts to cooperate in cinematography

Kazakh-American dialogue in this area started relatively later. The very first Kazakh film presented to American critics was "Dasht-I-Kipshak: Secret Signs" on the 550th anniversary of Kazakh Khanate in 2015. The film was released to the public at the Robert De Niro's New York

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>272</sup> "Ayka" shortlisted for Oscar. "Kazinform" international news agency, Dec. 18, 2018. URL: <a href="http://lenta.inform.kz/ru/ayka-shortlisted-for-oscar-a3478767">http://lenta.inform.kz/ru/ayka-shortlisted-for-oscar-a3478767</a> (Accessed: 15 May 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>273</sup> Kazakh-Chinese film "the Composer" receives four awards in LA. "Strategy2050.kz" Information agency, Nov. 11, 2019. URL: <a href="https://strategy2050.kz/en/news/kazakh-chinese-film-the-composer-receives-four-awards-in-los-angeles-/">https://strategy2050.kz/en/news/kazakh-chinese-film-the-composer-receives-four-awards-in-los-angeles-/</a> (Accessed: 15 May 2020)

Movie Studio and George Washington University. The picture demonstrating the geopolitical importance of Kazakhstan was a result of the diligent effort of Kazakhstan National Library's expediting team to Italy, Ukraine and Armenia. According to American film critics, the film was a true discovery of the real history of Kazakhs. Professor at Columbia University noted three important points, why it was important to show it to an American audience. The main element is the Silk Road, which has always united cultures and people bringing peace. The second is globalization, which is accepted as a phenomenon, but has been actually existing since ancient times. And the third point is Kazakh cinematography making a valuable contribution to study world culture and demonstrating the historical importance of Kazakhstan itself in world history.<sup>274</sup>

As a result, film critics, professor of Columbia University and cultural attaches of the U.S. Embassy visited Kazakhstan and discussed the upcoming cooperation with the KazRIC Director. The days of culture and cinema of Kazakhstan – 2017 held in the U.S. laid the foundation for Kazakhstan-American cooperation in cinematography. In 2018, the Director of KazRIC during a working trip to Washington held a number of important meetings to discuss aspects of cooperation with Hollywood film companies. The negotiations were not inconclusive. Same year, delegates arrived in Astana. KazRIC and Global Policy Initiatives (GPI) Company signed an Agreement. GPI was appointed special assistant to President Clinton in the White House and coordinated the American Jewish community. To the Agreement, the two sides will cooperate in training of local staff of cinematography and technical specialists, implementation of legislative and administrative initiatives.<sup>275</sup>

Although Kazakhstan-American cooperation in cinema is just beginning, there are a number of projects in the pigeonholes of the two countries. For decades, the connecting link between Hollywood and Kazakhstan has been Nomad Stunts. Nomad Stunts has been on the list of the world's best stunt teams since 2015. Currently, the team is acting in both domestic and foreign films. In Hollywood and Russia, the team is listed as permanent participants in large-scale projects. Viking, Legend of Kolovrat, Golden Horde series, Tobol (Russia), Expendables, Marco Polo series, 47 ronin (USA) and others could be an example. The team works under the leadership of J. Kunguzhinov, the Best Stuntman and Honored Figure, "Kurmet" medal winner of Kazakhstan,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>274</sup> New York Film Critics identified the Kazakhstani movie as a discovery of Kipchaks' real history. Kazakh Research Institute of Culture of Ministry of culture of Kazakhstan, Aug. 24, 2015. URL: <a href="http://cultural.kz/en/news/view?id=1732">http://cultural.kz/en/news/view?id=1732</a> (Accessed: 10 May 2020)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>275</sup> Kazakhstansko-amerikanskoye sotrudnichestvo cherez kinematograf [Kazakh-American partnership through cinema]. Kazakh Research Institute of Culture of Ministry of culture of Kazakhstan. Aug. 5, 2018. URL: <a href="http://cultural.kz/ru/news/view?id=2488">http://cultural.kz/ru/news/view?id=2488</a> (Accessed: 10 May 2020)

the nominee of the stuntman Oscar – Taurus in Los Angeles. In 2019, Nomad Stunts began work at the Disney Project "Mulan" where all the stunts were performed.<sup>276</sup>

\*\*\*

Hence, the modern cultural dialogue between Kazakhstan and the powers is at the highest level. The favorable atmosphere in the dialogues offers Kazakhstan an opportunity to promote a positive image and magnificent culture as never before. State programmes and interstate projects must certainly continue in the new decade and contribute to the popularization of the country.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>276</sup>Almaty-based Nomad Stunts founder achieves long-held wish to work with Disney. The Astana Times News, Jun. 23, 2019. URL: <a href="https://astanatimes.com/2019/07/almaty-based-nomad-stunts-founder-achieves-long-held-wish-to-work-with-disney/">https://astanatimes.com/2019/07/almaty-based-nomad-stunts-founder-achieves-long-held-wish-to-work-with-disney/</a>; <a href="https://nomadstunts.com/">https://nomadstunts.com/</a> (Accessed: 20 May 2020)

#### **Conclusion**

Kazakhstan's foreign policy and its relations with the international community, including the great powers, have always been fairly stable. The country remains committed to its initial multi-vector policy. Over the years of independence, although the country is in a geopolitically unstable region, there were no periods of total cooling of interaction with any of the powers. Despite the recent political conflicts Kazakhstan managed not only to maintain the previous cooperations, but was able to bring it to high and confidence level.

The long-term multidimensional cooperations between Kazakhstan and the powers are based on trade and economy, military and security, culture and humanitarian ties. The intensification of interactions at the present stage is confirmed by the bilateral agreements reached on Enhanced Strategic Partnership. These are the full-fledged Agreement with Russia from 2013, and Declaration with China from 2015. Although there is no agreement between Kazakhstan and the United States, there is a Joint Statement of the presidents from 2018.

The relaunched governmental structures and legal frameworks also served as a guarantee for Kazakhstan's foreign policy activity towards the powers. These are the State Strategy up to 2050, Economic Strategy "Nurly Zhol", and Industrial and Innovative Development Programme 2015-2020. Accordingly, the country started implementing its own space, military-technical, and high-tech industry, which had certainly influenced diplomatic dialogues with Russia, China, and the U.S.

There is a separate set of earlier cooperation documents, which are still in force and serve as the legal cornerstone of contemporary relations. The author was familiarized with more than 100 interstate, intergovernmental, regional, international, state, commercial type documents, which were added as a primary source. Certainly, the existing archive of bilateral agreements with the powers is several times larger. With Russia alone, the country has 400 interregional documents, and annually dozens of agreements are signed within the Interregional Forum. During one official visit of N. Nazarbayev to China in 2015 and the USA in 2018, more than 20 agreements were reached with each of them.

Concerning trade and economy, Russia remains the main trading partner of Kazakhstan. Relations with China developed very intensively during these periods. China became one of the first importers of Kazakh goods. The main Kazakhstani investor is the USA. Thus, Kazakhstan quite appropriately preserved the balance of power in three dimensions: export, import, investment.

As a traditional industry of trade and economic cooperation remains energy resources. In 2014-2020, Kazakhstan paid special attention to the industrial sector and implemented projects in

energy, agriculture, transport and logistics. In the energy sector, the country expanded cooperation with Russian and American companies deeply rooted in this area. With Russia, it acquired a goal-oriented strategic character. In the case of the USA, the countries are working on upgrade partnerships to strategic dialogue. Kazakhstan and America cooperate in the financial sector as well. The U.S. assists in marketing, consulting, providing high technology and access to the world stock market. China has been successful in innovation and industrial sectors of Kazakhstan. In 2014-2020, for the record, the most effective and productive relations were built with China.

Competition in certain industries is not excluded. The case of Russia and America, it is uranium. Between China and America, it is agriculture and other industrial projects. Transport and logistics corridors are a potential area of competition between Russia and China. But, since the interests of countries do not interfere with each other, there are no open conflicts between the powers.

Kazakhstan is successfully developing contacts between its regions and powers. In the case of Russia and China, it usually promotes border regions cooperation. Here, the cooperation with Russia is a "role-model". The countries are working systematically and steadily on interregional dialogue. Kazakhstan has established contact with 76 constituent entities of Russia, and Russia cooperates with all 14 regions of Kazakhstan. Since 2014, Kazakhstani-Chinese interregional negotiations had been intensified. The most effective interaction is between East Kazakhstan region, Almaty region, and XUAR. Currently, 90% of joint Kazakhstani-Chinese projects are implemented in Kazakhstani regions. Despite the geographical distance, Kazakhstan and America began to build up relations in the same direction. Kazakhstan conducted negotiations with mayors of Pennsylvania, Illinois, Nebraska, Minnesota, Arkansas. As a result, U.S. Secretary of Commerce with 16 directors of multinational companies visited Kazakhstan. The U.S. is mainly focused on the regions, where the Russian-Chinese presence prevails.

After 2014, the most pressing issue was security for Kazakhstan. Territorial integrity, the negative impact of Ukraine crisis, possible excessive pressure from Russia, possible Chinese expansion, etc. were widely discussed both in society and in expert circles. Many forecasts are just the result of groundless intrigue in media, which makes it relevant to work on the country's information security. Certainly, there are "hot potatoes" in security concerning the Caspian region, Kazakhstan's participation in the transit of cargo to Afghanistan and in peace missions under the powers initiatives. But, during 2014-2020, Kazakhstan did not have to enter into an open conflict with any power skilfully smoothing rough edges.

According to the analyses, Kazakhstan's cooperation with Russia in the military-technical defense is stable. Kazakhstan-American relations have been most successful in training young military personnel. Although the dialogue with China has been progressing since 2016, there are no pivotal changes. In 2016-2020, the ground was prepared for further deepening of relations, since Kazakhstan in its military-technical assembly intends to build up relations with China in the future.

In space industry, Kazakhstan intends to continue cooperation with Russia. But some Baikonur constituent entities were returned to Kazakhstan. It indicates the willingness of Kazakh aerospace structure to develop its industry independently. Kazakhstan has already established basic communication linkages with China and the U.S. to further civil-commercial promotion of Baikonur.

In the last chapter, three areas were selected as case studies: education with a focus on inter-universities cooperation; high technology with the main focus on digitization; culture with a focus on cinematography. Fundamental reforms in education, high technology, and culture in Kazakhstan influenced its interaction with the powers. The country started skillfully used its "soft power" levers to promote awareness and a positive image. In 2014-2020, inter-universities memoranda of cooperation were reached between agricultural, agro-industrial, pedagogical, and business universities of the countries. In digitization, Kazakhstan-Russian cooperation is actively discussed within regional organizations. The countries intend to create a common system in digitization. The first documents on joint projects cooperation have already been signed with the U.S. and China.

To sum up, there was a declining trend of activities in foreign policy 2014-2015. By 2016, Kazakhstan managed to return relations into the same groove. Since 2017, there has been an intensification of building a new dialogue in industrial and innovative sectors, digitization, cinematography, and inter-museum and inter-regional relations. Cooperation with the powers in the above areas had not been developed before or over-dominated by a partnership with one power.

Thus, it can be concluded that Kazakhstan successfully conducted its foreign policy on the Concept 2014-2020, demonstrating a high degree of maneuverability. Despite the challenging time – the ambitious foreign policy coincided with conflicts between the powers after the Crimea integration – Kazakhstan managed to use the "great political game" between the powers for its "great benefit".

#### **REFERENCES**

#### **SOURCES**

## International agreements of the Republic of Kazakhstan

- 1. 1992 jyláy 25 mamyrdaáy Qazaqstan Respýblikasy men Resei Federatsiiasy arasyndaáy dostyq, yntymaqtastyq jáne ózara kómek týraly shartqa ózgerister engizý týraly hattama, [Protocol on the amendments to the Treaty of Friendship, Cooperation and Mutual Assistance between the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Russian Federation of May 25, 1992]. Bulletin of International Agreements of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2013, no. 5, doc. 53 (Accessed: 7 August 2019)
- 2. 2011 jyláy 25 qarashadaáy Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń Úkimeti men Resei Federatsiasynyń Úkimeti arasyndaáy (2020 jylga deiingi) uzaq merzimdi ekonomikalyq yntymaqtastyq baádarlamasy [Program of long-term economic cooperation between the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Government of the Russian Federation (until 2020) of November 25, 2011]. Source: Embassy of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the Russian Federation.

URL: <a href="https://www.kazembassy.ru/kaz/dvustoronnee\_sotrudnichestvo/dogovornaya\_baza/?cid">https://www.kazembassy.ru/kaz/dvustoronnee\_sotrudnichestvo/dogovornaya\_baza/?cid</a>
<a href="mailto:sotrudnichestvo/dogovornaya\_baza/?cid">sotrudnichestvo/dogovornaya\_baza/?cid</a>
<a href="mailto:sotrud

- 3. Qazaqstan Respýblikasy men Resei Federatsiasy arasyndagy XXI gasyrdagy tatý kórshilik jane odaqtastyq týraly shartty ratifikatsialaý: Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń Zańy 2014 jylgy 7 qarashadagy [Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On ratification of the Agreement between the Russian Federation and the Republic of Kazakhstan on Good-Neighbourliness and Alliance in the XXI century of November 7, 2014]. Bulletin of International Agreements of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2015, no. 1, art. 3. (Accessed: 7 August 2019)
- 4. 2011 jyláy 15 qyrkúiektegi Qazaqstan Respýblikasy men Resei Federatsiasy arasyndaáy 2012-2017 jyldaráa arnaláan óniraralyq jane shekara many yntymaqtastyq baádarlamasy [Program of interregional and cross-border cooperation between the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Russian Federation for 2012-2017 of Sep. 15, 2011]. Source: Embassy of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the Russian Federation.

URL: <a href="https://www.kazembassy.ru/rus/dvustoronnee\_sotrudnichestvo/dogovornaya\_baza/?cid">https://www.kazembassy.ru/rus/dvustoronnee\_sotrudnichestvo/dogovornaya\_baza/?cid</a>
<a href="mailto:=9">=9</a> (Accessed: 18 December 2019)

- 5. 2013 jyláy 7 qyrkúiektegi Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń Úkimeti men Qytai Halyq Respýblikasynyń Úkimeti arasyndaáy saýda-ekonomikalyq yntymaqtastyqty orta jane uzaq merzimdi damytý baádarlamasy (2020 deiin) [Medium- and long-term trade and economic development Cooperation Program between the Republic of Kazakhstan and the People's Republic of China (until 2020)" of September 7, 2013]. URL: http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P1300000940 (Accessed: 16 September 2019)
- Joint Declaration on New Stage of Comprehensive Strategic Partnership between the People's Republic of China and the Republic of Kazakhstan. Source: Ministry of Foreign Affairs of People's Republic of China. Aug. 31, 2015.
   URL: <a href="https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\_eng/wjdt\_665385/2649\_665393/t1293114.shtml">https://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\_eng/wjdt\_665385/2649\_665393/t1293114.shtml</a>
   (Accessed: 16 September 2019)
- 7. Agreement between the Government of Russian Federation and the Government of Republic of Kazakhstan on cooperation of border regions of Jan. 26, 1995. Source: CIS Legislation. URL: https://cis-legislation.com/document.fwx?rgn=8607 (Accessed: 18 December 2019)
- 8. 2010 jylgy 7 qyrkúnektegi Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń Úkimeti men Resei Federatsiasynyń Úkimeti arasyndagy óńiraralyq jane shekara mańy yntymaqtastyqy týraly kelisim [Agreements between the Government of Republic of Kazakhstan and the Government of Russian Federation on interregional and cross-border cooperation of Sep. 7, 2010]. URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P100000905">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P100000905</a> (Accessed: 17 December)
- 9. Soglasheniye mezhdu Pravitelstvom Respubliki Tatarstan i Akimatom Kyzylordinskoy oblasti o cotrudnichestve ot 2 dekabrya 2014 [Agreement on cooperation between Republic of Tatarstan and Akimat of Kyzylorda region of Dec. 2, 2014] 02.12.2014. Source: Ministry of Industry and Trade of the Republic of Tatarstan. URL: https://mpt.tatarstan.ru/rus/respublika-kazahstan.htm (Accessed: 21 March 2020)
- 10. Soglasheniye mezhdu Pravitelstvom Respubliki Tatarstan i Akimatom Atyrauskoy oblasti o sotrudnichestve ot 2 dekabrya 2014 [Agreement on cooperation between Republic of Tatarstan and Akimat of Atyrau region of Dec. 2, 2014]. Source: Ministry of Industry and Trade of the Republic of Tatarstan. URL: https://mpt.tatarstan.ru/rus/respublika-kazahstan.htm (Accessed: 21 March 2020)
- 11. Soglasheniye mezhdu Pravitelstvom Respubliki Tatarstan i Akimatom Aktyubinskoy oblasti sotrudnichestve ot 10 noyabrya 2017 [Agreement on cooperation between Republic of Tatarstan and Akimat of Aktobe region of Nov. 10, 2017]. Source: Ministry of Industry and

- Trade of the Republic of Tatarstan. URL: ttps://mpt.tatarstan.ru/rus/respublika-kazahstan.htm (Accessed: 21 March 2020)
- 12. 2015 jyláy 11 jeltoqsandaáy Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń Úkimeti men Qytai Halyq Respýblikasynyń Úkimeti arasyndaáy 2015-2020 jyldaráa arnaláan shekara mańy yntymaqtastyq baádarlamasy [Cross-border cooperation program for 2015-2020 between the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Government of People's Republic of China for 2015-2020 of Dec. 11, 2015]. URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P1500001004">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P1500001004</a> (Accessed: 12 January 2020)
- 13. Additional Protocol to the Protocol to the Agreement between the Russian Federation and the Republic of Kazakhstan on the delineation of the bottom of the northern part of the Caspian Sea. Decree for the purposes of exercising sovereign rights to subsoil use of July 6, 1998 of Apr. 12, 2017. Source: B. Yeltsin Presidential Library, 2017. URL: <a href="https://www.prlib.ru/en/node/682642">https://www.prlib.ru/en/node/682642</a> (Accessed: 24 November 2019)
- 14. Qazaqstan Respýblikasy men Resei Federatsiiasy arasyndagy "Baiqońyr" keshenin tiimdi paidalaný jónindegi yntymaqtastyqty damytý týraly 2004 jylgy 9 qańtardagy kelisimdi ratifikatsialaý: Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń 2010 jylgy 29 sáyirdegi Zańy [Law dated April 29, 2010 on ratification of the Agreement between the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Russian Federation on the development of cooperation on the effective use of the Baikonur complex of January 9, 2004]. Collection of acts of the President and the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2010, №8 (2561), art. 42. URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/Z100000273">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/Z100000273</a> (Accessed: 17 March 2020)

## Legislation of Kazakhstan and the "Great Powers"

- 15. Qazaqastannyń egemen memleket retinde qalyptasý jane damý strateguasy [Strategy of Formation and Development of Kazakhstan as a Sovereign State]. Jul. 15, 1992. No. 853 URL: <a href="https://online.zakon.kz/Document/?doc\_id=30006969">https://online.zakon.kz/Document/?doc\_id=30006969</a> (Accessed: 19 November 2019)
- 16. Qazaqstan Respýblikasy syrtqy saiasatynyń 2014–2020 jyldarga arnalgan tujyrymdamasy: Qazaqstan Respýblikasy Prezidentiniń 2014 jylgy 21 qańtardagy Jarlygy [Foreign Policy Concept for 2014–2020 Republic of Kazakhstan approved by the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan of January 21, 2014]. Yegemen Qazaqstan, Jan. 30, 2014, № 20 (28244). URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/U1400000741/info">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/U1400000741/info</a> (Accessed: 28 August 2019)
- 17. Jer Kodeksine ózgerister men tolyqtyrýlar engizý týraly: Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń 2015 jylgy 2 qarashadagy Zańy [Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On the amendments and

- additions to the Land Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan" of November 2, 2015]. Qazaqstan Respýblikasy Parlamentiniń Jarshysy. 2015 j., № 21-I, 126-qujat [Bulletin of the Parliament of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2015, No. 21-I, art. 126]. URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/Z1500000389/info">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/Z1500000389/info</a> (Accessed: 24 November 2019)
- 18. Qaqstan joly-2050: bir maqsat, bir múdde, bir bolashaq: 2014 jylgy 11 qarashadagy Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń Prezidenti N. Á. Nazarbaevtyń Qazastan Halqyna Joldayy [Kazakhstan's way 2050: common aim, common interests, common future by the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan N. A. Nazarbayev of January 17, 2014]. Yegemen Qazaqstan, Jan. 18, 2014, № 11 (28235). URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/K1400002014">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/K1400002014</a> (Accessed: 24 November 2019)
- 19. Nurly Jol bolashaqqa bastar jol: 2014 jylgy 17 qańtardagy Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń Prezidenti N. Á. Nazarbaevtyń Qazastan Halqyna Joldayy [Nyrly Zhol The Path to the Future by the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan N. A. Nazarbayev of November 11, 2014]. Yegemen Qazaqstan, Nov. 11, 2014, № 221 (28444).
  - URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/K14002014\_2z">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/K14002014\_2z</a> (Accessed: 24 November 2019)
- 20. Ulttyq qaýipsizdiģi týraly: Qazaqstan Respýblıkasynyń 2012 jylģy 2 qańtartdaģy Zańy [Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On national security of the Republic of Kazakhstan" dated January 2, 2012]. Yegemen Qazaqstan, Jan. 17, 2012, № 18-19 (27090). URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/Z1200000527">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/Z1200000527</a> (Accessed: 10 February 2020)
- 21. Ğarysh qyzmeti týraly: Qazaqstan Respýblıkasynyń 2012 jyláy 6 qańtartdaáy Zańy [Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On space actibity" dated January 2, 2012]. Yegemen Qazaqstan, Jan. 26, 2012, № 37-38 (27110). URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/Z1200000528">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/Z1200000528</a> (Accessed: 9 March 2020)
- 22. Qazaqstan Respýblikasynda bilim berýdi damytýdyń 2011-2020 jyldarga arnalgan memlekettik bagdarlamasyn bekitý týraly: Qazaqstan Respýblikasy Prezidentiniń 2010 jylgy 6 jeltoqsandagy Jarlygy [State Program of Education Development for 2011-2020 Republic of Kazakhstan approved by the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan of December 6, 2010]. Yegemen Qazaqstan, Dec. 14, 2010, № 529-532 (26375). URL: http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/U1000001118 (Accessed: 22 March 2020)
- 23. Úsh tilde bilim berýdi ilgeriletý jónindegi is-sharalar josparyn bekitý týraly: Qazaqstan Respýblikasy memleket hatshysynyń 2015 jylgy 30 qazandagy Ókimi [Order of the Republic of Kazakhstan Secretary of state "on approval of the Action Plan for trilingual education promotion" of October 30, 2015]. Official Site of the President Republic of Kazakhstan. URL:

- https://www.akorda.kz/ru/secretary\_of\_state/secretary\_of\_state\_orders/ob-utverzhdenii-plana-meropriyatii-po-prodvizheniyu-trehyazychnogo-obrazovaniya (Accessed: 22 March 2020)
- 24. Qazaqstan Respýblikasy Indýstrua jáne Jana tehnologualar minustrliginin 2014-2018 jyldarga arnalgan strategualyq jospary: Qazaqstan Respýblikasy Úkimetinin 2013 jylgy 31 jeltoqsandagy Qaýlysy [Resolution of the Republic of Kazakhstan Government of Industrial and New technologies Strategic Plan 2014-2018 approved in December 12, 2017]. Collection of acts of the President and the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, 2013, №87, art. 1080. URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P1300001574">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P1300001574</a> (Accessed: 12 April 2020)
- 25. Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń "jasyl ekonomikaga" kóshý jónindegi tujyrymdamasy: Qazaqstan Respýblikasy Prezidentiniń 2013 jylgy 30 mamyrdagy Jarlygy [Concept for the transition of the Republic of Kazakhstan to a "green economy" by the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan of May 30, 2013]. Yegemen Qazaqstan, Jun. 1, 2013, № 139 (28078). URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/T1300000577">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/T1300000577</a> (Accessed: 12 April 2020)
- 26. "Tsifrlyq Qazaqstan" memlekettik bagdarlamasyn bekitý: Qazaqstan Respýblikasy Úkimetiniń 2017 jylgy 12 jeltoqsandagy Qaýlysy [Resolution of the Republic of Kazakhstan Government "On approval of the State Program "Digital Kazakhstan" of December 12, 2017]. URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P1700000827">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/P1700000827</a> (Accessed: 12 April 2020)
- 27. Qaqstan joly-2050: bir maqsat, bir múdde, bir bolashaq: 2014 jylgy 11 qarashadagy Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń Prezidenti N. Á. Nazarbaevtyń Qazastan Halqyna Joldayy [Kazakhstan's way 2050: common aim, common interests, common future by the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan N. A. Nazarbayev of January 17, 2014]. Yegemen Qazaqstan, Jan. 18, 2014, № 11 (28235). URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/K1400002014">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/K1400002014</a> (Accessed: 24 November 2019)
- 28. Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń mádeni saiyasatynyń tujyrymdamasy: Qazaqstan Respýblikasy Prezidentiniń 2014 jylgy 21 qarashadagy Jarlygy [Cultural Policy Concept of the Republic of Kazakhstan approved by the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan of November 4, 2014]. Collection of acts of the President and the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Dec. 30, 2014, №67, art. 619. URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/U1400000939">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/U1400000939</a> (Accessed: 23 April 2020)

## Documents of state authorities

- 29. A List of Treaties and Other International Agreements of the United States in Force on January 1, 2019. U.S. Department of State, Office of the Legal Adviser, Kazakhstan-U.S., pp. 246-248. URL: <a href="https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/2019-TIF-Bilaterals-web-version.pdf">https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/2019-TIF-Bilaterals-web-version.pdf</a> (Accessed: 11 September 2019)
- 30. A. Mamin receives Head of Rosatom State Corporation Alexey Likhachev. Official Information Source of the Prime Minister of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Nov. 26, 2019. URL: <a href="https://primeminister.kz/en/news/a-mamin-prinyal-glavu-goskorporacii-rosatom-a-lihacheva">https://primeminister.kz/en/news/a-mamin-prinyal-glavu-goskorporacii-rosatom-a-lihacheva</a> (Accessed: 29 May 2020)
- 31. The United States and Kazakhstan Sign Open Skies Agreement. U.S. Embassy & Consulate in Kazakhstan, Jan. 6, 2020. URL: <a href="https://kz.usembassy.gov/the-united-states-and-kazakhstan-sign-open-skies-agreement/">https://kz.usembassy.gov/the-united-states-and-kazakhstan-sign-open-skies-agreement/</a> (Accessed: 1 June 2020)
- 32. V Tatarstane planiruyut postroit logisticheskiy tsentr dlya produktov iz Respubliki Kazakhstan [Tatarstan plans to build a logistics center for products from Kazakhstan]. Trade Representative Office of Ministry of trade and integration of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the Russian Federation, Mar. 31, 2020. URL: <a href="https://kaztrade.ru/news/v-tatarstane-planiruyut-postroit-logisticheskiy-centr-dlya-produktov-iz-respubliki-kazahstan.html">https://kaztrade.ru/news/v-tatarstane-planiruyut-postroit-logisticheskiy-centr-dlya-produktov-iz-respubliki-kazahstan.html</a> (Accessed: 29 May 2020)
- 33. V Kazakhstane zapustili zavod po proizvodstvu traktorov "Kirovets" [In Kazakhstan, the plant launched the production of tractors "Kirovets"]. Trade Representative office of Ministry of trade and integration of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the Russian Federation, Oct. 25, 2019. URL: <a href="https://kaztrade.ru/news/v-kazahstane-zapustili-zavod-po-proizvodstvu-traktorov-kirovec.html">https://kaztrade.ru/news/v-kazahstane-zapustili-zavod-po-proizvodstvu-traktorov-kirovec.html</a> (Accessed: 29 May 2020)
- 34. Kazakhstan and China have established a joint investment fund. JSC National Managing Holding "Baiterek", Jun. 11, 2018. URL: <a href="https://www.baiterek.gov.kz/en/news/kazakhstan-and-china-have-established-joint-investment-fund">https://www.baiterek.gov.kz/en/news/kazakhstan-and-china-have-established-joint-investment-fund</a> (Accessed: 10 February 2020)
- 35. Podnimem parusa dlya dalnego plavaniya po vostochnomu vetru "Odnogo poyasa, odnogo puti" [We will raise sails for long-distance navigation on the East wind "One belt-One way"]. Embassy of the people's Republic of China in the Republic of Kazakhstan, Apr. 25, 2019. URL: <a href="http://kz.china-embassy.org/rus/dszc/emba/t1657856.htm">http://kz.china-embassy.org/rus/dszc/emba/t1657856.htm</a> (Accessed: 28 January 2020)
- 36. "Nur zholy" new vehicle pass to be opened on the Kazakhstan-Chinese border. The national chamber of entrepreneurs of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Atameken", Sep. 26, 2018. URL: <a href="https://atameken.kz/en/news/30561-na-kazahstansko-kitajskoj-granice-otkroyut-novyj-avtopropusk-nur-zholy">https://atameken.kz/en/news/30561-na-kazahstansko-kitajskoj-granice-otkroyut-novyj-avtopropusk-nur-zholy</a> (Accessed: 28 January 2020)

- 37. American companies are studying investment opportunities in Kostanay region. Akimat of Kostanay region, Nov. 9, 2018.
  - URL: <a href="https://www.gov.kz/memleket/entities/kostanay?lang=ru">https://www.gov.kz/memleket/entities/kostanay?lang=ru</a> (Accessed: 16 February 2020)
- 38. Prime Minister Askar Mamin's working trip to the US and Great Britain. Official Information Source of the Prime Minister of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Dec. 10, 2019. URL: <a href="https://primeminister.kz/en/media/photo/rabochiy-vizit-premer-ministra-rk-askara-mamina-v-ssha-i-velikobritaniyu">https://primeminister.kz/en/media/photo/rabochiy-vizit-premer-ministra-rk-askara-mamina-v-ssha-i-velikobritaniyu</a> (Accessed: 16 February 2020)
- 39. Ambassador strengthens commercial ties with Georgia. Consulate General of the Republic of Kazakhstan in New York city, Jan. 28, 2020. URL: <a href="https://kazconsulny.org/kazykhanov-kazakhstan-strengthens-ties-georgia">https://kazconsulny.org/kazykhanov-kazakhstan-strengthens-ties-georgia</a> (Accessed: 16 February 2020)
- 40. Ministr oborony Rossii posetit Respubliku Kazakhstan s ofitsialnym vizitom [Russian defense Minister to Kazakhstan]. Ministry of Defense of Russia, Jan. 30, 2014. URL: <a href="http://mil.ru/et/news/more.htm?id=11898005@egNews">http://mil.ru/et/news/more.htm?id=11898005@egNews</a> (Accessed: 16 March 2020)
- 41. V Astane sostoyalas vstrecha ministrov oborony Rossii i Kazakhstana [In Astana hosted a meeting of defense Ministers of Russia and Kazakhstan]. Ministry of Defense of Russia, Jul. 4, 2014. URL: <a href="https://function.mil.ru/news\_page/country/more.htm?id=11965665@egNews">https://function.mil.ru/news\_page/country/more.htm?id=11965665@egNews</a> (Accessed: 16 March 2020)
- 42. International Army Games 2017 start in Alabino. Ministry of Defense of Russia, Aug. 1, 2017. URL: <a href="https://eng.mil.ru/en/news\_page/country/more.htm?id=12135064@egNews">https://eng.mil.ru/en/news\_page/country/more.htm?id=12135064@egNews</a> (Accessed: 16 March 2020)
- 43. Istoriya VPK Kazahstana [History of the military industrial complex of Kazakhstan]. Kazakh military website. URL: <a href="https://military-kz.ucoz.org/index/istorija\_vpk\_kazakhstana/0-44">https://military-kz.ucoz.org/index/istorija\_vpk\_kazakhstana/0-44</a> (Accessed: 16 March 2020)
- 44. Mi-171 helicopters will be launched in Kazakhstan. KADEX Ministry of Industry and infrastructural development of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Dec. 14, 2019. URL: https://kadex.kz/eng/starting 2020 the assembly of mi-8amt mi-171 helicopters will be launched (Accessed: 12 March 2020)
- 45. Vneseniye izmeneniy v rossiysko-kazakhstanskiye dogovory ob ispolzovanii i arende poligonov Minoborony Rossii budet sluzhit interesam obeikh stran [Amendments to the Russian-Kazakh agreements on the use and lease of polygons of the Russian defense Ministry will serve the interests of both countries]. Ministry of Defense of Russia, Apr. 16, 2015. URL: <a href="http://mil.ru/et/news/more.htm?id=12016305@egNews">http://mil.ru/et/news/more.htm?id=12016305@egNews</a> (Accessed: 8 December 2019)

- 46. Strategic plan of national space agency of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2011-2015. Old website of Aerospace Comittee Ministry of investments and of the Republic of Kazakhstan: URL: <a href="https://gh-ecology.kz/en/o-predpriyatii/ba-darlamaly-zhane-strategiyaly-dokumentter/strategiyaly-ba-darlamalar/ctrategicheskij-plan-natsionalnogo-kosmicheskogo-agentstva-respubliki-kazahstan-na-2011-2015-gody">https://gh-ecology.kz/en/o-predpriyatii/ba-darlamaly-zhane-strategiyaly-dokumentter/strategiyaly-ba-darlamalar/ctrategicheskij-plan-natsionalnogo-kosmicheskogo-agentstva-respubliki-kazahstan-na-2011-2015-gody</a> (Accessed: 9 March 2020)
- 47. Tsıfrlyq damý, ınnovatsıya jane aerogarysh onerkásibi mınıstrliginin 2017-2021 arnalgan strategiyalyq jospary [Ministry's strategic plan for 2017-2021]. Ministry of Digital Development, Innovations, Aerospace Industry of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Jan. 13, 2020. URL: <a href="https://www.gov.kz/memleket/entities/mdai/documents/details/8195?lang=kk">https://www.gov.kz/memleket/entities/mdai/documents/details/8195?lang=kk</a> (Accessed: 10 April 2020)
- 48. Vvod v ekspluatatsiyu vtorogo sputnika DZZ zaplanirovan na vtoroy kvartal 2015. [Commissioning of the second remote sensing satellite is scheduled for the second quarter of 2015]. National Company Kazakhstan Garysh Sapary, Jan. 16, 2015. URL: http://old.gharysh.kz/news/73.html (Accessed: 15 March 2020)
- 49. Press-reliz "Dni kosmosa v Kazakhstane 2015" [Press release "space Days in Kazakhstan-2015"]. National Company Kazakhstan Garysh Sapary, Nov. 24, 2015. URL: <a href="http://old.gharysh.kz/news/681.html">http://old.gharysh.kz/news/681.html</a> (Accessed: 9 March 2020)
- 50. Geologicheskaya sluzhba SSHA na primere raboty kazahstanskih sputnikov DZZ obuchila upravleniyu vodnymi resursami [The US geological survey trained water resources management on the Kazakhstan's remote sensing satellites]. National Company Kazakhstan Garysh Sapary, Oct. 7, 2015. URL: <a href="http://old.gharysh.kz/news/558.html">http://old.gharysh.kz/news/558.html</a> (Accessed: 12 March 2020)
- 51. Geologicheskaya sluzhba SSHA ukreplyaet sotrudnichestvo s Kazkosmosom [US geological survey strengthens cooperation with Kazkosmos]. National Company Kazakhstan Garysh Sapary, Jun. 16, 2016. URL: <a href="http://old.gharysh.kz/news/1030.html">http://old.gharysh.kz/news/1030.html</a> (Accessed: 12 March 2020)
- 52. Rossiya i Kazakhstan dogovorilis o rasshirenii nauchno-obrazovatelnogo sotrudnichestva [Russia and Kazakhstan agreed to expand scientific and educational cooperation]. Ministry of science and higher education of the Russian Federation, Oct. 16, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.minobrnauki.gov.ru/ru/press-center/card/?id\_4=1992">https://www.minobrnauki.gov.ru/ru/press-center/card/?id\_4=1992</a> (Accessed: 7 May 2020)
- 53. Grant Awards support higher education collaboration between US and Kazakhstan. American Councils for International Education, Mar. 19, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.americancouncils.org/news/across-globe/grant-awards-support-higher-education-collaboration-between-us-and-kazakhstan-0">https://www.americancouncils.org/news/across-globe/grant-awards-support-higher-education-collaboration-between-us-and-kazakhstan-0</a> (Accessed: 7 May 2020)

- 54. V SSHA proshli Dni kultury Kazakhstana [Days of Kazakh culture were held in the USA]. Kazakh Research Institute of Culture of Ministry of culture of Kazakhstan, Jul. 7, 2014 URL: http://cultural.kz/en/news/view?id=1732 (Accessed: 22 May 2020)
- 55. Dni kultury Kazakhstana v Rossii otkrylis gala-kontsertom na VDNKH [Days of Kazakh culture in Russia opened with a gala concert at VDNH]. Ministry of culture of Russian Federation, Sep. 9, 2019.
  - URL: <a href="https://www.mkrf.ru/press/news/dni\_kultury\_kazakhstana\_v\_rossii\_otkrylis\_gala\_kont">https://www.mkrf.ru/press/news/dni\_kultury\_kazakhstana\_v\_rossii\_otkrylis\_gala\_kont</a> <a href="mailto:sertom\_na\_vdnkh/">sertom\_na\_vdnkh/</a> (Accessed: 23 May 2020)
- 56. Dni kultury Rossii v Kazakhstane otkroyutsya vystupleniyem Kubanskogo kazachyego khora. [Days of Russian culture in Kazakhstan will open by Kuban Cossack choir]. Ministry of culture of Russian Federation, Oct. 14, 2019.

  URL: <a href="https://www.mkrf.ru/press/news/dni-kultury-rossii-v-kazakhstane-otkroyutsya-vystu-pleniem-kubanskogo-kazachego-khora-/">https://www.mkrf.ru/press/news/dni-kultury-rossii-v-kazakhstane-otkroyutsya-vystu-pleniem-kubanskogo-kazachego-khora-/</a> (Accessed: 23 May 2020)
- 57. Ministry kultury Kazakhstana i Rossii podpisali soglasheniye o sotrudnichestve [Russian-Kazakh Culture Ministers signed a cooperation agreement]. Kazakh Research Institute of Culture of Ministry of culture of Kazakhstan, Dec. 9, 2014.
  - URL: <a href="http://www.cultural.kz/ru/news/view?id=885">http://www.cultural.kz/ru/news/view?id=885</a> (Accessed: 19 May 2020)
- 58. V Mosfilme obsudili kontseptsiyu razvitiya kazakhstanskogo kinematografa [Mosfilm discussed Kazakhstan's concept of cinematography development]. Kazakh Research Institute of Culture of Ministry of culture of Kazakhstan, Aug. 12, 2016.
  - URL: <a href="http://www.cultural.kz/ru/science/view?id=59">http://www.cultural.kz/ru/science/view?id=59</a> (Accessed: 19 May 2020)
- 59. New York Film Critics identified the Kazakhstani movie as a discovery of Kipchaks' real history. Kazakh Research Institute of Culture of Ministry of culture of Kazakhstan, Aug. 24, 2015. URL: http://cultural.kz/en/news/view?id=1732 (Accessed: 10 May 2020)
- 60. Kazakhstansko-amerikanskoye sotrudnichestvo cherez kinematograf [Kazakh-American partnership through cinema]. Kazakh Research Institute of Culture of Ministry of culture of Kazakhstan. Aug. 5, 2018. URL: <a href="http://cultural.kz/ru/news/view?id=2488">http://cultural.kz/ru/news/view?id=2488</a> (Accessed: 10 May 2020)

## Speeches, joint statements of Presidents, statesmen

61. Qazaqstan men AQSH: XXI gasyrdagy keńeitilgen strategialyq áriptestik [United States and Kazakhstan: An Enhanced Strategic Partnership for the 21st Century]. Jan. 17, 2018. URL:

- <a href="https://www.akorda.kz/kz/events/international\_community/foreign\_visits/kazakstan-zhane-aksh-xxi-gasyrdagy-keneitilgen-strategiyalyk-ariptestik">https://www.akorda.kz/kz/events/international\_community/foreign\_visits/kazakstan-zhane-aksh-xxi-gasyrdagy-keneitilgen-strategiyalyk-ariptestik</a> (Accessed: 15 August 2019)
- 62. Joint Press Statements of President Trump and President N. Nazarbayev of Kazakhstan. Jan. 16, 2018. URL: <a href="https://translations.state.gov/2018/01/16/remarks-by-president-trump-and-president-nursultan-nazarbayev-of-kazakhstan-in-joint-press-statements/">https://translations.state.gov/2018/01/16/remarks-by-president-trump-and-president-nursultan-nazarbayev-of-kazakhstan-in-joint-press-statements/</a> (Accessed: 15 August 2019)
- 63. Press Availability by Deputy Secretary Burns in Astana. U.S. Embassy & Consulate in Kazakhstan, May 8, 2014. URL: <a href="https://kz.usembassy.gov/press-availability-by-deputy-secretary-burns-in-astana/">https://kz.usembassy.gov/press-availability-by-deputy-secretary-burns-in-astana/</a> (Accessed: 9 September 2019)
- 64. Dzhon Kerri ob Ukraine, ugroze IG i EAES [J. Kerry about Ukraine, ISIS`s threat and EEU]. Nov. 3, 2015. URL: <a href="https://mir24.tv/news/13466526/dzhon-kerri-ob-ukraine-ugroze-ig-i-eaes">https://mir24.tv/news/13466526/dzhon-kerri-ob-ukraine-ugroze-ig-i-eaes</a> (Accessed: 9 September 2019)
- 65. XI Russia-Kazakhstan Interregional Cooperation Forum (full text content of meeting and speeches of N. Nazarbayev and V. Putin). Atyrau, Sep. 30, 2014.

  URL: <a href="http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/46700">http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/46700</a> (Accessed: 18 December 2019)
- 66. XII Russia-Kazakhstan Interregional Cooperation Forum (full text content of meeting and speeches of N. Nazarbayev and V. Putin). Sochi, Sept. 15, 2015. URL: <a href="http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/50299">http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/50299</a> (Accessed: 18 December 2019)
- 67. Russia-Kazakhstan Interregional Cooperation Forum (full text content of meeting and speeches of N. Nazarbayev and V. Putin). Chelyabinsk, Nov. 9, 2017.

  URL: <a href="http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/56031">http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/56031</a> (Accessed: 16 December 2019)
- 68. Russia-Kazakhstan Interregional Cooperation Forum (full text content of meeting and speeches of N. Nazarbayev and V. Putin). Petropavlovsk, Nov. 9, 2018.
  URL: <a href="http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/59075">http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/59075</a> (Accessed: 17 December 2019)
- 69. Russia-Kazakhstan Interregional Cooperation Forum (full text content of meeting and speeches of K.-J. Tokayev and V. Putin). Omsk, Nov. 7, 2019. URL: <a href="http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/61997">http://en.kremlin.ru/events/president/news/61997</a> (Accessed: 18 December 2019)
- 70. My khotim, chtoby Kazakhstan byl stabilnoy i nezavisimoy stranoy (U.S. Ambassador to Kazakhstan William H. Moser: We want Kazakhstan to be a stable and independent country) Jan. 31, 2020. URL: <a href="https://kursiv.kz/news/obschestvo/2020-01/uilyam-mozer-my-khotim-chtoby-kazakhstan-byl-stabilnoy-i-nezavisimoy">https://kursiv.kz/news/obschestvo/2020-01/uilyam-mozer-my-khotim-chtoby-kazakhstan-byl-stabilnoy-i-nezavisimoy</a> (Accessed: 16 February 2020)

#### Official statistics

- 71. Reforming Kazakhstan: Progress, Challenges and Opportunities. Global Relations Secretariat of OECD. Source: The work was published under the responsibility of the OECD Secretary-General, 2017. p.187 URL: <a href="https://www.oecd.org/eurasia/countries/OECD-Eurasia-Reforming-Kazakhstan-EN.pdf">https://www.oecd.org/eurasia/countries/OECD-Eurasia-Reforming-Kazakhstan-EN.pdf</a> (Accessed: 25 August 2019)
- 72. The EEU's foreign trade with China for Jan-Aug. 2018. Source: Eurasian Commission. URL: <a href="http://www.eurasiancommission.org/ru/act/trade/catr/monitoring/Documents/Obzor3/%D0%95%D0%90%D0%AD%D0%A1-%D0%9A%D0%B8%D1%82%D0%B0%D0%B9%20(%D1%8F%D0%BD%D0%B2%D0%B0%D1%80%D1%8C-%D0%B0%D0%B2%D0%B3%D1%83%D1%81%D1%82%202018).pdf (Accessed: 2 October 2019)</a>
- 73. Kazakhstan trade statistics: export, import, products, etc. in 2014-2018. Source: World Integrated Trade Solution. URL: <a href="https://wits.worldbank.org/CountryProfile/en/KAZ">https://wits.worldbank.org/CountryProfile/en/KAZ</a> (Accessed: 15-20 November 2019)
- 74. The Report on Russian-Kazakhstani foreign trade turnover in 2019. Source: Russian Foreign Trade's statistics based on data from the Federal Customs Service of Russia, Feb. 13, 2020. URL: <a href="https://russian-trade.com/reports-and-reviews/2020-02/torgovlya-mezhdu-rossiey-i-kazahstanom-v-2019-g/">https://russian-trade.com/reports-and-reviews/2020-02/torgovlya-mezhdu-rossiey-i-kazahstanom-v-2019-g/</a> (Accessed: 18 December 2019)
- 75. Transfers of major weapons: Deals with deliveries or orders made for 2014 to 2019 between Kazakhstan and Russia, USA, China. Source: SIPRI's trade registers. URL: <a href="http://armstrade.sipri.org/armstrade/page/trade\_register.php/;">http://armstrade.sipri.org/armstrade/page/trade\_register.php/;</a>; <a href="http://armstrade.sipri.org/armstrade/html/export\_values.php">http://armstrade.sipri.org/armstrade/html/export\_values.php</a> (Information generated: 26 April 2020)
- 76. Foreign Military Training. FY 2014-2019. Source: Join report of U.S. Department of Defense and the Department of State. URL: <a href="https://securityassistance.org/sites/default/files/243009.pdf">https://securityassistance.org/sites/default/files/243009.pdf</a> (2014-2015); <a href="https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/fmt\_vol1\_16\_17.pdf">https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/fmt\_vol1\_16\_17.pdf</a> (2017-2018); <a href="https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2019/12/FMT\_Volume-I\_FY2018\_2019.pdf">https://www.state.gov/wp-content/uploads/2019/12/FMT\_Volume-I\_FY2018\_2019.pdf</a> (2018-2019) (Accessed: 28 April 2020)

# Agreements within the regional organizations, partnership dialogues, and integrations

77. Treaty on Eurasian Economic Union. Jan. 1, 2015. URL: docs.eaeunion.org/docs/en-us/0003610/itia\_05062014 (Accessed: 2 October 2020)

- 78. Eýrazıa damý bankin qurý turaly kelisimdi ratifikatsiyalaý týraly: Qazaqstan Respýblikasynyń 2006 jylgy 2 sáýirdegi № 137 Zańy [№ 137 Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan on ratification of the Agreement on Eurasian development Bank establishment dated April 12 2006] URL: <a href="http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/Z060000137">http://adilet.zan.kz/kaz/docs/Z060000137</a> (Accessed: 2 October 2020)
- 79. Framework agreement between the Government of the United States of America, the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic, the Government of the Republic of Tajikistan, the Government of Turkmenistan, and the Government of the Republic of Uzbekistan concerning the development of trade and investment relations dated June 1, 2004. Source: UNCTAD International Investment Agreements Navigator. URL: <a href="https://investmentpolicy.unctad.org/international-investment-agreements/treaties/treaties-with-investment-provisions/3346/us-central-asia-tifa">https://investment-provisions/3346/us-central-asia-tifa</a> (Accessed: 13 September 2019)
- 80. Create conditions for the development of light industry in the EAEU Member States. Source: Eurasian Economic Commission, Nov. 24, 2016. URL: <a href="http://www.eurasiancommission.org/en/nae/news/Pages/24-11-2016-2.aspx">http://www.eurasiancommission.org/en/nae/news/Pages/24-11-2016-2.aspx</a> (Accessed: 2 June 2020)
- 81. The digital potential of the countries-participants of the EDB. EDB Centre for integration studies, Research Department, Sep. 23, 2019.
  URL: <a href="https://eabr.org/upload/iblock/566/EABR\_Digital\_Potential\_EN.pdf">https://eabr.org/upload/iblock/566/EABR\_Digital\_Potential\_EN.pdf</a> (Accessed: 6 April 2020)

## Documents of Kazakhstani, Russian, Chinese, and American companies

- 82. CPC General Director Nikolay Brunich gave the interview to Interfax on CPC plans. Caspian Pipeline Consortium, Feb. 10, 2014.
  - URL: <a href="http://www.cpc.ru/EN/press/pressaboutus/Pages/20140210.aspx">http://www.cpc.ru/EN/press/pressaboutus/Pages/20140210.aspx</a> (Accessed: 4 February 2020)
- 83. KTK effektivnyy i nadezhnyy marshrut dlya eksporta nefti [Interview with former Kaztransoil General Director K. Kabildin: CPC is an effective and reliable route for oil exports]. Caspian Pipeline Consortium, Mar. 3, 2018.
  - URL: <a href="http://www.cpc.ru/RU/press/pressaboutus/Pages/20180303.aspx">http://www.cpc.ru/RU/press/pressaboutus/Pages/20180303.aspx</a> (Accessed: 4 February 2020)
- 84. Alexey Miller and Kazakh Energy Minister Kanat Bozumbayev address cooperation prospects. Gazprom, Feb. 26, 2018.

- URL: <a href="https://www.gazprom.com/press/news/2018/february/article408091/">https://www.gazprom.com/press/news/2018/february/article408091/</a> (Accessed: 4 February 2020)
- 85. Lukoil analyses possibilities for green energy projects in Kazakhstan. Lukoil oil company, Apr. 4, 2018. URL: <a href="https://www.lukoil.com/PressCenter/Pressreleases/Pressrelease?rid=210636">https://www.lukoil.com/PressCenter/Pressreleases/Pressrelease?rid=210636</a> (Accessed: 4 February 2020)
- 86. Lukoil concludes contract for hydrocarbon exploration and developmet on Zhenis block in Kazakhstan. Lukoil oil company, Apr. 3, 2019.
  - URL: <a href="https://www.lukoil.com/api/presscenter/exportpressrelease?id=332259">https://www.lukoil.com/api/presscenter/exportpressrelease?id=332259</a> (Accessed: 4 February 2020)
- 87. V. Alekperov nagrazhden vysshey gosudarstvennoy nagradoy Kazakhstana [V. Alekperov was awarded the highest state award of Kazakhstan]. Lukoil oil company, Sep. 5, 2019. URL: <a href="https://lukoil.ru/PressCenter/Pressreleases/Pressrelease?rid=389625">https://lukoil.ru/PressCenter/Pressreleases/Pressrelease?rid=389625</a> (Accessed: 4 February 2020)
- 88. Transportirovka gaza i marketing [Gas transportation and marketing]. LLP KazRosGas, May 27, 2020. URL: <a href="https://kazrosgas.org">https://kazrosgas.org</a> (Accessed: 2 June 2020)
- 89. Bo Andersson the President of "Avtovaz" JSC had a series of meetings in Kazakhstan. Spource:

  Asia Avto Kazakhstan car assembly plant, Sep. 23, 2014. URL: <a href="http://aziaavto.kz/en/bo-andersson-the-president-of-avtovaz-jsc-had-a-series-of-meetings-in-kazakhstan">http://aziaavto.kz/en/bo-andersson-the-president-of-avtovaz-jsc-had-a-series-of-meetings-in-kazakhstan</a> (Accessed: 2 June 2020)
- 90. Presidents of Russia and Kazakhstan approved of cooperation between Avtovaz and Bipek avto at Siberian market. Asia Avto Kazakhstan car assembly plant, Oct. 10, 2014. URL: <a href="http://aziaavto.kz/en/presidents-of-russia-and-kazakhstan-approved-of-cooperation-between-avtovaz-and-bipek-avto-at">http://aziaavto.kz/en/presidents-of-russia-and-kazakhstan-approved-of-cooperation-between-avtovaz-and-bipek-avto-at</a> (Accessed: 2 June 2020)
- 91. Avtovaz and Bipek Avto Azia Avto proceed with cooperative capturing of Central Asia markets. Asia Avto Kazakhstan car assembly plant, Oct. 15, 2015. URL: <a href="http://aziaavto.kz/en/avtovaz-and-bipek-avto-azia-avto-proceed-with-cooperative-capturing-of-central-asia-markets">http://aziaavto.kz/en/avtovaz-and-bipek-avto-azia-avto-proceed-with-cooperative-capturing-of-central-asia-markets</a> (Accessed: 1 June 2020)
- 92. GE Healthcare rasskazala, kak digital-resheniya mogut povysit effektivnost raboty meduchrezhdeniy v Kazakhstane [GE Healthcare told how digital solutions can improve the efficiency of medical institutions in Kazakhstan]. GE Reports, Oct. 25, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.genewsroom.com/press-releases/ge-healthcare-%D1%80%D0%B0%D1%81%D1%81%D0%BA%D0%B0%D0%B7%D0%B0%D0%B0%D0%B0%D0%BA%D0%B0%D0%BA%D0%B0%D0%BA%D0%BA%D0%B0%D0%BA%D0%BA%D0%BA%D0%BA%D0%BA%D0%BA%D0%BA%D0%BA%D0%BA~D0%BA%D0%BA%D0%BA%D0%BA%D0%BA~D0%BA%D

- digital-%D1%80%D0%B5%D1%88%D0%B5%D0%BD%D0%B8%D1%8F-%D0%BC%D
  0%BE%D0%B3%D1%83%D1%82-%D0%BF%D0%BE%D0%B2%D1%8B%D1%81%D0
  %B8%D1%82%D1%8C-%D1%8D%D1%84%D1%84%D0%B5%D0%BA%D1%82%D0%
  B8%D0%B2%D0%BD%D0%BE%D1%81%D1%82%D1%8C-%D1%80%D0%B0%D0%B
  1%D0%BE%D1%82%D1%8B (Accessed: 15 April 2020)
- 93. Kazakhtelecom builds the digital Silk Road (interview with director of Kazakhtelecom B2B products development L. Muravjov). Mobile World Live, Jul. 8, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.mobileworldlive.com/latest-stories/kazakhtelecom-builds-the-digital-silk-road/">https://www.mobileworldlive.com/latest-stories/kazakhtelecom-builds-the-digital-silk-road/</a> (Accessed: 12 April 2020)

#### Periodicals news

- 94. MFTs "Astana" stanet klyuchevym elementom novoy finansovoy infrastruktury Yevrazii [Interview with MFC Director K. Kelimbetov: Astana MFC will become a key element of the new financial infrastructure of Eurasia]. Rossiyskaya gazeta, Jul. 2, 2018. URL: <a href="https://rg.ru/2018/07/02/mfc-astana-stanet-kliuchevym-elementom-novoj-finansovoj-infrastruktury-evrazii.html">https://rg.ru/2018/07/02/mfc-astana-stanet-kliuchevym-elementom-novoj-finansovoj-infrastruktury-evrazii.html</a> (Accessed: 11 February 2020)
- 95. Nazarbayev vstretilsya s rukovoditelyami Skolkovo, AvtoVAZa i RZHD [Nazarbayev met with with the heads Skolkovo, AvtoVAZa and RZHD]. "Vzglyad" business newspaper, Jun. 16, 2016. URL: <a href="https://vz.ru/news/2016/6/16/816400.html">https://vz.ru/news/2016/6/16/816400.html</a> (Accessed: 17 February 2020)
- 96. A. Mamin takes part in 1st Kazakhstan-China Interregional Coop Forum. Kazahstanskaya pravda, Sep. 12, 2017. URL: <a href="https://www.kazpravda.kz/en/news/politics/askar-mamin-took-part-in-the-first-kazakhstan-china-interregional-coop-forum">https://www.kazpravda.kz/en/news/politics/askar-mamin-took-part-in-the-first-kazakhstan-china-interregional-coop-forum</a> (Accessed: 12 March 2020)
- 97. Zamestitel posla SSHA rasskazal zachem priezzhal v Petropavlovsk [The Deputy US Ambassador told why he came to Petropavlovsk]. Petropavlovsk News, Apr. 05, 2018. URL: <a href="https://pkzsk.info/zamestitel-posla-ssha-rasskazal-zachem-priezzhal-v-petropavlovsk/">https://pkzsk.info/zamestitel-posla-ssha-rasskazal-zachem-priezzhal-v-petropavlovsk/</a> (Accessed: 16 February 2020)
- 98. Amerikantsy investiruiut v Karagandinskuiu oblast [Americans invest in Karaganda region]. 
  "Novyi vestnik" magazine News of Karaganda and Karaganda region, Nov. 8, 2018. URL: 
  <a href="https://nv.kz/2018/11/08/222291/">https://nv.kz/2018/11/08/222291/</a> (Accessed: 16 February 2020)
- 99. Amerikanskie tekhnologii vnedriaiut v Turkestanskoi oblasti [American technologies are being introduced in Turkestan]. "Yuzhnyy Kazakhstan" socio-political newspaper, Jan. 31, 2020. URL: <a href="https://yujanka.kz/amerikanskie-tehnologii-vnedryayut-v-turkestanskoj-oblasti/">https://yujanka.kz/amerikanskie-tehnologii-vnedryayut-v-turkestanskoj-oblasti/</a> (Accessed: 16 February 2020)

- 100. Mirotvorchestvo effektivnyy otvet globalnym vyzovam [Peacemaking is an effective response to global challenges]. Komsamolskaya pravda, Nov. 26, 2019. URL: https://www.kp.kz/daily/27059/4127712/ (Accessed: 21 March 2020)
- 101. Pentagon formiruyet v Kazakhstane antirossiyskiy rubezh [Pentagon is forming an anti-Russian sentiment in Kazakhstan]. Nezavisimaya gazeta, Aug. 9, 2017. URL: http://www.ng.ru/politics/2017-08-09/1\_7047\_kazahstan.html (Accessed: 22 March 2020)
- 102. Verkhovnyy Glavnokomanduyushchiy VS RK posetil tseremoniyu otkrytiya 4-oy Mezhdunarodnoy vystavki "KADEX 2016" [N. Nazarbayev attended the opening ceremony of the 4th International exhibition]. "Bastion" military-technical magazine, Jun. 2, 2016. URL: <a href="http://bastion-karpenko.ru/2016/06/03/03-06-2016-2/">http://bastion-karpenko.ru/2016/06/03/03-06-2016-2/</a> (Accessed: 3 March 2020)
- 103. Kuda v Kazakhstane ukhodyat milliardy tenge, potrachennyye na kosmos [Interview with the Ministry of Digital Development, Innovations, Aerospace Industry: Where do billions of tenge spent on space go in Kazakhstan?]. "Liter" governmental socio-political newspaper, Oct. 25, 2019. URL: <a href="https://liter.kz/12886-kuda-v-kazahstane-uhodyat-milliardy-potrachennye-na-kosmos-bolshoe-intervyu/">https://liter.kz/12886-kuda-v-kazahstane-uhodyat-milliardy-potrachennye-na-kosmos-bolshoe-intervyu/</a> (Accessed: 17 April 2020)
- 104. Ya byla voskhishchena tem, chto v Kazakhstane vnedryayut politiku trekhyazychiya [Interview with Kerri Hannan: I was delighted that Kazakhstan is implementing a policy of trilingualism]. "Bilimdi El" educational socio-political newspaper of Kazakhstan, Nov. 22, 2019. URL: <a href="https://bilimdinews.kz/?p=75548">https://bilimdinews.kz/?p=75548</a> (Accessed: 31 March 2020)

## Online Media Information

- 105. V Almaty sozdan Soyuz kitayskikh predprinimateley [Union of Chinese entrepreneurs established in Almat]. Xinhua News, Apr. 26, 2017. URL: <a href="http://russian.news.cn/2017-04/26/c\_136236350.htm">http://russian.news.cn/2017-04/26/c\_136236350.htm</a> (Accessed: 30 December 2019)
- 106. Amerikansko-kazakhstanskoy biznes assotsiatsii ispolnilos 20 let [American-Kazakhstan business Association`s 20<sup>th</sup> anniversary]. "Khabar" news agency, Jan. 20, 2019. URL: <a href="https://24.kz/ru/news/economyc/item/291188-amerikansko-kazakhstanskoj-biznes-assotsiatsii-ispolnilos-20-let">https://24.kz/ru/news/economyc/item/291188-amerikansko-kazakhstanskoj-biznes-assotsiatsii-ispolnilos-20-let</a> (Accessed: 30 December 2019)
- 107. Kakim budet Kazakhstan odnovremenno v VTO i EAES? [What will Kazakhstan be like in the WTO and the EEU at the same time?] Source: Azattyq Radio, Nov. 27, 2014. URL: <a href="https://rus.azattyq.org/a/kazakhstan-vstuplenie-vto-eaes/26712958.html">https://rus.azattyq.org/a/kazakhstan-vstuplenie-vto-eaes/26712958.html</a> (Accessed: 24 August 2019)

- 108. Prezident RK poruchil usilit razvedku uglevodorodnykh mestorozhdeniy [The President of Kazakhstan instructed to strengthen the exploration of hydrocarbon deposits]. "Kapital" business information center, Sep. 17, 2015. URL: <a href="https://kapital.kz/economic/43762/prezident-rk-poruchil-usilit-razvedku-uglevodorodnykh-mestorozhdeniy.html">https://kapital.kz/economic/43762/prezident-rk-poruchil-usilit-razvedku-uglevodorodnykh-mestorozhdeniy.html</a> (Accessed: 28 February 2020)
- 109. Novyy tranzit: zachem Kazakhstanu "Sila Sibiri" [New transit: why Kazakhstan needs the "Power of Siberia"]. "Gazeta.ru" socio-political online publication, Nov. 27, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.gazeta.ru/business/2019/11/26/12833018.shtml">https://www.gazeta.ru/business/2019/11/26/12833018.shtml</a> (Accessed: 2 June 2020)
- 110. Bitva titanov za mirnyy atom [Battle of the titans for the peaceful atom]. "Automic Energy" information portal, Mar. 25, 2013. URL: <a href="https://www.atomic-energy.ru/smi/2013/03/25/40683">https://www.atomic-energy.ru/smi/2013/03/25/40683</a> (Accessed: 13 September 2019)
- 111. Construction of a NPP in Kazakhstan is not planned yet K. Tokayev. "The Qazaq Times" social-political portal, Jun. 11, 2019. URL: <a href="https://qazaqtimes.com/en/article/63704">https://qazaqtimes.com/en/article/63704</a> (Accessed: 11 October 2019)
- 112. Kazakhstan i Kitay prodlevayut kontrakty na nedropolzovaniye [Kazakhstan and China to extend the contracts for subsoil use]. Azattyq Radio, Jul. 8, 2017. URL: <a href="https://rus.azattyq.org/a/28535123.html">https://rus.azattyq.org/a/28535123.html</a> (Accessed: 31 May 2020)
- 113. Kazakhstan to increase Russian crude transit to China. "Reuters" international multimedia portal, Sep. 25, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.reuters.com/article/kazakhstan-russia-china-oil-idAFL5N26G2X0">https://www.reuters.com/article/kazakhstan-russia-china-oil-idAFL5N26G2X0</a> (Accessed: 2 June 2020)
- 114. Kitay i Kazakhstan rasshiryayut sotrudnichestvo [China and Kazakhstan are expanding their cooperation]. "Stan Radar" CA news, Nov. 15, 2016. URL: <a href="https://stanradar.com/news/full/22923-kitaj-i-kazahstan-rasshirjajut-sotrudnichestvo.html">https://stanradar.com/news/full/22923-kitaj-i-kazahstan-rasshirjajut-sotrudnichestvo.html</a> (Accessed: 1 June 2020)
- 115. Kazakhstan i Kitay podpisali soglasheniy na \$14 mlrd. [Kazakhstan and China signed agreements worth \$14 billion]. "Kapital" business information center, Dec. 15, 2014 URL: <a href="https://kapital.kz/economic/35907/kazakhstan-i-kitay-podpisali-soglasheniy-na-14-mlrd.html">https://kapital.kz/economic/35907/kazakhstan-i-kitay-podpisali-soglasheniy-na-14-mlrd.html</a> (Accessed: 17 September 2019)
- 116. Kazakhstan budet transportirovat uran v Severnuyu Ameriku cherez Kitay [Kazakhstan will transport uranium to North America via China]. "Ria Novosti" Russian agency of international information, Sep. 2, 2015 URL: <a href="https://ria.ru/20150902/1223598591.html">https://ria.ru/20150902/1223598591.html</a> (Accessed: 31 May 2020)

- 117. Kazakhstan nameren uvelichit postavki urana v Kitay [Kazakhstan intends to increase uranium supplies to China]. "Kapital" business information center, Sep. 18, 2019 URL: <a href="https://kapital.kz/economic/81282/kazakhstan-nameren-uvelichit-postavki-urana-v-kitay.html">https://kapital.kz/economic/81282/kazakhstan-nameren-uvelichit-postavki-urana-v-kitay.html</a> (Accessed: 31 May 2020)
- 118. Nazarbayev vstretilsya s ispolnitelnym direktorom Chevron [Nazarbayev met with Chevron Executive Director]. "Tengri news" online publication and information portal, May 6, 2016. URL: <a href="https://tengrinews.kz/kazakhstan\_news/prezident-kazahstana-vstretilsya-rukovodstvom-kompanii-293973/">https://tengrinews.kz/kazakhstan\_news/prezident-kazahstana-vstretilsya-rukovodstvom-kompanii-293973/</a> (Accessed: 9 February 2020)
- 119. Nazarbayev vstretilsya s ispolnitelnym direktorom Chevron [Nazarbayev met with Chevron Executive Director]. "Tengri news" online publication and information portal, Nov. 22, 2017. URL: <a href="https://tengrinews.kz/kazakhstan\_news/nazarbaev-vstretilsya-s-ispolnitelnyim-direktorom-chevron-331528/">https://tengrinews.kz/kazakhstan\_news/nazarbaev-vstretilsya-s-ispolnitelnyim-direktorom-chevron-331528/</a> (Accessed: 9 February 2020)
- 120. N. Nazarbayev obsudil s glavoy Chevron perspektivy vzaimodeystviya v sfere neftedobychi i neftepererabotki [Nazarbayev met with Chevron Executive Director]. "Kapital" business information center, Apr. 4, 2018. URL: <a href="https://kapital.kz/economic/68097/prezident-vstretilsya-s-glavoy-soveta-direktorov-shevron-mayklom-uirtom.html">https://kapital.kz/economic/68097/prezident-vstretilsya-s-glavoy-soveta-direktorov-shevron-mayklom-uirtom.html</a> (Accessed: 9 February 2020)
- 121. Kazakhstan i SSHA obsudili ryad voprosov v oblasti energeticheskogo partnerstva [Kazakhstan and the United States discussed a number of issues in the field of energy partnership]. "Kursiv" business portal, Dec. 20, 2017. URL: <a href="https://kursiv.kz/news/otraslevyetemy/2017-12/kazakhstan-i-ssha-obsudili-ryad-voprosov-v-oblasti-energeticheskogo">https://kursiv.kz/news/otraslevyetemy/2017-12/kazakhstan-i-ssha-obsudili-ryad-voprosov-v-oblasti-energeticheskogo</a> (Accessed: 9 February 2020)
- 122. Sosedyam pshenitsu, SSHA uran [Neighbors wheat, the US uranium]. Azattyq Radio, Oct. 10, 2015. URL: <a href="https://rus.azattyq.org/a/export-kazakhstana-pshenitsa-uran-import-myasa/27298694.html">https://rus.azattyq.org/a/export-kazakhstana-pshenitsa-uran-import-myasa/27298694.html</a> (Accessed: 2 June 2020)
- 123. Minenergo Kazakhstana udovletvoreno otkazom Trampa ot kvot na uran [The Ministry of energy of Kazakhstan is satisfied with trump's rejection of quotas for uranium]. "Informburo.kz" information and analytical portal, Jul. 17, 2019. URL: <a href="https://informburo.kz/novosti/minenergo-kazahstana-udovletvoreno-otkazom-trampa-ot-kvot-na-uran.html">https://informburo.kz/novosti/minenergo-kazahstana-udovletvoreno-otkazom-trampa-ot-kvot-na-uran.html</a> (Accessed: 1 June 2020)
- 124. Rossiya, Kazakhstan i Belorussiya budut sotrudnichat v sfere legkoy promyshlennosti [Russia, Kazakhstan and Belarus will cooperate in the light industry]. "Regnum" news agency, Jan. 20, 2015. URL: <a href="https://regnum.ru/news/1886009.html">https://regnum.ru/news/1886009.html</a> (Accessed: 1 June 2020)

- 125. Kazakhstan i Rossiya podpisali neskolko soglasheniy [Kazakhstan and Russia signed several agreements]. "Kapital" business information center, Apr. 3, 2019. URL: <a href="https://kapital.kz/economic/77205/kazakhstan-i-rossiya-podpisali-neskol-ko-soglasheniy.html">https://kapital.kz/economic/77205/kazakhstan-i-rossiya-podpisali-neskol-ko-soglasheniy.html</a> (Accessed: 1 June 2020)
- 126. Rossiya i Kazakhstan narashchivayut sotrudnichestvo v sfere mashinostroyeniya [Russia and Kazakhstan are increasing their cooperation in the field of mechanical engineering]. "MIR 24" information and analytical Internet portal, Sep. 14, 2018. URL: <a href="https://mir24.tv/news/16322764/rossiya-i-kazahstan-narashchivayut-sotrudnichestvo-v-sfere-mashinostroeniya">https://mir24.tv/news/16322764/rossiya-i-kazahstan-narashchivayut-sotrudnichestvo-v-sfere-mashinostroeniya</a> (Accessed: 31 May 2020)
- 127. Sotrudnichestvo Kazakhstana i Rossii v oblasti mashinostroyeniya [Cooperation between Kazakhstan and Russia in the field of mechanical engineering]. "Khabar" news agency, May 8, 2019. URL: <a href="https://24.kz/ru/tv-projects/promyshlennost/item/313677-sotrudnichestvo-kazakhstana-i-rossii-v-oblasti-mashinostroeniya-promyshlennost">https://24.kz/ru/tv-projects/promyshlennost/item/313677-sotrudnichestvo-kazakhstana-i-rossii-v-oblasti-mashinostroeniya-promyshlennost</a> (Accessed: 31 May 2020)
- 128. Proyekty Kazakhstana i Kitaya [Kazahstan-Chinese projects]. "Sputnik" news agency, Sep. 20, 2019. URL: <a href="https://ru.sputniknews.kz/infographics/20190920/11579476/proekty-kazakhstan-china.html">https://ru.sputniknews.kz/infographics/20190920/11579476/proekty-kazakhstan-china.html</a> (Accessed: 9 February 2020)
- 129. Cherez Kazakhstan iz Kitaya v Yevropu perevezeno za god 19 mln tonn gruzov [19 million tons of cargo were transported from China to Europe via Kazakhstan during the year]. "Khabar" news agency, Apr. 26, 2019. URL: <a href="https://24.kz/ru/news/economyc/item/311177-cherez-kazakhstan-iz-kitaya-v-evropu-perevezeno-za-god-19-mln-tonn-gruzov">https://24.kz/ru/news/economyc/item/311177-cherez-kazakhstan-iz-kitaya-v-evropu-perevezeno-za-god-19-mln-tonn-gruzov</a> (Accessed: 14 February 2020)
- 130. GE Transportation signs over \$900 million locomotive and service agreements. Global Railway Review, Jan. 17, 2018. URL: <a href="https://www.globalrailwayreview.com/news/65539/ge-transportation-locomotive/">https://www.globalrailwayreview.com/news/65539/ge-transportation-locomotive/</a> (Accessed: 9 February 2020)
- 131. Podvodim itogi vizita N. Nazarbayeva v SSHA [Summing up the results of N. Nazarbayev's visit to the US]. "Kaspiyskiy vestnik" Caspian region news portal, Jan. 18, 2018. URL: <a href="http://casp-geo.ru/podvodim-itogi-vizita-nursultana-naz/">http://casp-geo.ru/podvodim-itogi-vizita-nursultana-naz/</a> (Accessed: 1 January 2020)
- 132. Astana and St. Petersburg reached agr't on cooperation. "Strategy2050.kz" Information agency, Nov. 13, 2013. URL: <a href="https://strategy2050.kz/en/news/3179/">https://strategy2050.kz/en/news/3179/</a> (Accessed: 25 May 2020)
- 133. Kazakhstan-China Interregional Cooperation Forum kicks off in Almaty. "Informburo.kz" information and analytical portal, May 15, 2019URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-china-interregional-cooperation-forum-kicks-off-in-almaty\_a3526427">https://www.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-china-interregional-cooperation-forum-kicks-off-in-almaty\_a3526427</a> (Accessed: 8 February 2020)

- 134. Khorgos raiskoe mesto dlia pokupatelei i turistov iz Kitaia i Kazakhstana [Khorgos is a key destination for shoppers and tourists from China and Kazakhstan]. Xinhua News, Jun. 18, 2017.
  - URL: <a href="http://russian.mofcom.gov.cn/article/counselorsreport/201706/20170602595194.shtml">http://russian.mofcom.gov.cn/article/counselorsreport/201706/20170602595194.shtml</a> (Accessed: 11 February 2020)
- 135. Rekordnoe chislo turistov posetilo MTSPS Khorgos [Record number of tourists visited ICBC "Khorgos" in 2018]. "Informburo.kz" information and analytical portal, Jan. 7, 2019. URL: <a href="https://informburo.kz/novosti/rekordnoe-chislo-turistov-posetilo-mcps-horgos-v-2018-godu.html">https://informburo.kz/novosti/rekordnoe-chislo-turistov-posetilo-mcps-horgos-v-2018-godu.html</a> (Accessed: 8 February 2020)
- 136. V ianvare-iiule 2019 goda tovarooborot mezhdu Kitaem i Kazakhstanom uvelichilsia [In Jan.-Jul., the trade turnover between China and Kazakhstan increased by 8.6 percent]. Xinhua News, Sep. 23, 2019. URL: <a href="http://russian.news.cn/2019-09/23/c\_138415033.htm">http://russian.news.cn/2019-09/23/c\_138415033.htm</a> (Accessed: 8 February 2020)
- 137. Import kitayskikh tovarov v Kazakhstan snizilsya na 24% [Imports of Chinese goods to Kazakhstan decreased by 24%]. "Kapital" business information center, Apr. 3, 2020. URL: <a href="https://kapital.kz/economic/85964/import-kitayskikh-tovarov-v-kazakhstan-snizilsya-na-24.html">https://kapital.kz/economic/85964/import-kitayskikh-tovarov-v-kazakhstan-snizilsya-na-24.html</a> (Accessed: 8 May 2020)
- 138. Vostochno-Kazakhstanskaia oblast kak obrazets sotrudnichestva [East Kazakhstan region as a role-model of cooperation]. SILUXGC New silk road observation, Jun. 28, 2019. URL: <a href="http://ru.siluxgc.com/html/R1413/201906/8998008735502706114017.shtml">http://ru.siluxgc.com/html/R1413/201906/8998008735502706114017.shtml</a> (Accessed: 13 March 2020)
- 139. KAZ Minerals namerena poluchit med s proyekta Aktogay II v 2022 godu [Kazakhstan: Kaz Minerals to get copper from Aktogay II in 2022]. "Kapital" business information center, Jan. 23, 2018. URL: <a href="https://kapital.kz/economic/66287/kaz-minerals-namerena-poluchit-med-s-proyekta-aktogay-ii-v-2022-godu.html">https://kapital.kz/economic/66287/kaz-minerals-namerena-poluchit-med-s-proyekta-aktogay-ii-v-2022-godu.html</a> (Accessed: 11 February 2020)
- 140. Uzhe v dekabre na reke Turgusun v raione Altai planiruiut poluchit elektroenergiiu [It is planned to get electricity on the Turgusun river in the Altai region]. "Altaynews.kz" online publication, Nov. 10, 2019. URL: <a href="https://altaynews.kz/ru/uzhe-v-dekabre-na-reke-turgusun-v-rajone-altaj-planiruyut-poluchit-elektroenergiyu-43896.html">https://altaynews.kz/ru/uzhe-v-dekabre-na-reke-turgusun-v-rajone-altaj-planiruyut-poluchit-elektroenergiyu-43896.html</a> (Accessed: 13 February 2020)
- 141. Zaisan. Zhizn prigranichnogo goroda [Zaisan. Life at the border]. Azattyq Radio, Jan. 23, 2020. URL: <a href="https://rus.azattyq.org/a/kazakhstan-vko-zaisan-reportage/30389825.html">https://rus.azattyq.org/a/kazakhstan-vko-zaisan-reportage/30389825.html</a> (Accessed: 11 February 2020)

- 142. 1st China Culture and Tourist Expo kicks off in East Kazakhstan. "Kazinform" international news agency, Feb. 23, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/en/1st-china-culture-and-tourist-expo-kicks-off-in-e-kazakhstan\_a3503098">https://www.inform.kz/en/1st-china-culture-and-tourist-expo-kicks-off-in-e-kazakhstan\_a3503098</a> (Accessed: 14 February 2020)
- 143. Kazakhstan and the USA interested in developing interregional coop. "Kazinform" international news agency, Oct. 22, 2014. URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-and-the-usa-interested-in-developing-interregional-coop\_a2709037">https://www.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-and-the-usa-interested-in-developing-interregional-coop\_a2709037</a> (Accessed: 16 February 2020)
- 144. Amerikanskaia kompaniia AECOM namerena privlech investitsii v proekt Shymkent-Siti [American company AECOM intends to attract investment in the project "Shymkent city"]. "Inbusiness.kz" news agency, Jun. 25, 2016. URL: <a href="https://inbusiness.kz/ru/last/amerikanskaya-kompaniya-aecom-namerena-privlech-investitsii">https://inbusiness.kz/ru/last/amerikanskaya-kompaniya-aecom-namerena-privlech-investitsii</a> (Accessed: 16 February 2020)
- 145. Kazakhstan nameren privlech amerikanskiye investitsii [Kazakhstan intends to attract American investment]. "Kapital" business information center, Jul. 29, 2018. URL: <a href="https://kapital.kz/economic/72393/kazakhstan-nameren-privlech-amerikanskiye-investitsii.html">https://kapital.kz/economic/72393/kazakhstan-nameren-privlech-amerikanskiye-investitsii.html</a> (Accessed: 16 February 2020)
- 146. Tyson Foods looks into processing meat in Kazakhstan. Trend News Agency, Feb. 14, 2020. URL: <a href="https://en.trend.az/business/construction/3191924.html">https://en.trend.az/business/construction/3191924.html</a> (Accessed: 16 February 2020)
- 148. Ministr oborony Kazakhstana vstretilsya s glavoy oboronnogo vedomstva Rossii [The Minister of defence of Kazakhstan met with the defense Ministry of Russia]. "Tengri news" online publication and information portal, Nov. 8, 2018. URL:

- https://tengrinews.kz/kazakhstan\_news/ministr-oboronyi-kazahstana-vstretilsya-glavoy-oboronnogo-357300/ (Accessed: 23 March 2020)
- 149. Zachem Kazakhstan sblizhayetsya s Rossiyey v oblasti vooruzheniy? [Why is Kazakhstan getting closer to Russia in military equipment?]. "Kursiv" business portal, Sep. 8, 2016. URL: <a href="https://kursiv.kz/news/politika/2016-09/zachem-kazakhstan-sblizhaetsya-s-rossiey-v-oblasti-vooruzheniy">https://kursiv.kz/news/politika/2016-09/zachem-kazakhstan-sblizhaetsya-s-rossiey-v-oblasti-vooruzheniy</a> (Accessed: 18 March 2020)
- 150. Eksperty prizyvayut k regionalizatsii strategii bezopasnosti [Experts call for regionalization of security strategy]. Azattyq Radio, Feb. 16, 2015. URL: <a href="https://rus.azattyq.org/a/strategii-bezopasnosti-kazakhstan/26851515.html">https://rus.azattyq.org/a/strategii-bezopasnosti-kazakhstan/26851515.html</a> (Accessed: 23 August 2019)
- 151. Kuda letit "Stepnoy orel"? [Where is the Steppe eagle going?]. "Strategic culture Foundation" electronic edition, Jul. 1, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.fondsk.ru/news/2019/07/01/kuda-letit-stepnoj-orel-48504.html">https://www.fondsk.ru/news/2019/07/01/kuda-letit-stepnoj-orel-48504.html</a> (Accessed: 27 September 2019)
- 152. Ekspertnaya otsenka netraditsionnykh ugroz natsionalnoy bezopasnosti RK [Expert assessment of non-traditional threats to national security of Kazakhstan]. Sayasat: all about Kazakhstan politics, Oct. 7, 2014. URL: <a href="http://sayasat.org/articles/1028-ekspertnaja-ocenka-netradjicionnyh-ugroz-nacionalnoj-bezopasnosti-rk">http://sayasat.org/articles/1028-ekspertnaja-ocenka-netradjicionnyh-ugroz-nacionalnoj-bezopasnosti-rk</a> (Accessed: 23 March 2020)
- 153. Kazakhstan may leave EEU if its interests are infringed: Nazarbayev. "Tengri news" online publication and information portal, Aug. 25, 2014. URL: <a href="https://en.tengrinews.kz/politics\_sub/kazakhstan-may-leave-eeu-if-its-interests-are-infringed-255722/">https://en.tengrinews.kz/politics\_sub/kazakhstan-may-leave-eeu-if-its-interests-are-infringed-255722/</a> (Accessed: 15 September 2019)
- 154. Tem li i tak li vooruzhena kazahstanskaya armiya? Central Asia Monitor, Jul. 22, 2015.

  URL: <a href="https://camonitor.kz/17141-tem-li-i-tak-li-vooruzhena-kazahstanskaya-armiya.html">https://camonitor.kz/17141-tem-li-i-tak-li-vooruzhena-kazahstanskaya-armiya.html</a>
  (Accessed: 27 February 2020)
- 155. Kazakhstan planiruyet perevooruzhitsya na 70% [Kazakhstan plans to rearm by 70%]. National news service, May 13, 2016. URL: <a href="https://nsn.fm/hots/hots-kazakhstan-planiruet-perevooruzhit-vooruzhennye-sily-na-70">https://nsn.fm/hots/hots-kazakhstan-planiruet-perevooruzhit-vooruzhennye-sily-na-70</a> (Accessed: 9 April 2020)
- 156. Itogi KADEX-2014 [KADEX-2014 results]. Military-industrial complex news portal "VPK News", May 28, 2014.
  - URL: <a href="https://vpk.name/news/115898\_kadex\_2014\_itogi\_i\_perspektivy.html">https://vpk.name/news/115898\_kadex\_2014\_itogi\_i\_perspektivy.html</a> (Accessed: 11 March 2020)

- 157. Kadex 2018 kratkiye itogi [Kadex 2018 a brief summary]. "Arsenal Otechestva" information and analytical magazine, May 28, 2018. URL: <a href="https://arsenal-otechestva.ru/new/1056-kadex-2018-kratkie-itogi">https://arsenal-otechestva.ru/new/1056-kadex-2018-kratkie-itogi</a> (Accessed: 11 March 2020)
- 158. Kazakhstan, China Strengthen Defence Cooperation. The Astana Times News, Oct. 16, 2015. URL: <a href="https://astanatimes.com/2015/10/kazakhstan-china-strengthen-defence-cooperation/">https://astanatimes.com/2015/10/kazakhstan-china-strengthen-defence-cooperation/</a> (Accessed: 22 March 2020)
- 159. Kazakhstan zakupayet kitayskiye samolety [Kazakhstan buys Chinese aircrafts]. Belarus Security blog, Jan. 31, 2018. URL: <a href="https://bsblog.info/kazaxstan-zakupaet-kitajskie-samolety/">https://bsblog.info/kazaxstan-zakupaet-kitajskie-samolety/</a> (Accessed: 26 April 2020)
- 160. Russia has released footage of its new "Hunter" stealth attack drone. CNN World news, Aug. 7, 2019. URL: <a href="https://edition.cnn.com/2019/08/08/europe/russia-hunter-drone-scli-intl/index.html">https://edition.cnn.com/2019/08/08/europe/russia-hunter-drone-scli-intl/index.html</a> (Accessed: 25 April 2020)
- 161. Kosmicheskiy put Kazakhstana: cherez ternii k zvezdam [Kazakhstan's space path: through thorns to the stars]. "Kazinform" international news agency, Feb. 25, 2018. URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/ru/kosmicheskiy-put-kazahstana-cherez-ternii-k-zvezdam\_a3165631">https://www.inform.kz/ru/kosmicheskiy-put-kazahstana-cherez-ternii-k-zvezdam\_a3165631</a> (Accessed: 26 April 2020)
- 162. T. Musabayev rasskazal o planakh i perspektivakh razvitiya kosmicheskoy otrasli RK [T. Musabayev about plans and prospects for the development of space industry]. "Kapital" business information center, Oct. 10, 2015. URL: <a href="https://kapital.kz/economic/44972/talgat-musabayev-rasskazal-o-perspektivakh-baykonura.html">https://kapital.kz/economic/44972/talgat-musabayev-rasskazal-o-perspektivakh-baykonura.html</a> (Accessed: 29 April 2020)
- 163. Dorozhnaya karta po sovmestnomu ispolzovaniyu kompleksa "Baykonur" na 2014-2016 gody vypolnena [The road map for the joint use of the Baikonur complex for 2014-2016 has been completed]. "Kazinform" international news agency, Jan. 25, 2017. URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/ru/dorozhnaya-karta-po-sovmestnomu-ispol-zovaniyu-kompleksa-baykonur-na-2014-2016-gody-vypolnena\_a2992709">https://www.inform.kz/ru/dorozhnaya-karta-po-sovmestnomu-ispol-zovaniyu-kompleksa-baykonur-na-2014-2016-gody-vypolnena\_a2992709</a> (Accessed: 1 May 2020)
- 164. Kazakhstan i Rossiya obsuzhdayut vykhod goroda Baykonyra iz arendy [Kazakhstan and Russia are discussing the exit of the city of Baikonur from the lease]. "Sputnik" news agency, Apr. 11, 2019. URL: <a href="https://ru.sputniknews.kz/politics/20190411/9789932/kazakhstan-russia-baikonyr-gorod-arenda-vyvod.html">https://ru.sputniknews.kz/politics/20190411/9789932/kazakhstan-russia-baikonyr-gorod-arenda-vyvod.html</a> (Accessed: 1 May 2020)
- 165. Kazakhstan otberet u Rossii chast Baykonura [Kazakhstan will take back part of Baikonur from Russia]. "Lenta.ru" online news publication, Dec. 12, 2019. URL: <a href="https://lenta.ru/news/2019/12/12/baikonur/">https://lenta.ru/news/2019/12/12/baikonur/</a> (Accessed: )

- 166. Kazakhstan i Kitay namereny sovmestno razrabotat sputnik svyazi [Kazakhstan and China intend to jointly develop a communications satellite]. "Kapital" business information center, Dec. 4, 2015. URL: <a href="https://kapital.kz/economic/46008/kazakhstan-i-kitay-namereny-sovmestno-razrabotat-sputnik-svyazi.html">https://kapital.kz/economic/46008/kazakhstan-i-kitay-namereny-sovmestno-razrabotat-sputnik-svyazi.html</a> (Accessed: 20 April 2020)
- 167. Kazakhstan and China intend to cooperate in the field of space technologies. "Kazinform" international news agency, Sep. 10, 2016. URL: <a href="http://lenta.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-china-to-cooperate-in-the-sphere-of-space-technologies">http://lenta.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-china-to-cooperate-in-the-sphere-of-space-technologies</a> a2935481 (Accessed: 18 April 2020)
- 168. Kazcosmos delegation visited space infrastructure facilities of China. "Kazinform" international news agency, May 30, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/en/kazcosmos-delegation-visited-space-infrastructure-facilities-of-china\_a3532424">https://www.inform.kz/en/kazcosmos-delegation-visited-space-infrastructure-facilities-of-china\_a3532424</a> (Accessed: 20 April 2020)
- 169. Ancient Geoglyphs Discovered in Kazakhstan. National Geographic Education Blog, Feb. 11, 2015. URL: <a href="https://blog.education.nationalgeographic.org/2015/11/02/ancient-geoglyphs-discovered-in-kazakhstan/">https://blog.education.nationalgeographic.org/2015/11/02/ancient-geoglyphs-discovered-in-kazakhstan/</a> (Accessed: 22 March 2020)
- 170. Kazakhstan, U.S. vow to step up space cooperation. "Kazinform" international news agency, Jan. 18, 2018. URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-u-s-vow-to-step-up-space-cooperation\_a3125396">https://www.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-u-s-vow-to-step-up-space-cooperation\_a3125396</a> (Accessed: 18 March 2020)
- 171. Tokayev obeshchayet provesti reformy v sfere obrazovaniya [Tokayev promises to carry out reforms in education]. "Kursiv" business portal, Jul. 4, 2019. URL: <a href="https://kursiv.kz/news/obrazovanie/2019-07/tokaev-obeschaet-provesti-reformy-v-sfere-obrazovaniya">https://kursiv.kz/news/obrazovanie/2019-07/tokaev-obeschaet-provesti-reformy-v-sfere-obrazovaniya</a> (Accessed: 18 April 2020)
- 172. International Forums of Russian-Kazakh Rectors. Lomonosov Moscow State University, Nov. 11, 2017. URL: <a href="https://www.msu.ru/news/forum-rektorov-rossii-i-kazakhstana.html">https://www.msu.ru/news/forum-rektorov-rossii-i-kazakhstana.html</a> (Accessed: 8 April 2020)
- 173. Otkrytiye rossiysko-kazakhstanskikh shkol i universitetov obsudili Putin i Tokayev [Putin and Tokayev discussed the opening of Russian-Kazakh schools and universities]. "Sputnik" news agency, Nov. 7, 2019.
  - URL: <a href="https://ru.sputniknews.kz/education/20191107/11978308/russia-kazakhstan-shkoly-putin-tokaev.html">https://ru.sputniknews.kz/education/20191107/11978308/russia-kazakhstan-shkoly-putin-tokaev.html</a> (Accessed: 18 April 2020)
- 174. Nazarbayev Intellectual School may appear in Russia. "Kazinform" international news agency, Nov. 7, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/en/nazarbayev-intellectual-school-may-appear-in-russia\_a3583313">https://www.inform.kz/en/nazarbayev-intellectual-school-may-appear-in-russia\_a3583313</a> (Accessed: 18 April 2020)

- 175. Pervoe zasedanie Sovmestnoi rabochei gruppy istorikov Rossii i Kazahstana [First meeting of the Joint working group of historians of Russia and Kazakhstan]. IWH RAS, Mar. 3, 2018. URL: <a href="http://igh.ru/news/pervoe-zasedanie-sovmestnoi-rabochei-gruppy-istorikov-rossii-i-kazahstana?locale=ru">http://igh.ru/news/pervoe-zasedanie-sovmestnoi-rabochei-gruppy-istorikov-rossii-i-kazahstana?locale=ru</a> (Accessed: 20 April 2020)
- 176. 19 kitayskikh i kazakhstanskikh vuzov zaklyuchili soglasheniya o sotrudnichestve [19 Chinese and Kazakh universities have signed cooperation agreements]. People's Daily Online, Aug. 1, 2018. URL: <a href="http://russian.people.com.cn/n3/2018/0801/c31517-9486878.html">http://russian.people.com.cn/n3/2018/0801/c31517-9486878.html</a> (Accessed: 8 April 2020)
- 177. Kazakhstan i Kitay narashchivayut sotrudnichestvo v sfere obrazovaniya i nauki [Interview with the Director of the Confucius Institute of ENU S. Koshanova: Kazakhstan and China increase cooperation in education and science]. "Kazinform" international news agency, Jul. 18, 2018. URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/ru/kazahstan-i-kitay-naraschivayut-sotrudnichestvo-v-sfere-obrazovaniya-i-nauki\_a3324011">https://www.inform.kz/ru/kazahstan-i-kitay-naraschivayut-sotrudnichestvo-v-sfere-obrazovaniya-i-nauki\_a3324011</a> (Accessed: 18 April 2020)
- 178. Russia proposed Kazakhstan to jointly transit to digital economy. "Strategy2050.kz" Information agency, Sep. 14, 2017. URL: <a href="https://strategy2050.kz/en/news/48093/big/">https://strategy2050.kz/en/news/48093/big/</a> (Accessed: 2 May 2020)
- 179. V Sintszyane poyavilis pervyye eksperimentalnyye zony transgranichnoy elektronnoy kommertsii [The first experimental zones of cross-border e-Commerce appeared in Xinjiang]. SILUXGC New silk road observation, Mar. 12, 2019. URL: <a href="http://ru.siluxgc.com/html/R1683/201903/22100552389616.shtml">http://ru.siluxgc.com/html/R1683/201903/22100552389616.shtml</a> (Accessed: 2 May 2020)
- 180. Kazakhstan to test 5G in pilot mode this year Abayev. "Kazinform" international news agency, Feb. 20, 2019. URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-to-test-5g-in-pilot-mode-this-year-abayev\_a3500121">https://www.inform.kz/en/kazakhstan-to-test-5g-in-pilot-mode-this-year-abayev\_a3500121</a> (Accessed: 6 May 2020)
- 181. Kazakhstan seeks high-tech, agricultural cooperation with China, says Tokayev during Beijing Business Council meeting. The Astana Times News, Sep. 13, 2019. URL: <a href="https://astanatimes.com/2019/09/kazakhstan-seeks-high-tech-agricultural-cooperation-with-china-says-tokayev-during-beijing-business-council-meeting/">https://astanatimes.com/2019/09/kazakhstan-seeks-high-tech-agricultural-cooperation-with-china-says-tokayev-during-beijing-business-council-meeting/</a> (Accessed: 6 May 2020)
- 182. Tokayev poruchil perenyat u Kitaya opyt tsifrovizatsii grazhdan [Tokayev instructed to learn China's experience in digitization of civil sectors]. "Kursiv" business portal, Oct. 8, 2019. URL: <a href="https://kursiv.kz/news/obschestvo/2019-10/tokaev-poruchil-perenyat-u-kitaya-opyt-cifrovizacii-grazhdan">https://kursiv.kz/news/obschestvo/2019-10/tokaev-poruchil-perenyat-u-kitaya-opyt-cifrovizacii-grazhdan</a> (Accessed: 6 May 2020)
- 183. On first visit to Kazakhstan, GE Digital CEO says digital transformation transforms global industry (lecture of CEO of GE Digital Bill Ruh at the NU). The Astana Times News, Nov. 5,

- 2017. URL: <a href="https://astanatimes.com/2017/11/on-first-visit-to-kazakhstan-ge-digital-ceo-says-digital-transformation-transforms-global-industry/">https://astanatimes.com/2017/11/on-first-visit-to-kazakhstan-ge-digital-ceo-says-digital-transformation-transforms-global-industry/</a> (Accessed: 13 May 2020)
- 184. GE Healthcare to take part in Kazakh Ministry's digitalization projects. "Kazinform" international news agency, Nov. 15, 2018. URL: <a href="https://www.inform.kz/en/ge-healthcare-to-take-part-in-kazakh-ministry-s-digitalization-projects\_a3456715">https://www.inform.kz/en/ge-healthcare-to-take-part-in-kazakh-ministry-s-digitalization-projects\_a3456715</a> (Accessed: 11 May 2020)
- 185. Days of Chinese Culture will be held in Kazakhstan. Silkroad News, Sep. 23, 2014. URL: <a href="http://silkroadnews.org/en/news/days-of-chinese-culture-will-be-held-in-kazakhstan-on-september-25-28">http://silkroadnews.org/en/news/days-of-chinese-culture-will-be-held-in-kazakhstan-on-september-25-28</a> (Accessed: 23 May 2020)
- 186. Kazakhstan i Rossiya podpisali programmu sotrudnichestva v oblasti kultury na 2017-2019 [Kazakhstan and Russia signed a cooperation programme in culture for 2017-2019]. Forbes Kazakhstan, Sep. 6, 2016. URL: <a href="https://forbes.kz/news/2016/09/06/newsid\_120197">https://forbes.kz/news/2016/09/06/newsid\_120197</a> (Accessed: 30 April 2020)
- 187. "Ayka" shortlisted for Oscar. "Kazinform" international news agency, Dec. 18, 2018. URL: <a href="http://lenta.inform.kz/ru/ayka-shortlisted-for-oscar\_a3478767">http://lenta.inform.kz/ru/ayka-shortlisted-for-oscar\_a3478767</a> (Accessed: 15 May 2020)
- 188. Kazakh-Chinese film "the Composer" receives four awards in LA. "Strategy2050.kz" Information agency, Nov. 11, 2019. URL: <a href="https://strategy2050.kz/en/news/kazakh-chinese-film-the-composer-receives-four-awards-in-los-angeles-/">https://strategy2050.kz/en/news/kazakh-chinese-film-the-composer-receives-four-awards-in-los-angeles-/</a> (Accessed: 15 May 2020)
- 189. Almaty-based Nomad Stunts founder achieves long-held wish to work with Disney. The Astana Times News, Jun. 23, 2019. URL: <a href="https://astanatimes.com/2019/07/almaty-based-nomad-stunts-founder-achieves-long-held-wish-to-work-with-disney/">https://astanatimes.com/2019/07/almaty-based-nomad-stunts-founder-achieves-long-held-wish-to-work-with-disney/</a>;

  <a href="https://nomadstunts.com/">https://nomadstunts.com/</a> (Accessed: 20 May 2020)
- 190. Kitayskiy Shelkovyy put i "Nurly zhol" poydut odnoy dorogoy [Interview with M. Shibutov, D. Satpayev: Chinese Silk Road and Nurly Zhol will go the same way]. Forbes Kazakhstan, May 2015.
  URL:<a href="https://forbes.kz/finances/integration/kitayskiy shelkovyiy put i nurlyi jol poydut odnoy dorogoy/">https://forbes.kz/finances/integration/kitayskiy shelkovyiy put i nurlyi jol poydut odnoy dorogoy/</a> (Accessed: 4 October 2019)
- 191. Kto v konechnom itoge dolzhen zanimatsia gazifikatsiei VKO? [Interview with A. Kulzhanov, first Deputy General Director Tarbagatai Munai: Who should ultimately be engaged in gasification of East Kazakhstan region?]. Forbes Kazakhstan, Feb. 10, 2020. URL: <a href="https://forbes.kz//process/energetics/strategicheskiy\_gaz/?">https://forbes.kz//process/energetics/strategicheskiy\_gaz/?</a> (Accessed: 13 February 2020)
- 192. Ot mechty do dostizheniia tseli [Interview with Zh. Zhnaykulov, Director of Global Chemicals Industries, Karazhal Operating]. Forbes Kazakhstan, Oct. 7, 2015. URL:

https://forbes.kz//process/businessmen/jumabek\_janyikulov\_ot\_mechtyi\_do\_dostijeniya\_tseli
//? (Accessed: 9 February 2020)

- 193. Skolko Kazakhstan tratit na Bolashakerov i deystvitelno li oni tsennyye rabotniki. (Interview with the President JSC "Center for International Programs": How much Kazakhstan spends on the Bolashak students?). "Tengri news" online publication and information portal, Apr. 2, 2019. URL: <a href="https://tengrinews.kz/article/skolko-kazahstan-tratit-bolashakerov-deystvitelno-oni-1110/">https://tengrinews.kz/article/skolko-kazahstan-tratit-bolashakerov-deystvitelno-oni-1110/</a> (Accessed: 11 May 2020)
- 194. MON planiruyet vdvoye uvelichit kolichestvo obuchayushchikhsya za rubezhom kazakhstantsev v blizhayshiye 10 let [Interview with the President JSC "Center for International Programs": MES plans to double the number of Kazakhstani students studying abroad]. "Kursiv" business portal, Jan. 4, 2019.

URL: <a href="https://kursiv.kz/news/obrazovanie/2019-01/mon-planiruet-vdvoe-uvelichit-kolichestvo-obuchayuschikhsya-za-rubezhom">https://kursiv.kz/news/obrazovanie/2019-01/mon-planiruet-vdvoe-uvelichit-kolichestvo-obuchayuschikhsya-za-rubezhom</a> (Accessed: 15 May 2020)

#### **LITERATURE**

### **Books and Scientific Monographs**

- Griffiths M. International Relations Theory for the Twenty-First Century. New York, 2007.
   p.184
- Kolomeytseva A. A. Problemy i perspektivy vzaimootnosheniy Rossii i stran SNG na rynke gaza [Problems and prospects of relations between Russia and the CIS countries in the gas market]. Moscow, Nauchnaya biblioteka, 2017. p. 246
- 3. Aleksandrova D. A., Andreeva E. S., Yermakova S. M., Ivanova V. A., Ippolitova I. V., Makarevskiy M. N., Nemenskyi O. B., Popova D. S., Petrovskyi O. V., Tacica K. I., Shevchenko A. M., NATO v politike postsovetskikh gosudarstv posle vossoyedineniya Kryma s Rossiyey [NATO in the politics of post-Soviet States after the reunification of Crimea with Russia]. Moscow, Russian Institute for Strategic Studies (RISS), Center for CIS countries studies, 2018. p. 90
- 4. Nazarbayev N. A. Gasyrlar togysynda [The Critical Decade]. Almaty, Atamura, 2003. p. 256
- 5. Syroezhkin K. Kazakhstan-Kitay: ot prigranichnoy torgovli k strategicheskomu partnerstvu [Kazakhstan-China: from cross-border trade to strategic partnership]. Almaty, KazISS, Monography in 3 books. Book 3. Collection of documents. 2010. p. 524

### Dissertations and abstracts

6. Tokayev T. K.-J. Strategiya Respubliki Kazakhstan v otnoshenii Zapada: natsionalnye interesy, prioritety, napravleniya [Strategy of the Republic of Kazakhstan to the West: national interests, priorities, approaches]. Ph.D. thesis: 23.00.04. Diplomatic Academy of MFA of the Russian Federation, Moscow, 2009, p. 216.

### Articles

- 7. Abdakimova D. A. Voprosy sootnosheniya vneshney politiki i natsionalnoy bezopasnosti Respubliki Kazakhstan [Correlation issues of foreign policy and national security of the Republic of Kazakhstan]. Materials of the XVI International scientific and practical conference "Tatishchev readings: actual problems of science and practice", 2019, vol. 2. pp. 29-34
- 8. Aymurzinov M. S., Baimukhamedov M. F., Baimukhamedova G. S. Technological modernization of the economy of the country based on the implementation of state program "digital Kazakhstan". Agrarian Bulletin of the Urals, 2019, №2 (181). pp. 42-45
- 9. Baizakova Zh., McDermott R. Threat Perception in Central Asia in Response to Russia—Ukraine: Kazakhstan Will Not Be Next. NATO Defense College`s Research Paper, 2015, №119. pp. 1-16
- 10. Burkov V. G., Meshcheryakov K. Y., Novikova I. N. Policy of Russia in the former Soviet Union after return of the Crimea: challenges and priorities. Journal "Administrative Consulting", 2015, №11. pp. 71-79
- 11. Dyussebayev D., Kukeyeva F. Belt and road initiative for Kazakhstan: Opportunities and risks. Silk Road to Belt Road: reinventing the past and shaping the future, Springer Singapore, 2018. pp. 296-305
- 12. Engels S. Military Professionalization Programs in Kazakhstan and the U.S.: How to Implement and What Will We Gain? Connections: The Quarterly Journal, 2017, No. 2. pp. 91-104
- 13. Harlanov A. S. Cooperation of Russia and Kazakhstan in the space and high technologies. "Economics. Management. Law" Series, 2019, No. 2. pp. 59-68
- 14. Idrisov M. M. The program for social-innovation development of the Republic of Kazakhstan in 2015-2019. Kazakhstan Institute of the Industry Development, 2015, 4(5). pp. 253-272
- 15. Ionova E. Kazakhstan and the Ukrainian crisis. Russia and New States of Eurasia, 2014, No 2. pp. 43-53

- 16. Kukeyeva F., Raimova G. Foreign Policy Concept of the Republic of Kazakhstan: Cooperation with the U.S. KazNU Bulletin, International relations and international law series, 2014, №2(66). pp. 28-33
- 17. Kuzembayeva A. B. Specific issues in Kazakhstan U.S. relations at the present stage. KazNU Bulletin, 2015, №1(69). pp. 151-155
- 18. Malysheva D. B. Post-Soviet states of Central Asia in China's policies. Mirovaya ekonomika i mezhdunarodnye otnosheniya, 2019, vol. 63, No. 5. pp. 101-108
- 19. Meshcheryakov K. Y. The Russian-Kazakh relations during the "Ukrainian crisis", Klio, 2016, №5. pp. 118-134
- 20. Mukhametkhanuly N. China's Concept of "Win-Win Cooperation" find the New Stage of Cooperation between China and Kazakhstan, China, 2018. pp. 512-521
- 21. Rakhmanova G. B. Project "Western Europe and Western China" in the industrial development of Kazakhstan. Bulletin KazUIR&WL "International relations and Regional studies", 2013, №1-2 (11-12). pp. 113-120
- 22. Robert S. R. The Ukraine Conflict and the Future of Kazakhstan's Multi-Vector Foreign Policy. PONARS Eurasia Policy Memo, 2015, No. 388. pp. 1-6
- 23. Sadovskaya E. Y. Kiaytskaya migratsiya v Kazakhstane [Chinese migration in Kazakhstan]. Demaskop Weekly, 2015, №629-630. pp. 1-27
- 24. Suleimenova G. S. Kazakhstan-China transit. 2018. pp.77-80 URL: http://elib.bsu.by/bitstream/123456789/195606/1/%D0%A1%D1%83%D0%BB%D0%B5% D0%B9%D0%BC%D0%B5%D0%BD%D0%BE%D0%B2%D0%B0\_%D0%9A%D0%90% D0%97%D0%90%D0%A5%D0%A1%D0%A2%D0%90%D0%9D-%D0%9A%D0%98%D 0%A2%D0%90%D0%99-%D0%A2%D0%A0%D0%90%D0%9D%D0%97%D0%98%D0 %A2.pdf (Accessed: 18 December 2019)
- 25. Syroezhkin K. Problems of Modern Kazakh-Chinese Relations. Russia and New States of Eurasia, 2019, No I (XLII). pp. 21-36
- 26. Tian E. Vzaimootnosheniya Kitayskoy Narodnoy Respubliki i Respubliki Kazakhstan na primere sotrudnichestva v sfere obrazovaniya [Relations between China and Kazakhstan on the example of cooperation in education]. 2018 − №4. pp. 8-17. URL: https://nbpublish.com/library\_read\_article.php?id=27722 (Accessed: 2 April 2020)
- 27. Troitskiy E. F. Kazakhstansko-amerikanskiye otnosheniya i "dilemma mnogovektornosti" [Kazakh-American relations and the "multi-vector dilemma"]. Center for Eurasian Studies at TSU, 2018, Expert comment No.1. pp. 1-4

28. Yergaliyeva K., Zhanbulatova R. Kazakhstan-Russia cross-border cooperation in the context of the common economic space. Bulletin D'Eurotalent-fidjip, 2019, №3. pp.13-21

### Analytical Reports

- 29. Ageleuov G. Kitay-Kazakhstan: Perspektivy vzaimodeystviya [China-Kazakhstan: Prospects for cooperation]. News Agency "Fergana", May 25, 2017. URL: https://www.fergananews.com/articles/9422 (Accessed: 11 October 2019)
- 30. Aliyev N. U.S.-Kazakhstan Transit Agreement Faces Challenges from Russia. The Central Asia-Caucasus Analyst, September 20, 2018. URL: https://www.cacianalyst.org/publications/analytical-articles/item/13534-us-kazakhstan-transit-agreement-faces-challenges-from-russia.html (Accessed: 18 December 2019)
- 31. Alekseeva N. "De-fakto soglasheniye uzhe deystvuyet": kak soobshcheniya o "bazakh SSHA v Kazakhstane" povliyayut na peregovory o statuse Kaspiya ["De facto agreement already in effect": how reports of "US bases in Kazakhstan" will affect negotiations on the Caspian sea status]. New channel "RT", April 30, 2018. URL: https://russian.rt.com/world/article/508306-kaspii-kazakhstan-nato-tranzit (Accessed: 11 October 2019)
- 32. Barnes H. Uranovaya igra Kazakhstana: mezhdu Rossiyey, Kitayem i Zapadom [Uranian game of Kazakhstan: between Russia, Chuins and West]. BBC Russian service, December 18, 2017. URL: https://www.bbc.com/russian/features-42315870 (Accessed: 3 January 2020)
- 33. Belova M. Atasu-Alashankou: istoriya reeksporta rossiyskoy nefti [Atasu-Alashankou: history of Russian oil re-export]. Business newspaper "RBK TEK 360", July 2014. URL: http://tek360.rbc.ru/articles/4/ (Accessed: 11 October 2019)
- 34. Cornell S.E., Kukeyeva F., Nursha A. Starr S.F., Sultanov B., Wimbush S.E. Looking Forward: Kazakhstan and the U.S. Singapore, Central Asia-Caucasus Institute & Silk Road Studies Program, 2014. p. 54
- 35. Kashin V. U Kitaya poyavyatsya vozmozhnosti po obespecheniyu bezopasnosti svoikh obyektov vdol "shelkovogo puti" [China get an opportunity to ensure the security of its facilities along the Silk Road]. Information-analytical publication "Eurasia. Expert", March 4, 2018. URL: https://eurasia.expert/kitaya-bezopasnosti-obektov-shelkovogo-puti-/ (Accessed: 16 February 2020)
- 36. http://pcsu.ru/%D0%B2%D1%82%D0%BE-%D0%B8-%D0%B5%D0%B0%D1%8D%D1
  %81-%D1%81%D0%B5%D1%80%D1%8C%D0%B5%D0%B7%D0%BD%D1%8B%D1%
  85-%D0%BF%D1%80%D0%BE%D1%82%D0%B8%D0%B2%D0%BE%D1%80%D0%B

- 5%D1%87%D0%B8%D0%B9-%D0%B2%D0%BE%D0%B7 (Accessed: 18 September 2019)
- 37. Karazhanov Z. "KADEX 2016": glavnaya skhvatka za tsentralnoaziatskiy rynok vooruzheniy yeshche vperedi [KADEX 2016: the main battle for the Central Asian arms market is still ahead]. Expert information platform "Ritm Eurasia", June 10, 2016. URL: https://www.ritmeurasia.org/news--2016-06-10--kadex-2016-glavnaja-shvatka-za-centralnoaziatskij-rynok-vooruzhenij-esche-vperedi-24051 (Accessed: 3 April 2020)
- 38. Kaukenov A. Vzaimootnosheniya Kitaya i Kazakhstana v novykh geopoliticheskikh usloviyakh. [Relations between China and Kazakhstan in new geopolitical conditions]. Central Asian Bureau for Analytical Reporting, February 18, 2015 URL: https://cabar.asia/ru/adil-kaukenov-vzaimootnosheniya-kitaya-i-kazakhstana-v-novykh-geopoliticheskikh-usloviyakh/ (Accessed: 15 August 2019)
- 39. Li Xin. Chinese perspective on the creation of a Eurasian Economic space. Valdai Discussion Club Report. Moscow, 2016. p. 22
- 40. Lillis J. Kazakhstan: Po lezviyu britvy mezhdu Rossiyey i Zapadom (interview with R. Isaacs) [Kazakhstan: on the edge between Russia and the West]. Information and analytical platform "Eurasianet", December 11, 2014. URL: https://russian.eurasianet.org/node/61571 (Accessed: 18 August 2019)
- 41. Shibutov M. Eksport Kazakhstana: obzor dinamiki [Export of Kazakhstan: overview of dynamics]. Information agency "Regnum", August 27, 2019. URL: <a href="https://regnum.ru/news/2700790.html">https://regnum.ru/news/2700790.html</a> (Accessed: 11 October 2019)
- 42. Shibutov M. Uranovaya zavisimost KNR ot Kazakhstana: zachem Kitayu stolko urana? [China's uranium dependence on Kazakhstan: why does China need so much uranium?] Information agency "Regnum", August 11, 2017. URL: https://regnum.ru/news/2309464.html (Accessed: 15 December 2019)
- 43. Shibutov M. Provokatsiya o kazakhstanskikh i kirgizstanskikh mirotvortsakh v Sirii: dlya chego? [Provocation on Kazakhstan and the Kyrgyz peacekeepers in Syria: why?]. Information agency "Regnum", June 26, 2017.
  - URL: https://regnum.ru/news/polit/2292829.html?utm\_medium=source&utm\_source=rnews (Accessed: 3 March 2020)
- 44. Syroezhkin K. Kazakhstan i Kitay: analiz poslednikh dogovorennostey [Kazakhstan and China: analysis of recent agreements]. November 4, 2016. URL: <a href="http://www.ca-portal.ru/article:30965">http://www.ca-portal.ru/article:30965</a> (Accessed: 18 December 2019)

- 45. Zelenina A. Bitva za Shelkovyy put: Kazakhstan pereformatiruyet kartu logistiki Yevrazii [Battle for the silk road: Kazakhstan reformats the logistics map of Eurasia]. Information agency "Regnum", November 7, 2015. URL: https://regnum.ru/news/2006996.html (Accessed: 15 December 2019)
- 46. Zhusupova A. Programmy pereseleniya "Yug-Sever": vostrebovannost i uspeshnost [Resettlement programme "South-North": the demand and success]. 2019. URL: https://ekonomist.kz/zhussupova/programy-pereseleniya-ug-sever-vostrebovannost// (Accessed: 25 March 2020)

### **APPENDIX**

Appendix I.

a) Kazakhstan's trade turnover with superpowers and their share in total "all commodities" from\to Kazakhstan (\$ billion), 2014-2019

	Country	Russia	China	USA		Kazakhstan
2014		20.1	17	2.4		120.8
	Export	6.3 (8%)	9.7 (12.3%)	412 million (0.518%)		79.5
	Import	13.8 (39%)	7.3 (17.8%)	1.9 (4.8%)		41.3
		15.3	10.4	1.9		76.5
2015	Export	4.5 (9.8%)	5.4 (11.9%)	434 million (0.945%)		46
(4	Import	10.8 (34%)	5 (16.6%)	1.4 (4.85%)	<b> </b>	30.6
		12.6	7.8	1.8	OVE	62.1
2016	Export	3.5 (9.5%)	4.2 (11.4%)	617 million (1.68%)		36.7
2	Import	9.1 (36%)	3.6 (14.5%)	1.2 (5.07%)	FOREIGN TRADE TURNOVER	25.4
		16.3	10.3	1.6	RAL	77.6
2017	Export	4.6 (9.56%)	5.7 (11.9%)	390 million (0.804%)		48.3
(4	Import	11.7 (39%)	4.6 (15.8%)	1.2 (4.23%)	REIC	29.3
		18.4	11.6	2.2	F0]	93.5
2018	Export	5.2 (8.64%)	6.3 (10.3%)	955 million (1.56%)		61
(4	Import	13.2 (39%)	5.3 (15.9%)	1.2 (3.79%)		32.5
		19.6	14.3	2.2		97.49
2019	Export	5.6 (9.7%)	7.8 (13.5%)	895 million (1.55%)		59
2	Import	14 (36%)	6.5 (17.1%)	1.3 (3.53%)		38.49
	I			L 	<del>_</del>	<del></del>

Source: World Bank (World Integrated Trade Solution) & Trend Economy

## b) Kazakhstan's GDP Growth \$ billion and Real GDP in %, 2014-2019 (provided 2013's results for comparison pre-2014 period)

Year	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019
Billion USD	236.63	221.42	184.39	137.28	162.89	170.54	168.5
%	6	4.2	1.2	1.1	4.1	4.1	4.5

**Source:** World Economic Outlook & Trading Economics | World Bank (table elaborated by the author)

## c) Kazakhstan FDI flows from great powers 2014-2019 (\$ billion)

Year	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019 (Q2)	Total
Russia	1.6	0.515	-	1.2	1.4	0.632	5.347
China	1.8	0.83	0.98	1	1.4	0.922	6.932
USA	4.1	2.8	3.4	3.6	5.3	2.98	21.98

**Source:** National Bank RK & inBusiness.kz (table elaborated by the author)

## Appendix II.

# a) Amount of military equipment deliveries from the powers to Kazakhstan (\$ million\billion), 2014-2019.

<b>Year\Country</b>	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	Total
Russia	28	441	198	163	267	305	1381
USA	3	-	3	3	-	-	9
China	-	-	9	-	23	-	32
Total	31	441	210	166	290	305	1422

**Source:** SIPRI Arms Transfers Database (table elaborated by the author)

### b) Military Professionalization of Kazakhstani students

Year	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019
Students	275	17	537	350	323	121
U.S. financial support	\$2,537,579	\$609,213	\$1,396,648	\$1,322,310	\$2,474,431	\$1,981,402

Source: U.S. annual Military Training Report (table elaborated by the author)