

## SCIENTIFIC ADVISOR'S REFERENCE

<b>Program:</b>	Master in Corporate Finance
<b>Student:</b>	Yuliya Karpeeva
<b>Title of thesis:</b>	Multiple large shareholders' relations with the largest shareholder and company's value: a study of Russian public companies

**Justification of the topic choice. Accuracy in defining the aim and objectives of the thesis.** Justification of the topic choice; accuracy in defining the aim and tasks of the thesis; originality of the topic and the extent to which it was covered; alignment of the thesis' topic, aim and objectives.

Ownership structure in its relationship with companies' financial performance is well studied topic. Less research is devoted to the issue of the relationship between shareholders relations and performance. In emerging markets with insider-oriented corporate governance model, highly concentrated ownership and weak shareholders protection relations between large owners could significantly impact company's performance and efficiency. There are only few studies on this topic conducted on emerging markets and virtual absence of this type of research for Russian companies. Therefore this thesis could make a considerable contribution to existing studies on the topic of multiple large shareholders effect. The results obtained in the paper could be explained by characteristics of the Russian corporate environment and provide a new understanding of specific institutional context. The research is conducted on the sample of Russian companies with dual-class shares, where the agency conflict among shareholders could be more acute because of the separation of cash flow and control rights. The research bears theoretical contribution and provides managerial implications.

The goal of the research is clearly defined. A number of objectives stated are consistent with the goal. The topic is fully covered by the thesis content.

**Structure and logic of the text flow.** Logic of research; full scope of the thesis; alignment of thesis' structural parts, i.e. theoretical and empirical parts.

The structure is logical and consistent with the structure of academic paper. In the first chapter the author analyzes evolution of corporate ownership structure in Russia, provides the concept of multiple large shareholders and presents a literature review. Description and analysis of ownership structures in Russia is thorough and contains conclusions important for substantiation of further empirical analysis and research results. The analysis presented in this chapter is followed by research hypotheses statement. Chapter 2 contains the description of methodology, data, results of empirical analysis, discussion and conclusions. It is worth noting that Karpeeva Y. provided the algorithm of identification of related shareholders for Russian companies, developed by the author herself. This procedure reflects specifics of the Russian context. It is the author's contribution to existing research.

Theoretical and empirical parts are aligned. Estimation results, theoretical value and managerial implications are substantiated. Conclusions are thorough and reflect the authors view of possible reasons and implications of results obtained.

**Quality of analytical approach and quality of offered solution to the research objectives.** Adequacy of objectives coverage; ability to formulate and convey the research problem; ability to offer options for its solution; application of the latest trends in relevant research are for the set objectives.

In general the quality of analytical approach could be evaluated as high. The quality of the thesis content could be evaluated as high. The thesis definitely has a research nature and contains practical implications. Goal and objectives are covered and fulfilled thoroughly. Research questions and hypotheses are defined properly. The author uses relevant methodology for testing hypotheses. The choice of variables for empirical analysis is well grounded both in the theoretical part and empirical chapter.

Thus objectives, hypotheses, methodology are consistent with those used in academic literature. The literature review and conclusions demonstrate high analytical skills of the author.

**Quality of data gathering and description.** Quality of selecting research tools and methods; data validity adequacy; adequacy of used data for chosen research tools and methods; completeness and relevance of the list of references.

Data are valid and relevant. The methodology, research tools and methods are relevant for this research, processing the data collected.

The list of references is relevant, complete and contains recent reputable papers, as well as it includes fundamental publications in this area of research.

**Scientific aspect of the thesis.** Independent scientific thinking in solving the set problem/objectives; the extent to which the student contributed to selecting and justifying the research model (conceptual and/or quantitative), developing methodology/approach to set objectives.

The thesis is conducted independently. The author demonstrated scientific thinking in solving research problem. The author applied methodology used in existing studies, to meet objectives set. Karpeeva Y. applied her own approach to identification of related large shareholders. Empirical findings are substantiated and have references to existing studies. Empirical analysis provides support to the number of hypotheses stated, research results contribute to existing studies. Given that there are no similar studies for Russian companies, the paper makes a theoretical contribution.

**Practical/applied nature of research.** Extent to which the theoretical background is related to the international or Russian managerial practice; development of applied recommendations; justification and interpretation of the empirical/applied results.

Empirical results are interpreted properly. Practical recommendations are based on empirical findings. The advantage of the research is a thorough discussion part, where the author provides her own view and explanation of results obtained, referring to existing research and practice of corporate governance in Russia

**Quality of thesis layout.** Layout fulfils the requirements of the Regulations for master thesis preparation and defence, correct layout of tables, figures, references.

The layout of the thesis meets the requirements for master thesis preparation.

The Master thesis of Yulia Karpeeva meets the requirements for master thesis of MCF program thus the author of the thesis can be awarded the required degree.

Date

12.06.2015

Scientific Advisor:

Asst. Prof. Yulia Ilina

