

REFeree's REVIEW

Program:	Master in International Business Program
Student:	Karl-Christian Martin Buehler
Title of thesis:	CEO incentive plans improvement in German public companies

Justification of the topic choice. Accuracy in defining the aim and objectives of the thesis. Justification of the topic choice; accuracy in defining the aim and tasks of the thesis; originality of the topic and the extent to which it was covered; alignment of the thesis' topic, aim and objectives.	5			
Structure and logic of the text flow. Logic of research; full scope of the thesis; alignment of thesis' structural parts, i.e. theoretical and empirical parts.	5			
Quality of analytical approach and quality of offered solution to the research objectives. Adequacy of objectives coverage; ability to formulate and convey the research problem; ability to offer options for its solution; application of the latest trends in relevant research are for the set objectives.	5			
Quality of data gathering and description. Quality of selecting research tools and methods; data validity adequacy; adequacy of used data for chosen research tools and methods; completeness and relevance of the list of references.	5			
Scientific aspect of the thesis. Independent scientific thinking in solving the set problem/objectives; the extent to which the student contributed to selecting and justifying the research model (conceptual and/or quantitative), developing methodology/approach to set objectives.	5			
Practical/applied nature of research. Extent to which the theoretical background is related to the international or Russian managerial practice; development of applied recommendations; justification and interpretation of the empirical/applied results.	5			
Quality of thesis layout. Layout fulfils the requirements of the Regulations for master thesis preparation and defense, correct layout of tables, figures, references.		4		

Each item above is evaluated on the following scale, as applicable: 5 = the thesis meets all the requirements, 4 = the thesis meets almost all the requirements, 3 = a lot of the requirements are not met in the thesis, 2 = the thesis does not meet the requirements.

Additional comments:

Justification of the topic choice. Accuracy in defining the aim and objectives of the thesis.

CEO incentive plans improvement as a part of principal-agent problem is front-end direction of international research. The results of such investigations are valuable and could be implemented for majority of public companies.

The main goal of the research was to analyze and improve mechanism of CEO incentive plans in the German public companies by using appropriate game theoretical modeling. Research topic is clearly formulated and justified both from academic and practical point of view. The aim and objectives of research are clearly settled and fit well the logic of the study. The goal and research objectives are good aligned.

Structure and logic of the text flow.

The structure of the thesis is clear cut and fully reflects logic of research. It is easy to read and follow the logic of the study. All required basic notions, concept and terms are introduced in a consecutive manner with substantial number of references on relevant sources. For the figure 2 in the second chapter it is recommended to give a reference in the text.

Quality of analytical approach and quality of offered solution to the research objectives.

Author of the thesis demonstrates the ability to design research by the implementation of methods from different fields of science, including statistics, mathematical game theory, case method and content analysis. The research questions correspond to the main goal of the study.

Quality of data gathering and description.

For the game-theoretic model author correctly takes data from open sources, and explains the statement of mathematical model in details with good scientific style. So as for regression model: description of primary data, logic and the results of the model are excellent.

Scientific aspect of the thesis

To reviewer's opinion the main scientific result is found in the empirical part by introducing and investigating two statistics hypnotizes. The results could be further implemented in more common research of principal-agent problem.

Practical/applied nature of research

The main goal and objectives of the research are practically oriented. The methodology suggested in the thesis can be developed further and can be successfully applied for majority of public companies.

Quality of thesis layout

Some points to highlight and page remarks:

1. Page 55: figure 2 has no reference in the text;
2. Page 67: author's recommendation for a company is "Given the model, results show that a change in strategy or CEO is not recommended...". From game-theoretical approach solution should include the strategies of all the players. For which part (principal or agent) is the author's recommendation and which recommendation is for another part?

Master thesis of Karl-Christian Martin Buehler meets the requirements of the Master in International Business Program, and according to the reviewer's opinion deserves an "excellent A" grade, thus the author can be given the desired degree.

13.06.2015

Referee:
Senior lecturer,
Operations Management Department



Andrei Ziatchin