REFEREE'S REVIEW

Program:	Master of Corporate Finance
Student:	Nikitina Evgeniya
Title of thesis:	ANALYSIS OF THE IMPACT OF TOBACCO CONTROL MEASURES ON THE VALUE OF TOBACCO COMPANIES

Justification of the topic choice. Accuracy in defining the aim and objectives of the thesis. Justification of the topic choice; accuracy in defining the aim and tasks of the thesis; originality of the topic and the extent to which it was covered; alignment of the thesis' topic, aim and objectives.	5			
Structure and logic of the text flow. Logic of research; full scope of the thesis; alignment of thesis' structural parts, i.e. theoretical and empirical parts.	5			
Quality of analytical approach and quality of offered solution to the research objectives. Adequacy of objectives coverage; ability to formulate and convey the research problem; ability to offer options for its solution; application of the latest trends in relevant research are for the set objectives.		4		
Quality of data gathering and description. Quality of selecting research tools and methods; data validity adequacy; adequacy of used data for chosen research tools and methods; completeness and relevance of the list of references.			3	
Scientific aspect of the thesis. Independent scientific thinking in solving the set problem/objectives; the extent to which the student contributed to selecting and justifying the research model (conceptual and/or quantitative), developing methodology/approach to set objectives.			3	
Practical/applied nature of research. Extent to which the theoretical background is related to the international or Russian managerial practice; development of applied recommendations; justification and interpretation of the empirical/applied results.		4		
Quality of thesis layout. Layout fulfils the requirements of the Regulations for master thesis preparation and defense, correct layout of tables, figures, references.	5			

Each item above is evaluated on the following scale, as applicable: 5 = excellent, 4 = good, 3 = satisfactory, 2 = poor.

Additional comments:

Quality of analytical approach and quality of offered solution to the research objectives. In scientific practice the effect of any events usually measured by ESA (event study analysis) method, or CTAR (calendar time abnormal return) method, or Difference-in-Difference method and so on. Using multiple regression is justified only when the cross-country comparisons of companies is made (different taxes, or different degree of regulation of the market of tobacco products, etc.).

Quality of data gathering and description. The choice of GDP or disposable income as independent variables is not correct. The changes of the market value of companies are rather determined by the dynamics of the stock index, i.e. market values of other companies.

Scientific aspect of the thesis. The regression model is built with gross errors. For example: the market value of the company is determined by the total amount of dividends paid by the company, not the amount of the dividend per share. Thus the author does not take into account the total number of company's shares (the regression coefficient is enormous $-3,6 \cdot 10^7$, see for example Table 5 on p.39). Such a model can give incorrect results that meaningless to discuss.

Practical/applied nature of research. "Implementation of tobacco control measures works in favor to companies" — this finding is likely the result of errors of the author's model. The other findings are trivial and well-known.

Master thesis of Nikitina Evgeniya meets the requirements of MCF program, and deserves a "satisfactory" grade, thus the author can be given the desired degree.

Referee:
Associate Professor _____ /Okulov V.L./
15.06.2013