REFEREE'S REVIEW

Program:	Master in Corporate Finance
Student:	Yakovleva Ekaterina
Title of thesis:	**SUPPLY CHAIN RELATED HIDDEN COSTS AS THE FACTOR OF THE M&A DEALS OVERVALUATION (Airlines case study)**

Justification of the topic choice. Accuracy in defining the aim and objectives of the thesis. Justification of the topic choice; accuracy in defining the aim and tasks of the thesis; originality of the topic and the extent to which it was covered; alignment of the thesis' topic, aim and objectives.	**5**	4	3	2
Structure and logic of the text flow. Logic of research; full scope of the thesis; alignment of thesis' structural parts, i.e. theoretical and empirical parts.	**5**	4	3	2
Quality of analytical approach and quality of offered solution to the research objectives. Adequacy of objectives coverage; ability to formulate and convey the research problem; ability to offer options for its solution; application of the latest trends in relevant research are for the set objectives.	**5**	4	3	2
Quality of data gathering and description. Quality of selecting research tools and methods; data validity adequacy; adequacy of used data for chosen research tools and methods; completeness and relevance of the list of references.	**5**	4	3	2
Scientific aspect of the thesis. Independent scientific thinking in solving the set problem/objectives; the extent to which the student contributed to selecting and justifying the research model (conceptual and/or quantitative), developing methodology/approach to set objectives.	**5**	4	3	2
Practical/applied nature of research. Extent to which the theoretical background is related to the international or Russian managerial practice; development of applied recommendations; justification and interpretation of the empirical/applied results.	**5**	4	3	2
Quality of thesis layout. Layout fulfils the requirements of the Regulations for master thesis preparation and defense, correct layout of tables, figures, references.	**5**	4	3	2

Each item above is evaluated on the following scale, as applicable: 5 = excellent, 4 = good, 3 = satisfactory, 2 = poor .

Additional comments:

Please, elaborate on the above mentioned criteria (about 500 words)

The recent research shows that the major part of M&A deals do not rich the expected results. The reasons are debated and measures are taken. The reviewed thesis represents another attempt to find the reasons for failure in the supply chain hidden costs.

Author collected a unique bunch of data related to M&A deals in airline industry possessing a high level of expertise in this particular industry. The cases and data collected truly have the independent value and may serve as a good basis both for further research in different dimensions and for practical studies.

The literature review is full and modern, covering the whole field and presented in a very logical way – through the whole thesis confirming or explaining the results, so they are quoted just to the point.

The qualitative analysis of the research is strong and based on good empirical data, controversially the quantitative part is rather poor. In my opinion the regression models do not have any significant meaning for the current thesis; moreover, the input data are doubtful. In practice, due to complexity of cost systems even being insider it is very hard to get accurate data, describing the hidden supply chain costs and losses from supply chain halts. For outsider the task is almost impossible.

Conclusions presented are too general and mainly focus on problem description rather than research results. Thus the recommendations look obvious – improve pre-merge due diligence in supply chain area and integrate strategic and operational analysis in one model

In general, the author of reviewed thesis more focused on "technical" aspects of the research such as collecting data and analyzing them, than on systemizing and generalizing the findings into recommended to-do list.

Quality of thesis layout is generally good but some misprints occur – literature is not numbered, references are presented in different formats.

Master thesis of **Yakovleva Ekaterina** meets the requirements of Master in International Business program, and deserves a **good** grade, thus the author can be given the desired degree.

Date 13/06/2012

Referee:

Candidate Degree in Economics,
Associate Professor
Olga M. Udovichenko